



Proposed Minutes for May 5, 2009
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

37 Washington Street
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Valerie Norton (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Linda Williams, David Barham
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

May 5, 2009 – OLD BUSINESS

Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order at 5:05 p.m. Staff in attendance J. Grieder & T. Norton

I. CONSENT	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	MAP-PARCEL	AGENT
1. Minucci, A. (Island Comp.) – 53715	17 Centre Street – HSAB	New sign: projecting sign	42.3.1-203.4	
2. Norton, Elliott (Rotary Rest.) – 53716	1 Sparks Avenue	New sign: wall sign	55-180.1	J. Stetina
3. Fuller, Al – 53717	5 Marsh Hawk Lane	Roof material change	56-11	R. Campese
4. Killen, David – 53718	81 Hinsdale Road	Rev: COA (door change)	69-21	NAG
5. Rapp, Todd & Amanda – 53719	23 Orange Street – HSAB	Patio	42.3.2-9	E. McMorrow
6. Moran, Paul - 53720	333 Madaket Road – MAB	Rev: COA #53313 (wind/doors)	60.2.4-64.3	NAG
7. Doutechev, Anton – 53721	9B Waydale Road	Sliding door	67-31	Self
8. Doutechev, Anton – 53722	9B Waydale Road	Fence	67-31	Self
9. Lemberg, Marie – 53723	53 Pochick Avenue	Roof material change	79-127	Self
10. Nantucket Land Bank – 53724	81 Milestone Road	Move on: paddle racket court	69-1	L. Thornewill
11. Detmer, Chris – 53725	3 Quaise Pasture Road	Replace windows	26-20.5	SMRD
12. Nancy Swain Trustee - 53726	14 W. Sankaty Ave – SAB	Reroof: material change	73.4.2-124	Self

Sitting Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham, Coombs

Alternates

Representing

Concerns

Motion Motion to **Approve** (Williams)

Vote 4-0, McLaughlin abstain

Certificate # 53715 to 53726

II OTHER BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	MAP-PARCEL	AGENT
1. NIR (graficas et al)	18 Broad Street – HSAB	New sign: projecting sign	42.4.2-32	L. Thornewill

Sitting Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham
Alternates Coombs
Representing Kevin Kuester for SAC – Sign would be located in a very prominent spot with two logos on the same sign. Near “Dune” which was approved without serif.
Concerns (5:09) SAC comments read. Barham – stays within boundaries. Coombs – No comments
Motion Motion to **Approve** (Williams)
Vote 5-0

Certificate # 53727

2. Robinson, Phyllis	22 Hussey Street – HSAB	Brickwork on foundation	42.3.4-97	L. Thornewill
Sitting Alternates Representing	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Brick work Discussion	<p>L. Thornewill – brickwork instructions were included on the construction site plans. S. Anderson – were instructed by staff to use smaller paver bricks. Willing to adjust the above-ground bricks to match intent. “He (Voigt) said we didn’t have to use a lime mortar.” Can use a restoration mortar colored to look like lime.</p> <p>Approval caveat for COA 53241 read (only items pertinent to issue). Grieder – everyone was working in good faith and work drifted further a field than intended. Barham – want to reset and get going in right direction. Commission wants a ¼ inch mortar, which was being done in 19th century, so it is doable. Would like to see a large enough test panel that can be signed off on and is on site as a guide. Lime mortar looks softer and plumper than Portland Cement mortar. Roggeveen – are the bricks being used ok or should they go back to original bricks? Barham – would like to see reuse of original bricks as much as possible. Have enough photographs to know what was originally there. Williams – would like to see antique-width grout.</p> <p>Contractor is to do another mock-up with mortar joint at ¼-inch thick (that looks like photographs of what was originally there). Board created a committee made up of David Barham, Linda Williams and Mark Voigt to go on site and inspect mock up and progress</p>			
Height concern	Barham – eyeballing still looks like the building is higher than original. Would like it reshot to ensure it has not gone up.			

3. Town of Nantucket Police Dept.	2 Fairgrounds Street	Public Safety Building		
Sitting Alternates Representing	Roggeveen, Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Concerns	<p>Charles Gibson</p> <p>Kaestle-Booz rep – changed window frames on main entrance façade to match. Presented options on how to get water off car-port roof without cutting holes in it.</p> <p>(5:34) Barham - main entrance façade details. All columns must be wood. Fascia should be smooth with no lines across it. Roggeveen – fix the details.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with Barham speaking for the commission to work with staff on details of gutters & entablature, roof trim gutter returns and parking area gutters.			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53728	

III. OLD BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	MAP-PARCEL	AGENT
-------------------	---------	---------------	------------	-------

4. Akins, Scott	207 Madaket Road – MAB	Shed	59-49	Self
Sitting Alternates Representing	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Concerns	<p>Scott Akins</p> <p>(5:12) MAB comments read. McLaughlin – would like to see it further back on lot. Barham – ditto to preserve tree screen. Coombs – ditto.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with shed sited more Northwesterly in order to preserve two outside trees (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53729	

5. Reinig, James	15 Milk Street – HSAB	Addition, lift, renovate	42.3.3-88	L. Thornewill
Sitting Alternates Representing	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Concerns	<p>Luke Thornewill – moving windows in West elevation dormer off the floor. Don’t think the chimney being removed is historic.</p> <p>(5:47) HSAB comments read. Barham - agrees with HSAB. Triple French doors visible from Milk St. Windows going against the ridge. Very visible cross gable. Additions have begun to overwhelm the original main mass. However, can read the history of the additive masses. Coombs – ditto. Williams – West elevation windows on wall are now flush with dormer. Removal of existing chimney. Should leave old windows with their odd patterns as is. Flush dormers that go up to the ridge. McLaughlin – dormers going to the peak.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

Proposed Minutes for May 5, 2009

6.	MPB Nominee Trust	13 C Street – MAB	Replace dock & walkway	60.2.1-76	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates					
Representing	Lisa Botticelli Sara Alger Surveyor – tide at 4.6 feet medium				
Concerns	(5:57) Roggeveen - ConCom is good with the proposed plan. Barham – enlarged platform at top seems “fussy”; would like to see another option than the vertical pickets. Would rather see horizontal boards. Chamfered post caps.				
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with chamfered post caps and horizontal boards. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53730	
7.	TON (Parks & Rec)	81 Milestone Road	Concession stand	69-1	NAG
Sitting	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates					
Representing	Steve Theroux – all the metal roofs tend toward grey. Stucco was introduced 1890 to 1940 and came to Nantucket in early 1900s: 1916 at 48 W Chester St. 4 Fair in 1915, as well Maria Mitchell. 7 Fair St went to stucco in 1904, so there is a historic precedence for stucco. Charles Bartlett – prefer stucco due to ease of maintenance. Cement is a good medium for art work but have a power washer. People seem to like to break up shingle.				
Concerns	(6:04) Roggeveen – when they built distillery, they wanted stucco, but HDC suggested block. There is an historic precedence for a painted block house. Coombs – N. Liberty St. needed to be re-sided with stucco and it was very expensive to repair, more so than cement block. Roggeveen - just leave concrete block exposed. Would like block painted, trimmed with lattice to soften look with dark green roof. Williams – agrees. Coombs – ditto. McLaughlin – the green will stand out, would like grey roof with stucco. Barham – without trees, there will be a good deal of visibility. Thinks a green roof in dead of winter looks odd.				
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with concrete block painted Quaker grey and forest green trim, doors and roof. (Williams)				
Vote	3-2, McLaughlin & Barham		Certificate #	53731	
8.	Humphrey, Lia	124 Surfside Road	Shed	80-298.1	Permits Plus
Sitting	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates					
Representing	Mark Poor				
Concerns	(6:20) Williams – “absolutely not.” Completely visible, open car port, visible. Barham – roof ridge runs contrary to that of the main dwelling, and eave height needs to be much lower. Flair at top of columns would be more appropriate than flair at bottom. Trellis should not cover posts but be placed behind and more of it. McLaughlin – 3 open bays facing the road. Coombs – agree with Barham. Roggeveen - agrees with Barham.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions (Barham)				
Vote	4-1, Williams		Certificate #		
9.	3 Martins Lane LLC	3 Martins Lane – HSAB	New parking, apron & curbcut	42.3.2-133	S. Cohen
Sitting	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates					
Representing	Steven Cohen – submitted photos of other streets with curb cuts. Client would be willing to take on burden of replacing cement with brick in order to get drive way.				
Concerns	(6:26) HSAB comments read. Williams – curb cut and drive not appropriate. Barham – agrees, street should remain to maintain uniqueness. Roggeveen – one of the most picturesque streets in town, look will be diminished by allowing curb cuts. Coombs – agrees. McLaughlin – agrees.				
Motion	Motion to DENY due to architectural and historic inappropriateness (Williams)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53733	

10. Ericksen, Michael	26 Orange Street – HSAB	Renovate & addition	42.3.2-135	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli – client hoping to respect and retain character of house in process of modernizing. In my mind this plan is to that end. Willing to put balustrade back. Client thinks the roof once was grey and would prefer that, but willing to keep red. Want as many shingles natural to weather, shingles presently painted white on all sides. At one point did not have shutters, so based on that want to remove them. Changing front door from Victorian to solid. Addition we are planning to remove shows up on 1940s aerials. Major visibility is from Washington St town annex building park. Addition of 3 rd floor dormer is to utilize attic.			
Concerns	(6:33) HSAB comments read. McLaughlin – changes are appropriate and would show 3 rd evolution. OK with a grey roof. Barham – opposed to removing painted shingles, not enthused about Victorian door but it should stay, pleased about return of railing over addition, old photos show similar difficulty with shutters and house looks better. South elevation new double-hung window should be pulled off corner. East elevation the excessive French doors and dormers detracts from the original roof line; gable roof should be hipped. The red has become closely related to the identity of the house. Coombs – agrees with Barham. Would not mind some shingles natural to weather but front should remain white. Would like roof to remain red. Williams – South elevation agree about window. East elevation, agree about look. Ok with little gable. French doors, would be ok with single door in place of single window. 3 rd floor dormer are not uncommon and there are many up on the Cliff. Would like to see roof remain red. Roggeveen – dormer as designed overwhelms the roof, and room could be smaller, two shed dormers without a connector. Agree with Barham on East elevation; would like to see white maintained all around.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
11. Jeffers/Shove	4 Swift Rock Road	New dwelling	40-33	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns	(6:55) Barham – OK. Like that it is set in swale. McLaughlin – OK. Coombs – OK. Williams – OK no white.			
Motion	Motion to Approve (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate # 53733		
Break 6:59 to 7:09 p.m. (time from here on is based on recording not clock.)				
12. Madison, John	17 Ipswich Road	Sheds	76.4.1-94	Structures Unltd.
Sitting	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Nancy Drazzal			
Concerns	(7:09) Barham – at least visibility from one side. Pitch on gables facing road with more normal pitch through body then brought others up to the cross gable. Gables should be 8 pitch. Originally divided these window panes to be more like these then used whiteout and went with larger window. Smaller window size more attractive. Williams - Completely inappropriate because it is bizarre. Two little 10-pitch sheds four feet wide with huge thing in the middle of it that's bigger than the sheds. Wall of windows on something six feet wide. Two humongous windows. Completely inappropriate structure and visible. Coombs – a bar getting light sitting in the middle of Ipswich road, what is she's looking at? Windows and correct roof. Roggeveen - single building with a back part on half with bar on half with covered patio part coming out of it.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
13. Dahlia Assoc. (Woodbox)	29 Fair Street – HSAB	Exhaust vent	42.3.2-192	C. Lenhardt
Sitting	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Chuck Lenhardt – hoping to get Option A			
Concerns	(2:00) Williams – no comments. Prefer painted metal. Barham – The square tap at top should be painted, preferable matt. Stucco is preferable should be uncolored though painted metal is marginally approvable. Coombs – prefer covering the tin. McLaughlin – box and parged using 16” three-liner flue. Roggeveen -			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with stucco box buff grey and vent painted matt grey. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate # 53734		

Proposed Minutes for May 5, 2009

14. Paddock House Trust	18 India Street – HSAB	Condenser unit location	42.3.1-59	NAG
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Bill McGuire – will be on patio on isolators so there will be no vibration. Unit 27 X 15 X 32 inches.			
Concerns	Charity Benz for abutter Carol Cross – would be nice if it were enclosed in some way. Another unit is recessed. (2:06) Barham – on other applications required AC recessed into ground with plantings, there is an opportunity here to set into ground with plants that also screen visually and through noise up instead of out. Removing some patio and sinking in place concerned that wood patio would become sounding board. There are locations away from patio and tree. Coombs – could drop down without too much trouble. Williams – more elevated the more disseminates, concerned about tree. Could take up some deck and sink in place. Will need to apply for retaining wall.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions to siting and recessing (Barham)			
Vote	3-0	Certificate #		

15. Brodie, Peter	70 Sankaty Road – SAB	Garage	49-81	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Val Oliver – owner asked to come back with applied for location. Alternative location would have a slope off requiring retaining wall. Changed door to wood.			
Concerns	(2:15) Barham – Do not think appropriate for garage to be forward of house along Sankaty Rd. Extremely deep property so could go further back. Coombs – no problem. Williams – grade changes dramatically behind house so this is a good place to put it.			
Motion	Motion to Approve (Coombs)			
Vote	2-1, Barham	Certificate #	53735	

Coombs depart 7:37 p.m.

16. Brooks, Shelley	11A Mary Ann Lane	New duplex	68-983	V. Oliver
Sitting	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Roggeveen - There is not a quorum. Applicant has option of holding to next meeting or waiving right to a consistent board.			
Representing	Brooks – waives right to a consistent board. Val Oliver – complete redesign, broke up massing, eliminated some parking, eliminated 3 rd floor on back unit. Shelley Brooks -			
Concerns	(2:22) Williams – Parking is in front of front door. Moving in right direction. Third floor dormer, should be larger and dropped off ridge with different windows. Could keep parking at front grass. Barham – Agree about front door partially obstructed, presently must step around car. Concerned about so many parking places: too much building, parking, zoning set back. North elevation has big, fat units that are over-scaled. Additive massing is not working. Balcony not appropriate to walk under to get to back porch and unrelated to rest of façade. Very visible ungainly, large, unattractive building absorbing vast majority of lot. McLaughlin – (inaudible) Roggeveen – planning board permits grass parking. Would rather see porch. Duplex zoning change should have required larger lots. Need HDC approval for grass-crete. Still have large rooms and wasted space that could be pulled in to reduce massing.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions (Williams)			
Vote	4-0	Certificate #		

17. Muller, Cliff	140 Polpis Road	Porch & roofwalk	44-09	V. Oliver
Sitting	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates				
Representing	Val Oliver			
Concerns	(2:42)			
Motion	Motion to Hold due to lack of quorum to beginning of May 12 meeting			
Vote	4-0	Certificate #		

McLaughlin depart 7:57 p.m.

Proposed Minutes for May 5, 2009

18. Briggs/Dinowitz	97 Low Beach Road – SAB	Revisions	75.3.1-2	Permits Plus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Barham			
Alternates				
Representing	Mark Poor – Clearly defined roof line, 2 nd floor deck over entry was reduced so gable is now balanced, subordinate forms are clearly subordinate by minimizing 2 nd -story eave lines.			
Concerns	(2:45)Barham – Front bedroom on left is only marginally under porch has effect of unbalancing an otherwise symmetrical façade and upstaging front door. Feels in its entirety as an alien element. Central dormer at 2 nd floor & center body are recessive. Present configuration front porch seems to go forever, should be pulled back somewhat either side. Feels like one very large main mass. Williams – 93 X 32 foot box. These little doo-dads shoved off the front are bay windows don't break it up. Everything is on the same plane, without any break. Not once piece of additive massing here on the front. Roggeveen – has serious massing issues.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions (Williams)			
Vote	3-0	Certificate #		
19. Cahill, Kathleen	17 Williams Street – HSAB	Main house	55-658	SMRD
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Roggeveen signed Mullen Rule			
Representing	Steve Roethke – Shifted both buildings back from Pleasant Street, this on back 5 feet with a four-foot deep farmer's porch across front. Client wants back yard space, so don't want to shift house back.			
Concerns	(2:53) Williams – no comment. Barham – on Williams St elevation, the dormers are too wide and fat, gable trim too heavy. Northwest elevation left side French doors should have ¾ kick panel. Chimney should look like an old central chimney and should be 12 inches wider than shown. Roggeveen – 4 feet is not deep enough to be functional. Have room for one more foot to set back. Could easily shift house back a foot and get another foot.			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with porch at 5 feet deep, Southwest chimney 12 feet wider, Southeast dormer narrower. (Williams)			
Vote	3-0	Certificate #	53736	
20. Cahill, Kathleen	17 Williams Street – HSAB	Cottage	55-658	SMRD
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Barham			
Alternates				
Representing	Steve Roethke – redesigned.			
Concerns	(3:06) Williams – no concerns. Barham – on Southwest elevation four panes seem wide in the dormer; should be 3 and 3 with more shingles on the side.			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with Southwest dormer windows dropping to 3 and 3. (Williams)			
Vote	3-0	Certificate #	53737	
21. Cahill, Kathleen	17 Williams Street – HSAB	Shed	55-658	SMRD
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Barham			
Alternates				
Representing	Steve Roethke			
Concerns	(3:08)			
Motion	Motion to Approve (Barham)			
Vote	3-0	Certificate #	53738	
22. Grote, Susie	43 India Street – HSAB	Hardscaping, fence change	42.3.4-125	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Barham			
Alternates				
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns	(3:09) Williams – concerned that hinges on the fencing to the right will encourage parking on lawn. Barham – opening held tight to house, would like to see kick to other side for planting. Line up swing gate with arbor and remove existing fence to allow more planting along house to further conceal condensers and remove the “corral” feel of fencing.			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with the gates shifted east to line swing gate up with arbor and remove existing fence along building. (Barham)			
Vote	3-0	Certificate #	53739	

Proposed Minutes for May 5, 2009

23. Clarke, Barbara 32 Pocomo Road Pool and fence 14-77 Emeritus
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Barham
 Alternates
 Representing Matt McEachern – privet, fence then hydrangeas on outside of fence to soften. Black mesh, 2” pool fencing.
 Concerns (3:16) Barham – pool surround not labeled with arrow as bluestone. Roggeveen hydrangeas drop their blooms and leaves and winter leaving sticks.
 Motion Motion to **Approve** Through Staff with pool fence and drawings corrected to show bluestone. (Williams)
 Vote 3-0 **Certificate # 53740**

24. 51 Baxter Road LLC 51 Baxter Road – SAB Addition 49-16 Botticelli & Pohl
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Barham
 Alternates
 Representing Lisa Botticelli – North elevation is only place to add onto this building. Removed South facing balcony and left windows. Drawing error, should be vertical board. Both fireplaces are blocked; would like one that works.
 Concerns (3:20) Williams – I don’t have my notes so I’m not going to vote on this. (Meeting on hold while goes to car to get notes at 3:22; returns 3:25) On South elevation, strange window on right, which is being deleted, should remain as it is part of oddity of house; 2nd-floor new window bisected by additive massing. Details on foundation need to be corrected. On West elevation left side, very vertical plane with only one small window, should have two; ditto on right. On North elevation, one window being added. Barham – really important house, would like to see some features lost over time brought back especially along bluff side. Would like to see a serious effort to use NHA photos re replicate details on porch and decorative cresting underneath the two gables. Need to restate what the starting point was. On South elevation, do not have concerns. East elevation no concerns with windows under porch or window on right side; appears the railing is configured with solid portion at window sill height and could replace without loss of view to original at top and bottom. On West elevation, no problem with deletion of window on right because area is perforated with windows; large new entry hall and rebuilt stairs could be redesigned to pull dining-room wall back in. Existing ceiling under porch is quite extraordinary; all ceilings are spectacular. Fireplace mantel and posts were designed for this house by the original architect, really important and should be maintained; would like it well documented with pictures and drawings. Roggeveen – a restoration of this house is the sort of project that would be written up in magazines.
 Motion Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)
 Vote 3-0 **Certificate #**

25. 51 Baxter Road LLC 51 Baxter Road – SAB New cottage 49-16 Botticelli & Pohl
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Barham
 Alternates
 Representing Lisa Botticelli
 Concerns Roggeveen – we don’t fix a board if we don’t discuss this.
 Motion Motion to Hold for main house
 Vote 3-0 **Certificate #**

26. Morzano, Tracey 113 Cliff Road Paving 41-9 JGGA
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Barham
 Alternates
 Representing Goldsmith rep – submitted to Planning Board for second curb cut. Relocate privet off street with bayberry or some such indigenous on street side.
 Concerns (3:45) Barham – would like to see path from street directly to door as have some other dwellings along Cliff Rd; it’s a formal house and should address street. My preference then would be to confine parking to left and maintain proper lawn in front of house. Williams – does not agree. Roggeveen – believes this is a more elegant treatment. Would suggest HDC write letter of support to Planning Board.
 Motion Motion to **Approve** with applicant to draft letter for Planning Board to be brought to Staff for finalizing and signing.
 Vote 2-0, Barham abstain **Certificate # 53741**

Proposed Minutes for May 5, 2009

27. Morzano, Tracey 113 Cliff Road Fence & gate 41-9 JGGA
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Barham
 Alternates
 Representing Ditto
 Concerns (3:52)
 Motion Motion to **Approve** with applicant to draft letter for Planning Board to be brought to Staff for finalizing and signing.
 Vote 2-0, Barham abstain **Certificate # 53742**

28. Loring, Patricia 5 Goose Pond Road – HSAB Reduce square footage 55-46 E. McMorrow
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Barham
 Alternates
 Representing Chris Holland
 Concerns (3:53) Barham – West elevation behind bathroom windows is storage space and could be pushed back farther. Water front is now lumpy though quirky.
 Motion Motion to **Approve** Through Staff with West elevation bathroom Nr 209 moved East 16 inches and descending gable as seen in previous approval restored. (Barham)
 Vote 3-0 **Certificate # 53743**

29. Lawler, Joseph 6 Packet Drive – SAB New dwelling 73-48 M. O’Connor
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Barham
 Alternates
 Representing Maurice O’Connor – eliminated on French door to single, turned triple French to double French.
 Concerns (4:00) SAB comments read. Williams – way outside ‘Sconset OHD, windows don’t need to be TDL. No main mass, this hierarchy belongs to a different style; front & side doors should be the same; double sidelights inappropriate; weirdo hip in the front. If this comes all the way down, there should be a line (indicating a wall) all the way down. No traditional additive massing. This element is alien to rest of house. Multiple ganged windows on front of house. Long dormers on North elevation. Many different styles stuck together. Barham – this wall surfaces in front of this wall. Floor plan indicates perfect crucible form. Extremely visible with two elevations facing streets. East elevation not attractive end elevation. North elevation, which is visible, shed dormers are enormous with chaotic fenestration. Front has disparate elements. Roggeveen – needs traditional additive massing where each chunk tells a story. There are a number of discordant elements. Large front gable and subordinate gable are both 12 pitch, which is rare on Nantucket and associated more with Victorian style structures. Rear wall extends straight across and dormer crosses both elements. Clipped roof element is not permissible. 5 pitch ok on little masses, not on main mass. No cohesion to angle of roofs. Applicant’s agent should talk to staff. Ref *Building With Nantucket in MInd* for working with additive massing on Nantucket.
 Motion Motion to Hold for revision (Williams)
 Vote 3-0 **Certificate #**

30. Lawler, Joseph 6 Packet Drive – SAB New garage 73-48 M. O’Connor
 Sitting Roggeveen, Williams, Barham
 Alternates
 Representing Maurice O’Connor
 Concerns
 Motion Motion to Hold for main house
 Vote 3-0 **Certificate #**

IV. HDC BUSINESS

Review Minutes -	April 28
Approve Minutes -	April 21
60 Day Denials -	7 Judith Lane LLC, window changes – Barham recused, no quorum. Held to May 7 1:00 p.m. meeting
Other Business -	34 Orange LLC – Which option – with or without railing. Chose railing option.
Commission Comments	

Adjourned 9:30 p.m.

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board **SAB** – ‘Sconset Advisory Board **MAB** – Madaket Advisory Board