



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

37 Washington Street
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Valerie Norton (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Linda Williams, David Barham
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

June 30, 2009 – OLD BUSINESS
Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Meeting called to order at 5:07pm.
Staff in attendance: Mark Voigt, James Grieder

I. CONSENT	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	MAP-PARCEL	AGENT
1. Yeakel, Nancy – 53905	2 Dooley Court	Color change: trim	68-75	Self
2. Benson, Peter – 53906	15 ½ Surfside Road	New deck	80-33.2	Alan Noll
3. ACK Gardn Club – 53907	51 Nobadeer Farm/81 Milestone	New signs: temporary signs	69-100/69-1	D. Frame
4. Country Village – 53908	12 Straight Wharf	New sign: hanging sign	42.3.1-138	D. Foregger
5. 54 Centre St – 53909	54 Centre Street	Color change: foundation	42.4.3-30	D. Boyce
Sitting	Williams, Norton (Acting Chair), Barham (Roggeveen, McLaughlin abstained)			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Vote	3-0	Certificate #	53905-53909	

II. OLD BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	MAP-PARCEL	AGENT
1. Newman, John	14 Friendship Lane	Solar panels	66-270	R. King
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Wagley, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Robert King: the equipment/inverters need to be close to the house because the energy loss over a distance necessitates a large wire that will not connect to the inverter.			
Concerns	Solar panels should only be applied on black roofs. Some of the panels would not be visible (1 st page left), but not all of them. There is plenty of room on the site (backyard) for a ground array. If a ground array will not work then there needs to be documentation proving it. The array as proposed does not fit aesthetically with the building.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for a View with additional information. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

Coombs arrived at 5:14pm.

2. Ramos, Roberto	83 Hinsdale Road	Addition	69-112	V. Oliver
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate			
Representing	Val Oliver, Roberto Ramos			
Concerns	Since the roof is being removed the front should be the taller structure, with a lower rear addition. The second story element is far enough back that it does not negatively impact the neighborhood.			
Motion	Motion to Approve Through Staff with the eaves aligned with the meeting rails on the flush dormer. (Williams)			
Vote	3-2 (Norton, Barham opposed)	Certificate #	53910	

3.	Nantucket Lot 51 LLC	135 Eel Point Road	New dwelling	33-11	J.G. Thorsen
Sitting	Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Wagley, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Gwynne Thorsen				
Concerns	Previous concerns read. The applicant has addressed many of the concerns expressed by the board. East and West elevation shed dormers should start below the ridge. The single row of casement windows looks too modern when the storm window is applied. The plan as currently provided will not be visible due to the changes made to the location.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)				
Vote	4-0				Certificate #
4.	Nantucket Lot 51 LLC	135 Eel Point Road	New cottage	33-12	J.G. Thorsen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Gwynne Thorsen				
Concerns	The shutters are not on the main dwelling on the other lot and should be eliminated. The West elevation requires a fence or grate to meet code. The building is appropriately sited and will not be visible.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through Staff with an appropriate fence or grate around the subterranean level on the West side. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				Certificate # 53911
	32:12				
5.	Kelly/Irwin	87 Hummock Pond Road	New dwelling	56-301.1	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Terry Kelly				
Concerns	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				Certificate # 53912
6.	Lawler, Joseph	6 Packet Drive – SAB	New dwelling	73-48	M. O'Connor
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Joseph Lawler, Maurice O'Connor				
Concerns	Previous concerns read. Concerns have been addressed, fits in with the neighborhood. The front door and sidelights is overdone – one or the other should be chosen. There are too many casements and they are too small. Windows flanking the front door are too large and should be reduced. All of the double-hung windows on the first floor should be the same size.				
Motion	Motion to Approve with the windows on the South elevation reduced in size to match the rest on that elevation. (Barham)				
Vote	2-1 (Williams opposed)				Certificate # 53913
7.	Lawler, Joseph	6 Packet Drive – SAB	New garage	73-48	M. O'Connor
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley, Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Joseph Lawler, Maurice O'Connor				
Concerns	Having the two storey-mass facing the road. The lower mass should face the street rather than the neighbor. Less concerns after seeing the site plan.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through Staff with meeting rails aligned with the eaves and windows matching the main house (6/2 rather than 2/2) (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				Certificate # 53914

8.	Piccirillo, Paul	125 Orange Street – HSAB	Door/exterior stair	55-394	Emeritus
Sitting	Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates	Hill Holdgate				
Representing	Matt McEachern – the cross-bucks are being retained and the A/C units have been addressed.				
Concerns	Previous concerns and HSAB comments read. Crossbucks are not appropriate for the neighborhood. The fence should be extended to enclose the A/C units. A new front door should be fabricated to reflect the original door, which has been thrown away, and the second door should reflect those elements as well.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through Staff with the original door re-fabricated and the fence extended to conceal the A/C units. (Barham)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53915	

Hill Holdgate departs 6:05pm.

9.	Auerbach, Herbert	18 Long Pond Drive – MAB	Garage/studio	59-20	D. Holcomb
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing	David Holcomb, Lisa Flaherty, Faye Gilfoy – the design is much improved.				
Concerns	Previous concerns read. Small casement and triple-mulled windows on the South elevation are a concern, as are the double French doors on the West. The second-floor balcony touching the pent roof looks odd. The building should be set back five more feet from the road as originally proposed. The proportions of the West elevation right-hand dormer relative to the dormer of the main mass is peculiar. Not concerned because the double French doors face into the property.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through Staff with South elevation 2nd-floor ganged windows reduced from three to two centered on the gable, 1st-floor windows changed from “C” to “A” type; West elevation 2nd-floor double set of glass doors on the subordinate mass centered in that subordinate mass, the 1st-floor door centered appropriately, and the 2nd-floor porch to be pulled back one foot on each end and supported on posts rather than brackets; and the building sited no further toward the road than the existing house. (Williams)				
Vote	3-0 (Barham, Norton abstained)		Certificate #	53916	
	1:20				

10.	Muller, Cliff	140 Polpis Road	Addition, roofwalk	44-9	V. Oliver
Sitting	Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	Val Oliver, Cliff and Courtney Muller				
Concerns	Previous concerns read. The change to two gables is a dramatic change to the house. Although it is not an old house, the long roof in this rural setting feels appropriate. The combination of the porch and double-gables is an aggressive presence on the road. The front door is off-center, there is a door on the second floor where there would typically be a post. Although there are historic overtones to the redesign it does not feel appropriate to this house. The roofwalk looks better in this house configuration. The West elevation the 6/6 windows of the original house should be retained. The roofwalk is still inappropriate. The double gables are a cause for concern. Feels like an awkward hybrid that is stretching to be something else.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #		
	1:36				

11.	Merson, John	71 Baxter Road – SAB	Move on-site, renovate	49-26.1	J. Merson
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Wagley				
Representing	John Merson				
Concerns	Previous concerns read. The proposed elevations of the chimney are drawn incorrectly – it has three steps rather than two. The applicant has addressed many of the boards concerns. The retaining walls should be made of Roman brick or gauged shale stone (Connecticut White Line). South elevation second-floor windows are a concern, as is the chaotic fenestration on that SW corner. The South elevation casements should be larger and could be a half-sash of one of the larger adjacent windows.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)				
Vote	5-0		Certificate #		
	2:04				

Break at 7:10pm; Wagley departs.

Return at 7:17pm.

12. Savel Nominee Trust	47 Pocomo Road	Pool	15-19	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Ray Pohl			
Concerns	Previous concerns read. No concerns due to lack of visibility.			
Motion	Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility. (Norton)			
Vote	4-1 (Barham)		Certificate #	53917

Williams departs 7:21pm.

Williams returns 7:24pm.

13. Sanibel Nominee Trust	14 North Water Street – HSAB	Renovation & addition	42.4.2-83	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Ray Pohl			
Concerns	Previous concerns read. The skylight should be wooden. A sitting room in this location is problematic, and damages the integrity of the house as does the proposed porch. A glass box added to that corner of North Water and Step Lane is inappropriate. The three-foot bump-out that eliminates the corner post is inappropriate. The re-use of the bracelet windows in the SW elevation does not work well as drawn and would look better on the NW elevation. This could be read as a sunroom, but in that case would not have a chimney. The floor plan shows a large amount of exterior wall demolition to create the bumpout and two corners of the house are being removed. The interior of the house will be visible through the sunroom at night; French doors opening into the sunroom might work.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	
	2:25			

14. 51 Baxter Road LLC	51 Baxter Road – SAB	New dwelling	49-16	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Ray Pohl			
Concerns	Previous concerns read. Appreciate the changes made by the applicant. The balcony on the East elevation is scaled at 2'6" and should be 3 feet (there is a step down that makes the height correct). The proportion on the balcony looks better short given that the building is so small. The shed dormers should be brought down from the ridge.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through Staff with dormers on the East elevation lowered approximately 6". (Williams) Motion to send a letter to the ZBA supporting the applicant's plan for the building to be in the front setback due to the historic layout of Baxter Road. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0; 5-0		Certificate #	53918

Williams departs 7:17pm.

15. Hofford, Gregg	6 Milestone Crossing	Revisions	68-461	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns	Previous concerns read. The "addition" has higher eave heights than the main mass of the house. The windows in East dormer could be reduced to a half-sash and the dormer eliminated.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through Staff with the West elevation the two-window dormer on the right side reduced to a one-window dormer centered on that mass; the East elevation dormer on the left side removed, the eave line run through and two "A"-sized windows to be tucked under the eave. (Add to COA.) (Norton)			
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	53919

16. Harman/Willauer	137 Hummock Pond Road	New dwelling	65-72	B. Meerbergen
Sitting	Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen, Natasha Harman			
Concerns	Previous concerns read. The building will be visible. The cupola is not appropriate here. Too many windows to be a barn, so it should be shingled. The front door should be a standard 6-panel door. Cottage corners are being used due the proposed siding materials. Masonry chimney doesn't fit on a barn-like structure such as this. The dormers are too large and too long; smaller windows and dormers would be more appropriate to this kind of structure. The chimney and the cupola are too close together – the chimney would look better on the end of one of the gables.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
3:01				
17. Harman/Willauer	137 Hummock Pond Road	New cottage	65-72	B. Meerbergen
Sitting	Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen, Natasha Harman			
Concerns	Previous concerns read.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for the main house. (Barham)			
Vote	4-0	Certificate #		
18. Harman/Willauer	137 Hummock Pond Road	New cabana	65-72	B. Meerbergen
Sitting	Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen, Natasha Harman			
Concerns	Previous concerns read.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for the main house. (Barham)			
Vote	4-0	Certificate #		
19. Grillo, Heather	169 Polpis Road	Addition	44-18	Chip Webster
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Ethan, Chip Webster			
Concerns	Revised set of plans is missing.			
Motion	Motion to Hold until the beginning of the next meeting. (Norton) (Call for plans.)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
20. Briggs, Jason	97 Low Beach Road – SAB	New dwelling	75-31.2	Chip Webster
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Ethan, Chip Webster			
Concerns	Previous concerns read. No concerns with the proposed changes. The dormers on the West elevation should be adjusted to be in line with the meeting rails. Does not look like traditional Nantucket vernacular – the curved railing on the East elevation, for example.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through Staff with square-shingle option for balcony and meeting rails to align with the eaves on the West-side dormers. (Coombs)			
Vote	4-1 (Barham opposed)	Certificate #	53920	
3:12				
21. MacLeod, Judith	56 Orange Street – HSAB	Addition	55.4.1-80	Lyman Perry
Sitting	Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Scott Hutton			
Concerns	Previous concerns read. Would like to see more of the original doors and windows preserved. The East elevation French doors looked better in the previous iteration. It would be preferable to keep the East elevation corner windows given that that is a traditional rear ell treatment.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through Staff with the reuse of original doors where possible and TDL doors for all replacements. (Norton)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #	53921	

22. MacLeod, Judith	56 Orange Street – HSAB	Garage	55.4.1-80	Lyman Perry
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Scott Hutton			
Concerns	Too many ganged elements (for example, in the dormer on the street side). Moving and incorporating the existing structure would be preferable. The secondary garage dwelling should not highlight the design details of the main house (bullnose casing) – it should be simpler. The 11/12 pitch does not coordinate well with the main building. The proposed new dwelling is a fine design, but not for this location. At least echoing the existing vernacular would be preferable.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0			Certificate #

23. MacLeod, Judith	56 Orange Street – HSAB	Demo existing garage	55.4.1-80	Lyman Perry
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Scott Hutton			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Hold for the garage. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0			Certificate #

III.HDC BUSINESS	
Review Minutes -	June 23
Approve Minutes -	June 16 – APPROVED
60 Day Denials -	<i>Fitzgerald, 23 Tashama, renovations – DENIED</i>
Other Business -	Belichick, 7 Pitman Road, windows: there is no door/window schedule provided in the original application. The homeowner needs to apply for an AS-BUILT revision for the unapproved window type. 1 Twin Street handout
Commission Comments	

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board
SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board
TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board
MAB – Madaket Advisory Board



An early lithograph of John McLaughlin celebrating the Fourth.

HAVE A GLORIOUS FOURTH OF JULY