



Proposed Minutes for January 19, 2010
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

37 Washington Street
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Valerie Norton (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Linda Williams, David Barham
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

January 19, 2010 – NEW BUSINESS
Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order at 5:07 p.m. Staff in attendance: M. Voigt & T. Norton, agenda adopted unanimously

I. CONSENT	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. ACKlandia Realty Trust - 54571	78 Pocomo Road	Rev. COA 51338 – enclose porch	15-39	M. Rowland
2. Kurzweil, Harvey – 54572	5 North Swift Rock Road	Screen in existing porch	31-34	V. Oliver
3. Carl, Diane & Mitchell – 54573	2 Chestnut Street – HSAB	Sign – Hawthorn House	42.3.1-69	M. Carl
4. Winship, Elizabeth – 54574	51 Main Street – HSAB	Sign – Nantucket Looms	42.3.1-224	E. Winship
5. Damsker, Benjamin – 54575	9 Swain Street	Rev. COA 54543 – windows	42.4.1-78	M. Rowland
6. Arakelian, Charles – 54576	11 Tetawkimmo Drive	Addition 345 SF	53-34	Self
7. Connor, Chris & Lisa – 54577	85 Somerset Road	As-built shed	66-80	Self
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve items 1 through 7. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried / McLaughlin abstain		Certificate #	54571 to 54577

II. OLD BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. Englert, Jack	45B Vestal Street	Pool & fence etc	41-591	M. Lombardi
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Norton recused			
Representing	Mark Lombardi – brought grade down which is difficult to see, shape & location more traditional. No longer has elevated deck and retaining wall.			
Concerns	(5:09) Williams – I need a topographical map for whole lot. Barham – still will be visible from curbside even though it has been dropped. Previous concern of single lot split by privet fence separating with two houses and one pool with a potential pool for the second house. Shape is an improvement.			
Motion	Motion to View with pool corners staked and topographical map. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	
2. Wheeler, Michael	14 Shimmo Pond Road	Pool & fence	43-17	M. Lombardi
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Mark Lombardi – Client wants to be able to see children from kitchen when kids are in pool.			
Concerns	(5:15) McLaughlin – no comment. Barham – really visible because area is so much lower than the road so that screening fence does not work. It is located in the front yard as Cabana will be. Williams – agrees with Barham. Several hundred feet of three-rail split rail fence. Norton – proximity to road. Agree with Williams on 3-rail fence, which is for livestock. Roggeveen – explore other locations. Reason by client is insufficient.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	
3. Wheeler, Michael	14 Shimmo Pond Road	Retaining walls and steps	43-17	M. Lombardi
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Mark Lombardi			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Hold for pool. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	

Proposed Minutes for January 19, 2010

4. Fifty-one Baxter Road LLC					
	51 Baxter Road – SAB	Rev. COA 54072 window Δ	49-16	Botticelli & Pohl	
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Barham, Wagley				
Alternates	Coombs				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli – during work learned that porch roof rotten and sunroom windows new and should match existing.				
Concerns	(5:22) (5:42) Barham – concerned about demo of porch roof and lack of documentation. Roggeveen – I think once on the porch, you are interior of house.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Williams) Motion to View. (Norton)				
Conclusion	Carried Carried Certificate #				
5. Field, Nancy Drahzal					
	31 Nonantum Avenue	A/C condenser location	87-155	B. Meerbergen	
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham				
Alternates	Wagley				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – proposing cedar board fence.				
Concerns	(5:24) McLaughlin – it's screened; no comments. Norton – now it will look like a trash bin. Fencing should snuggle closer to units with a gate for access. Williams – a fence that size cuts into vegetation. Barham – visibility and should not be placed to abut neighbor's property line.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with fence and units out of set back and fence closer to units. (Norton)				
Conclusion	Carried / Williams opposed Certificate # 54578				
6. Nesbitt Inn LLC/Kolb					
	67 Union Street – HSAB	New garage	55.1.4-93	B. Meerbergen	
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs				
Alternates					
Representing	Brook Meerbergen				
Concerns	(5:29) Coombs – did not find other garages along Orange that are in front of house. Williams – agree. McLaughlin – looks ok and meets guidelines. Roggeveen – too far forward of the house.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)				
Conclusion	Carried Certificate #				
7. Nesbitt Inn LLC/Kolb					
	67 Union Street – HSAB	Move shed	55.1.4-93	B. Meerbergen	
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs				
Alternates					
Representing					
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to Hold for garage. (Williams)				
Conclusion	Carried Certificate #				
8. Moss, Jacqueline (Robinson)					
	36 Shell Street – SAB	Addition	73.1.3-44.3	Emeritus	
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing	Matt McEachern – significant redesign.				
Concerns	(5:32) Williams – West elevation new gable dies into roof. Should have a simple ell off the back; 4 sets of French doors; headcasing on dormer driven into trim & dormers go to ridge height. North elevation, overwhelming gable. South elevation dormer is too high on roof. Too many 4-over-4 ganged windows. Norton – agrees with Williams; addition overwhelms main house. Barham – agrees with Williams and Norton. This is a cottage setting, but scale is huge.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)				
Conclusion	Carried Certificate #				

9. Dreamland Foundation	17 South Water Street – HSAB	Rev. COA 53439,53822	42.3.1-11.1	P. Roggeveen
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley//Roggeveen recused			
Representing	Tom Catalano – Read recapping of past meeting, which was handed out. Found historical photo of cross-bucks and Chippendale railings on the Water Street side. East elevation. Height of French doors reduced. Increased size of double-hung window in pediment gable. North & South elevation windows head heights dropped to match doors. Would like to prepare an on-site mock-up to facilitate choice of color for clapboards.			
	Bill Hunter Patty Roggeveen			
Concerns	(5:51) McLaughlin – no comments. Barham – Weather vane is not a traditional design. In response to extent of clapboard, the front marquee breaks up the side facing Athenaeum and sides have limited view (not broad face to broad avenue). Coombs – no comments. Williams – dormers should not be removed. Does not have relationship to Athenaeum for clapboarding, and it is a big barn. It was never a clapboarded meeting house at this location and that was only one-fifth of its lifetime; should be shingled. Maybe on gable ends but not the long walls. Details don't match the use of clapboards. Norton – agree with Williams ref dormers and clapboarding. It has a tremendous history that this proposal dislodges. At 49'7" clapboarding it will detract from the Athenaeum. Staff – louvers should be wood.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff as drawn with wood louver vents on South elevation no larger than window above and subsequent application for clapboard color. (Barham)			
Conclusion	Carried / Norton and McLaughlin opposed		Certificate #	54579

III. NEW BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
-------------------	---------	---------------	-----	-------

1. Sanford, Bruce	8 Folger Lane – HSAB	Egress windows & well	42.4.4-33.5	A. Bennett
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Andrew Bennett – 3 rd floor dormers have thermal panes.			
Concerns	(6:22) HSAB comments read. Norton – It is a new house, but it is in OHD where TDLs are required.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for staff to obtain clarification ref storm windows over basement egress windows. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	

2. Taylor, Severn	8 Walnut Lane – HSAB	Replace windows	42.3.4-69	Stuart Flegg
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	(6:30) HSAB comments read.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for either further information or representation and to return to HSAB. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	

3. Merullo, Michael	3 Tom Never's Road	Retaining Wall	71-2.1	Structures Ultd
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley//Williams recused			
Representing	Nancy Drazal – court approved sunken and needs a retaining wall, which will be visible only from court.			
Concerns	(6:32)			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	54580

4. Shockey, Donald	27 Morey Lane - SAB	Window & door change	73.3.2-39.5	J.G. Thorsen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	(6:34)			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	54581

Proposed Minutes for January 19, 2010

5. Oldakowski, S	34A Walsh Street	Add roof walk	29-106	C. Kardell
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Caleb Kardell			
Concerns	(6:35)			
Motion	Motion to View without comment. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
6. Groenstein, Mark	38 Hummock Pond Road	New dwelling	56-292	C. Barnes
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Curtis Barnes			
Concerns	(6:37) McLaughlin – No comments. Barham –no comment. Williams – East elevation deck should come back a couple of feet. Left “D” window on North elevation dissects wall.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with East elevation 2nd- floor deck set back one foot, and North elevation left “D” window removed. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54582	
7. Pommatt, Terrence	46 Duke’s Road	AS-BUILT Shed	56-274	T. Pommatt
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Terry Pommatt			
Concerns	(6:43) No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54583	
8. Nantucket Island Resort	11 South Water Street – HSAB	Replace awnings/color change	42.3.1-76	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Doug Mills			
Concerns	(6:45) HSAB comments read. Roggeveen – red clapboard is an inappropriate color for that location on that building. Barham & Norton - have issues with the design and color of proposed awning. Barham – awnings have and do function as signs that hide detail on building under pent roof. Roggeveen – green awnings are grandfathered, but this commission will not approve new awnings of a different color and design. Need to rethink color scheme.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions.			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
9. Nantucket Island Resort	11 South Water Street – HSAB	Hardscape	42.3.1-76	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Doug Mills – replacing planting bed with grass lawn and narrow walkway of grey brick. Fence will remain but arbor to go away.			
Concerns	(6:50) HSAB comments read. Norton – presently has a flag bracket on building. McLaughlin – no comments. Barham – flag pole in that area inappropriate and bricks should match those in town. Norton & Williams agree			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
10. Nantucket Island Resort	11 South Water Street – HSAB	Wall sign “Jack Wills”	42.3.1-76	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Doug Mills			
Concerns	(6:54) SAC comments read.			
Motion	Motion to View with pertinent section from sign guidelines ref product description and M. Silverstein’s letter as to why Jack Wills does not qualify as a chain store. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		

11. Nantucket Island Resort	11 South Water Street – HSAB	Quarterboard “Jack Wills”	42.3.1-76	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Doug Mills			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to View with pertinent section from sign guidelines ref product description and M. Silverstein’s letter as to why Jack Wills does not qualify as a chain store. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	
12. Belcher, Ward	8 Plover Lane	Addition to garage	12-57	M. Rowland
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Ben Normand			
Concerns	(6:58) Barham – length and height inappropriate and addition does not marry to existing. Norton & Williams agree. McLaughlin – no comment.			
Motion	Motion to View with approved house plans. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	
13. Kaplan, Mark	8 Bishop’s Rise	Garage-studio	40-42	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Doug Mills			
Concerns	(7:03)			
Motion	Motion to View with approved house plans and 2 height poles. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	
Break 7:07 to 7:1 p.m. Barham departed 7:07 p.m.				
14. Altreuter, Joan	5 Academy Lane – HSAB	Add window & sidelights	42.4.3-111	F. Church
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates	Roggeveen recused			
Representing				
Concerns	(7:16) HSAB comments read. Williams – need proper drawings of elevations and window schedule.			
Motion	Motion to View with drawings, window schedules, better photos with comments. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	
15. Jacoby, Jake	3 Tautemo Way	Mullion pattern change	83-22	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Wagley			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Matt McEachern – presently have 6-over-6 windows but came away from last applications <i>sans</i> approval for windows that pleased client. Owner wants a clear view of everything around. Jeff Stetina			
Concerns	(7:20) Norton – no concerns. McLaughlin – No comments. Wagley – should remain 6-over-6 windows. Williams – no concerns			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried / Wagley opposed		Certificate # 54584	
16. Counihan, Daniel	11 Swain Street	Doors, windows & chimney	42.4.1-77	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Matt McEachern – pre-existing 1970s structure,			
Concerns	(7:24)			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate # 54585	

17. Gustavson, Fred	31 West Chester Street – HSAB	Replace door and window	41-451	R. Kusler
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Wagley			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Bob Kusler			
Concerns	(7:26) HSAB comments read. Norton – French door should be TDL with kick panel and made of wood. Wagley – agree that windows should be separated.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff on N elevation left window moved slightly left and farthest right moved along side with one shingle between, French doors wood, TDL with kick panels. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54586	
18. Bingham, Clara	1 Pimney’s Point	Addition	43-1	E. McMorrow
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Kevin Dale Ethan McMorrow			
Concerns	(7:33) Norton – it is approvable, but sorry to see cute house go away. Williams – transom over doors East & West elevation. Roggeveen - West elevation is most visible of highly visible location.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with dormer details replicated and remove transoms over doors. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54587	
19. Bingham, Clara	1 Pimney’s Point	Shed	43-1	E. McMorrow
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Kevin Dale Ethan McMorrow			
Concerns	(7:37)			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54588	
20. Hydrangea LP	21 Crooked Lane	New dwelling	41-480	B. Meerbergen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Wagley			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Brook Meerbergen Bill Cassidy			
Concerns	(7:39)			
Motion	Motion to View with poles at each end of main ridge without comment. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
21. Lombardi, Mark	10 Madaket Road – HSAB	Window wells & stairs	41-595	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	(7:42) Williams – exterior staircase next to open porch. Norton – all windows should be TDL. McLaughlin – no concerns. Coombs – no concerns. Staff – use of SDLs on an historic building.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with TDL windows and door. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried / Williams opposed	Certificate #	54589	
22. Gaw, Stuart	10 Robert’s Lane	Dormers & French door	56-28	S. Gaw
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Wagley			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Stuart Gaw – do not have photos of previously approved.			
Concerns	(7:49) Norton – dormers are too deep, pitches too shallow and overall too large. Should be 3’ setback.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff Exhibit A with shed dormers set back three feet. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54590	

IV.HDC BUSINESS	
Review Minutes -	Jan. 12
Approve Minutes -	Jan. 5 adopted by unanimous consent.
60 Day Denials -	<i>N/A</i>
Other Business -	Letter: Lin Neff – staff to write a letter explaining application must be pursued upon Miserelli’s return. Handouts: Establishment of position of Vice Chairman & Ethics exemptions for Nantucket HDC Possible warrant article. Intensity regulation ref increase of setbacks for pools. Motion to Submit warrant article limiting pools to be 20 feet from lot line. Carried.
Commission Comments	

Motion to Adjourn at 8:15 p.m. carried

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board
 SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board
TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board
 MAB – Madaket Advisory Board

PROPOSED