



Proposed Minutes for September 29, 2009
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

37 Washington Street
 Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
 Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Valerie Norton (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Linda Williams, David Barham
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

September 29, 2009 – OLD BUSINESS
 Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order at 5:06 p.m. Staff in attendance: J. Grieder & T. Norton

I. CONSENT	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M& P	AGENT
1. Kennedy, Victoria – 54180	36C Sesachacha Rd	Chang deck wall to rail	21-76.2	BPC
2. Langer, Stephen – 54181	15 Trotts Hills Rd	Shed	40-5	Structures Unltd
3. Graham, Kathryn – 54182	11 Priscilla Lane	Patio	41-351	S. Chambers
4. Weissman, Ronald – 54183	9 Deer Run Road	Garage	57-19	J. McGrath
5. 4 Meadow View RET – 54184	4 Meadow View Drive	Rebuild chimney	56-149	E. Trifero
6. Farrell, Francis – 54185	4 Westmoor Lane	Roof, window revisions	41-12	Self
7. Bendiksen, Carolyn – 54186	9 Grey Avenue	Replace windows, front door	67-323	K. Reinemo
8. Smith, Don – 54187	47 Tom Nevers Road	New foundation/addition	76-64	L. Thornewill
9. Fitzgerald, Susan – 54188	23 Tashama Lane	Add window	55-464	J. Bradley
10. Celli, Lynne – 54189	270 Madaket Road – MAB	Remove deck, door	59.4-322	J. Bradley
11. Kelly, Shelley – 54190	8 Starbuck Road - MAB	Garage	59.3-63	Structures Unltd
12. Gemis, Paul – 54191	12 Long Pond Drive – MAB	Material change: roof to wood	59-23	V. Oliver
13. Rowen, Howard – 54192	49 Cliff Road – HSAB	Basement light well	30-61	BPC
14. Pickard, Lee & Lynne – 54193	7B Grove Lane – HSAB	Shed	41-542	Structures Unltd
15. Rosa Rugosa R.T. – 54194	5 Cliff Road – HSAB	Original hardscaping plan	42.4.4-60	Jardins Int'l.
16. Maury, Larry – 54195	10 Candlehouse Ln - HSAB	Color change: door	55.4.4-106	Self
17. Schneider, Tom – 54196	12 Pleasant Street – HSAB	Rev: COA #51696	42.3.3-74	CWA
18. Reinig, James - 54197	15 Milk Street - HSAB	Rev: COA #53793	42.3.3-85	L. Thornewill

Sitting Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs

Alternates

Representing

Concerns

Motion Motion to **Approve**. (Williams

Vote 3-0, McLaughlin abstain

Certificate # 54180 to 54197

Barham arrived 5:06 p.m.

II. OLD BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
------------------	---------	---------------	-----	-------

1. Kaplan, Mark 8 Bishop's Rise New dwelling 40-41 BPC

Sitting Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham

Alternates Coombs, Wagley

Representing

Concerns

Motion Held at applicant's request

Vote Certificate #

2. Kaplan, Mark 8 Bishop's Rise Pool 40-41 BPC

Sitting Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham

Alternates Coombs

Representing

Concerns

Motion Held at applicant's request

Vote Certificate #

Proposed Minutes for September 29, 2009

3. Mt. Vernon Company 15 North Beach Street Bldg 1 Roof material change 42.4.1-68 S. McCarthy
 Sitting Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing Susan McCarthy
 Concerns (5:07) Barham – looked better with wood, and is in prominent location. Coombs – agree with Barham. Norton – can’t force them to maintain wood shingles. Want to focus on color and architectural.
 Motion Motion to **Approve**. (Williams)
 Vote 3-2, Norton & Barham **Certificate # 54198**
4. Mt. Vernon Company 15 North Beach Street Bldg 2 AS-BUILT: roof material chg 42.4.1-68 S. McCarthy
 Sitting Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing Susan McCarthy
 Concerns
 Motion Motion to **Approve**. (Williams)
 Vote 3-2, Norton & Barham **Certificate # 54199**
5. Mt. Vernon Company 15 North Beach Street Bldg 3 AS-BUILT: roof material chg 42.4.1-68 S. McCarthy
 Sitting Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing Susan McCarthy
 Concerns
 Motion Motion to **Approve**. (Williams)
 Vote 3-2, Norton & Barham **Certificate # 54200**
6. Pawguket Realty Trust 4 Pawguket Lane New dwelling – renew COA 30-52 M. Rowland
 Sitting Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing
 Concerns (5:12) Norton – if building were moved back, it would not block view of “bug lights.”
 Motion Motion to Hold for representation. (Barham)
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate #**
Wagley arrived 5:12 p.m.
7. Frost, Eric 80 Madaket Road Window, fence change 57-5 M. Rowland
 Sitting Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley
 Alternates Coombs
 Representing
 Concerns (5:15)
 Motion Motion to **Approve** due to lack of visibility. (Williams)
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate # 54201**
8. Murray, Mary 21 Brewster Road New dwelling 54-296 V. Oliver
 Sitting Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates Wagley
 Representing Mike Forth,
 Mary Murray – presented a computer picture a 150-old house (not on Nantucket) that she loves and is trying to emulate.
 Val Oliver – put in a plan that brings the size down and reduces height.
 Concerns (5:16) McLaughlin – no comments. Barham –the roofwalk skirt should go. Front elevation, discussed with applicant the possibility of removing the inside dormers off the gambrel roofs. Front door needs more formal trim. Half-moon windows look large on this house. Rear elevation, central dormer does not work. Williams – agrees with Barham. Front elevation gable over 2nd floor door doesn’t look good. Top of chimney overworked. Coombs – West elevation, which is visible from Brewster, ganged window in dormer should be separated.
 Motion Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate #**

Proposed Minutes for September 29, 2009

9.	Keating, Barbara	46 Starbuck Road – MAB	New dwelling	50-31	V. Oliver
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley				
Alternates	Coombs				
Representing	Val Oliver				
Concerns	(5:29) MAB comments read. McLaughlin – agree with MAB comments. Rake boards should be 8 inch. Barham – 8 pitch unattractive on this design in that neighborhood. Lack of vertical alignment of windows. 4-light windows in gables. Outdoor shower under porch roof and in line with front of house as a continuation of the front wall. North elevation ganged 4-light windows should be a single that match windows. Chimney should be a proper interior chimney, and the 6 inches between it and the gable forward looks awkward and will prove ungainly for reshingling. Williams – Sidelights and glass in front door should be one or the other. Wagley – agree with Barham. On front elevation, have 15 light doors and 9 light doors and 2/1 windows create chaotic pane sizes. Norton – West elevation right window could be moved farther right.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions				
Vote	5-0				Certificate #
10.	Patterson, Kelley	70 Union Street – HSAB	Second floor deck	55.1.4-94/69	V. Oliver
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Wagley				
Representing	Val Oliver				
Concerns	(5:42) Prior concerns read. Williams – no concerns. McLaughlin – lack of visibility. Coombs - no concerns. Barham – some visibility of 2 nd floor.				
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Williams)				
Vote	4-1, Barham				Certificate # 54202
11.	Lombardi, Mark	10 Madaket Road (Chase Barn)	Rev. COA	41-595	BPC
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Norton recused				
Representing	Mark Lombardi – doing our best to keep it a barn. Want a tree screen between building and road. Want the deck to get up over the privet.				
Concerns	Mark Cutone – Most changes are on North. Reduced the decks. Added barn doors. (5:45) Prior concerns read. Barham – looks less and less like a barn particularly side the faces Madaket Road. South elevation, preferred submission of 9/4 and thought it was approvable. Gable and sidelights at front door in present submission don't work. East elevation chimney applied to outside wall, should be inside main body. West elevation no problems but prefer 9/4. North elevation want to see Madaket Road side look like a barn, rows of French doors and 2 nd -story decks don't fit that vernacular. Coombs – agree with Barham McLaughlin – agree with Barham. East elevation chimney should be brick. Williams – also agrees. Agree with Barham. Preferred the 1/23/07 design for the North elevation. Reduce West elevation 2 nd floor deck.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)				
Vote	4-0				Certificate #
12.	Silverman, Eric	2 Ishmael Drive	Addition	82-93	BPC
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley				
Alternates	Coombs				
Representing	Doug Mills				
Concerns	(6:11) Williams – West elevation, too many ganged windows. McLaughlin – no comments, couldn't find it. Barham – West elevation windows should be aligned with dormer windows. Wagley – over fenestrated.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)				
Vote	5-0				Certificate #

Proposed Minutes for September 29, 2009

13. Silverman, Eric	2 Ishmael Drive	Garage/studio	82-93	BPC
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Doug Mills			
Concerns	(6:17) Williams – this is a studio not a garage, it has no driveway, has no parking space, and taller than main house. Also, too many ganged windows, gables, decks. Barham – agrees with Williams. Roof line too complicated for a small building. McLaughlin – no comments. Wagley – agrees with Williams. Makes original dwelling look like a secondary. Norton – no relation between the two buildings.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
14. Turner, Louise	6 Martin's Lane – HSAB	Fence	42.3.2-198	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Luke Thornewill – measured existing fence at 5 feet 8 inches.			
Concerns	(6:22) Prior concerns read. Williams – would have to be a 1-over-5 with lattice, no more than 6 feet. Picket must be Type II capped. McLaughlin 5-foot in back exists and other is only 4 feet. Barham & Coombs agree with Williams.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with privacy fence as board and lattice not to exceed 6 feet and picket to be Type II capped. ((Ensure no driveway on sight plan.))			
Vote	5-0	Certificate # 54203		
15. Goldberg, Ken	156 Orange Street	New dwelling/garage	55-61	Emeritus
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Matt McEachern – 3-car garage with apartment. Details match main dwelling. Located 143 feet from road. Ridge will be visible from Orange Street, but visibility is minimal. Want to build up slope to be more level. This is a unique building so there is no precedence for it. If we go lower on the ridge height, it won't work.			
Concerns	(6:27) Barham – from front right to rear left has a 5 to 6 foot grade difference, but drawn as if level. Either needs to apply for grade change or drawings must reflect slope. Would like a 3-D of cut between dormers on Northeast elevation. Williams – need a correct GIS and correct topo map. Too many ganged windows, flush dormers, too high, no additive massing, two competing masses, garage going into living space on first floor, boot strapping off garage-apartment to get 26 feet over residential section. Pitch markers missing off drawing. Coombs – garage looks like it is part of a house not an apartment on a garage. McLaughlin – Southeast will be visible. Meeting rails don't align. Flush dormers are a no go. Norton – agree with Williams. Have some major changes to make.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
16. Hamill, Jennie & Mike	9 Gay Street – HSAB	Renovation/addition	42.4.3-34	Emeritus
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns	(6:43) HSAB comments read. William – East and West elevation cross gables at the rear. Ganged windows don't look like a glassed in porch at the rear. East elevation single French with kick panel. West elevation pull back dormer from extending into original section. Roofwalk does not belong on this house. Barham – Drafting error on Fascia East elevation 2 nd floor windows. Notch the windows not the frieze. South elevation ¼ round windows, should match profiles of old windows. Would like to see shutters restored. McLaughlin – no roofwalk. Wagley – drawing shows a basement window that is not there. Roofwalk would make this house look too huge in the neighborhood. Agree with Barham about shutters.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		

Proposed Minutes for September 29, 2009

17. Kevin Curran Trust	90 Tom Nevers Road	Addition	91-41.1	E. McMorrow
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Ethan McMorrow			
Concerns	(7:04) McLaughlin – if round windows hadn’t been left in, there would be no telling where original building was. Coombs – Roofwalk looks like a “second thought.” North elevation will be visible upon approach and is an improvement. Proposed is a much more interesting design. Williams – White trim on a house this size and door stained mahogany. Application needs to be corrected. No roofwalk. West elevation gable dormers are too formal, eight-foot doors on the 2 nd floor. North elevation front door has no relation to rest of house, must be either solid with sidelights or have windows, not both. Would like to see a roof plan, roof should be more simple. Lacks additive massing. Barham – agrees with Williams. Porch over front door combo of baluster and shingle, while around corner is shingle, should all be shingle. Flares don’t wrap around well. Could reduce size by reducing interior floor plan.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0	Certificate #		
18. Ambrecht, Ken	28 Jefferson Avenue – HSAB	Demo existing dwelling	30-134	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Held at applicant’s request			
Vote		Certificate #		
19. Ambrecht, Ken	28 Jefferson Avenue	New dwelling	30-134	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Held at applicant’s request			
Vote		Certificate #		
Break 7:25 to 7:34 p.m.				
20. Dinozzi, Robert	122 Tom Nevers Road	Fence	91-43.1	V. Wilson
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Tori Wilson – 53 inch maximum height, 3-rail split rail with wire black coated vinyl. Pool fence already exists to protect pool.			
Concerns	(7:34) McLaughlin - should be standard 2-rail split rail. Barham – 4 ½ feet fence does not look like standard split rail. Norton would rather see it as a two rail.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with a 2-rail split rail standard height with black vinyl fencing. (Williams)			
Vote	5-4	Certificate # 54204		
21. Brooks, James	10 Friendship Lane	Add dormer	66-268	V. Oliver
Sitting	McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Val Oliver			
Concerns	(7:39) Prior concerns read. Coombs – It is a hard house to see. 1-over-1 windows don’t go with house. Dormer won’t be visible. Wagley – Agree with windows. Barham – agrees about windows and 1 st floor windows should align with those above. Should have shutters on the front.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)			
Vote	4-0	Certificate #		
22. Compitello, Michael	25 Bank Street – SAB	Balcony	73.1.3-51	V. Oliver
Sitting	Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Val Oliver			
Concerns	(7:45)			
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Coombs)			
Vote	2-1, Barham	Certificate # 54205		

Proposed Minutes for September 29, 2009

23. Waine, Mary Anne 11 Bishop's Rise Addition 40-31.1 V. Oliver
 Sitting Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley
 Alternates Coombs
 Representing Val Oliver
 Dale Waine
 Concerns (7:47) Barham – North elevation 2nd story porch, 13X6, with white railing draws attention, should be natural and pulled back off the face of the house, and one door and window would justify length. Wagley – Agree with Barham.
 Motion Motion to **Approve** through staff with 2nd floor porch balusters as natural. (Williams)
 Vote 4-1 **Certificate # 54206**

24. Mucci, Richard 33/35 Woodbury Lane – HSAB New dwelling 41-276 BPC
 Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs, Wagley
 Alternates
 Representing Doug Mills – changes made to North and West elevation
 Concerns (7:54) Prior concerns read.
 Motion Motion to **Approve**. (Coombs)
 Vote 4-0 **Certificate # 54207**

25. Mucci, Richard 33/35 Woodbury Lane – HSAB New garage 41-276 BPC
 Sitting Williams, Barham, Coombs, Wagley
 Alternates
 Representing Doug Mills
 Concerns (7:57) Prior concerns read. Barham – doesn't relate to main house. A lot of roof on a little structure and main roof has least area. South elevation remove pent roof over garage doors and has no reflection in the main house. East and West elevation shed dormers overwhelm main roof and is not in keeping with main house especially the West elevation dormer, which faces the corner. Coombs & Wagley – agree with Barham. Williams – over fenestrated for a small house. No concern about pent roof.
 Motion Motion to Hold for revisions. (Barham)
 Vote 4-0 **Certificate #**

26. Lampe, John 7 Old North Wharf – HSAB Window & deck 42.3.1-82 J. Lampe
 Sitting Norton, Williams, Barham, Coombs, Wagley
 Alternates
 Representing
 Concerns (8:05) Barham - Plan A matches other side except that windows are crammed into the corners. Brackets in proposed are not at corner but 8 or 10 inches inside edge of balcony. Staff – door schedule says “insulated glass”; must be single pane.
 Motion Motion to Hold for revisions per Exhibit A. (Williams)
 Vote 5-0 **Certificate #**

27. Shockey, Don 27 Morey Lane – SAB Garage/apartment 73.3.2-2/39 JG Thorsen
 Sitting Norton, Williams, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing J. Gwynne Thorsen
 Concerns (8:10) Prior concerns read. Barham – would like to match main house chimney cap.
 Motion Motion to **Approve** through staff with chimney details to match main house, and pane patterns to match main house. (Williams)
 Vote 4-0 **Certificate # 54208**

28. Eaton, Chris 3 Jennifer Lane New dwelling 49.3.2-4.1 Emeritus
 Sitting Norton, Barham, Coombs, Wagley
 Alternates
 Representing Matt McEachern – South elevation recessed A/C units and can be recessed further.
 Concerns (8:13) Prior concerns read. Barham - no concerns. Coombs – well designed but large. Wagley – doesn't agree ref the size, it is out of proportion. Norton – A/C handlers should be shifted to the rear. Design works.
 Motion Motion to **Approve** through staff with air handlers relocated
 Vote 3-1, Wagley **Certificate # 54209**

Proposed Minutes for September 29, 2009

29. O'Connell, Don & Eileen	37 Massachusetts Ave – MAB	New dwelling	60.3.1-1	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Norton, Williams, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Luke Thornewill – total redesign. Don & Eileen O'Connell			
Concerns	(8:19) MAB comments read. Williams – no concerns. 2-over-2 keeps the pane sizes even. Barham – form and massing feel appropriate for the neighborhood. 2-over-2 windows are Victorian and perhaps 4-over-4 would be better. Coombs – no concerns. Wagley – agree with Barham ref windows. Norton - likes 2-over-2.			
Motion	Motion to Approve . (Williams)			
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	54210
30. O'Connell, Don & Eileen	37 Massachusetts Ave – MAB	Move off	60.3.1-1	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Norton, Williams, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Luke Thornewill Don & Eileen O'Connell			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve as move off or demo. (Williams)			
Vote	5-0		Certificate #	54211
31. Sanibel Nominee Trust	14 North Water Street – HSAB	Main house	42.4.2-83	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Held at applicant's request			
Vote			Certificate #	
32. Sanibel Nominee Trust	14 North Water Street – HSAB	Carriage house	42.4.2-83	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Held at applicant's request			
Vote			Certificate #	
33. Sanibel Nominee Trust	14 North Water Street – HSAB	Demo	42.4.2-83	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Held at applicant's request			
Vote			Certificate #	
34. Charbonneau, Mary	10 Curlew Court	Garage	68-522	L. Thornewill
Sitting	McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Luke Thornewill – simulated carriage house doors on garage			
Concerns	(8:25) Prior concerns read. Coombs – no concerns. Wagley – no concerns. McLaughlin – doors should be overhead doors. Barham – this is representative of a carriage house, not a garage attached to a house. Don't normally go with non-working applied hinges. Prefer a more carriage house door. Light block next to door should be natural.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with West elevation false hinges and handles removed from carriage house style doors and North elevation light block at natural.			
Vote	4-0		Certificate #	54212

35. Island Construction Co 3 Highland Avenue New dwelling 30-154 V. Oliver
 Sitting Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley
 Representing
 Concerns
 Motion Held for applicant to resubmit.
 Vote **Certificate #**

III.HDC BUSINESS	
Review Minutes -	Sept. 15 and Sept. 22
Approve Minutes -	Sept. 8 adopted by unanimous consent
60 Day Denials -	
Other Business -	125 Orange Street (Piccarillo) curbing update – application submitted Milestone Road road-work signs – staff update TTRAG handout – South Church JLC handout – house diagnoses. 16 Madaket Road – Greg Phillips was under impression that if he had a building permit for the 2 nd dwelling, he could get a sign off on the main house and pool. Is in real financial stress and is asking for a sign off. Approval required the 2 nd dwelling be constructed for the pool to be approved. Barham - have had discussions tonight about pools on Madaket Road and the required screening. The house and yard have been well landscaped which tells me someone made the choice last spring not to put in the foundation for that second foundation. Coming back now is not proper and put HDC and self into a corner. Phillips has a building permit for the 2 nd dwelling. Williams – “I am not going to be responsible for getting someone in this situation.” Barham – the applicant is adult enough to accept responsibility for his decisions. Now he should come up with another type of screening that would be appropriate for the interim. Staff – M. Voigt can not sign off until he has an application in place that allows him to sign off. McLaughlin – file an application for screening of the pool (evergreens) by Friday Oct. 9 to be put onto the Oct. 20 agenda.
Commission Comments	

Adjourned: 8:56 p.m.

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board

TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board