



.HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

37 Washington Street, Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
 Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Valerie Norton (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Linda Williams, David Barham
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ Minutes ~~

January 26, 2010 – OLD BUSINESS

Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order at 5:06 p.m. Staff in attendance: M. Voigt & T. Norton

I. CONSENT	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M& P	AGENT
1. Smith, E. / Zarella – 54591	127 Wauwinet Road	Move/demo: shed	12-7	Structures Unltd
2. McKeown, Chris – 54592	100 Squam Road	Rev: COA #54092 (decks)	12-35	G. Thorsen
3. McKeown, Chris – 54593	100 Squam Road	Rev: COA #54092 (door size)	12-35	G. Thorsen
4. Jones, Larry – 54594	76 West Chester Street	AS-BUILT outdoor shower	41-363	F. Clark
5. Sanibel Nominee Trust – 54595	14 N. Water Street	Rev: COA #54507 (windows)	42.4.2-83	L. Thornewill
6. Barber, Nate – 54596	7 Kelley Road	Rev: COA #54528 (windows)	54-27	Self
7. Murray, Mary – 54597	21 Brewster Road	Rev: COA #54290 (trim)	54-296	V. Oliver
8. Whitney, Caroline – 54598	18 Hooper Farm Road	Remove back door	55-86	J. Bradley
9. Wayland, Daniel – 54599	4 Pakanoket Lane	Door, window changes	55-546	M. Barber
10. Driscoll, P.(The Islander) – 54600	15 Old South Road	New shed	67-41.1	V. Oliver
11. Spaulding, Donna – 54601	14 Mary Ann Drive	AS-BUILT window well	68-444	Self
12. Savoca, Joyce – 54602	41 Skyline Drive	Re-roof: color, material Δ	79-100	P.Yalmadzhiev
13. Wick, Adele – 54603	65 Nobadeer Avenue	Window changes	88-59	Self
Sitting	Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates	Williams recused from Item 1			
Representing				
Concerns	Item 5 – reviewed, retain a chimney and remove a window that had been proposed in its place.			
Motion	Motion to Approve 1-4 & 6-13 (Barham) //Motion to Approve Item 5 (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried McLaughlin abstain//Carried		Certificate #	54591 to 54603

II. OLD BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. Englert, Jack	45B Vestal Street	Pool & fence etc	41-591	M. Lombardi
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Mark Lombardi – This is the first pool application, what happens if the neighbor wants a pool? There is no setback. Installing a double hedge with mesh fence between and board fences on side. Could use an evergreen hedge.			
Concerns	(5:09) Williams – in discussion about the subdivision HDC did not want to see pools side-by-side. Barham – visibility. Coombs – concerned about distance between edge of pool and condo line and possibility of future density of pools. Visibility. McLaughlin – not in OHD and should be approved. Williams – if it had been proposed while building was being discussed, could have moved basement stairs to allow pool to be better located.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions to include possible relocation of basement stairs. (Barham)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	
2. Fifty-one Baxter Road LLC	51 Baxter Road – SAB	Rev .COA 54072 window Δ	49-16	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Norton, Williams, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli			
Concerns	(5:23) Barham – not enthused about double-hung windows, would prefer awnings or something to preserve the old look. Would like to see posts and handrails trimmed consistent with early photos and 2 nd floor posts and rails. Coombs – agree with Barham about windows. Porch is in bad condition. Wagley – agrees. Williams – agrees.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with two larger North windows sliders, smaller either fixed or awnings and porch rebuilt exactly as is. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	54604

Proposed Minutes for January 26, 2010

3. Oldakowski, S	34A Walsh Street	Add roof walk	29-106	C. Kardell
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Caleb Kardell – house is tucked in, low profile and not really visible. Think the roof walk would add character.			
Concerns	(5:33) McLaughlin – House is 2 story & walk should be NTW with scuttle. Barham – three parallel posts on a walk only 8 feet long, center post should go away. Hear issues about scale and inclined to agree with Norton & Wagley. No chimney and low pitch. Wagley – no apparent justification for a roof walk on this house. Williams – no concerns. Norton – don't think it is appropriate on this tiny 2-story house in a neighborhood of small houses. When looking at cottages down there, they are turn-of-the-century and newer so roof walks, even though there are some there, should not be in this neighborhood. Perhaps if it was 6 feet.			
Motion	Motion to View to allow commissioners to compare with other buildings in neighborhood with roof walks. (Barham)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	
4. Belcher, Ward	8 Plover Lane	Addition to garage	12-57	M. Rowland
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Ben Normand – only garage bay elevation visible from Clover Way. Scaled back and added elements reflecting main house.			
Concerns	(5:47) Williams – fancy elements should not be pulled onto a simple structure. Needs to be more subdued; lose gable dormers and deck stairs. McLaughlin - no comment; approvable due to remote location. Barham – gable dormers are too wide, no commonality between two sections of building. Coombs – agree with Williams on shed dormers			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions (correct East elevation). (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	
5. Kaplan, Mark	8 Bishop's Rise	Garage-studio	40-42	BPC
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	(5:52)			
Motion	Motion to View with poles (which had fallen down) without comment. (Barham)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	
6. Altreuter, Joan	5 Academy Lane – HSAB	Add window & sidelights	42.4.3-111	F. Church
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Jen Iller			
Concerns	(5:53) Norton - Did not get a drawing of door without porch showing the sidelights.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with drawing showing door and sidelights as if screen not there. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate # 54605	
7. Hydrangea LP	21 Crooked Lane	New dwelling	41-480	B. Meerbergen
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – residence tied to barn. Brick is functional component to keep fire separation from barn. Katy Conte & Bill Cassidy – West Chester extension is the oldest road in town but not a town road. Would prefer gables instead of hipped roofs.			
Concerns	(5:57) Williams – no half rounds. Shutters are inappropriate and not operable. Coombs – concerned if West Chester Ext. should ever open. Chaotic fenestration detracts from the nice variations of shape, windows and simpler doors. Barham – agree with Williams & Coombs. Massing on a whole is handsome. 2 nd story windows should be type 3 and un-ganged. Bricks seem funny and should not be carried from barn to house. East elevation negative mass. McLaughlin – agree ref the chaotic fenestration. No access to the roof walk is shown. South elevation door not appropriate. Norton – it will be visible and is too stylized for such a rural area. Massing is great. South elevation sidelights are way too much and should be separate windows; triple unit above door looks too Southern. No shaft on the roof walk. Brick on connector not appropriate as well as shutters and half-rounds. Need cut-away of West elevation. Look into another fire-proof material instead of brick. Prefer square columns.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and update application. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	

Proposed Minutes for January 26, 2010

8. Sestrimski, Svetovar	23 Wampanoag Way	Play House	68-311	S. Sestrimski
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Svetovar Sestrimski – redesigned.			
Concerns	(6:16) Williams – no concerns. Wagley – ditto. McLaughlin – no comment. Barham – South elevation gable window should drop 6 to 8 inches.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with South elevation gable window dropping 6 inches. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54606	
9. Rapp, Todd	23 Orange Street – HSAB	Pool	42.3.2-9	E. McMorrow
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Kevin Dale – met with Curtis Barnes, who said church had no objections with this proposal.			
Concerns	(6:19)			
Motion	Motion to View with new plan without comment. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
10. Read, Phillip	14 Sherburne Turnpike	Addition	30-197	SMRD
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates	Barham recused			
Representing	Steve Roethke – addressed comments			
Concerns	(6:23) Williams – no concerns. McLaughlin – no concerns. Coombs – ditto. Wagley – no concerns			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54607	
11. Purple Wampum LLC	41 Jefferson Avenue – HSAB	Renovation	30-45	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Held for next old business meeting at applicant’s request.			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
12. Purple Wampum LLC	41 Jefferson Avenue	New cottage	30-45	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Held for next old business meeting at applicant’s request.			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
13. Toland, Lita	4 Pleasant Street – HSAB	Hardscape behind studio & house	42.3.3-157	B. Hunter
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Bill Hunter – will add the patio to this application in the revisions. Steven Cohen (abutters) – don’t see an application for the new patio behind the main house.			
Concerns	(6:26) Barham – existing patio is not visible and ok with the patio going in behind studio. McLaughlin – no comment with suggested changes. Coombs – no problem. Williams – no issue. Norton – appropriate location.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with corrected drawings & application including new patio behind the main house. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54608	

Proposed Minutes for January 26, 2010

14. Toland, Lita	4 Pleasant Street – HSAB	Remove brick paving	42.3.3-157	B. Hunter
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Bill Hunter – replacing hedge, brick pavers go away, and there will be no gate and little walk. Shower is being removed. Steven Cohen			
Concerns	(6:26)			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with corrected drawings showing no pavers and continual hedge. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried Certificate # 54609			
15. Toland, Lita	4 Pleasant Street – HSAB	Play House	42.3.3-157	B. Hunter
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Bill Hunter – if you want to hold them over, that is fine with me. I don't think it is an efficient use of the Commission's time. Steven Cohen – why is this not being reviewed now?			
Concerns	Williams – the play house is brand new and should have been new business. Norton – square footage is 86 SF, so no notification issue. This has never been an application.			
Motion	Motion to View. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried Certificate #			
16. Toland, Lita	4 Pleasant Street – HSAB	Shutters on house with rose	42.3.3-157	B. Hunter
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Bill Hunter – presentation of other houses in area with designs in the shutters. What if the applicant just removes the shutters? Steven Cohen			
Concerns	(6:42) Williams – these were denied and should never have been put up. They are not appropriate. Coombs – this is an historic house, designs should not be on shutters. The “Rooster” house is a much younger house. Norton – the “Rooster” house is 1930s. The house had traditional shutters and so would have to apply to remove shutters altogether. The design was denied, not shutters.			
Motion	Motion to Deny design in shutters as architecturally inappropriate and previous denial. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried Need application for ship shutters on studio. Certificate # 54610			
17.20 Cliff Road LLC	20 Cliff Road – HSAB	New foundation & window	42.4.4-57	C. Skehel
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Chris Skehel – walked around house with McLaughlin. Only structural changes are the basement and rear elevation want to replace two windows with a door. Existing rubble foundation will remain. Applicant is willing to put a landscape easement in place to keep basement access in present location.			
Concerns	(6:47) McLaughlin – presents photos of work done. East elevation new basement access staircase along Cliff Rd. West elevation triple doors will be visible. Barham – foundation material along Cliff Road has not been discussed and can't tell from application what will be used. Section along Cliff Road and under the kitchen will be block & parged. Rubble stone seen along East elevation should be used continuous under original section of the house. Staircase to basement should not be on Cliff Road. No problem with new doors. Williams – walk down is problematic along the road. Wagley – agree with Barham ref the foundation. Norton – window schedule should call out a manufacturer for the doors. This house is perpendicular to the road and the basement access must be moved. Parging on the foundation of the road elevation is ok since it was cement board. Staff – need to illustrate on the plans where what foundation material will be used.			
Motion	Motion to Fine 10-times normal application fee for work done without permit. (McLaughlin)// Motion to Hold for revisions with corrected foundation plans. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried Williams opposed//Carried Certificate #			

Proposed Minutes for January 26, 2010

18.Griffin/Lampe	18 Rabbit Run Road	New garage with pergola	43-176	Emeritus
Sitting	Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Williams recused			
Representing	Matt McEachern – client would really like round columns. Pergola pulls the garage and house together and in that context should be heavier.			
Concerns	(7:07) Coombs – reduced dormers look good. Pergola columns are heavy looking and should be 6 ½ inches. Barham – typical pergolas should have a run beam on top of columns. Everything else is ok. McLaughlin – pergola is not appropriate and is visible from the road. Norton – bump out and dormers diminish narrowness. Pergola is not ok.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff without the pergola at this time. (Coombs)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54611	
19.Griffin/Lampe	18 Rabbit Run Road	Patio and fence	43-176	Emeritus
Sitting	Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Williams recused			
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Hold for pergola to be added to this application. (Coombs)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
20.Moss (Robinson)	36 Shell Street – SAB	Addition	73.1.3-44.3	Emeritus
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Matt McEachern – small drafting error on South elevation, missing dormer profile. North elevation mislabeled			
Concerns	(7:15) McLaughlin – no concerns. Barham – <i>in toto</i> it is too much house in comparison with what is around it. Big shed dormers are out of scale on North & South elevations. Mix of slender, double-hung windows sometimes ganged, on original house makes a strange collection on the North elevation; scale difference between 4/4 on first floor & 6/6 on second floor is enormous. Wagley – area is large lots with small buildings, and this reverses the trend. Much too big. Williams – agree with Barham ref windows on North elevation. West elevation reduced visibility. East elevation wrapped porch is good. South elevation rear ell is so far back most of it is not visible. Staff – application shows foundation is being raised, but lacking the abutter’s letter.			
Motion	Motion to View with aerial shot and corrected drawings. (Williams) Need letter to abutter.			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		

III.HDC BUSINESS	
Review Minutes -	Jan. 19
Approve Minutes -	Jan. 12, Motion to Approve (Barham) Carried.
60 Day Denials -	N/A
Other Business -	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Handout: proposed warrant article as to go before BOS on Wednesday January 27, 2010. Motion to Endorse “that” language to get it onto the Warrant. (Williams) Barham amend motion wants handout to go to D. Roggeveen to be polished before the meeting. Carried Marvin Product Presentation – Marine Home Centre & Marvin Windows : Lisa Botticelli - window requested for 3 Cash’s Court addition application. Norton – approve this window for this project only. Staff – not directly about Cash’s Court, it relates to it. Presentation is about a Marvin TDL. Williams – Motion to Reaffirm Motion to Approve ref 3 Cash’s Court with “this” window. Carried Williams depart 7:49 Mark Stanley, Marine Home Center – want to get a Marvin product that can be used in OHD. Vin Anders, Marvin Windows – presentation for Marvin TDL window approvable in OHD. Pine, Mahogany, and other species as well as aluminum. Norton – need the narrower muntin profile.
Commission Comments	24 South Water roof walk. (Barham) is it approved

Motion to Adjourn 8:10 p.m. Carried

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board
 TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board