



Proposed Minutes for February 24, 2009
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

37 Washington Street
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Linda Williams (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Valerie Norton, David Barham
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

Feb. 24, 2009 – NEW BUSINESS

Town Annex Building, 37 Washington Street, Conference Room – 5:00 pm

Called to order 5:00 p.m. Staff in attendance: J. Grieder & T. Norton

I. CONSENT

1. Egan Maritime Institute – 53454	4 Winter Street – HSAB	Sign	42.3.4-74	
2. N.I.R.W.E. Harbour House – 53455	19 North Water St – HSAB	Pool fence	42.4.2-3	BPC
3. G.H..Y.C. – 53456	96 Washington St – HSAB	Window changes	55.1.4-8	A. Cashion
4. 54 Centre Street LLC – 53457	54 Centre Street – HSAB	Window change/remove porch	42.4.3-30	D. Boyce
5. West, John – 53458	1 Cambridge Street – HSAB	Rev. COA 49365 – delete revis	42.3.1-130	B. Polchinski
6. Estate of M. Goode – 53459	6 Back Street – HSAB	Remove door, chimney, window	55-356	P. Goode
7. Harris, Parker – 53460	27 Baxter Road – SAB	New doors	49.2.3-10	B. Moore
8. Diamond, Richard – 53461	16 Macy’s Lane	Door & H/C ramp	68-40	P. O’Rourke
9. Beaudette, Richard – 53462	3 Anna Drive	Change front door	55-245.4	R. Beaudette
10. Riverlight LLC – 53463	55 Squam Road	New house renewal	13-18	E. McMorrow
11. Riverlight LLC – 53464	55 Squam Road	New garage renewal	13-18	E. McMorrow
12. Crane, James – 53465	5 Salt Marsh Road	Window rev / add chimney	55-297	Bott. & Pohl
13. Frazier, Dalton – 53466	51 West Chester Street	Window / door changes	41-288	Emeritus
14. Savel Nominee Trust – 53467	47 Pocomo Road	Window / door revisions	15-19	Bott. & Pohl
15. Clarke, Barbara - 53468	32 Pocomo Road	Window change	14-77	Emeritus

Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Barham, Coombs, Wagley

Alternates

Representing

Concerns

Motion Motion to **Approve**

Vote 4-0, McLaughlin abstain

Certificate # 53454 to 53468

Norton arrived 5:04 p.m.

II. SIGN POLICY HEARING Part 3

Flag Signs

Chalkboards & Menu boxes Chris Young – temporary signage that is up for only the weekend can not be regulated, because it comes down before staff can react. However, some use “temporary” type signage (hand-written, hanging on card tables, etc.) for the entire summer season and those need to be cited.

Roggeveen - need some language that allows some “table” sales i.e. girl scouts, lemonade stands etc.

Umbrella signs Mark Voigt – presented exampled from San Antonio River Overlay District sign ordinance – do not allow signage on umbrellas in order to keep total square footage for the business. Plain umbrellas draw attention to actual signage.

Rock signs

Motion Motion to continue hearing to Mar. 3 meeting to give commissioners time to review information

III. OLD BUSINESS

1. Irwin, Richard 115 Cliff Road Addition 41-7 Permits Plus

Sitting McLaughlin, Norton, Coombs, Wagley

Alternates

Representing

Concerns (5:20) Northwest elevation visible from Gosnold Rd and sunroom gable only 4 ½ /12 pitch.

Motion Motion to Hold for revisions to sun room gable roof

Vote 4-0

Certificate #

Proposed Minutes for February 24, 2009

IV. NEW BUSINESS

- | | | | | | |
|----|---------------------|---|-----------------------------|----------------------|---------------|
| 1. | Housing Nantucket | 3 Norquarta Drive | Window, deck revisions | 67-511 | A. Marcavitch |
| | Sitting | McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs | | | |
| | Alternates | Wagley | | | |
| | Representing | Aaron Marcavitch | | | |
| | Concerns | (5:27) | | | |
| | Motion | Motion to Approve | | | |
| | Vote | 5-0 | | Certificate # | 53469 |
| 2. | Presta, Barbara | 53 Orange Street – HSAB | Basement windows | 42.3.2-153 | D. Wiley |
| | Sitting | McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Wagley | | | |
| | Alternates | Coombs | | | |
| | Representing | Chris Skehel – Building has been approved for a full basement, this is for windows. | | | |
| | Concerns | (5:29) HSAB comments read. This is one of the oldest houses on Orange Street. Plans not properly clouded, need a basement floor plan, need to know which are egress windows, need wood railing treatment for stairs down and window schedule. Making this an inhabited basement with windows and access, it will look very much different from the original. Applicant needs to look at historic buildings with this kind of foundation and windows and how corners are handed. | | | |
| | Motion | Motion to View and for further information (not necessary for view pack) (with comment) | | | |
| | Vote | 5-0 | | Certificate # | |
| 3. | Nantucket Golf Club | 250 Milestone Road | AS-BUILT garage doors | 50-3 | T. Bresette |
| | Sitting | McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs | | | |
| | Alternates | Wagley | | | |
| | Representing | | | | |
| | Concerns | (5:37) | | | |
| | Motion | Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility | | | |
| | Vote | 4-0, Barham abstain | | Certificate # | 53470 |
| 4. | Fisher, Karen | 4 Moby Way | Addition | 65-60 | NAG |
| | Sitting | McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Wagley | | | |
| | Alternates | Coombs | | | |
| | Representing | Doug Mills | | | |
| | Concerns | (5:39) Divisions on windows in addition vastly different from those on the existing. Roof pitch only 4 ½ /12. | | | |
| | Motion | Motion to Hold for revisions to roof | | | |
| | Vote | 5-0 | | Certificate # | |
| 5. | Kelly/Irwin | 87 Hummock Pond Road | New dwelling | 56-310.1 | Bott. & Pohl |
| | Sitting | McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs | | | |
| | Alternates | Wagley | | | |
| | Representing | Alicia Ranney | | | |
| | Concerns | (5:43) Abutter comment read. New structure should have a site plan generated by surveyor showing size and location of dwelling properly | | | |
| | Motion | Motion to View with one ridge pole closest to Hummock Pond Road (with comment) | | | |
| | Vote | 5-0 | | Certificate # | |
| 6. | PKG Designbuild LLC | 53 West Chester Road | Window rev / outdoor shower | 41-614 | Bott. & Pohl |
| | Sitting | McLaughlin, Norton, Barham, Coombs, Wagley | | | |
| | Alternates | Roggeveen feels ill equipped to sit on this since he did not sit on the original | | | |
| | Representing | Alicia Ranney | | | |
| | Concerns | (5:47) Shower placed in a visible location close to the front of the property, would like to be aware of compelling reasons for location. Due to proximity to OHD would like to see TDL instead of SDL. | | | |
| | Motion | Motion to Hold for revisions and clarification on shower | | | |
| | Vote | 5-0 | | Certificate # | |

Proposed Minutes for February 24, 2009

7. Brenner, Michael	10 Columbus Avenue – MAB	Skylights	59.3-212	V. Oliver
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Val Oliver			
Concerns	(5:55) MAB comments read. Two skylights on the roof plane and creates see-through effect. Rear skylight larger than guidelines allow			
Motion	Motion to View			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
8. Hilton, John	15 Evelyn Street – SAB	Fence	73.3.1-68	G. Thorsen
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Wagley			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Chris Lewis			
Concerns	(5:58) SAB comments read.			
Motion	Motion to Approve			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53471	
9. Castle, Mary Ellen	4 Crestwood Circle	Move-on shed	76-78	M E. Castle
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Val Oliver			
	Mary Ellen Castle			
Concerns	(6:02)			
Motion	Motion to Approve			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53472	
10. Stone, William	2 Atlantic Avenue – HSAB	Increase window height	55.4.1-98	Emeritus
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns	(6:05) HSAB comments read. Schedule needs to be corrected to reflect TDL. These new windows seem a more appropriate size and make the front windows look to be even smaller floating in a large shingled façade.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
11. Smith, William	58 Hummock Pond Road	Renovation relocation	56-74	Emeritus
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Wagley			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Matt McEachern – two phase renovation to make building more energy efficient			
Concerns	(6:18) Would like to see ultimate			
Motion	Motion to Hold for Phase II plans			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
12. Getter, Michael	20 Broad Street – HSAB	Patio awning	42.4.2-33	M. Getter
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Michael Getter – would be up year round. Same as system used by Languedoc			
Concerns	(6:22) HSAB comments read. Plans do not show height or poles or pitch of awning. Do not see how it interacts with the building. Need elevation drawing of awning relative to building from one side and front.			
Motion	Motion to View with elevation drawing and literature on frame material (with comment)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
	Wagley depart 6:29 p.m.			

Proposed Minutes for February 24, 2009

13. Ray/Downing 1 Toombs Court Shed 68-9 Structures Ultd
 Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing Nancy Drazhal
 Concerns (6:30)
 Motion Motion to **Approve** with door as fiberglass, metal or wood
 Vote 4-1, Barham **Certificate # 53473**

14. Maxwell, John 29 Jefferson Avenue – HSAB New windows / door 30-125 BPC
 Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing Joe Paul
 Concerns (6:32) HSAB comments read.
 Motion Motion to **Approve**
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate # 53474**

15. Moore, Norman 54 Milestone Road AS-BUILT greenhouse 54-113.2 N. Moore
 Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates Norton recused
 Representing Norton abutter wants to ensure it is not in set back.
 Concerns (6:34)
 Motion Motion to **Approve** due to lack of visibility
 Vote 4-0 **Certificate # 53475**

16. Dreamland Foundation 17 South Water Street – HSAB Construction fence 42.3.1-11.1 B. Hunter
 Sitting McLaughlin, Norton, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates Roggeveen recused
 Representing
 Concerns (6:37) HSAB comments read. Originally came in with green scrim, which is more appropriate in rural area where it blends in. Concern that part of the fence is on town property and the makes the town liable.
 Motion Motion to Hold for representation.
 Vote 4-0 **Certificate #**

17. 4 MVR LLC 4 Middle Valley Road Perimeter Fence 43-128 K. Dale
 Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing Kevin Dale
 Stephen Stimson – 4-foot high welded wire mesh (galvanized or stainless) mounted to round cedar posts embedded in vegetation. Will apply for farm gate in the future.
 Concerns (6:44) Would like a cut sheet about the material. Black vinyl coated disappears better. Stainless is not appropriate.
 Motion **Motion to View with fence material information and photos of grading mitigation.** (with comment)
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate #**

18. 4 MVR LLC 4 Middle Valley Road Handrails 43-128 K. Dale
 Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing Kevin Dale
 Stephen Stimson
 Concerns (6:37)
 Motion **Motion to View** (with comment)
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate #**

Proposed Minutes for February 24, 2009

- | | | | | |
|---------------|--|----------------------|--------|---------|
| 19. 4 MVR LLC | 4 Middle Valley Road | Tennis pavilion | 43-128 | K. Dale |
| Sitting | McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs | | | |
| Alternates | | | | |
| Representing | Kevin Dale | | | |
| | Stephen Stimson – Painted cedar 2X3/6 columns, latticed roof, painted white, open four sides, laminated safety glass rail buried into wall material. | | | |
| Concerns | (6:37) Would like a ridge pole for this. | | | |
| Motion | Motion to View with 2 ridge poles with flags. (with comment) | | | |
| Vote | 5-0 | Certificate # | | |
| | | | | |
| 20. 4 MVR LLC | 4 Middle Valley Road | Tennis court | 43-128 | K. Dale |
| Sitting | McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs | | | |
| Alternates | | | | |
| Representing | Kevin Dale | | | |
| | Stephen Stimson - 3'6" fence on top of 6' retaining wall. Walls are 16" to 18" wide | | | |
| Concerns | (6:37) The wall reaches 10' high on some sides. Plan does not accurately depict width of walls | | | |
| Motion | Motion to View with height poles on all 4 corners with flags. (with comment) | | | |
| Vote | 5-0 | Certificate # | | |
| | | | | |
| 21. 4 MVR LLC | 4 Middle Valley Road | Stone walls | 43-128 | K. Dale |
| Sitting | McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs | | | |
| Alternates | | | | |
| Representing | Kevin Dale | | | |
| | Stephen Stimson –At court wall is 6' high and notches into hill with fence at top of wall. Stone wall attaches to house and garage. | | | |
| Concerns | (6:37) | | | |
| Motion | Motion to View (with comment) | | | |
| Vote | 5-0 | Certificate # | | |
| | | | | |
| 22. 4 MVR LLC | 4 Middle Valley Road | Concrete walls | 43-128 | K. Dale |
| Sitting | McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs | | | |
| Alternates | | | | |
| Representing | Kevin Dale | | | |
| | Stephen Stimson – Retain area several feet high around a plinth. High quality surface and pigment in the concrete to mitigate the heaviness of concrete. Since they move toward water, want them to have a pier-like quality. Will attach horizontal cedar around rose garden to facility climbing plants. Topped with 3" blue-stone caps with thermal finish. | | | |
| Concerns | (6:37) Almost all these walls, fences and paving are not visible. Barham against concrete walls facing harbor which could become visible. | | | |
| Motion | Motion to View with grade cross-section as viewed from water as submitted with previous approval. (with comment) | | | |
| Vote | 5-0 | Certificate # | | |
| | | | | |
| 23. 4 MVR LLC | 4 Middle Valley Road | Paving | 43-128 | K. Dale |
| Sitting | McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs | | | |
| Alternates | | | | |
| Representing | Kevin Dale | | | |
| | Stephen Stimson - Paving - Shell driveway has 3-foot wide grass track down center, three areas; apron at end of main-house driveway. Blue-stone terraces around house and pool. Crushed native stone walkways through rose garden and kitchen garden. Hard-tru granular clay. Blue-stone stepping-stone walkways | | | |
| Concerns | (6:37) Don't approve aprons onto dirt roads. | | | |
| Motion | Motion to View (with comment) | | | |
| Vote | 5-0 | Certificate # | | |

Proposed Minutes for February 24, 2009

24. Paris, Carolyn 12 Roberts Lane AS-BUILT revisions 56-25 L. Thornewill
 Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing
 Concerns (7:37)
 Motion Motion to **Approve**
 Vote 3-0, Barham & Coombs abstain **Certificate # 53476**

V.HDC BUSINESS	
Review Minutes -	Feb. 17 – II Sign Policy correct Wendy Hutton to read “Wendy Hudson”
Approve Minutes -	Feb. 10 – adopted by unanimous consent
60 Day Denials -	
Other Business -	Mooney Building HSAB concerns – Commission wants staff to follow up. Eel Point Road roofwalks - Staff to look into and report back. Include date question came in on violation sheet – board wants spread sheet <i>((not sanitized version))</i>
Commission Comments	Discussions of concern about how cobbled roads will be repaved after sewer work

Adjourned 7:45 p.m.

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board