



Proposed Minutes for February 17, 2009  
**HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION**

37 Washington Street  
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554  
Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572  
[www.nantucket-ma.gov](http://www.nantucket-ma.gov)

**Commissioners:** Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Linda Williams (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Valerie Norton, David Barham  
**Associate Commissioners:** Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

Feb. 17, 2009 – OLD BUSINESS

Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order 5:02 p.m. Staff in attendance J. Grieder & T. Norton

**I. CONSENT**

1. Alfaro, Francisco – 53440	23A Bartlett Road	Window wells	67-6	C. Alfaro
2. Lee Dunn Inc – 53441	142 Old South Road	Roof material change	69-61	Bessey Const
3. Maglione, Bernadette - 53442	28 Appleton Road	Color change to NTW	66-503	Self
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to <b>Approve</b>			
Vote	Unanimous		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>53440 to 53442</b>

**II. SIGN POLICY HEARING Part 2**

Flag Signs	Chris Young Wendy Hudson
	Roggeveen - ban standard red, white, blue "Open" sign, could require they be custom made.
Chalkboards & Menu boxes	Chris Young 5 square feet because chalkboard added to menu box section and the size existed. It to be thought of as separate can change the size.
Umbrella signs	
Rock signs	
Motion	Motion to continue to beginning of Feb. 24 meeting for supplemental information to be presented by staff.
Vote	5-0

**III. OLD BUSINESS**

1. Nantucket Land Bank	15 N. Liberty Street – HSAB	Replace windows, color change	42.3.4-2	B. Perry
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Bruce Perry – not replacing, only re-trimming windows. Need to get the house shingled and weather tight before season. Would like trim at grey or such to move along.			
Concerns	(5:08) Need a proper plot plan showing true dimensions and position of house on lot. Concern rear deck will be very visible and is inappropriate. Need to know where driveway will be located. Need to know exactly how the grade will be altered. This style of house should have white trim. Modern deck on back of traditional house where a porch might have existed. Applicant should work with someone on design of traditional porch on back of house.			
Motion	Motion to Hold application for revisions. Staff to issue permits necessary for paint and shingling.			
Vote	5-0		<b>Certificate #</b>	
2. Nantucket Land Bank	48 Tennessee Ave – MAB	Demo boat house	59.4-92	B. Perry
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	(5:25)			
Motion	Motion to Hold for beginning of beginning of Mar. 3 meeting			
Vote	5-0		<b>Certificate #</b>	
Williams arrived 5:27 p.m.				

**Proposed Minutes for February 17, 2009**

<b>3.</b>	<b>Johnson, Joyce</b>	<b>34 Easton Street – HSAB</b>	<b>New garage</b>	<b>42.1.4-18</b>	<b>BPC</b>
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates					
Representing	Joe Paul				
Concerns	(5:29) Cupola looks out of place on such a tall, narrow building. Four-ganged windows facing the street. Panes on West elevation 2 <sup>nd</sup> floor window look much larger than others. Dormers should get tighter as one window of four is dropped. One wants symmetrical dormers, one does not.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions				
Vote	5-0		<b>Certificate #</b>		
<b>4.</b>	<b>Fifield, Randy</b>	<b>5 Fair Street – HSAB</b>	<b>Pool and A/C</b>	<b>42.3.1-108</b>	<b>CWA</b>
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Steve Blashfield – Owner aware of NHA concern and willing to work with NHA concerning screening landscaping. No specific dialogue between owner and NHA.				
Concerns	Mark Avery Abutter Fair Street Museum – express concern of NHA for pool and hardscape at this site, submitted letter of concern. Incongruous with Ray’s Ct. building open to public and there will be an impact. (5:35) Wagley not prepared to vote without further information on court case concerning pool at 3 Fair Street. Barham would like to see dialogue between two parties begin in order to give HDC better understanding. A/C condensers should be set into deeper wells to mitigate noise and visibility. <b>((Reduced set must be legible.))</b> Planting bed looks to be on the order of 12 to 15 inches deep which would barely cover pool. Looks like too much being packed into a small site. There is a lot of stone wall visible and rock must be more typical to Nantucket. Concern about view from NHA building into the pool area. <b>((Need cross section plan.))</b> Four-foot fence will not hide fence; if could lower pool grade further might be able to us a 5&1 fence or pergola. Concern about brick window well on front of property.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions				
Vote	5-0		<b>Certificate #</b>		
<b>5.</b>	<b>Fifield, Randy</b>	<b>5 Fair Street – HSAB</b>	<b>Hardscaping</b>	<b>42.3.1-108</b>	<b>CWA</b>
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Steve Blashfield Mark Avery				
Concerns	(5:35) Shell carrying across 44 feet total, bikes should go on grass and shell should be on driveway only. Driveway is too wide. Applicant needs to revisit size of parking – reduced would change impact of pool by enlarging yard and grass space.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions				
Vote	5-0		<b>Certificate #</b>		
<b>6.</b>	<b>Ramos, Roberto</b>	<b>83 Hinsdale Drive</b>	<b>Shed dormers</b>	<b>69-112</b>	<b>R. Ramos</b>
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Coombs				
Representing					
Concerns	(6:08) Not a traditional gambrel				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions, applicant to work with staff in regards to proper dormers				
Vote	5-0		<b>Certificate #</b>		
<b>7.</b>	<b>Graham, Kathryn</b>	<b>11 Priscilla Lane</b>	<b>Fence</b>	<b>41-351</b>	<b>Topham Design</b>
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Wagley				
Representing					
Concerns	(6:10)				
Motion	<b>Motion to View again with proper page and information on terminus of fence</b>				
Vote	5-0		<b>Certificate #</b>		

**Proposed Minutes for February 17, 2009**

8. Folberth, William      58 Walsh Street      New dwelling      29-97      Lyman Perry  
 Sitting      Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Coombs, Wagley  
 Alternates  
 Representing      Jen Riolo  
                          Jamie Cabral  
 Concerns      (6:12)  
 Motion      Motion to **Approve**  
 Vote      5-0      **Certificate #      53443**

9. 54 Centre Street LLC      54 Centre Street – HSAB      Fencing / gates      42.4.3-30      D. Boyce  
 Sitting      Norton, Barham, Coombs, Wagley  
 Alternates      Roggeveen & Williams recused  
 Representing      David Boyce  
                          Mark Lombardi – it’s a big house and one-car parking is restrictive.  
 Concerns      (6:16) Prior approval not included in view pack. Where fence stops near road, there is continuation of timber retaining wall and that is not an appropriate material. Need larger scale plans.  
 Motion      Motion to Hold for revision and ¼ - scale plans  
 Vote      4-0      **Certificate #**

10. 54 Centre Street LLC      54 Centre Street – HSAB      Paving      42.4.3-30      D. Boyce  
 Sitting      Norton, Barham, Coombs, Wagley  
 Alternates      Roggeveen & Williams recused  
 Representing      David Boyce  
                          Mark Lombardi  
 Concerns      (6:16) Parking looks to be excessive – 30 feet deep; it is effectively parking for two cars. Need to revise parking in order to minimize the amount of paved surface - should not extend deeper than the arch. Site is all gravel and brick and needs more lawn. In OHD gravel is not appropriate material, the driveway needs to be pulled back to single car.  
 Motion      Motion to Hold for revision and ¼ - scale plans  
 Vote      4-0      **Certificate #**

11. Merson, John      71 Baxter Road – SAB      Move / demo garage      49-26.1      J. Merson  
 Sitting      Roggeveen , Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs  
 Alternates      Wagley  
 Representing      J. Merson  
 Concerns      (6:33)  
 Motion      Motion to Hold for main house  
 Vote      5-0      **Certificate #**

12. Merson, John      71 Baxter Road – SAB      Move house on-site & additions      49-26.1      J. Merson  
 Sitting      Roggeveen , Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs  
 Alternates      Wagley  
 Representing      J. Merson – Built by Joseph Cunningham from Philadelphia and are looking for record of architect. Can not survive this close to bluff for long. To move back, it needs to be narrowed to fit within set back. Propose to remove post 1932 additions. To make up for loss of bedrooms, propose to put 2 in basement and add partial 2<sup>nd</sup> floor for third bedroom.  
 Concerns      (6:35) SAB comments read. Elegant modern design of 1930s with low level and hipped approach, concerned adding second floor would obliterate original lines. Listed as “Contributing” but should be listed “Individually Significant.”  
 Motion      Motion to Hold for revisions  
 Vote      5-0      **Certificate #**

**Proposed Minutes for February 17, 2009**

<b>13. Potter Trust</b>	<b>17 Liberty Street – HSAB</b>	<b>Rev: COA #52876 (skylights)</b>	<b>42.3.4-110</b>	<b>B. Meerbergen</b>
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen			
Concerns	(6:48) North elevation three-light window in gable not appropriate. In OHD should keep to guideline - one skylight per roof plane and made of wood. Skylights should be on elevation away from street.			
Motion	Motion to <b>Approve</b> Through Staff only the skylights made of wood			
Vote	4-1 Norton	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>53444</b>	
<b>14. Rogerson, Louise</b>	<b>53 Cato Lane</b>	<b>Revisions</b>	<b>56-46</b>	<b>D. Holcomb</b>
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Wagley , Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	David Holcomb – dropping the ridge would make 2 <sup>nd</sup> floor virtually useless. Joseph Beddell			
Concerns	(6:56)			
Motion	Motion to <b>Approve</b>			
Vote	5-0	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>53445</b>	
<b>15. Wentworth, Kim</b>	<b>14 Lincoln Avenue – HSAB</b>	<b>House</b>	<b>30-182</b>	<b>BPC</b>
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Mark Mark Cutone			
Concerns	(6:59) HSAB comments read. “Q” window North elevation looks different in proposed due to significantly different trim detail in proposed, which should have been applied for. First floor trim is much larger revealed than 2 <sup>nd</sup> floor so stands out more. Concern about height change in chimney, design change is fine.			
Motion	Motion to <b>Approve</b> Through Staff with chimney one foot taller			
Vote	5-0	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>53446</b>	
<b>Break 7:08 to 7:18 p.m.</b>				
<b>16. McLean, Biff</b>	<b>2 Spring Street – HSAB</b>	<b>Addition</b>	<b>55.1.4-16</b>	<b>NAG</b>
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Doug Mills			
Concerns	(7:18) Keep cornerboard on East elevation to keep tower framed			
Motion	Motion to <b>Approve</b> Through Staff with cornerboard added back in East elevation			
Vote	4-1 Barham	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>53447</b>	
<b>17. Loring, Patricia</b>	<b>5 Goose Pond Rd – HSAB</b>	<b>Addition</b>	<b>55-46</b>	<b>C. Holland</b>
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Sue Ellen Robertson			
Concerns	(7:20) East elevation brackets under suspended 2 <sup>nd</sup> floor deck need to look more substantial. Deck is too wide too horizontal. Would prefer to see porch with balustrades			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions			
Vote	5-0	<b>Certificate #</b>		
<b>18. Loring, Patricia</b>	<b>5 Goose Pond Rd – HSAB</b>	<b>Demo garage</b>	<b>55-46</b>	<b>C. Holland</b>
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Hold			
Vote	5-0	<b>Certificate #</b>		



**Proposed Minutes for February 17, 2009**

25. Irwin, Richard	115 Cliff Road	Addition	41-7	Permits Plus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing				
Concerns	(8:20)			
Motion	Carried forward to Feb. 24 for quorum			
Vote				<b>Certificate #</b>
26. Hammer, Jay	6 King Street – SAB	Foundation	73.1.3-86	Permits Plus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Steven Cohen			
Concerns	John Stover – this water is coming to us because the road has been built up. (8:21) <b>(Williams departed at 8:26)</b> Would like applicant to explore alternative ways to handle drainage other than raising an historic house to “code” height. <b>(Williams returned 8:32 then walked away again.)</b>			
Motion	<b>Motion to View</b> (with comment)			
Vote	4-0			<b>Certificate #</b>
27. Reinemo, Tim	63 Lovers Lane	New garage	80-214	T. Reinemo
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	K. Reinemo – house is 12/12, dormers 7/12, door 4/12			
Concerns	(8:37) Eave height and pitch should look more like the house.			
Motion	Motion to <b>Approve</b> Through Staff with 9/12 on main mass 5or6/12 on porch and trim details to match main house			
Vote	4-0			<b>Certificate # 53450</b>
28. Silva, David	16 Helens Drive	Addition	66-53	D. Silva
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	D. Silva			
Concerns	(8:42) Dormers should be set back three feet from wall.			
Motion	<b>Motion to View</b>			
Vote	5-0			<b>Certificate #</b>
	Williams depart 8:50 p.m.			
29. Mailloux, Sally	10 Salros Road	New building	67-107	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Matt McEachern orally waiving right to a consistent board			
Concerns	(8:51)			
Motion	Motion to <b>Approve</b>			
Vote	4-0			<b>Certificate # 53451</b>
	Williams returned 8:53			
30. Savel Nominee Trust	47 Pocomo Road	Rev: COA #53234 (windows)	15-19	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli			
Concerns	(8:53)			
Motion	Motion to <b>Approve</b>			
Vote	4-0			<b>Certificate # 53452</b>
31. Fiertz (Sunset Rlty LP)	64 Hulbert Avenue	Entry, porch & balcony	29-56	Lyman Perry
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Sanne Payne			
Concerns	(8:54) North elevation column capitol at roof of porch extends. Absence of cornice trim looks strange. <b>(Reduced set must be legible.)</b>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions			
Vote	5-0			<b>Certificate #</b>

**Proposed Minutes for February 17, 2009**

<b>IV.HDC BUSINESS</b>	
Review Minutes -	Feb. 10
Approve Minutes -	Feb. 3, adopted by unanimous consent
<b>60 Day Denials -</b>	<i>Greene, 37 Shell St. solar panels</i> <b>Motion to DENY 4-0</b>
Other Business -	Rosa Rugosa, 5 Cliff Road, clarification of board intent – board accepts clarification submitted by L. Botticelli for owner Presta, 53 Orange Street, statement clarifying intended repair work – D. Wiley’s letter seems to reflect views of commission. 13 Commercial Wharf, Marvin SDLs – Roggeveen informed owner’s agent that only those windows circled are approved as changed. Agent to talk to owner on how to proceed. Custom Built Windows – handout <b>FEB. 24 MEETING AT 37 WASHINGTON STREET CONFERENCE ROOM</b>
Commission Comments	D. Barham – South Street Unitarian Church Preservation Fund learned funds available if get in by Friday to repair/replace windows. Need to have HDC permission for work before Friday and HDC holds original preservation easement and needs letter stating HDC is aware. Roggeveen indicates that work needs to be permitted, but HDC willing to indicate work can go forward. Motion to Approve HDC sending letter in support. 5-0

Adjourned 9:15 p.m.

**Shaded – Historic Structures Advisory Board** SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory