



Proposed Minutes for May 12, 2009
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

37 Washington Street
 Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
 Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Valerie Norton (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Linda Williams, David Barham
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

May 12, 2009 – NEW BUSINESS
 Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order at 5:03 p.m. Staff in attendance: M. Voigt, J. Grieder & T. Norton

I. CONSENT	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. Manning Associates – 53745	7 Macys Lane	New sign: wall sign	68-40	J. Manning
2. NIR (Island Indulgence) – 53746	43 Straight Wharf – HSAB	New sign: wall sign	422.4-146	Y. Edri
3. Fisher, Susan – 53747	19 Goldfinch Drive	Color change: front door	68-510	N. Mack
4. NHA Properties – 53748	2 Clarendon Drive	Window, door revisions	76.1.4-149	A. Marcavitch
5. Ray, Sarah – 53749	8B Folger Avenue	Color change, hardscaping	80-426	S. Ray
6. Murphy, Catherine – 53750	12 Newtown Road	Reroof: color change	55-197	C. Murphy
7. Dountchev, Anton – 53751	9B Waydale Road	Rev: COA#53722 (add gate)	67-31	Self
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve (Williams)			
Vote	4-0, McLaughlin abstain		Certificate #	53745 to 53751

II. OLD BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. Muller, Cliff	140 Polpis Road	Porch & roofwalk	44-9	V. Oliver
Sitting	Norton, Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Val Oliver – not expanding roof at this time. Willing to give up roofwalk for the porch. Ray St. Peters – extending porch to eight feet to allow room for furniture and maneuvering.			
Concerns	(5:04) Norton – no concerns. Coombs – roofwalk on this house. Barham – would also prefer not to see roofwalk. Porch 2/4 pitch toward street & 9/4 away from street; they should be equal. Williams – 8 foot porch is too deep on a reverse salt box; skirt is inappropriate; size looks out of proportion on the roof. Agree pitch angles need to be fixed.			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with East elevation of the roof termination point changed and no roofwalk at this time. (Norton)			
Vote	4-0		Certificate #	53752

III. NEW BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. Fanning, Anthony	4 Berkeley Avenue	Replace windows	76.1.4-134	Self
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Combs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	(5:13)			
Motion	Motion to Approve (Williams)			
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53753
2. Winn, Gary	250 Polpis Road	Demo: shed	26-27	Self
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Combs, Wagley			
Representing	Gary Winn			
Concerns	(5:15)			
Motion	Motion to Approve (Williams)			
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53754

Proposed Minutes for May 12, 2009

3. Gelb, Larry 10 Deacon's Way Masonry grill stand 40-83 M. Rowland
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham
 Alternates Combs, Wagley
 Representing Ben Normand
 Concerns (5:17)
 Motion Motion to **Approve** due to lack of visibility (Williams)
 Vote 5-0 Certificate # 53755

4. Foregger, Doug Tuckernuck Island – TAB Rev: COA 53530 94-24 M. Rowland
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs (**Roggeveen depart 5:24 p.m.**)
 Alternates Wagley //Williams recused
 Representing Ben Normand
 Concerns (5:19)
 Motion Motion to Hold for more historical documentation to include shed (McLaughlin)
 Vote 4-0 Certificate #

Roggeveen return 5:26 p.m.

5. Einstein, William 76 Cliff Road Window changes 30-70 M. Rowland
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham
 Alternates Combs, Wagley
 Representing Ben Normand
 Concerns (5:26) HSAB comments read. Norton – outside limit of OHD built circa 1960s.
 Motion Motion to **Approve** (Williams)
 Vote 4-1, Barham Certificate # 53756

6. NIR / White Elephant 19 North Water Street – HSAB Gate height change 42.4.2-3 BPC
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham
 Alternates Combs, Wagley
 Representing Doug Mills – to meet public pool code requirements
 Concerns (5:29)
 Motion Motion to **Approve** (Williams)
 Vote 5-0 Certificate # 53757

7. Atlantic Light LLC 1 Baxter Road – SAB Rev: COA #53047 73.1.4-12 BPC
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham
 Alternates Combs, Wagley
 Representing Thea Molloy
 Concerns (5:30) SAB comments read.
 Motion Motion to **Approve** (Williams)
 Vote 5-0 Certificate # 53758

8. MacLeod, Judith 56 Orange Street – HSAB Addition 55.4.1-80 LPA
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham
 Alternates Combs, Wagley
 Representing Michael Chady
 Concerns (5:33)
 Motion **Motion to View with abutters' letters and historic photos; if there was a roofwalk need historic documentation on that as well.** (without comment)
 Vote 5-0 Certificate #

9. MacLeod, Judith 56 Orange Street – HSAB New garage 55.4.1-80 LPA
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham
 Alternates Combs, Wagley
 Representing
 Concerns
 Motion **Motion to View**
 Vote 5-0 Certificate #

Proposed Minutes for May 12, 2009

10. MacLeod, Judith	56 Orange Street – HSAB	Demo: existing garage	55.4.1-80	LPA
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Combs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to View			
Vote	5-0			Certificate #
11. Quattrocchi, Lisa	17 Gardner Street – HSAB	Outdoor shower	42.3.4-170	R. Green
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Combs, Wagley			
Representing	Richard Green			
Concerns	(5:37) HSAB comments read.			
Motion	Motion to Approve (Williams)			
Vote	5-0			Certificate # 53759
12. Quattrocchi, Lisa	17 Gardner Street – HSAB	Hardscaping	42.3.4-170	R. Green
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Combs, Wagley			
Representing	Richard Green			
Concerns	(5:41)			
Motion	Motion to Approve (Williams)			
Vote	5-0			Certificate # 53760
13. Glowacki, Walter	67 Old South Road	Convert to cabana	68-158	Structures
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Combs, Wagley			
Representing	Nancy Drahzal			
Concerns	(5:42)			
Motion	Motion to Approve (Williams)			
Vote	5-0			Certificate # 53761
14. Auerbach, Herbert	18 Long Pond Drive – MAB	New garage-studio	59-20	D. Holcomb
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Combs, Wagley			
Representing	David Holcomb – removed two feet from building size and used simpler doors. Fay Gilfoy 16 Long Pond Dr. – too high, too many windows. Garage studio across the street has less fenestration. Too much deck space in combination with the very large decks on the house			
Concerns	(5:45) MAB comments read.			
Motion	Motion to View with center ridge pole. (without comment) (Norton)			
Vote	5-0			Certificate #
15. Fitzgerald, Susan	23 Tashama Drive	Renovation	55-464	J.B.
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Combs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	(5:52)			
Motion	Motion to View (without comment) (Williams)			
Vote	5-0			Certificate #

Proposed Minutes for May 12, 2009

16. 29 Baxter Road HT	29 Baxter Road – SAB	Outdoor shower	49.2.3-9	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Combs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	(5:53) SAB comments read. Norton – North elevation visible in winter. Should be traditional height of 6'. Williams – agrees.			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff at 6 feet max straight across (Norton)//Rescind prior motion. Motion to View (with comment)			
Vote	5-0//5-0	Certificate #		
17. Moore, Norman	54 Milestone Road	Move on-site: shed	54-113.2	
Sitting	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Barham, Combs, Wagley			
Alternates	(Norton recused. Williams recused)			
Representing	Norton – abutter no concerns			
Concerns	(5:59)			
Motion	Motion to Approve (McLaughlin)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53762	
18. Moore, Norman	54 Milestone Road	AS-BUILT shed	54-113.2	
Sitting	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Barham, Combs, Wagley			
Alternates	(Norton recused. Williams recused)			
Representing	Norton – abutter			
Concerns	(5:59)			
Motion	Motion to Approve (McLaughlin)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53763	
19. Prospect Hill Cemetery	Hummock Pond Road	Retaining wall	56-276	J. Morash
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Combs, Wagley			
Representing	Jeff Morash – Last year met with committee (Coombs & Barham) to discuss hardscape plans. This application is in response to those meetings.			
Concerns	(6:00) Would like photos of sample granite.			
Motion	Motion to View with photos of sample granite included if possible (without comment) (Norton)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
20. Baldassano, William	2 & 2A Gardner Perry Lane	Trellis	55-33	Self
Sitting	Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham, Wagley			
Alternates	Combs//Roggeveen declined			
Representing				
Concerns	(6:11) Williams – free-standing trellis will look odd until plants grow in. Coombs – no concern, reminiscent of laundry line trellis. Barham – wants a top rail capping the pickets. As turns back to corner of house, there is a gap. Wagley – does not like 6 feet height. Norton – agrees with Barham, it is a traditional look.			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with top rail and connected to corner board at North elevation and max height of 5'6" from grade. (Williams)			
Vote	4-1, Wagley	Certificate #	53764	
21. Fry, Paul	3 Nickanoose Way	AS-BUILT shed	55-559	C. Barnes
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Combs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	(6:17) Letter from office of zoning enforcement read.			
Motion	Motion to Approve (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53765	

IV.HDC BUSINESS	
Review Minutes -	May 5 and May 7
Approve Minutes -	April 28 – adopted by unanimous consent
60 Day Denials -	<i>Hammer, 6 King Street, new foundation (deadline May 13) – Motion to DENY, 5-0, 53766</i>
Other Business -	<p>Handout: preserving brick walls</p> <p>T.O.N., “Public Way” concrete posts – Alan Reinhardt, Chairman Roads and Right of Way Committee, is wishing to replace pre-cast concrete public way markers subject to deterioration. Committee attempted to duplicate original molds done in 1950s, but to recast design is cost prohibitive. Granite is less subject to degradation with only plus \$10 difference. Looking to mark public access points around the island. Looking for approval of granite posts to replace concrete. Would like the 12 markers ready for 350 anniversary of original settlement. McLaughlin – concerned about theft and vandalism. Williams – likes granite. Barham – prefer rough hewn granite. Saperstein – stone as came from quarry was polished on one side. Barham – prefers lettering that is just incised, no paint. In downtown and ‘Sconset OHDs unpainted with serif font would be more appropriate. Norton – would like to see original font duplicate as “stubby and bold and squished together.” Would like to see medallions replaced. Spray stone to promote aging. Wagley – likes granite. Coombs – agrees with Norton. Roggeveen – historically is concrete post from mid 20th Century so do not want to create a fake history. Agrees with Norton. Would like to see existing markers duplicated in shape and lettering. The ones that have the medallions would like to see those reused. Want to see application under sign guidelines and work with other town departments.</p> <p>Main Street, brickwork – Reinhardt Board of Selectman, first heard was Wednesday at selectmen meeting, Jeff Willett gave his explanation. Checked it out Thursday. Roggeveen - Willett on vacation and Elizabeth Gibson has instructed Mohammed Nabulsi to meet with Voigt. Heard rumor that town is not going to change it because “three of the selectmen like it.” Town needs to apply just as much as private entities. HDC needs for Voigt to meet with Nabulsi. DPW did not react properly to the “Stop Work Order.” Public telling HDC Chairman that HDC needs to “Stick to its guns and make the town comply.” Going to deal with this through the process, Libby and DPW.</p> <p>Nantucket Land Bank, 1 Fair Street Park, masonry – Reinhardt Chairman Nantucket Land Bank. David Bartsch, landscape architect, in 9 or 10months spent review project talked about bank across street, stone façade to the wall, the width of joints, and understand “Exhibit A” was “similar” to what was approved. Spirit of what “Exhibit A” represents is the Coursed ASHlar, but not the zigzag and bore holes. Blocks are 18X9 based on a number of factors essentially the ability to use flat surface in construction of a curve, the block height is 18 inches and cap is 6 inches. Looked at proportion of horizontal to vertical. Went with largest stone possible within a field. Barham – would like to see the drawing. (Bartsch brought in drawing and discussed with Commission.) There looks to be too much regulation in the block sizes of those at the site than what the Commission had intended. There seemed to be some confusion in the application discussions of type of surface along Main Street. Coombs – thought stones were going to be more irregular in size as shown in “Exhibit A”. Roggeveen – stone work going in does not look like what was represented to the commission at approval. Blocks on site smaller than they look in photos submitted with application. ((Roggeveen & Williams departed 7:18 p.m. Norton chair)) Norton – perhaps should have a section of dry-laid wall. Wiley – believe moved forward with the correct intent of the approval. Changing block size now would be very expensive and that is of great concern. Coombs – would like to see a small section of the wall. ((McLaughlin departed 7:26 p.m.)) Voigt – sample dry-laid coarsing for Commissioner who sat the project to go see and meet on Thursday to discuss. Barham – interior walls material is not clear in the meeting discussions and not clear what Liberty Stone is. Bartsch – Liberty Stone is a type of field stone. Barham – what is on site is a quarry product. When approved “Field stone wall” expected cobbled rock with a smooth surface cap to sit on. Instead have monolithically regulated rock. Bartsch – stone will be in place Wednesday at noon for viewing by Commissioners. Voigt – have to honor open meeting law and hold the meeting at 1 p.m. May 14 at 37 Washington Street Conference Room.</p>
Commission Comments	

Adjourned 7:40 p.m.

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board
 TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board