



Proposed Minutes for April 21, 2009
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
37 Washington Street
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Linda Williams (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Valerie Norton, David Barham
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

April 21, 2009 – OLD BUSINESS

Emergency change of venue from Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria

Convened at 5:10 at 37 Washington Street p.m. in HDC office second floor

Staff in attendance J. Grieder & T. Norton

L Williams elected Chairman Pro Tem unanimous

I. CONSENT	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	MAP-PARCEL	AGENT
1. NIR (POSH) – 53649	4 S. Water St – HSAB	New sign: projecting sign	42.3.1-176	J. Hicks
2. Payne, Harry – 53650	159 Main St – HSAB	New fence	41-288	Self
3. McBournie/Richards – 53651	2 Coon Street – HSAB	Hardscaping	55.1.4-96	Self
4. Greenberg, Judith – 53652	35 Centre St – HSAB	Renewal of expired COA #32051	42.3.1-03	B. Young
5. Dorton, Patrick - 53653	29 King Street – SAB	New fence	73.4.2-101	J. Stetina
6. Seacrest LLC (Rogers) – 53654	79 Squam Road	Renewal of expiring COA #48181	13-07	Permits Plus
7. Muhler, L. & T. – 53655	9 Swift Rock Road	Reroof: material change	40-69	B. Williams
8. Damsker, Benjamin – 53656	9 Swain Street	Move off: shed	42.2.1-78	Rowland Assoc.
9. Damsker, Joseph – 53657	7 Swain Street	Move on: shed	42.2.1-79	Rowland Assoc.
10. Williams, Clifford – 53658	4 Manchester Circle	Add railing to back porch	56-463	Self
11. Hayford, Susan – 53659	41 Madaket Road	Add handrails to front steps	41-413	Self
12. Kostadinova, Virginia - 53660	9 Waydale Rd, Apt. A	New fence and gate	67-31	Self
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates	Hill Holdgate			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve			
Vote	Unanimous			
		Certificate #	53649 to 53660	

II. SIGN POLICY HEARING (Part 8)

Held over for April 28

1. Flag signs
2. Chalkboards/menu boxes
3. Umbrella signs
4. Rock signs

Tape recording at 5:15 p.m.

III. OLD BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	MAP-PARCEL	AGENT
1. TON (ACK Airport)	14 Airport Road	Entrance sign	78-4.1	P. McCarthy
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Kevin Kuester for SAC			
Concerns	(5:14)			
Motion	Motion to Approve (Barham)			
Vote	2-1, Coombs			
		Certificate #	53661	

Proposed Minutes for April 21, 2009

2.	Cahill, Kathleen	17 Williams St - HSAB	New dwelling	55-658	SMRD
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Barham Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Steve Roethke – Specifically had roof sloping toward Pleasant Street to bring the eave height down. It is not the first 2-story house in the area. Can control muntin specs with the Marvin Signature series.				
Concerns	(5:17) HASB comments read. Barham – Size and mass in an area predominantly 1 to 1 ½ story, an awful lot of house on a site in addition to what else is being built. Also too close to road. Southeast elevation does not have strong shadow lines. Street elevation two pent roofs over doors of house & cottage, main house should have more formality than cottage. Picture unit on Northwest elevation. Marvin’s have a shallow muntin profile that does not look traditional. Norton – Use of Marvin windows as well as 2/1 on a traditional 4 bay design. Coombs – Agrees with Barham on massing and main house front door. 2/1 does not go with design of the house. Wagley – Agrees. Windows should be 6/6, especially in this location. Williams – Poles were placed in area where there was a rise in elevation at least two feet. 2/1 are a rural element. To recap, fenestration is not an issue, there is grade versus height issue, flush dormers. Not stepped back enough. Front door needs to be more formal.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions (Norton)				
Vote	5-0				Certificate #
3.	Cahill, Kathleen	17 Williams St - HSAB	New cottage	55-658	SMRD
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Barham Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Steve Roethke – redesign with change in dimensions. Curb cuts are in place per Planning Board.				
Concerns	(5:36) Norton – Secondary dwelling should be removed from main structure. Southeast elevation numerous egress windows visible from Pleasant. The building is over 22 feet with a full basement, flush dormers. Northeast elevation has tow matching flush dormers that make the building look like a box – too plain. Corner of Orange and Back is an example of bad alignment. Coombs – Two buildings aligned in a straight line. Wagley – Agree. Barham – Agrees and does not believe two units of these sizes will fit on this lot; problematic having cottage and main equally set back – looses separate buildings on same lot with a-dominant-dwelling feel. A kind of incoherence in the way the windows and dormers fall.				
Motion	Motion to Hold (Barham)				
Vote	5-0				Certificate #
4.	Cahill, Kathleen	17 Williams St – HSAB	New shed	55-658	SMRD
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Barham Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Steve Roethke				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to Hold for main house and cottage				
Vote	5-0				Certificate #
5:50 p.m. Break to move into conference room first floor.					
5.	Butler, Claudia	2 Field Avenue	Storage tent 8X12	80-174	C. Butler
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Hill Holdgate				
Alternates					
Representing					
Concerns	(5:52) Coombs – you can hardly see them and they fit into landscape with soft colors. Barham – The yard is in such a state of disarray with stuff scattered and left for a number of years and so concerned about approving something that would be such an annoyance to neighbors. Hill Holdgate – Not architecturally appropriate and a time limit should be placed on it. Williams – This is a vast improvement over what was there.				
Motion	Motion to Approve for two years from April 21, 2009 and to reapply at that time (Coombs)				
Vote	3-1, Barham				Certificate # 53662
6.	Butler, Claudia	2 Field Avenue	Storage tent 12X20	80-174	C. Butler
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Hill Holdgate				
Alternates					
Representing					
Concerns	Same as above				
Motion	Motion to Approve for two years from April 21, 2009 and to reapply at that time (Coombs)				
Vote	3-1, Barham				Certificate # 53663

Proposed Minutes for April 21, 2009

7. Savel Nominee Trust 47 Pocomo Road Tennis Court 15-19 Botticelli & Pohl
 Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs, Hill Holdgate
 Alternates
 Representing Lisa Botticelli – Sunk court down to grade of lowest end and moved fence so there is no fill used, will screen corner with pine trees. Pole height is now two feet lower than originally proposed. Stone wall 4 feet and poles 6 feet.
 Concerns (5:58) Coombs – questions answered. Hill Holdgate – Post material is wood with black vinyl clad wire, would like court fence corners to be squared off at least on road side. Barham - the court should be set a further two feet below grade; a four-foot fence would be hidden behind the berm. Left room for only one layer of screening and it takes staggered plants for effective screening. Williams – There was a lack of fore thought in the site planning that created this problem of the court too close to the road.
 Motion Motion to Hold for revision (Barham)
 Vote 4-0 **Certificate #**

8. Savel Nominee Trust 47 Pocomo Road Retaining wall 15-19 Botticelli & Pohl
 Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs, Hill Holdgate
 Alternates
 Representing Lisa Botticelli
 Concerns
 Motion Motion to Hold for court (Barham)
 Vote 4-0 **Certificate #**

9. Dimock, Don 54 Bartlett Road Window Change 66-100 D. Dimock
 Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs, Hill Holdgate
 Alternates
 Representing Don Dimock
 Concerns (6:11) Barham – Double-ganged dormer windows pushed to the top and become the largest windows where one expects a very small window. The windows are really big.
 Motion Motion to **Approve** (Hill Holdgate)
 Vote 3-1, Barham **Certificate # 53664**

10. Paddock House Trust 18 India Street Condenser Unit on roof 42.3.1-59 NAG
 Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates Hill Holdgate and Norton – recused
 Representing Charity Benz for Frost at 20 India St – the noise of condenser less than 10 feet from Frost’s barn. Completely visible. Noise cone will be right under attic window of Frost’s barn. It is a contrivance that seems to be an act of desperation.
 Concerns (6:14) Barham – Very visible from Rose lane, applicant’s photo minimizes visibility. Sets an appalling precedence in the OHD and should be rejected. Coombs – agrees. Applicant shows pictures of commercial buildings and this is not a commercial building. Williams – This is very visible from Rose Lane. Asked for possible relocation where it could be encased with sound deafening and received no answer.
 Motion Motion to Hold for revisions to location of condenser (Barham)
 Vote 3-0 **Certificate #**

Wagley depart 6:23 p.m.

11. Brodie, Peter 70 Sankaty Road New garage 49-81 V. Oliver
 Sitting Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs, Hill Holdgate
 Alternates
 Representing Val Oliver – willing to do wood door.
 Concerns (6:21) SAB comments read. Barham – location in front yard is inappropriate. This stretches the term “little ancillary building.” Norton – No door and window schedule and all doors should be wood, garage should be set back behind façade of house. This is large for a shed.
 Motion Motion to Hold for revisions to location and door/window schedule (Norton)
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate #**

Proposed Minutes for April 21, 2009

12. Brooks, Shelley	11A Maryanne Drive	New duplex	68-983	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Alternates				
Representing	Val Oliver			
Concerns	Shelly Brooks – don't want two little houses which forces lots of paving, want green space. (6:27) Williams - Can only stack four spaces so parking must change. Should be less wide across the front with the second unit stepping down like additive massing in the rear. Cross gable in back is massive and causes most of the problems. Barham – Much too much building on the site, both units are very large compared to buildings in neighborhood. Need a fully-developed site plan which can also be reviewed. Wants to see the window wells now, not later. Coombs – Agree. Hill Holdgate – Also concerned with size of massing. Like the concept of a 3-bay on the front. Unit 2 needs to be more subordinate.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions (Barham)			
Vote	4-0		Certificate #	
13. Phillips, Julie	34 Sylvia Lane	Deck/outdoor shower/door	42.4.4-11	P. Shuttleworth
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Alternates				
Representing	P. Shuttleworth			
Concerns	(6:42)			
Motion	Motion to Approve (Barham)			
Vote	4-0		Certificate #	53665
14. 51 Baxter Road LLC	51B Baxter Road	New foundation/window/door	49-16	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Held at applicants request for next Old Business			
Vote			Certificate #	
15. 51 Baxter Road LLC	51A Baxter Road	New cottage	49-16	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Held at applicants request for next Old Business			
Vote			Certificate #	
16. Irwin, Richard	115 Cliff Road	Addition	41-07	Permits Plus
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Mark Poor			
Concerns	(6:43)			
Motion	Held for a quorum at beginning of April 28 meeting			
Vote			Certificate #	
17. Fowler/Jones	2 Underhill Lane	Hardscaping	73.3.2-35	Jardin Int'l.
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Mirka Barkova			
Concerns	(6:45) Norton – Concerns addressed. Barham – Height 56 inches and being white. Would like the picket fence set back to align with the façade of the house. Williams – Section along neighbor's property is visible.			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with Type II fence continued on north side to front plane of the house			
Vote	4-0		Certificate #	53666

Proposed Minutes for April 21, 2009

18. Pierce, Jonathan 29 Clarendon Road New garage 76.4.2-387 SMRD
 Sitting Williams, Norton, Coombs, Hill Holdgate
 Alternates
 Representing Steve Roethke
 Concerns (6:51)
 Motion Motion to **Approve** (Hill Holdgate)
 Vote 4-0 **Certificate # 53667**

19. Merson, John 71 Baxter Road Move/renovation/addition 49-26.1 J. Merson
 Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing John Merson – removed partial 2nd story on main mass. Created “basement”. Bottom windows slanted “skylights” for basement and are treated, not see-through.
 Concerns (6:53) Williams – prefers true hipped-roof design for 2nd-floor element. Barham – Lifting up with row at street level works well and maintains horizontal lines. West elevation 2 right windows right of chimney free-floating don’t align with those above, seem out of place and need to be aligned. Front door at ground level looks like split-level, should be lifted to the level of the proper first floor. New row of bottom windows should be flush to main mass and not slanting out. Should keep the hipped roof on 2nd floor. Water side below-ground level windows need to align with those above. East elevation “saloon” look not good.
 Motion Motion to Hold for revisions (Barham)
 Vote 3-0 **Certificate #**

20. Merson, John 71 Baxter Road Move off demo garage 49-26.1 J. Merson
 Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing John Merson
 Concerns
 Motion Motion to Hold for house (Barham)
 Vote 3-0 **Certificate #**

21. Dreamland Foundation 5 Water Street Master sign plan 42.3.1-11.1 Wm Hunter
 Sitting Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing Bill Hunter – Would like to keep “local businesses open . . .”
 Steven Cohen – Champion would like to have two “Local business” tied to gate in street or heavy equipment in street.
 Concerns (7:12) SAC comments read. Two “Think Green” signs going away, “Respect this community” going away, “local businesses” up for a specific time period. Norton – application needs a sign-size schedule.
 Motion Motion to Hold for sign applications (Barham)
 Vote 4-0 **Certificate #**

22. Presta, Barbara 53 Orange Street Basement windows 42.3.2-153 D. Wiley
 Sitting Williams, Norton, Barham
 Alternates Coombs, Hill Holdgate
 Representing
 Concerns
 Motion Held for quorum to April 28
 Vote **Certificate #**

23. Alexander, Candice 80 Washington St Ext Balcony 42.2.3-20 BPC
 Sitting Norton, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing Doug Mills – currently only unit that doesn’t have a balcony
 Concerns (7:24) Barham – Been a proliferation of little balconies along the water front that speak to conversion from a working to recreational water front with a holiday feel. It is important to preserve something of the severity of the old water front. Balcony does not improve appearance of neighborhood and water front. Norton – They are all around the water side and this is the least visible.
 Motion Motion to **Approve** (Coombs)
 Vote 2-1 Barham **Certificate # 53668**

Proposed Minutes for April 21, 2009

24. Cappadona, Nikki 20 Bartlett Road New dwelling 67-594 D. Holcomb
 Sitting Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing David Holcomb
 Concerns (7:32) Williams – 7 pitch on the main mass is too flat with too much wall plane ratio to roof.
 Motion Motion to **Approve** Through Staff with front mass at 8/12 with rectangular gable vents. (Norton)
 Vote 4-0 **Certificate # 53669**

25. Cappadona, Nikki 20 Bartlett Road Demo move 67-594 D. Holcomb
 Sitting Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing David Holcomb
 Concerns
 Motion Motion to **Approve** (Barham)
 Vote 4-0 **Certificate # 53670**

26. Compitello, Jeanne 25 Bank Street Balcony 73.1.3-51 V. Oliver
 Sitting Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing Val Oliver
 Concerns (7:37) Barham – this is a sweet, petite building, and the balcony ends up looking ridiculously large; should be a Juliet balcony.
 Motion Motion to Hold for revisions (Barham)
 Vote 4-0 **Certificate #**

27. Muller, Cliff 140 Polpis Road Roofwalk and addition 44-9 V. Oliver
 Sitting Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing Val Oliver
 Ray St. Peters
 Concerns (7:42) Williams – Appears the original house is going away. Plans need dimensions to include pitch. Barham – is large, shouldn't be a 2-story. Existing works well in the setting. The character is changing to something more suburban with a front façade inappropriate to a rural neighborhood. Slightly projecting gables don't work, nor does the large front gable. 2nd-story deck should go away. No skirt on roofwalk.
 Motion Motion to Hold for revisions (Norton)
 Vote 4-0 **Certificate #**

28. Mariner House 30 Centre Street Material change sidewall 42.3.1-162 V. Oliver
 Sitting Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs, Hill Holdgate
 Alternates
 Representing Val Oliver
 Concerns (7:52) Williams – one of the only buildings in town that was clapboarded all the way around. There is something wrong with the wood that the paint is peeling so quickly, moisture coming at it from behind the paint. No other building in town peels like that. The clapboarding needs to be fixed; and shingling might not fix the issue. Coombs, Barham – going to shingle destroys the character of the building.
 Motion Motion to Hold (Barham)
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate #**

Proposed Minutes for April 21, 2009

29. Rosa Rugosa R. T.	5 Cliff Road	Window changes	42.4.4-60	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli – just the windows along the front replaced with Boston Sash.			
Concerns	(8:01) Norton & Barham – the balances. Barham – replacement of century old glass. This house is getting the treatment which piece by piece there is not a lot of the historic fabric left. Would have liked to see a product cut of window to know what it looks like. Williams – we need to move this along and the lead windows need to come out. Coombs – would like to see a window survey of what can be saved.			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with hidden balances, plank frame, light restoration glass on four windows of house front			
Vote	4-0		Certificate #	53671
30. Crane, James	5 Salt Marsh Road	Window change	55-297	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Held at applicant’s request to next Old Business			
Vote			Certificate #	
31. Glowacki, Walter	24 Evergreen Way	Move on shed	68-711	Nikki
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Alternates				
Representing				
Concerns	(8:14)			
Motion	Motion to Approve (Hill Holdgate)			
Vote	4-0		Certificate #	53672
32. Stone, William	2 Atlantic Avenue	Hardscaping	55.4-98	Emeritus
Sitting	Williams, Norton, Barham, Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Alternates				
Representing				
Concerns	Applicant request to be held over for a second time. Last action was an extension granted on Feb. 12. No action within requisite time.			
Motion	Motion to DENY due to lack of response (Barham)			
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53673

Hill Holdgate departed 8:18 p.m.

IV.HDC BUSINESS	
Review Minutes -	April 14
Approve Minutes -	March 31 – adopted unanimously
60 Day Denials -	<i>Glowacki, 2 Waydale Road, New dwelling - Motion to DENY due to lack of response, unanimous 53674</i> <i>Varian, 54 Union Street, H/C ramp - Motion to DENY due to lack of response, unanimous 53676</i> <i>Westmoor LLC, 10 Westmoor Farm Rd, AS-BUILT retaining wall - Motion to DENY due to lack of response, unanimous 53677</i>
Other Business -	
Commission Comments	

Adjourned at 8:20 p.m.

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board