



Proposed Minutes for March 31, 2009
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

37 Washington Street
 Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
 Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Linda Williams (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Valerie Norton, David Barham
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

March 31, 2009 – OLD BUSINESS
 Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order at 5:03 p.m. Staff in attendance: M. Voigt & J. Grieder

I. CONSENT	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. J. Arno Inc. – 53575	21 South Water St – HSAB	Replace etched glass with plain	42.4.2-102	Emeritus
2. Krivit, Harriet – 53576	3 ½ Franklin Street – HSAB	Fence	41-261	T. Taaffe
3. Commonwealth of Mass – 53577	42 Fairgrounds Road	Replace windows	67-295	J. Boyd
4. Rogerson, Louise – 53578	53 Cato Lane	Addition	56-46	D. Holcomb
5. Mitchell, Carter – 53579	2 Teasdale Circle	Door change	69-77	Emeritus
6. Davis, Charles – 53580	3A Field Avenue	Patio & walkway	80-407	Self
7. American Legion Post 82 – 53581	21 Washington Street – HSAB	Replace egress stairs	42.3.1-40	E.McMorrow
8. Casscells, Ward - 53582	3 North Gully Road – SAB	Window & chimney change	73.1.3-7	E.McMorrow

Sitting Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs

Alternates

Representing

Concerns

Motion Motion to Approve. (Coombs)

Vote 3-0 (McLaughlin abstained)

Certificate # 53575 to 53582

Norton arrived at 5:05 p.m.

Williams arrived at 5:06 p.m.

II. SIGN POLICY HEARING Part 7

1. Flag signs

2. Chalkboards / menu boxes

3. Umbrella signs

4. Rock signs

Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham

Alternates Coombs

Representing

Concerns

The revisions as presented are unclear regarding what is being added and deleted. Strike “watertight” and “glass/plexiglass”? Should have heading that comments in red are proposed additions to the current guidelines.

Motion Motion to continue meeting, final revisions to be adopted at next meeting after being posted for public review. (Barham)

Vote 5-0

Certificate #

Proposed Minutes for March 31, 2009

III. SIGNS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. ACK Airport Sitting Alternates Representing Concerns Motion Vote	14 Airport Road Roggeveen, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs Al Petersen, Paul McCarthy, Jean Petty SAC comments read. Roggeveen: Why does the sign depart from standard municipal signage? The entrance sign should be bigger (8-10 feet wide, the same height above the ground). Williams: Should have white lettering; seal should not be on the sign; agrees on a larger sign. McLaughlin: Application should be held until the commissioners view the property. Barham: Sign should have white lettering, rather than gold; the posts are oversized for the sign; the sign should be larger as the airport can be confusing to newcomers. Coombs: 8-10 foot sign would be problematic; lettering should be white. Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)	New sign (A): entrance	78.4-1	A. Petersen
		Certificate #		
2. ACK Airport Sitting Alternates Representing Concerns Motion Vote	14 Airport Road Roggeveen, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs Al Petersen, Paul McCarthy, Jean Petty Would prefer to see without red arrows. Motion to Approve on simple cedar posts, natural to weather. (Williams)	New sign (B): exit/rental/parking	78.4-1	A. Petersen
		Certificate #	53583	
3. ACK Airport Sitting Alternates Representing Concerns Motion Vote	14 Airport Road Roggeveen, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs Al Petersen, Paul McCarthy, Jean Petty SAC comments read. Town seal over "arrivals" should be deleted. Concerned that future airline signs will be designed to reflect the current signs. Motion to Approve. (Williams)	New sign (C): arrival/departure	78.4-1	A. Petersen
		Certificate #	53584	
4. ACK Airport Sitting Alternates Representing Concerns Motion Vote	14 Airport Road Roggeveen, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs Al Petersen, Paul McCarthy, Jean Petty SAC comments read. Motion to Approve without "ACK" logo, simple cedar posts, natural to weather.	New sign (D): directionals	78.4-1	A. Petersen
		Certificate #	53585	
5. ACK Airport Sitting Alternates Representing Concerns Motion Vote	14 Airport Road Roggeveen, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs Al Petersen, Paul McCarthy, Jean Petty SAC comments read. The original configuration, with the seal and a quarterboard, is preferable to either the seal alone or the redesigned seal and banners. Motion to Approve with "Nantucket Memorial Airport" quarterboard below, as submitted on A401. (5:45 p.m.)	New sign (E): Town seal	78.4-1	A. Petersen
		Certificate #	53586	

Proposed Minutes for March 31, 2009

6. Dreamland Foundation	South Water Street – HSAB	Master Sign Plan	42.3.1-11.1	VDH
Sitting	Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs (Roggeveen abstained)			
Alternates				
Representing				
Concerns	SAC comments read. Agree with SAC comments.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation and clarification of which signs are required by law. (Barham) (5:50 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

7. NHA	15 Broad Street – HSAB	New sign: banner	42.4.2-61	M. Avery
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	M. Avery			
Concerns	Previous concerns read. SAC comments read. The revised design is acceptable.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams) (5:52 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate # 53587		

III. OLD BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
--------------------------	----------------	----------------------	----------------	--------------

1. Town of Nantucket	2 Fairgrounds Road	Public Safety Building	67-40	K. Witzell
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	K. Witzell, Charlie Gibson			
Concerns	<p>Previous concerns read.</p> <p>Williams: no comment.</p> <p>Norton: concerns have been addressed; gutter system should be addressed.</p> <p>Barham: sorry to see the chimneys go, as they broke up the ridgeline; proportion of belvedere feels too narrow and tall – it should be wider; half-round moulding on entrance is inappropriate; a detail of the entrance should be provided; sidelights feel too wide in relation to the windows above; see redesign as proposed by Barham.</p> <p>Roggeveen: change in cupola from windows to louvers; it went from being a traditional cupola to something that is merely functional; the door is drawn incorrectly.</p> <p>Coombs: window pane sizes have changed and become chaotic; need information about tint of concrete material.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams) (6:18 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

2. Town of Nantucket	2 Fairgrounds Road	Maintenance Building	67-40	K. Witzell
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	K. Witzell, Charlie Gibson			
Concerns	<p>Previous concerns read. Needs specifications on solar panels.</p> <p>Barham: would prefer the PV array on the ground if possible; side view of the canopy over the door is heavily drawn; metal doors and windows look too commercial and are problematic; wood louvers are preferred</p> <p>Williams: looks like a utility building, pent roof is drawn incorrectly, no problem overall</p> <p>Norton: radius corners on garage door windows are inappropriate; would like to see a site plan in relation to the neighborhood</p> <p>Coombs: agree with Norton, and Barham re solar panels</p> <p>Roggeveen: the roof is completely appropriate for this application of the panels, is not very visible, and should be encouraged</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams) (6:31 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

Proposed Minutes for March 31, 2009

3. Wong, Bernice	68 Orange Street – HSAB	Door, window, delete chimney	55.4.1-136	E. McMorrow
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Ethan McMorrow			
Concerns	The historic documentation provided by the applicant shows two chimneys, and there are none currently extant; one of the chimneys was approved for removal, the other was not, and is the subject of the current application. Williams: no comment Norton: the building needs the chimney on the ridgeline, and it important to the period of the building; documentation showing that the ridgeline chimney is later needs to be provided. Roggeveen: not concerned about the removal of the chimney, but does not feel strongly either way Barham: the chimney, while only visible from certain angles, makes this “mongrelized”			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (2-2 Barham, Norton) Motion fails to carry. Motion to Approve the door and window changes. (Norton) (6:43 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53588	

4. Keller, Dennis	3 Nosegay Lane – SAB	Rev COA: 51902	73.1.4-14	R. Meyers
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Rob Meyers, Fletcher Haig			
Concerns	Previous concerns not read. Roggeveen: “failed products” are more likely to be quickly replaced as Nantucket is an affluent location; the shingle end gives away that it is a plastic product; the problem with this is that it could deteriorate visually but still function as a roof; doesn’t mind visible solar panels so long as they work architecturally with the building – the two proposed designs do not; there is too much jammed into a small space; it may be the case that the design available from this manufacturer simply will not comply with what the board wants. Barham: we can’t wait 20 years to find out if they will weather appropriately; concerned about the precedent in a visible location near SOHD; propose a mockup of part of the roof for review (building to be completed by mid-June); three dormers as approved are preferable to the proposed shed dormer with solar panels installed on them; the building will be visible from the Bluff Walk as well as the road; would prefer to see an installation of the panels on the ground Norton: concerned about roof material in visible location next to an historic house; solar panels will be highly visible and the design of the entire structure is problematic; not in favor of any visible solar panels, even if on the ground. McLaughlin: look like fiberglass and should not be allowed near an OHD; asserts that SOHD extends 200 feet beyond current lines; solar panels this close to SOHD are inappropriate. Williams: even though it’s outside the SOHD the age of the houses in the neighborhood is a concern; may be far enough away to not be visible; black solar panel on gray roof accentuate the panels and are problematic in this situation; placing them on the dormers is problematic, would prefer them on lower roof plane The commission does not want to see the dormer massing changed; SDL double-hung casements, when open would look to fake.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

Break 7:20 to 7:30 p.m.

5. Bolton, Lynn	4 Shell Street – SAB	Window change	73.1.2-32	J. Cox
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	J. Cox			
Concerns	Windows have been replaced over time – no concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53589	

Williams depart 7:33 p.m.

6. Alexander, Candace	80 Washington Street – HSAB	Balcony	42.2.3-20	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Doug Mills (sliders are called for instead of French doors due to space concerns			
Concerns	Norton: Anderson sliders were installed and are inappropriate (may not have been approved); hesitant to approve more Anderson sliders Barham: the balcony is too wide, and the brackets should be redesigned			
Motion	Motion to Hold for clarification regarding previous approvals. (Norton) (7:37 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

Proposed Minutes for March 31, 2009

7. Fowler (Jones)	2 Underhill Lane – SAB	Shed	73.3.2-35	Jardins Int'l.
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Mirka Barkova			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton) (7:38 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53590	

Williams return 7:39 p.m.

8. Fowler (Jones)	2 Underhill Lane – SAB	Hardscaping	73.3.2-35	Jardins Int'l.
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Mirka Barkova			
Concerns	Norton: are 4x4 posts with a wire fence embedded in a hedge seems unusual; would prefer metal stakes Williams: would prefer to see the fence ending with the house, as the guidelines call for; concerned with the amount of wire Barham: concerned about visibility from the road and that the fence will overwhelm the architecture in the front. Roggeveen: wire fence is not appropriate to the front of the house in this neighborhood			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams) (7:46 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

9. Trianon Seaman	47 Main Street – HSAB	Sidewalk, threshold change	42.3.1-206	S. Cohen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Steven Cohen: has been told that AAB willing to work with applicant, i.e., (B) the threshold can simply be removed the non-foundational piece of the granite, cut the bottom side and replace it, leaving the worn threshold top intact; the door would be adjusted to reflect the changed elevation; (A) alternatively, a higher pitch on the elevations could be installed. John Stover: the stone can be lowered without cutting by removing part of the rubble foundation.			
Concerns	No access to the building provided; the sill height in relation to the floor is the concern. Barham: "horsefeathers" (feathered strips) could be used to address the difference in elevation from one side of the stoop to the other; would prefer to go with the slightly higher pitch and horsefeathers on the inside leaving the threshold untouched McLaughlin: simply turn the stone ¼-turn and make it flat Norton: raising the entire sidewalk for both stores would be preferable; nothing would need to be changed.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through Staff lowering the stone in principle with threshold inspection by staff at the appropriate stage. (Williams) (8:12 p.m.)			
Vote	3-2, Norton & Barham	Certificate #	53591	

10. Nantucket Pharmacy	45 Main Street – HSAB	Sidewalk, threshold change	42.3.1-4	S. Cohen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Steven Cohen, John Stover			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams) (8:13 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53592	

Proposed Minutes for March 31, 2009

11. Rosa Rugosa RT	5 Cliff Road – HSAB	Rev COA 53414 (windows)	42.4.4-60	Bott & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli: want to go back to plank frame windows, removing c.1920 windows; moving chimney back to original location			
Concerns	Previous concerns read. McLaughlin: no comment, looks better than it does now Barham: dormer is completely inappropriate; divided on the windows, since the existing ones are fairly old, with old glass and are dovetailed. Roggeveen: the frame isn't the concern, it's the jamb and the sash that are the problem Chimney: not on application – Norton to review with new information Dormers: not appropriate Windows: plank-framed Boston Sash, similar to 105 Main Street may work – Barham to review			
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information. (Williams) (8:27 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
12. O'Neill, John	16 Paul Jones Road	Rev COA 53293 (addition)	41-97.1	Structures Unltd.
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Nancy Drazal			
Concerns	Norton, McLaughlin: dormer should be set back 3 feet from the gable Barham: going to be very visible, the building would not fit in the neighborhood; garage across the street with lower eave lines would be preferable			
Motion	Motion to Approve with dormer set back 3 feet, window on east and head casing lowered to match the dormer; West elevation porch to end at door. (Williams) (8:33 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		53593
13. Layton, Margaret	77B Skyline Drive	AS-BUILT shed addition	41-97.1	Structures Unltd.
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing				
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		53594
14. Newman, John	14 Friendship Lane	New dwelling	66-270	J. Newman
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing				
Concerns	Previous concerns read.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for clarifications on what was revised (no clouding on the elevations). (Williams) (8:38 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
McLaughlin departs 8:38 p.m.				
15. Taber, Mason	2 L Street – MAB	Addition, deck	59.4-261	L. Arnold
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs (Williams recused)			
Alternates				
Representing	Lloyd Arnold			
Concerns	Previous concerns addressed.			
Motion	Motion to Approve (McLaughlin) (8:41 p.m.)			
Vote	4-0, Barham abstained	Certificate #		53595
McLaughlin returns 8:41 p.m.				

Proposed Minutes for March 31, 2009

16. Irwin, Richard	115 Cliff Road	Addition	41-07	Permits Plus
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing				
Concerns	Multi-color clouding is unclear.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for clarification (without comment) (8:43 p.m.)			
Vote	3-0	Certificate #		
17. Verney, Liz & Geoff	25 Capaum Pond Road	Window change	40-16	M. Rowland
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Ben Normand			
Concerns	Previous concerns addressed.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams) (8:45 p.m.)			
Vote	4-1 (Barham)	Certificate #	53596	
18. Rare Half Gas RT	82 Easton Street – HSAB	Change garage doors	42.4.2-5	Bott & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli			
Concerns	Previous concerns read			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams) (8:45 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53597	
19. Tritman, Steve	65 Wanoma Way	Revisions	92-19	V. Oliver
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Val Oliver			
Concerns	Previous concerns read. Barham: porch on left of North elevation should be brought to the roof next to it.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the posts rearranged to move them in front of windows. (Norton) (8:50 p.m.)			
Vote	4-1, Barham	Certificate #	53598	
20. Muller, Cliff	140 Polpis Road	Add roofwalk & porch	44-9	V. Oliver
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Val Oliver			
Concerns	Barham: interior plans don't clarify the exterior elevations Williams: porch drawn wrong, roofwalk is a concern Norton: trying to place a gable dormer on long slope roof is a concern; West elevation is a the main problem Roggeveen: a full second story would be preferable			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams) (8:55 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
21. Land Bank	17 N. Liberty Street – HSAB	Parking & sidewalk	42.3.4-1	
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Bruce Perry			
Concerns	Pea-stone gravel should be used.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams) (8:56 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53599	

Proposed Minutes for March 31, 2009

22. Land Bank	15 N. Liberty Street – HSAB	Window/door changes	43.3.4-2	B. Perry
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Bruce Perry			
Concerns	Previous concerns read.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with appropriately drawn and detailed door surround/sidelights (similar to Exhibit A) and window/door schedule and an appropriately drawn back door (four feet sq); and porch recentered. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53600	(9:05 p.m.)
23. Land Bank	15 N. Liberty Street – HSAB	Fence	42.3.4-1	B. Perry
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Bruce Perry			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve with fence five feet back from road. (Norton) (9:08 p.m.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53601	
24. Gustin, Victoria	42 Quidnet Road	AS-BUILT showers	21-26.1	V. Gustin
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Victoria Gustin			
Concerns	Previous concerns read. Needs a landscaping plan showing how it would be screened, showing how it is integrated into the yard.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with landscaping plan. (Williams) (9:20 p.m.)			
Vote	4-1, Norton	Certificate #	53602	
McLaughlin departs 9:22 p.m.				
25. Sabelhaus, Melanie	3 Heather Lane	Column changes	30-24.1	Bott & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli			
Concerns	Previous concerns read.			
Motion	Motion to Approve with the column, base and capital are made of wood. (Williams) (9:24 p.m.)			
Vote	3-0	Certificate #	53603	
26. Stone, William	2 Atlantic Avenue – HSAB	Window changes	55.4-98	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns	Previous concerns read. Concerns have been addressed.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with head casings reduced to 1x4. (9:28 p.m.)			
Vote	3-0	Certificate #	53604	
27. Stone, William	2 Atlantic Avenue – HSAB	Hardscaping	55.4-98	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns				
Motion	<i>Held over until next meeting.</i>			
Vote		Certificate #		
28. Cappadona, Nikki	20 Bartlett Road	New dwelling	67-594	D. Holcomb
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	David Holcomb			
Concerns	Previous concerns read.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

Proposed Minutes for March 31, 2009

29. Cappadona, Nikki	20 Bartlett Road	Move/demo	67-594	D. Holcomb
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	David Holcomb			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Hold for new dwelling. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0			Certificate #

IV. HDC BUSINESS	
Review Minutes -	March 24
Approve Minutes -	March 17
60 Day Denials -	
Other Business -	Wentworth, 14 Lincoln Avenue – concern about the amount of original material begin removed; Mark Cutone of BPC informed the board that it had simply been covered up. Bricks – handout
Commission Comments	Fence on Easton Street, across from White Elephant

Adjourned 9:45 p.m.

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board