



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

37 Washington Street
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Valerie Norton (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Linda Williams, David Barham
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

February 2, 2010 – NEW BUSINESS

Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order at 5:06 p.m. Staff in attendance: M. Voigt & J. Grieder.

I. CONSENT	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	MAP-PARCEL	AGENT
1. Taylor, Severn – 54612	8 Walnut Lane – HSAB	Replace windows	42.3.4-69	S. Flegg
2. 2 ¼ Mi Hill Tst – 54613	2 Quarter Mile Hill Road	Rev: COA #54086, 54329	42.3.3-49	C. Webster
3. S Nantucket LLC – 54614	84 N. Liberty Street	Rev: COA #54250	41-131	Botticelli & Pohl
4. Hellman, N. – 54615	48 Centre Street	New sign: projecting sign	42.3.1-1	P. Giorgio
5. NIR (Sosebee) – 54616	22 Old South Wharf	New sign: projecting sign	42.2.4-2	D. Sosebee
6. NIR (Sosebee) – 54617	22 Old South Wharf	86 picture window/move door	42.2.4-2	D. Sosebee
7. The Islander LLC – 54618	15 Old South Road	New sign: wall sign	67-41.1	P. Driscoll
8. The Islander LLC – 54619	15 Old South Road	New sign: projecting sign	67-41.1	P. Driscoll
9. 3 Maxey Pond Rd – 54620	3 Maxey Pond Road	Rev: COA #53195 (shower)	40-106	C. Barnes
10. Smith, John – 54621	5 Sparrow Drive	New shed	68-530	C. Lenhart
11. Hestwood, Robert – 54622	2A Longwood Drive	New apron	71-13.3	Self

Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham

Alternates Coombs, Hill Holdgate

Representing

Concerns

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Barham)**

Conclusion Carried (McLaughlin abstained)

Certificate # 54612-54622

III. NEW BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	MAP-PARCEL	AGENT
1. Arno, Joseph	27 Easy Street – HSAB	New windows	42.4.2-18	B. McGowan

Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs

Alternates Hill Holdgate

Representing

Concerns HSAB comments read. Used to be a ropewalk on Brant Point. Commission agrees with HSAB comments.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions and applicant to meet with HSAB to develop more appropriate fenestration. (Norton)**

Conclusion Carried

Certificate #

2. Nantucket Island Resort	14 Swain Street	New doors, windows	42.4.1-82	N. Malloy
----------------------------	-----------------	--------------------	-----------	-----------

Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Hill Holdgate

Alternates Coombs

Representing Nathan Malloy

Concerns

Motion **Motion to View. (Barham)**

Conclusion Carried

Certificate #

3. Reilly, Edward	11 Plum Street	Addition	80-28	Permits Plus
-------------------	----------------	----------	-------	--------------

Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs

Alternates Hill Holdgate

Representing Mark Poor

Concerns No concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Norton) (Barham abstained)**

Conclusion Carried

Certificate # 54623

PLEASE TURN OFF CELL PHONES

4.	J. Pepper Frazier	7 Plum Street	AS-BUILT: shed	80-26	JP Frazier
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Hill Holdgate				
Alternates	Coombs				
Representing	Matt McEachern				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)				
Conclusion	Carried			Certificate #	54624

13:00

5.	Nantucket Electric Comp.	32 Bunker Road	Wind turbine (residential)	78-2.7	S. Holdgate
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Hill Holdgate				
Representing					
Concerns	Concerned about the shape of the blades; does it need to be lit per FAA regulations?				
Motion	Motion to Hold for additional information and representation. (Norton)				
Conclusion	Carried			Certificate #	

6.	Matloff, Harvey	15 Nichols Road	Window, door change	92.4-185	T.A. Nelson
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Hill Holdgate				
Alternates	Coombs				
Representing	Tom Nelson				
Concerns	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)				
Conclusion	Carried			Certificate #	54625

Applications must be stapled.

7.	Skae, Betsy	37 Brewster Road	Window, door change	54-87	SCI/Charles
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Charles Lenhart				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)				
Conclusion	Carried			Certificate #	54626

8.	Sayer, Ruth	10 Gardner Street – HSAB	Add window	42.3.3-13	B. Meerbergen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Hill Holdgate				
Alternates	Coombs				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen				
Concerns	HSAB comments read. The bay is a Victorian-style addition and is not appropriate to a house of this vintage (Norton, Hill Holdgate agree, chair does not) and the bay is oversized and should be grounded – simpler window treatment would be preferable. The second floor windows are too large. Satellite dish should be relocated.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Norton)				
Conclusion	Carried			Certificate #	

9.	Kenzie Nominee Trust	7 Grant Avenue	Fence	30-142	D. Champoux
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Dave Champoux				
Concerns	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)				
Conclusion	Carried			Certificate #	54627

PLEASE TURN OFF CELL PHONES

10. Piuggi, Jack (Lawler)	6 Packet Road – SAB	Rev: COA #53913	73-58	Permits Plus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Hill Holdgate			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Mark Poor			
Concerns	The previously-approved exterior chimney would not be preferable, otherwise the changes are an improvement.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the chimney interior to the structure. (Barham)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54628	
11. Kotalac, Rick	54A Bartlett Road	Dormers/doors	66-1	E. McMorrow
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Rick Kotalac			
Concerns	Highly visible, concerned that T-111 not be used. The doors are off-center for structural reasons. The dormers are inappropriate (Roggeveen, Barham).			
Motion	Motion to View with previous approval. (Barham)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
12. Curran, Kevin	90 Tom Nevers Road	Addition/renovation	91-41.1	E. McMorrow
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Hill Holdgate			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Kevin Curran, Bill Hunter, Ethan McMorrow			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54629	
47:50				
13. Alban, James	1 Indian Avenue	Addition, roof walk	30-114.1	E. McMorrow
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Ethan McMorrow			
Concerns	HSAB comments read. East elevation, access to roof walk will be highly visible. The infill connector will make this a much large building; they should remain two separate structures (Norton, Coombs agreed with Barham). Main house could support a roofwalk.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
14. Dorton, Patrick	21 Woodbine Street	New dwelling	80-321	N. McMullen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Hill Holdgate			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Nathan McMullen			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54630	
Williams arrived 5:56pm.				
15. Lot 51 LLC	135 Eel Point Road	Cottage window/door change	33-12	J.G. Thorsen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Chris Lewis			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Barham)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54631	

PLEASE TURN OFF CELL PHONES

16. Lot 51 LLC	135 Eel Point Road	Cabana door change	33-12	J.G. Thorsen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Chris Lewis			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54632	
17. 15 Irving Street LLC	15 Irving Street	Add four-light window	79-121	J.G. Thorsen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Chris Lewis			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54633	
18. Yaeger Gregg Trust	37 Cliff Road – HSAB	Hardscaping	42.4.4-42	GDC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Julie Jordin			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to View with elevation and cross-section of wall included. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
19. Yaeger Gregg Trust	39 Cliff Road – HSAB	Hardscaping	42.4.4-42	GDC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Julie Jordin			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to View with reduced set of plans provided at meeting and written permission for access. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
20. Forrester, Mike	6 Kelley Road	Add window & replace door	54-29	B. Conlin
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Bruce Conlin			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54634	
21. Wade, Roger	5 Deacon's Way	Pool, spa, & pool deck	40-87	B. Champoux
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Ben Champoux			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to View with stakes in place. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
22. Wade, Roger	5 Deacon's Way	Fence & arbor	40-87	B. Champoux
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Ben Champoux			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to View. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		

PLEASE TURN OFF CELL PHONES

23. McGrath, Ben	12 Cliff Road – HSAB	Arbor, gate	42.4.4-62	R. Kurash
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Bruce Conlin			
Concerns	HSAB comments read.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54635	
23. Murray, Mary	21 Brewster Road	Rev: COA (roofwalk skirt)	54-296	V. Oliver
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs (Norton recused)			
Alternates	Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Val Oliver, Mary Murray			
Concerns	A skirt is atypical and a shaft would be preferred. The skirt would be visible from Polpis Road. A partial skirt may be approvable.			
Motion	Motion to View with roofing panel plan. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
24. Boucher, Charles	40 Wanoma Way	New dwelling	92.4-237	V. Oliver
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Hill Holdgate (Barham departed 6:34 returned 6:37)			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Val Oliver			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to View. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
25. Cannon, Robert	10 Pinkham Circle	New dwelling	56-165	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Luke Thornewill			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to View. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
26. Cannon, Robert	10 Pinkham Circle	Garage	56-165	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Luke Thornewill			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to View. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
27. Atlas Realty Trust	212 Eel Point Road	Hardscaping: pergola	38-35	M. McGowan
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs (Roggeveen recused)			
Alternates	Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Marty McGowan			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54636	
28. Atlas Realty Trust	212 Eel Point Road	Hardscaping: spa	38-35	M. McGowan
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs (Roggeveen recused)			
Alternates	Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Marty McGowan			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54637	

PLEASE TURN OFF CELL PHONES

29. Atlas Realty Trust	212 Eel Point Road	Hardscaping: retaining wall	38-35	M. McGowan
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs (Roggeveen recused)			
Alternates	Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Marty McGowan			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54638	
30. Spitler, Barbara	85 Millbrook Road	Rev: COA (workshop)	40-262	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Mark Cutone			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54639	
31. Spitler, Barbara	85 Millbrook Road	Rev: COA (cabana)	40-262	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Mark Cutone			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54640	
32. Strain, Anne	16 Mount Vernon Rd – HSAB	Enlarge porch	55.4-33	B. Baker
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation and revisions. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
33. Folk, John	341 Polpis Road	Pool, hardscaping	24-20	Jardins Int'l.
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Elizabeth O'Rourke			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54641	
34. Abbey, Douglas	18 Hinckley Lane – HSAB	Dormer change	30-243	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns	HSAB comments read. Dormer, windows are too large; meeting rails do not align. A flush design will not work in any configuration – a shed dormer might work.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
35. Frazier, Dalton	51 West Chester Street	Door change	41-288	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams) (Barham, McLaughlin opposed, chair in favor)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54642	

PLEASE TURN OFF CELL PHONES

36. Gustavson, Fred	31 West Chester Street – HSAB	Door & window change	41-451	B. Kusler
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing				
Concerns	HSAB comments read.			
Motion	Motion to View with previous approval. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	
37. Caldwell, Janet	8 Ishmael Road	Renew: COA #50042 (main)	82-90	Self
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams) (Barham abstained)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	54643
38. Caldwell, Janet	8 Ishmael Road	Renew: COA #50043 (cottage)	82-90	Self
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams) (Barham abstained)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	54644
39. Caldwell, Janet	8 Ishmael Road	Renew: COA #50044 (demo)	82-90	Self
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams) (Barham abstained)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	54645

IV. HDC BUSINESS	
Review Minutes -	Jan. 26
Approve Minutes -	Jan. 19 – Motion to Approve (Barham) Carried.
60 Day Denials -	
Other Business -	Radar signs for Milestone Road. Rotten Pumpkin Farm presentation
Commission Comments	

Motion to Adjourn 8:10 p.m. carried.

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board
TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board