



Proposed Minutes for March 24, 2009
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

37 Washington Street
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Linda Williams (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Valerie Norton, David Barham
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

March 24, 2009 – NEW BUSINESS
Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order at 5:00 p.m. Staff in attendance: M. Voigt & T. Norton

I. CONSENT	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. N.I.R. – 53552	18B Federal Street	Wall sign – The Golden Basket	42.3.1-72	
2. N.I.R. – 53553	18B Federal Street	Projecting – The Golden Basket	42.3.1-72	
3. T.O.N. – 53554	3 East Chestnut Street	Wall sign – Human Resources	42.4.2-29	R. Sylvia
4. Rodrigues/Thomas – 53555	4 Sparks Avenue	Wall sign – Four Sparks Ave Salon	55-191	M. Rodrigues
5. Mid Island Realty Trust - 53556	2 Sanford Road	Wall sign – The Camera Shop	55-806	R. McMorrow
6. Schonbeck, Andrew – 53557	1 Little Neck Way – MAB	Add screen porch, enlarge deck	38-19.1	M. Rowland
7. Coleman, William – 53558	10 Tashama Lane	Add deck	55-478	B. Meerbergen
8. Coonley, Kiril & Judith – 53559	75 Cliff Road	Fence	30-162	Self
9. Divenere, Anne – 53560	21 Mill Street – HSAB	Replace fences	55.4.4-73	A. Divenere
10. 54 Centre Street LLC - 53561	54 Centre Street – HSAB	Extend fence	42.4.3-30	D. Boyce

Sitting McLaughlin, Barham Coombs, Wagley

Alternates Roggeveen & Williams recused

Representing

Concerns

Motion Motion to Approve

Vote 3-0, McLaughlin Abstain

Certificate # 53552 to 53561

Norton arrived 5:05 p.m.

II. SIGN POLICY HEARING Part 6

1. Flag signs

Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham

Alternates Coombs, Wagley

Concerns Would like specifications of what the flags should be like. “custom designed” or similar verbiage included into guidelines.

Motion Revisions need to be included in view packs to be voted on March 31.

2. Chalkboards / menu boxes

Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham

Alternates Coombs, Wagley

Concerns

Motion Revisions need to be included in view packs to be voted on March 31.

3. Umbrella signs

Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham

Alternates Coombs, Wagley

Concerns Do not want to allow umbrella signs.

Motion Revisions need to be included in view packs to be voted on March 31.

4. Rock signs

Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham

Alternates Coombs, Wagley

Concerns

Motion Revisions need to be included in view packs to be voted on March 31.

Proposed Minutes for March 24, 2009

III. NEW BUSINESS		ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1.	Jelleme, Jan	1 Pilgrim Road	Move on-site: shop	41-220	J. Jelleme
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing	Jan Jelleme				
Concerns	(5:08)				
Motion	Motion to Approve				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53562	
2.	Cahill, Kathleen	17 Williams Street – HSAB	New dwelling	55-658	SMRD
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing	Steve Roethke –Proposing Marvin SDL but can revisit. Kimberly has developed as an alley along the backside of residences. Pleasant street’s historic nature “downsizes” as it progresses closer to Mid-Island.				
Concerns	(5:09) HSAB comments read. Marvin does not meet HDC standards of single-pane TDL in OHD. Window wells need to be addressed on elevations. Williams – Stoop showing at Southeast elevation Williams St. side door does not show up on site plan. Northwest elevation window set into porch. Norton – Dual frontage Southeast elevation door should be window. Window dimensions 2/1 seem odd on traditional-style house. Egress window wells on the corners. Barham – Would like to see cottage and house in tandem. Site seems to be over-built. Southwest elevation door pent-roof looks too rural. Northwest elevation plate-glass window under porch. Southeast elevation massing heavy. Roggeveen - A gate in hedging could properly tie house to Pleasant St. Disagrees with Barham ref. rural nature. Windows should be 2/2. Doesn’t appear as an old house and does not have additive massing.				
Motion	Motion to View with two poles (with comment)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #		
3.	Cahill, Kathleen	17 Williams Street – HSAB	New cottage	55-658	SMRD
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing	Steve Roethke – due to set back could not pull cottage away to give main house more prominence, thus sits in line. Used massing and size to present as subordinate.				
Concerns	(5:22) To be studied in conjunction with main dwelling. Windows need to be single-pane TDL to match house. Northeast elevation does not show basement access and window wells. McLaughlin – Exceeds 22-foot second dwelling height restriction. Shed roof instead of gable over door. Williams – Should be shed to match door. Not concerned about cottage exceeding secondary dwelling height restriction. Barham – Concerned about height. Northwest elevation is very visible and looks very much like the rear of a building. Southeast elevation has a better corner presence. Norton – Agrees with Barham. Concerned about height, should be 22 feet. Concerned about existence of second dwelling with such a large house. Second should be more of a studio with lower eave height. Don’t want to see egress window wells from the corners. Roggeveen – Not drawn correctly. Agree with Barham ref street appearance – rear minus stairs presents to street better than proposed front. Should be more subordinate with lower eave lines.				
Motion	Motion to View with one 22-foot pole and revisions which provide a side-by-side of both houses (with comment)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #		
4.	Cahill, Kathleen	17 Williams Street – HSAB	New shed	55-658	SMRD
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing	Steve Roethke				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to View (with comment)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #		

Proposed Minutes for March 24, 2009

5. Golding, Alison 5 Cedar Circle Solar panels 55-507 R. Andersen
 Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley
 Representing Rob Andersen
 Concerns (5:38)
 Motion Motion to **Approve**
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate # 53563**

6. Wong, Bernice 68 Orange Street – HSAB Door, window Δ, delete chimney 55.4.1-136 E. McMorrow
 Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley
 Representing
 Concerns (5:39) HSAB comments read.
 Motion **Motion to View with corrected application per HSAB** (without comment)
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate #**

7. Keller, Dennis 3 Nosegay Lane – SAB Rev: COA 51902 new shingle 73.1.4-14 Rbt. Meyers
 Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley
 Representing Rob Meyers South Mountain Co. – Enviroshake resembles weathered cedar. To support solar need to lengthen dormer 33 feet and change pitch from 4/12 to 5/12; same system as on New School 5.6 KW of capacity prod 6700 KW a year = 2/3 est. usage. Don't make anything smaller for residential that 3X5 feet.
 Fletcher Haigh Blade Runner Const.
 Connie Keller – Hired consultant from Martha's Vineyard to make house energy efficient.
 Dennis Keller
 Concerns (5:42) SAB comments read. New roof shingle material, dormer massing change and photovoltaic collectors on South elevation dormer and garage door roof, and change windows to triple pane.
 Roggeveen – Meeting rails not aligned because pitch changed by lowering eave not raising top. Too new to have a sense of how Enviro-shake ages so need manufacturer UV reaction info. What are the various sizes of the photovoltaic panels. Solar panels must esthetically fit in because they become an architectural feature.
 McLaughlin – New roofing material in/that close to 'Sconset OHD
 Barham – What are details of Enviroshake when it reaches the edge of the roof.
 Motion **Motion to View with proper plot plan and manufacturer UV reaction info, various sizes of the photovoltaic panels information, manufacture spec sheets on windows and prior approval** (with comment)
 Staff to verify whether or not in SOHD.
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate #**

8. Muller, Cliff 140 Polpis Road Add roofwalk , porch 44-9 V. Oliver
 Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley
 Representing Val Oliver
 Concerns (6:05)
 Motion **Motion to View** (without comment)
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate #**

9. Williams, Theresa 61 Polpis Road Boathouse 43-15 V. Oliver
 Sitting McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham
 Alternates Coombs
 Representing Val Oliver
 Theresa Williams & David Marks
 Concerns (6:07) Norton – Large structure with full second-floor that could be used as a dwelling on a lot with two dwellings.
 Barham – Windows on mid section of garage door and hipped roof above does not work.
 Motion Motion to **Approve**
 Vote 3-2, Norton & Barham **Certificate # 53564**

Proposed Minutes for March 24, 2009

10. Barada, Theresa	14 Tashama Lane	Addition	55-408	L. Thornewill
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Luke Thornewill – North elevation bay window to create symmetry & shed addition Theresa Barada			
Concerns	(6:12) Barham – Prefer to see another configuration of double-hung on the north. North elevation side door with windows upstages the actual front door on the same elevation. Norton agrees Williams & McLaughlin – No concerns. Roggeveen - Thinks it supports a double bay.			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with the addition pulled off front 2 feet and back aligned			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53565	
11. Thompson, Fargo	66 South Shore Road	Rev. COA 46572 window & door	80-44	M. Rowland
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Ben Normand			
Concerns	(6:19) Barham - French doors ought to be 4-lights			
Motion	Motion to Approve			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53566	
12. Verney, Liz	25 Capaum Pond Road	Window, door changes	40-10	M. Rowland
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Ben Normand			
Concerns	(6:21) East elevation facing pond. Barham – half-round. Roggeveen - Half-round should relate to door/windows. Norton – very random looking combo of half-round, transom & doors.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions to East elevation			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
13. Damsker, Ben	9 Swain Street	New dwelling	42.4.1-78	M. Rowland
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Ben Normand			
Concerns	(6:27) Barham - Only door facing street is garage & large gable mass sticks very far forward of main mass, concern if integrated into street scape. Norton – agrees			
Motion	Motion to View with one pole and stake at each end and with letter of concern. (with comments)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
14. Turner, Louise	6 Martins Lane – HSAB	Material Δ: foundation (brick)	42.3.2-173	L. Turner
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Luke Thornewill			
Concerns	(6:32) HSAB comments read.			
Motion	Motion to Approve			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53567	
15. 8 Pilgrim LLC (Kern)	73A West Chester Street	Rev: COA 53198 (Δ garage)	41-359	B. Meerbergen
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Brook Meerbergen			
Concerns	(6:33) Norton – Skylights oversized and are visible. Roggeveen - Visibility of skylights.			
Motion	Motion to Approve one skylight per “BWNIM” pg. 111 and with cutaway drawing			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53568	

Proposed Minutes for March 24, 2009

16. Bolton, Lynn	4 Shell Street – SAB	Window change	73.1.2-32	J. Cox
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Jason Cox			
Concerns	(6:38) Application does not indicate side of change. No way to tell if relates to rest of house and windows around			
Motion	Motion to View ; applicant must submit for next meeting exterior elevation of change and photos of all four sides.			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
17. Alexander, Candace	80 Washington Street #2 - HSAB	Balcony	42.2.3-20	BPC
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Mark Cutone			
Concerns	(6:44) HSAB comments read.			
Motion	Motion to View (without comment)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
18. Stavnes, Harald	258 Polpis Road	Outdoor shower (cottage)	25-25.1	BPC
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Mark Cutone			
Concerns	(6:47)			
Motion	Motion to Approve			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53569	
19. Stavnes, Harald	258 Polpis Road	Addition to shed	25-25.1	BPC
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Mark Cutone			
Concerns	(6:48)			
Motion	Motion to Approve			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53570	
20. Stavnes, Harald	258 Polpis Road	Fence	25-25.1	BPC
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Mark Cutone – to hide utilities.			
Concerns	(6:49) Norton – 6-foot 6 is too high.			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff at 6 feet max			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53571	
21. Fowler (Jones)	2 Underhill Lane – SAB	Hardscaping	73.3.2-35	Jardins Int'l.
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Mirka Barkova			
Concerns	(6:53) SAB comments read. Williams – Wire fence will be visible in the winter.			
Motion	Motion to View (without comment)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
22. Fowler (Jones)	2 Underhill Lane – SAB	Shed	73.3.2-35	Jardins Int'l.
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to View with fence (without comment)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

Proposed Minutes for March 24, 2009

23. Allen's Lane LLC	20 Allen's Lane	Rev. COA 51375 (raise ridge)	67-20	Emeritus
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	(6:57) Roggeveen - throws building lines off and makes it look too tall.			
Motion	Motion to Approve			
Vote	4-0, Roggeveen abstain	Certificate #	53572	

24. Trianon Seaman	47 Main Street – HSAB	Sidewalk, door threshold Δ	42.3.1-206	S. Cohen
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Steven Cohen – 47 & 45 are tied together; cut granite, lower door sill making longer door. Arno might be willing to get in on the work and thus spread out.			
Concerns	(6:59) Roggeveen – Could make sidewalk look like it also worn and make it undulate into sill. Applicant has had a one year waiver to come into compliance and did not do it. Now they are in a hurry before opening for season. Barham - Leave the threshold as is and run bricks up to it. Norton – Granite should line up as it does now instead of lowering the sill. Want to see the interior floors. Granite flows all the way around the building. Staff – Commission should view all of Main Street to assess where issues will be coming up in the future. McLaughlin – drop sill Williams – drop sill			
Motion	Motion to View (with comment)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

25. Nantucket Pharmacy	45 Main Street – HSAB	Sidewalk, door threshold Δ	42.3.1-4	S. Steven Cohen
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Steven Cohen			
Concerns	(6:59)			
Motion	Motion to View (with comment)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

26. Trianon Seaman	47 Main Street – HSAB	Obliterate Congdon's lettering	42.3.1-206	S. Cohen
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Steven Cohen – On suggestion is to bondo-fill, and paint the lettering. Alternative is to maintain lettering and veneer with plain wood or new sign.			
Concerns	(7:19) Roggeveen - Pacific Bank became part of Bank Boston, people began removing their accounts. Bank of America was wise enough to embrace history. Ralph Lauren wanted to put pony over compass rose but decided to restore. Everyone knows where the "Congdon" building is. Commission not in favor. Norton - The history is in the name and building.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for agent to talk to applicants			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

Wagley departed 7:25 p.m.
Break 7:25 to 7:35 p.m.

27. Watts, Katherine	29 New Sconset Street – SAB	Shed	73.4.2-78	Structures Unltd.
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Nancy Drahzal			
Concerns	(7:35)			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with a wood door			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53573	

Proposed Minutes for March 24, 2009

28. Sablehaus, Melanie	3 Heather Lane	Rev: COA 51335 (Δ columns)	30-24.1	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Alisha Ranney			
Concerns	(7:36) Should be wood columns with wood capitols and wood bases. Williams – Would never have approve columns on the garage in such a rural area. Barham – Should be made with historically correct emphasis on the columns.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for approved garage column			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
29. Savel Nominee Trust	47 Pocomo Road	Rev: COA 52756 Patio & stairs	15-19	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Alisha Ranney			
Concerns	(7:38)			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with an appropriate fence if required.			
Vote	5-0	Certificate # 53574		
30. Rare Half Gas R.T.	82 Easton Street – HSAB	Rev: COA 51489 door style/color	42.4.2-5	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Alisha Ranney			
Concerns	(7:40) HSAB comments read.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
31. Rosa Rugosa Realty T.	5 Cliff Road	Rev. COA 53414 Δ windows	42.4.4-60	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Alisha Ranney			
Concerns	(7:41) HSAB comments read.			
Motion	Motion to View with submitted historic photos (without comment)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
32. O'Neill, John	16 Paul Jones Road	Rev: COA 53293 (addition)	41-97.1	Structures Unltd.
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Nancy Drazhal			
Concerns	(7:44) Williams – Dormer should be set back three feet, though it is not visible. Roggeveen - E elevation shows coming to ridge but side shows dropped down, drawings need to be corrected. McLaughlin – believes it is visible. Barham – agrees with McLaughlin.			
Motion	Motion to View (with comment)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
33. Nantucket Land Bank	17 North Liberty Street – HSAB	Paving	42.3.4-1	B. Perry
Sitting	McLaughlin, Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Bruce Perry – Grass-crete protects from drivers doing doughnuts in parking lot.			
Concerns	(7:49)HSAB comments read. Williams – prefers Grass-crete with gravel. Norton – This is a very large space of grass-crete, would prefer something else. Barham – Agrees with Norton. Benches have a very post-WWII look Roggeveen – Have approved Grass-crete outside the OHC; at hospital looks awful and at Ice rink looks too modern. This is the Lily pond and should be a more historically-looking appropriate material.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions to parking material			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

Proposed Minutes for March 24, 2009

IV. HDC BUSINESS	
Review Minutes -	March 17
Approve Minutes -	March 10 – adopted by unanimous consent
60 Day Denials -	<i>N/A</i>
Other Business -	<p>Violation Track Sheet – handout. Updates, additions, and changes.</p> <p>7 Eagle Lane has a new violation, a white vinyl/plastic arbor.</p> <p>4 Pleasant – needs a letter of violation.</p> <p>Check address of “Bright-blue clapboard”</p> <p>Muskeget – Briggs house up-date Roggeveen - Nantucket Land Council has worked out plan to transfer town part of Muskeget to Land Bank and place conservation easement to prevent future building but allow the fishing cottage can be maintained.</p>
Commission Comments	<p>8 Lily Street – grass-crete parking</p> <p>20 Federal Street – Coombs: Copper kick plates on risers. Staff - Building does not have a sign off yet.</p> <p>Roggeveen - Never regulated kick plates before.</p> <p>21 Long Pond – plastic fence</p>

Adjourned 8:15 p.m.

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board

PROPOSED