



Proposed Minutes for June 23, 2009

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

37 Washington Street

Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554

Telephone: 508.228.7231

Fax: 508.325.7572

www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Valerie Norton (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Linda Williams, David Barham
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

June 23, 2009 – NEW BUSINESS

Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order at 5:03 p.m. Staff in attendance J. Grieder & T. Norton

Ginny Way of Sustainable Nantucket introduced herself and the Historic Green Committee which is writing an addendum to BWNIM ref energy efficiency and historic buildings.

I. CONSENT	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. Lightship Basket Museum – 53877	49 Union Street – HSAB	Sign	55.1.4-31	
2. Carter, Robert – 53878	9 Warren Street – HSAB	Fence	55.4.1-95	Self
3. 3 Magnolia LLC – 53879	3 Magnolia Avenue – SAB	Color change	73.3.1-80	M. Williams
4. Vigneaux, Barbara – 53880	15 Meadow Lane	Replace/add windows	41-406.2	P. Boynton
5. Kelly, Daniel – 53881	9 Meetinghouse Lane	Extend 2 nd floor deck	49-76	NAG
6. Oh, Fran – 53882	20 Golfview Drive	Fence (Type III) & gate	66-186	D. Leisher
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley, Hill Holdgate			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve			
Vote	4-0, McLaughlin abstain		Certificate #	53877 to 53882

II. OLD BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. Grillo, Heather	169 Polpis Road	Addition	44-18	CWA
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Ethan Griffin – No historic documentation was available.			
Concerns	Chip Webster – Made modification on portions that can not be seen and left front façade is untouched. (5:09) Norton – No historic documentation was included in the view pack. This is a very important building, one of the only remaining farm houses in the Polpis area and it is unchanged. There is information on it in <i>Polpis, Past and Present</i> . The addition ridge should not be same height as original and should be lowered 18 inches below main mass to ensure subordination to the main dwelling. Eave heights too high and flush dormers are a concern. Barham & Coombs – ditto McLaughlin - not visible Roggeveen – commission is looking for lower eaves and lower ridge.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions, labeled demo plan with roof framing detailed and more historic documentation. (Norton)			
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	

2. Grillo, Heather	169 Polpis Road	Move on-site: shed	44-18	CWA
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Norton)			
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53883

Proposed Minutes for June 23, 2009

3.	Hofford, Gregg	6 Milestone Crossing	Revisions	68-461	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates					
Representing	Matt McEachern				
Concerns	(5:17) Norton & McLaughlin – no concerns. Barham – 6-panel French door West elevation should have kick panel. East & West elevation double dormer windows look higher than “A” windows. Coombs – East elevation blank wall draws eye to dormer. Roggeveen – Still doesn’t look like secondary mass. Cross gable				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Norton)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #		
4.	Briggs, Jason	97 Low Beach – SAB	New dwelling	75-31.2	CWA
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley				
Alternates	Coombs				
Representing	Chip Webster Ethan Griffin				
Concerns	(5:26) Previous concerns read. McLaughlin - Roofwalk not appropriate on 1 ½ story. South elevation 2 nd floor, double French doors should be a single French door and window and porch railing should not be curved. Barham – Assortment of different parts of houses that don’t relate well. Proportion of right, left and center don’t look architecturally of a piece or in sequence. South elevation 2 nd -floor balcony on Left with French doors looks awkward. Hipped porch with gable looks busy. North elevation 3-light horizontal window 2 nd floor right looks awkward. East elevation roof projection mudroom does not succeed as a salt box with the break in the roof with overhang supported by bracket. Shed dormer roofs on West elevation should drop off ridge one foot. Norton – Main and subsidiary masses are headed in the correct direction. Agree with Barham’s details. Not concerned about roofwalk but needs to be properly drawn and constructed and without skirt. Wagley – Agree with McLaughlin about roofwalk and Barham & Norton on all else. Roggeveen – Eave lines on subordinate masses need to be lower than main mass. Juliet balcony should be on back.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Norton)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #		
5.	Savel Nominee Trust	47 Pocomo Road	Pool and hardscaping	15-19	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Wagley, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Ray Pohl				
Concerns	(5:39) Norton – would prefer to have rolling landscape with boulders which are more natural looking. This is very formal for an outlying area. (No Locus Map) There are piers on the wall supporting a wood fence stained to match house that look odd. McLaughlin – no concerns. Barham – Creation of a platform that damages the natural flow of land is a concern. Coombs – Not visible from water.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Norton)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #		
6.	Balling, Dan	110 Pleasant Street	Rev. COA 52708 – massing	55-149.1	SMRD
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	McLaughlin abstained.				
Representing	Steve Roethke – changed 60 sq ft from original approval. “Bronze” is a clad coloring that is a slightly darker brown than Andersen “Sand tone.”				
Concerns	(5:47) Norton – no concerns. Coombs – No concerns. Barham – South elevation porch post falls in middle of window and door swing barely misses post; should move toward street about 18 inches. North elevation similar issue, line up post with 2 nd floor window; porch roof could be pulled off corner a smidge. Gable, front and back, seem oversized. Roggeveen – no concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Coombs)				
Vote	3-1, Barham		Certificate #	53884	

Proposed Minutes for June 23, 2009

III. NEW BUSINESS		ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1.	Kinsella, Catherine	21A Hummock Pond Road	New dwelling	56-11	C. Kinsella
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Hill Holdgate				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing	Catherine Kinsella				
Concerns	(5:58) Norton – Height of 28’6” seems high though design brings it down visually; would like to know what sort of buildings are around it. Barham – Lack of fenestration around front door leaves porch inhospitable and blank. Hill Holdgate & McLaughlin – no comments Roggeveen – Front porch has limited visibility.				
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with corrected drawings, no chimney cap and details of the rear elevation basement stair. (Norton)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53885	
2.	Williams, Clifford	4 Manchester Circle	Fence	56-463	C. Williams
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Wagley, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Clifford Williams				
Concerns	(6:07) Barham – Plantings to meet fence at front plane of house best idea. McLaughlin – No comment Roggeveen – Don’t allow high fences to come forward of the house.				
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with 6’ fence not to pass front plane of house. (Barham)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53886	
3.	Phillip, Mark	25B Essex Road	Addition to garage	67-612	Self
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley				
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Mark Phillips – submit revised drawings at meeting.				
Concerns	(6:11) Norton – Balcony ? elevation should be bracketed and without a roof with a regular railing.				
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with balcony being a railing with brackets. (June 23 drawings with balcony from June 12 drawings.)				
Vote	4-0, McLaughlin abstain		Certificate #	53887	
4.	Knutti, Ken	4 Grove Lane – HSAB	Shed addition	41-557	D. Wiley
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Hill Holdgate				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing					
Concerns	(6:17) Barham & McLaughlin – See-through skylights.				
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Norton)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53888	
5.	McKerrow, Martin	24 Crooked Lane	Chimney cap	41-335	G. Folger
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Wagley, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Gordon Folger				
Concerns	(6:22) Norton & Coombs – no concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve with either solid walls on the ends or corners with sufficient mass, whichever works best.				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53889	
6.	ACK Human Services	1 Miacomet Road	Rev COA 51182	67-345	SMRD
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley				
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Steve Roethke – every door and window have shifted.				
Concerns	(6:30)				
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Norton)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53890	

Williams arrived 6:32 p.m.

Proposed Minutes for June 23, 2009

7.	Bartlett's Farm	33 Bartlett Farm Road	Solar panels	82-501	SMRD
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Steve Roethke – panels on all south facing sloping trellis roofs over the outdoor garden center.				
Concerns	(6:33) Barham, Norton, & Roggeveen – Want the panels on roof nearest parking placed on flat section of trellis or the inside slope. Pitch is only 4/12. It is presently nicely designed and the panels would cover up the design element.				
Motion	Motion to View with additional information about efficiency of panels in other locations (with comment). Barham)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #		
8.	Schreiner, Edwin	7 Wall Street	Arbor	82-80	E. Schreiner
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate				
Representing					
Concerns	(6:41) Need a locus map, proper site plan and photo of house. Plan showing location is a septic plan without proper info on driveways, house and walkways..				
Motion	Motion to Hold for more information				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #		
9.	Geddes, Robert	28 Hummock Pond Road	AS-BUILT shed	56-84	R. Geddes
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Robert Geddes				
Concerns	(6:43)				
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Williams)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53891	
10.	Irwin, Richard	115 Cliff Road	Add dormers	41-7	Permits Plus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Mark Poor -				
Concerns	(6:44) Barham – no objection. Norton – changes character but appropriately done				
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with amended window schedule. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53892	
11.	Newman, John	14 Friendship Lane	Solar panels	66-270	Robert King
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Robert King - 12 panel array, 2400 watts				
Concerns	(6:47)				
Motion	Motion to View (without comment). (Norton)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #		
12.	Stott, Charles	42 Long Pond Drive – MAB	AS-BUILT shed	59.4-114	C. Stott
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Charles Stott				
Concerns	(6:51) MAB comments read.				
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Williams)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53893	

Proposed Minutes for June 23, 2009

13. Brooks, Shelly	11A Mary Ann Lane	Rev: COA #53789	68-983	V. Oliver
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Val Oliver			
Concerns	(6:52)			
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53894	
14. Ramos, Roberto	83 Hinsdale Road	Addition (resubmission)	69-112	V. Oliver
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Val Oliver – was a garage that was added onto, now wants a 2 nd floor			
Concerns	(6:54)			
Motion	Motion to View (without comment). (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
15. Green, Susan	1 Twin Street – HSAB	Hardscaping revisions	42.3.2-43	Jardins Int'l.
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Elisabeth O'Rourke			
Concerns	(6:56)			
Motion	Motion to Approve . (McLaughlin)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53895	
16. Nantucket Lot 51 LLC	135 Eel Point Road	New dwelling	33-12	J.G. Thorsen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Gwynne Thorsen – set in a hollow			
Concerns	(7:00)			
Motion	Motion to View with one ridge pole (without comment). (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
Wagley departs. Break 7:02 to 7:11 p.m.				
17. Adequate Holdings LLC	35 Eel Point Road	Add shutters	32-63	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli			
Concerns	(7:11)			
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53896	
18. Botticelli & Pohl Inc	24 Pine Street – HSAB	Add shutters, revise bay	42.3.2-110	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli			
Concerns	(7:13) Norton – No window schedule, would like more info on age of windows. McLaughlin – No comments. Barham – Would like to view it with age on windows and bay. Eaves differ on various sides of house			
Motion	Motion to View with documentation on windows and bay (with comment). (Barham)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

Proposed Minutes for June 23, 2009

19. Turner, Louise	6 Martin's Lane – HSAB	Curb cut and driveway	42.3.2-18	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Luke Thornewill – Says that in 20 years have never submitted a hardscape plan. Chris Perry – HDC directed them to talk to DPW ref. curb cut. Feels that in talks with staff he was led to believe they had approval for a driveway. No body touched, ripped or destroyed that curbed.			
Concerns	(7:18) HSAB comments read. Roggeveen - Nothing on previous approvals apply for a curb cut and applicants were told to submit a hardscaping plan. Would like staff to research history of curb at 24 Fair Street. Norton – Materials for curb, apron and drive not labeled on plans. Opposed to curb cuts along Martin's Lane. McLaughlin – One of the most famous streets on the island. The curbing and stone ripped out, (photo on camera). Barham – Opposed to curb cuts on Martin's lane. Williams – Nothing to add. Roggeveen - In conjunction with appeal for 3 Martin's Lane, there is a lot of public outcry against curb cuts along this road.			
Motion	Motion to DENY due to historical incompatibility. (Barham)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53897	
20. Clarke, Barbara	32 Pocomo Road	Pool shed & flag pole	14-77	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Matt McEachern – Flag pole 30-feet high			
Concerns	(7:35) Roggeveen – Don't exert control over simple flag poles, only when they have cross trees.			
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Norton)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53898	
Hill Holdgate & Barham depart 7:37 p.m.				
21. Pindell, Pamela	53 Polpis Road	AS-BUILT changes	54-23	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns	(7:38)			
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53899	
22. Davidson, Adriana	25 Clifton Street – SAB	Addition, replace door & trim	73.4.1-3	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns	(7:40) SAB comments read. Norton – Addition is appropriate to design of building. Williams & Coombs – no comments. McLaughlin – See-through sky lights on addition.			
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53900	
23. Antonietti, Eleanor	1 Somerset Road	Metal hoop shed	56-18	E. Antonietti
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Eleanor Antonietti – only temporary but looking at least 4 years down the road to build a garage. To house antique car and antique wood boat.			
Concerns	(7:44) Norton – Concern about its permanence adjacent to historic building. McLaughlin – no comments. Coombs – Would be willing to give 1½ to 2 years then have applicant come back for review.			
Motion	Motion to Approve for two years. (Williams)			
Vote	3-2, Roggeveen & Norton	Certificate #	53901	

Proposed Minutes for June 23, 2009

24. Hither Creek LLC					
	20 Washington Avenue – MAB	Window replacement	60.2.1-13	A. Chanler	
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Coombs				
Alternates					
Representing					
Concerns	(7:50)				
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff as Like kind or use Brosco TDL with similar muntin patterns. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53902	
25. DeZalduando, Barbara					
	13 Cliff Road – HSAB	Renewal: COA# 35765	42.4.4-57	Self	
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Coombs				
Alternates					
Representing					
Concerns	(7:53)				
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Williams)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53903	
26. Brooks, David					
	70 Goldfinch Drive	Rev. COA 52609 reduce size	68-684	M. Rowland	
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Williams, Coombs				
Alternates					
Representing	Ben Normand				
Concerns	(7:55)				
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff without clapboard.				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53904	

IV.HDC BUSINESS	
Review Minutes -	June 16, 2009
Approve Minutes -	May 26, June 2, June 9 – adopted by unanimous consent.
60 Day Denials -	
Other Business -	<p>HANDOUTS: Violations update</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • NIR White Elephant Fence – Board fence Type C very plain approved on hotel lot; there is a note on the plan about a fence across the street on a different lot, but that would not have been approvable. NIR needs to apply for the fence or take it down. • NIR Harbor House pool temporary fence – no objections to fence. • NIR White Elephant statue – Needs a sign permit. ((Williams depart 8:05 p.m.)) • 31 Easy Street – (Liddle) no concerns. • 7 Pitman Rd. ‘Sconset Belichick – <p>David Bentley – Staff won’t sign off on inspection due to double glazed windows on house. Submits photos of TDLs in SOHD and how “bad” they look. Double- vs single-glazed windows have never been an issue before. Looks more historic. We are not filing for a change, we believe we applied for this.</p> <p>Belichick – The application was approved three years ago and nothing on the form said it had to have TDLs, now I am being held up for SDL windows.</p> <p>Roggeveen – In all core districts, single-pane TDLs are required. This board has always decided to prefer storms and TDLs rather than SDLs in OHDs. This has been argued by HDCs across the country. It is a matter of not how SDL windows looks to applicant, but how it looks in relation to other historic buildings. Did not apply for SDLs.</p> <p>Norton – Remembers viewing property last year. Windows are not an exact historic copy – no putty on the outside. Need to apply for an as-built change; this needs to be discussed with a full board.</p> <p>Staff – industry standard defines TDLs as single-glazed, ref’s Andersen web site.</p> <p>MOTION TO VIEW WITH FULL PREVIOUS APPROVAL and to come back up June 30.</p>
Commission Comments	<p>Norton – Corner Bartlett & Thirty-acres demo by neglect.</p> <p>Norton – 13 Commercial Wharf “rebuild” has SDL windows and should be on Violation list.</p> <p>Coombs – 2 Atlantic fence has not been put back to original design.</p> <p>Coombs – Old lady house belonging to Lindsey Butler bad shape but not condemned.</p>

Adjourned 8:35 p.m.

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board
 SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board
TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory oard
 MAB – Madaket Advisory Board