



# HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

37 Washington Street  
 Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554  
 Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572  
[www.nantucket-ma.gov](http://www.nantucket-ma.gov)

**Commissioners:** Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Linda Williams (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Valerie Norton, David Barham  
**Associate Commissioners:** Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ AGENDA ~~

Mar. 10, 2009 – NEW BUSINESS

Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Convened 5:02pm. Staff in attendance: M. Voigt & J. Grieder

**I. CONSENT**

1. Root, Tracy - <b>53518</b>	20 Broad Street	Color changes trim & fence	42.4.2-33	M. Getter
2. Von Summer, Hollis – <b>53519</b>	24 Ahab Drive	Move/demo shed	82-107	C.W.A.
3. Von Summer, Hollis – <b>53520</b>	24 Ahab Drive	New shed	82-107	C.W.A.
4. Brook, David - <b>53521</b>	70 Goldfinch Drive	Screen in porch	68-684	B. Turnbull
5. Burnham, Alice - <b>53522</b>	12 Sherburne Turnpike	Change roof material	30-174.1	S. Valero
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve (Williams)			
Vote	4-0 (McLaughlin abstained)		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>53518 to 53522</b>

**II. SIGN POLICY HEARING**

**Part 5**

**Presentation of proposed changes**

Flag signs	Approvals would count toward sign square footage totals.			
Chalkboards / menu boxes	Chalkboards are preferable to whiteboards.			
Umbrella signs	Two versions of the revisions were proposed: one with umbrellas and one without.			
Rock signs	Rock signs cannot be approved off of the applicant's property. There should be limits to font size, type, etc., which is in fact addressed elsewhere in the guidelines.			
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Wendy Hudson			
Concerns	Previous meetings reviewed.			
Motion	Motion to Hold until the beginning of the next meeting (March 17 <sup>th</sup> ). (approved by unanimous consent).			
Vote	5-0		<b>Certificate #</b>	

Roggeveen departs 5:33pm.

**III. OLD BUSINESS**

1. Kumin, Sol	31 Sheep Pond Road – MAB	Addition	63-36	N. McMullen
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Jay Hanley			
Concerns	Previous concerns read.			
Motion	Motion to <b>Approve</b> through staff with dormers moved in three feet from the edge and the drawing properly clouded. (Williams)			
Vote	3-0 (5:42pm)		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>53523</b>
2. 34 Orange LLC	34 Orange Street – HSAB	Change exterior stair	42.3.2-217	BPC
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Mark Cutone			
Concerns	Previous concerns read. The vertical drop in the railing is more problematic than the curved newel posts.			
Motion	Motion to <b>Approve</b> through staff with elimination of drop in railing (43 Orange cited as an example). (Norton)			
Vote	3-0 (5:44pm)		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>53524</b>

3.	Nantucket Land Bank	86 Union Street	Renovation	55-404	B. Perry
	Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
	Alternates	Coombs			
	Representing				
	Concerns	Previous concerns read. The doors are called out as sliding doors but there is no track detailed on the plans. Would prefer to see the original door re-created; the track over the door would be hooded and would extent the length of the building. This building will be standing alone and will become an iconic building; every effort should be made to recreate the earlier incarnation of the building as shown in the photograph (i.e., one window on the SW elevation rather than two, 12-lite rather than 6-lite).			
	Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions that more closely approximate the original structure. (Norton)			
	Vote	5-0 (5:54pm)	<b>Certificate #</b>		
4.	Fisher, Karen	4 Moby Way	Addition	65-60	NAG
	Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley			
	Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
	Representing	Bill McGuire			
	Concerns	Previous concerns read. The v-roof is inappropriate but will not be visible.			
	Motion	Motion to <b>Approve</b> due to lack of visibility. (Norton)			
	Vote	5-0 (5:58pm)	<b>Certificate #</b>	53525	

## II. NEW BUSINESS

1.	NHA – Whaling Museum	13 Broad Street	Sign	42.4.2-61	NHA
	Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
	Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
	Representing	Mark Avery			
	Concerns	SAC concerns read. Photographs are non-traditional for the island, sepia tone might work. Muted colors or a working diagram might be more appropriate. Simple text would ultimately be preferred.			
	Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)			
	Vote	5-0	<b>Certificate #</b>		
2.	Cappadona, Nikki	20 Bartlett Road	Demo/move	67-594	D. Holcomb
	Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
	Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
	Representing	David Holcomb			
	Concerns	Historical documentation required – the application will not be reviewed until this is provided.			
	Motion	N/A			
	Vote	N/A	<b>Certificate #</b>		
3.	Cappadona, Nikki	20 Bartlett Road	New duplex	67-594	D. Holcomb
	Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
	Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
	Representing	David Holcomb			
	Concerns				
	Motion	Motion to View with a ridgepole. (Williams)			
	Vote	5-0 (6:22pm)	<b>Certificate #</b>		
4.	Cliffside Beach Inc.	46 Jefferson Avenue	Replace fence	30-44	J. Glidden
	Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
	Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
	Representing				
	Concerns	The picket fence is six feet tall as per agreements with abutters. Concerned that it is visible and might not be made of wood.			
	Motion	<b>Motion to View.</b> (with comment) (Williams)			
	Vote	5-0 (6:25pm)	<b>Certificate #</b>		

5. Forster, Nancy 1 Swain Street Expand deck 42.4.1-81 M. Rowland  
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley  
 Representing Mickey Rowland  
 Concerns No concerns.  
 Motion Motion to **Approve**. (Williams)  
 Vote 5-0 (6:23pm) **Certificate # 53526**
6. Gelb, Larry 10 Deacon's Way Rev: COA #53347 40-83 M. Rowland  
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley  
 Representing Mickey Rowland  
 Concerns There is a plasma TV indicated on the plans that would be clearly visible from Capaum Pond.  
 Motion Motion to **Approve** through staff as grey with corrected plans. (Williams)  
 Vote 5-0 (6:30pm) **Certificate # 53527**
7. Hutton, Inez 49 Polpis Road AS-BUILT (2 skylights) 54-21 T. Boyes  
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley  
 Representing Tom Boyes  
 Concerns Concerned about the number of skylights in total. The original approval specifically addressed the number of skylights.  
 Motion **Motion to View**. (with comment) (Williams)  
 Vote 5-0 (6:33pm) **Certificate #**
8. Layton Trust 77B Skyline Drive AS-BUILT shed addition to shed 79-109 M. Layton  
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley  
 Representing  
 Concerns  
 Motion Motion to Hold for representation, drawing and color photographs. (Williams)  
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate #**
9. Layton Trust 77 Skyline Drive Shed 79-109 M. Layton  
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley  
 Representing  
 Concerns No concerns.  
 Motion Motion to **Approve**. (Williams)  
 Vote 5-0 (6:37pm) **Certificate # 53528**
10. Landaverde, N. 11A Pine Tree Road Rev: COA #52661 68-224 E. McMorrow  
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley  
 Representing Ethan McMorrow  
 Concerns No concerns.  
 Motion Motion to **Approve**. (Williams)  
 Vote 5-0 (6:39pm) **Certificate # 53529**

**Williams departs 6:40pm.**

11. Foregger, Doug                      Tuckernuck – TAB                      Move on: Humane House                      94-24                      M. Rowland  
 Sitting                      Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs (Williams recused)  
 Alternates                      Wagley  
 Representing                      Doug Foregger, Mickey Rowland, Bam LaFarge (TAB)  
 Concerns                      TAB comments read. Adapted reuse allows for the addition of windows, so they don't need to be hidden. The proposed window treatment is odd and would result in a variegated shingle pattern if they are to be left open all summer. Shingled shutters would present a false story – either leave a blank wall or add windows. The chimney should be located at or closer to the ridge, which is traditional.  
 Motion                      Motion to **Approve** through staff with natural wood board shutters and window casings. (Barham)  
 Vote                      4-1 (Norton) (6:55pm)                      **Certificate #      53530**

**Williams returns 6:55pm.**

**Williams departs 6:56pm.**

12. Taber, Mason                      2 L Street – MAB                      Addition & increase height                      59.4-261                      L. Arnold  
 Sitting                      Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates                      Coombs, Wagley  
 Representing                      Lloyd Arnold  
 Concerns                      MAB concerns read. Application is incomplete and difficult to follow. No window schedule included.  
 Motion                      **Motion to View** (with comment). (Norton)  
 Vote                      5-0 (7:02pm)                      **Certificate #**

**Williams returns 7:02pm.**

13. Kumin, Sol                      31 Sheep Pond Road – MAB                      Paint deck trim                      63-36                      J.Hanley  
 Sitting                      Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates                      Coombs, Wagley  
 Representing  
 Concerns                      MAB comments read. Concerned about white trim in that location.  
 Motion                      Motion to **Approve**. (Williams)  
 Vote                      3-2 (McLaughlin, Barham) (7:04pm)                      **Certificate #      53531**

14. Arnold, Gale                      110 Wauwinet Road                      Re-site on lot                      11-29                      M. Rowland  
 Sitting                      Roggeveen, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs  
 Alternates                      Wagley  
 Representing                      Mickey Rowland  
 Concerns                      HSAB comments read.  
 Motion                      Motion to **Approve** through staff with a benchmark. (Williams)  
 Vote                      4-0 (7:07pm)                      **Certificate #      53532**

**Recess 7:08 to 7:12 p.m.**

**Wagley departs at 7:08pm**

15. Remick, Devin                      27 Allens Lane                      Solar tubes & panels                      67-267  
 Sitting                      Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates                      Coombs  
 Representing  
 Concerns                      No concerns.  
 Motion                      Motion to **Approve**. (Williams)  
 Vote                      5-0 (7:14pm)                      **Certificate #      53533**

**Williams departs 7:13 p.m.**

16. NHA Properties                      66 Pochick Avenue                      Window replacement                      79-177                      A. Marcavitch  
 Sitting                      Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs (Williams recused)  
 Alternates  
 Representing  
 Concerns                      Not in favor of replacing 6/6 with 1/1.  
 Motion                      Motion to **Approve** through staff with 6/6 windows. (Barham)  
 Vote                      5-0 (7:17pm)                      **Certificate #      53534**

**Williams returns 7:18 p.m.**

17. Tritman, Donna 65 Wanoma Way Rev: COA #53045 92-19 V. Oliver  
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates Coombs  
 Representing Val Oliver  
 Concerns North elevation: wall is bumping out four feet. The porch is the lesser of two evils, but the revisions overall make the house look worse. There is no cohesive message from the board because the house is problematic in-and-of-itself.  
 Motion Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams) (7:27pm)  
 Vote 5-0 Certificate #

18. Whittemore, Edwin 36 King Street – SAB Window wells & railing 73.4.2-116 C. Skehel  
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates Coombs  
 Representing Chris Skehel  
 Concerns SAB comments read.  
 Motion Motion to **Approve** through staff with a proper site plan. (Williams)  
 Vote 5-0 (7:28pm) Certificate # 53535

**Williams departs 7:30 p.m.**

19. Keane, John 4 East Chestnut Street – HSAB Remove window & change stair 42.3.1-10.1 Emeritus  
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs  
 Alternates  
 Representing Matt McEachern, John Keane  
 Concerns HSAB comments read.  
 Motion Motion to **Approve**. (Norton)  
 Vote 5-0 (7:31pm) Certificate # 53536

**Williams returns 7:34 p.m.**

20. Dillon, Lucy 37 Liberty Street – HSAB Hardscaping 42.3.4-118 Self  
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates Coombs  
 Representing Lucy Dillon  
 Concerns HSAB comments read. The bollards are a concern, as are the antique granite steps – they should all match – and the lighting fixtures look too modern (if they were lower they might be less of an issue). The bollards are broken faced and don't look appropriate at that location. Concrete-filled metal tubes disguised as a fence is a possible option to protect the fence and house. The stone choice for the wall is too gauged and should look more like Nantucket fieldstone.  
 Motion Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)  
 Vote 5-0 (7:48pm) Certificate #

21. Ruley, Robert 12 Tom's Way AS-BUILT shed 67-47 Self  
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates Coombs  
 Representing Bob Ruley  
 Concerns No concerns.  
 Motion Motion to **Approve**. (Williams)  
 Vote 5-0 (7:49pm) Certificate # 53537

22. NHA/Greater Light 8 Howard Street – HSAB Rev: COA #52443 42.3.3-11 C. Webster  
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates Coombs  
 Representing Steve Blashfield,  
 Mark Avery (The applicant intends to move forward with a scaled-back version of the plan that will not disturb the roof framing and will involve less of the foundation being replaced.)  
 Concerns HSAB comments read. The necessity of proposed changes to the foundation needs to be documented (photos, etc.), or the intent to demo the wall to accommodate proposed programming needs to be clarified. The applicant has not provided enough information to proceed with permitting.  
 Motion **Motion to View with more information on the state of the existing foundation and a demo plan for the floor system** (with comment). (Williams)  
 Vote 5-0 (8:06pm) Certificate #

