



**Proposed Minutes for November 24, 2009**  
**HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION**

37 Washington Street  
 Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554  
 Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572  
[www.nantucket-ma.gov](http://www.nantucket-ma.gov)

**Commissioners:** Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Valerie Norton (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Linda Williams, David Barham  
**Associate Commissioners:** Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

**November 24, 2009 – OLD BUSINESS**  
 Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order at 5:00 p.m. Staff in attendance M. Voigt & T. Norton

<b>I. CONSENT</b>	<b>ADDRESS</b>	<b>PROPOSED WORK</b>	<b>MAP-PARCEL</b>	<b>AGENT</b>
1. Schonbek, Andrew – 54443	1 Little Neck Way – MAB	Remove porch roof	38-19.1	M.Rowland
2. Hayford, Susan – 54444	41 Madaket Road	Replace/change doors	41-413	J. Hayford
3. Remain 54LLC – 54445	50 Main Street – HSAB	Door sign 6”X6” 2 <sup>nd</sup> floor	42.3.1-192	M. Philbrick
4. Nesbitt Inn LLC/Kolb	67 Union Street – HSAB	Move shed on site	55.1.4-93	B. Meerbergen
5. Parsons, Timothy – 54446	80 Old South Road	8 SF addition 1 <sup>st</sup> floor	68-411	T. Parsons
6. Boeckman, Phillip – 54447	6 Underhill Lane – SAB	Steps	73.3.2-58.2	M. Rowland
7. Romano – 54448	171 Polpis Road	Add/move windows	45-1.3	M.W.Inc
8. Levin, Mindy – 54449	10 Folger Avenue	Color change	80-162	C. Gallant
9. Jacoby, Jake – 54450	3 Tautemo Way	Replace windows	83-22	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley//Norton recused			
Representing				
Concerns	Item 4 to be held to track with the garage, item 16 on Old Business.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve</b> (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried/ McLaughlin abstain		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>54443 to 54450</b>

<b>II. OLD BUSINESS</b>	<b>ADDRESS</b>	<b>PROPOSED WORK</b>	<b>MAP-PARCEL</b>	<b>AGENT</b>
1. Eighth Ave South LLC	33 Hooper Farm Road	Dormers	67-23	NAG
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Steve Theroux			
Concerns	(5:07) No concerns			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff per Exhibit A.</b> (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>54451</b>

2. Nowak, Barbara	5A West Sankaty Road – SAB	New dwelling	73.4.2-27.1	Norton P. Trust
Sitting	Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates	Norton Recused			
Representing	<b>Rick Norton</b> – only two houses with gables forward in the neighborhood. Dormer dying into roof, have had two approved without concerns only recently. Multiple fenestrations in ‘Sconset are typical. Trying to show multi-generational build up. Willing to move 8 feet from right set-back.			
Concerns	(5:10) SAB comments read. <b>Barham</b> – West elevation dormer not consistent with most neighboring houses and looks more like a side rather than front elevation. North elevation variety of roofs and window types. South elevation four windows under shed dormer over descending staircase; should scale back to three windows and end before gable roof. Chimney looks low on ridgeline for neighborhood. Not many Victorian features but chimney does – should be simpler. Houses in neighborhood have projecting eaves. <b>McLaughlin</b> – agree with Barham. South elevation shingle roof instead of angled pergola. <b>Coombs</b> – Agree with Barham ref dormers. Ok about Victorian look. North elevation gable dormer doesn’t look right. <b>Wagley</b> – agrees ref dormers. <b>Williams</b> – share dormer concerns and chimney concerns. Cap not appropriate. East elevation rear eave lower than front eave. Chaotic fenestration. Gable dormer is only one on house, looks out of place. Angled pergolas South elevation should be a roof.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (McLaughlin)			
Conclusion	Carried		<b>Certificate #</b>	

**Proposed Minutes for November 24, 2009**

3. Belcher, Ward                      8 Plover Lane                      New dwelling                      123-57                      M. Rowland  
 Sitting                      Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates                      Coombs, Wagley  
 Representing                      **Ben Normand**  
 Concerns                      (5:31) **Williams** – don’t want to see octagonal or round elements in this location. Too many ganged windows. West elevation port-hole window is a concern. South elevation 4-lite windows. 2<sup>nd</sup> story bay window East elevation. **Norton** – looks too high especially because pitch drives height up. Agree ref bays and angles into sun porch, too many angels on walls. Agree ganged windows. House that exists should be added onto. **McLaughlin** – West elevation octagon/round windows. **Barham** – East elevation dormer. West elevation little gabled dormers look wrong.  
 Motion                      Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)  
 Conclusion                      Carried                      **Certificate #**
4. Belcher, Ward                      8 Plover Lane                      Move off/demo existing                      123-57                      M. Rowland  
 Sitting                      Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates                      Coombs, Wagley  
 Representing                      Ben Normand  
                                  Sara Otay – interested in moving this building  
 Concerns  
 Motion                      Motion to Hold for new dwelling  
 Conclusion                      Carried                      **Certificate #**
5. Lamm, Robert                      16 Winn Street                      Access stair                      56-205                      L. Thornewill  
 Sitting                      Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates                      Coombs, Wagley  
 Representing  
 Concerns                      (5:39) **Williams** –don’t approve bridges over window wells into main entrance North elevation .  
 Motion                      Motion to Hold for revisions eliminating bridge element. (Williams)  
 Conclusion                      Carried                      **Certificate #**
6. Oberling, Gary                      38 Wanoma Way                      Deck addition & door change                      92.4-236                      BPC  
 Sitting                      Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley  
 Alternates                      Coombs  
 Representing                      **Mark Cutone**  
 Concerns                      (5:43) **Barham** – South elevation three not four doors  
 Motion                      **Motion to Approve through staff South elevation three doors 2<sup>nd</sup> floor.** (Williams)  
 Conclusion                      Carried                      **Certificate # 54452**
7. Rushmore, Judith                      27 Walsh Street                      Raise house                      29-80                      V. Oliver  
 Sitting                      Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates                      Coombs, Wagley  
 Representing                      **Val Oliver**  
 Concerns                      (5:46) **Williams** – not appropriate and not necessary. **Norton** – in such cases, HDC generally asks for a FEMA map to verify facts. Do not agree with retaining wall and raising grade. Standard down there is to incorporate into house by use of square lattice and other simple treatments. This is wrong direction for this house. **McLaughlin** – several photos of houses raised in area to show no reason it can not be raised.  
 Motion                      Motion to Hold for revisions and further info for requirement, topographical map, as-built driveway, and all stone work in back yard. (Williams)  
 Conclusion                      Carried                      **Certificate #**

**Proposed Minutes for November 24, 2009**

8.	Lichtenfield Residence	1 Jennifer Lane – SAB	Shower & fence	49.2.3-56	Emeritus
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	<b>Matt McEachern</b>				
Concerns	(5:53) <b>Williams</b> – privet is not going to hide this and wire should be black. Wire running along the road is a problem due to visibility, should be picketed. <b>Coombs</b> – picket along Jennifer. <b>Wagley</b> – agrees. <b>Norton</b> – Arbor on Jennifer Lane and agree ref wire along the road.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff per exhibit A.</b> (Williams)				
Conclusion	Carried			<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>54453</b>
9.	McCready, Richard	239 Hummock Pond Road	Addition to main house	82-41	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing	<b>Matt McEachern</b>				
Concerns	(5:59) <b>Norton</b> – South elevation gable dormer configuration with shed connecting. Presently a simple design and South elevation is over fenestrated and visible. West elevation deck with great large brackets. <b>Barham</b> – agree. Deck set into roof with nothing underneath defies logic West elevation. <b>Williams</b> – North elevation as-built not right and needs to be corrected. Agree ref fenestration South elevation. South elevation dormer overwhelming. Balcony. <b>McLaughlin</b> – no comments. <b>Roggeveen</b> – removing entire South half of roof.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)				
Conclusion	Carried			<b>Certificate #</b>	
10.	McCready, Richard	239 Hummock Pond Road	Addition to studio	82-41	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing	<b>Matt McEachern</b>				
Concerns	(6:06) <b>McLaughlin</b> – East elevation, need a one-foot set back on dormer. <b>Barham</b> – East elevation should not go to the ridge; and asymmetrically opposed to one on other side. <b>Williams</b> – Don't think as-built drawings are correct. Agree East elevation dormer. <b>Norton</b> – agree ref dormers.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)				
Conclusion	Carried			<b>Certificate #</b>	
11.	Bamber, Ronald	28 Washing Pond Road	Addition & windows	31-14	Permits Plus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Coombs				
Alternates					
Representing	<b>Ron Bamber</b> – Going from 40 to 50 feet long. Only old house on Washing Pond Road, built in 1952. Want to add bathrooms to bedrooms on the second floor.				
Concerns	(6:10) <b>McLaughlin</b> – It is visible. <b>Norton</b> – as a 40 foot house it has nice proportions which it loses when it is stretched out. <b>Coombs</b> – Agree with Norton. Addition of dormer windows creates helter-skelter line up. <b>Williams</b> – Extra windows make it more stretched looking. <b>Roggeveen</b> – don't have sufficient information and so can't articulate what's going on. Need better floor plans.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for additional information and detailed floor plans and existing floor plans				
Conclusion	Carried			<b>Certificate #</b>	
12.	Dillard, David	86 Centre Street – HSAB	New garage	42.4.4-25	A. Rezendes
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing	Al Rezendes				
Concerns	(6:24) No concerns				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with clouded drawings.</b> (Williams)				
Conclusion	Carried			<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>54454</b>

**Proposed Minutes for November 24, 2009**

<b>13. Leventhal, Marvin</b>					
	2 North Cambridge St - MAB	New dwelling	59.4-107	C.L. Barnes	
Sitting	Norton, Williams, Barham, Coombs, Wagley				
Alternates					
Representing	<b>Curtis Barnes</b> – reduced dormers & photographed dormers in old Madaket area. Most dormers are shed. <b>Marvin &amp; Alice Leventhal</b>				
Concerns	(6:26) No concerns				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve with removal of roofwalk on existing structure.</b> (Williams_				
Conclusion	Carried	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>54455</b>		
<b>14. Bouque, Chris</b>					
	18 Bartlett Road	New building	67-113.1	Emeritus	
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates					
Representing	<b>Matt McEachern</b> – North elevation mass width was pulled back to maintain scale. West elevation deck/covered porch reduced. Approximately 1800 SF on the ground. <b>Chris Bouque.</b>				
Concerns	(6:28) <b>McLaughlin</b> – 2½ story is too big. <b>Barham</b> – 2 <sup>nd</sup> story porch roof would help building look smaller if open-air deck. Cupola signals that building has commercial purpose, but does not work with South elevation shed dormer. North elevation back-side dormer & gable dormer facing East don't make sense in combination; front and back should match. Nothing special about dormers facing Bartlett Road. <b>Williams</b> – Cupola drives height up and is inappropriate. South elevation dormer should come down off the roof and is a flat-roof element. <b>Coombs</b> – Columns should go away. Too high and massive at nearly 30 feet. Third floor will be very visible. <b>Norton</b> – agree with many comments. 3 <sup>rd</sup> floor is over built; 2 <sup>nd</sup> floor could be better utilized and thus reduce/eliminate 3 <sup>rd</sup> floor.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)				
Conclusion	Carried	<b>Certificate #</b>			
<b>15. Sparrough, Michael</b>					
	68 Miacomet Avenue	Additions & deck	67-356	S. Bowman	
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley				
Alternates	Coombs				
Representing	<b>Scott Bowman</b>				
Concerns	(6:45) <b>McLaughlin</b> – West elevation windows with transom and door of glassed-in porch looks like a store front and not appropriate. <b>Barham</b> – can't find north on the floor plans. No concerns <b>Wagley</b> – no concerns				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve.</b> (Williams)				
Conclusion	Carried	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>54456</b>		
<b>16. Nesbitt Inn LLC/Kolb</b>					
	67 Union Street – HSAB	Garage	55.1.4-93	B. Meerbergen	
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, McLaughlin, Coomb				
Alternates					
Representing	<b>Brook Meerbergen</b> – Zoning Board of Appeals denied encroachment into set back. Resited to Union Street side and turned so eave line is perpendicular to Union St. There are examples of utility type buildings close to Union Street.				
Concerns	(6:54) <b>Williams</b> – too vertical, too narrow, this lot should not have a garage and now it is forward of house on Union Street. Should be one-story and set back. <b>McLaughlin</b> – three-foot set back on dormers. <b>Coombs</b> – Agree with Williams. Dormers need to go. Needs a front door, should be behind house not in front of a historic house. House needs to retain its presence on Union Street. <b>Roggeveen</b> – Building is nice looking but does not belong on this lot. This is just an excuse to put a building there that is designed as a way to sneak in a secondary dwelling.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)				
Conclusion	Carried	<b>Certificate #</b>			
<b>17. Nesbitt Inn LLC/Kolb</b>					
	67 Union Street – HSAB	Shed move out of set back	55.1.4-93	B. Meerbergen	
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing	Brook Meerbergen				
Concerns					
Motion	Motion to Hold for garage. (Williams)				
Conclusion	Carried	<b>Certificate #</b>			

**Proposed Minutes for November 24, 2009**

18. Kaplan, Mark	8 Bishop's Rise	New dwelling	40-42	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	<b>Joe Paul</b> – all columns square, windows to 6/1, no corner boards, reduced to 2 French doors and flanking windows North elevation, Triple French to <b>double ? elevation</b> . Railing to half shingle/half rail East & West elevation. West elevation double French to single with flanking windows, West elevation double gable to hip and bay.			
	<b>Doug Mills</b> – don't want interior steps.			
Concerns	(7:05) <b>Williams</b> – Columns need to be plain posts; they are drawn as tapered square. <b>Barham</b> – East elevation wall seems to pop up. (Paul - flip-flopped lay out to put this behind trees.) Still feels blocky. New treatment on main mass is improvement, but pitches on gables are shallow. Does not stitch together well. <b>Coombs</b> – Northwest picture window might be visible. <b>Wagley</b> – agree with Barham. Agree that columns should be posts. 16-lite doors with 6-over-1 windows are jarring. <b>Roggeveen</b> – Could be a shingle-style house; it's getting there. Northwest elevation "roundy" 2 <sup>nd</sup> -floor balcony should be squared off.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	<b>Certificate #</b>		
19. Kaplan, Mark	8 Bishop's Rise	Pool	40-42	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Joe Paul Doug Mills			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Hold for house. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	<b>Certificate #</b>		
Break 7:22 to 7:30 p.m.				
20. Hecht, Nikos	15 Baxter Road – SAB	Main house renovation	73.1.4-5	T. Kligerman
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	<b>Tom Kligerman</b> – changed location of fireplace and brought chimney into body of house. Went back to East elevation French doors and left existing double-hung windows flanking. East elevation triple casement & South elevation took lights from top of double hung to match panes on casements.			
Concerns	(7:30) <b>Williams</b> – East elevation 18 light French doors should be shorter and only 15 light so that headers are even with windows. <b>Barham</b> – Doors and window headers should align. Owls on chimneys. (Staff – was owl approved?) <b>McLaughlin</b> - East elevation doors should be 7 feet. <b>Wagley</b> – agree ref doors.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with Exhibit A.</b> (Barham)			
Conclusion	Carried/Wagley opposed	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>54457</b>	
21. Wilson, Jay	24 Brant Point Road	Windows, doors & deck	29-851	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	(7:40) No concerns			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve.</b> (McLaughlin)			
Conclusion	Carried	<b>Certificate #</b>	<b>54458</b>	
22. Griffin, Robert	18 Rabbit Run Road	New dwelling	42-176	Emeritus
Sitting	Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	<b>Matt McEachern</b>			
Concerns	(7:42) <b>McLaughlin</b> – 76 feet long. All meeting rails need to align. <b>Barham</b> – No clear additive massing along North & South elevation. North elevation main ridge block is divided into two with gable dormers either side of main block. Right shed dormer pushes height up. South elevation main high ridge with pasted on gable-forward rural farm house element does not work. <b>Coombs</b> – Agree with Barham. Exterior chimney looks very big with the corbelling all the way down at the bottom; owls should go because they call attention. South elevation main door needs to be more prominent as the main mass. <b>Wagley</b> – agree with what's been said. North & South elevation shed dormers start at the ridge line. <b>Norton</b> – Need a topographical map.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coomb)			
Conclusion	Carried	<b>Certificate #</b>		

**Proposed Minutes for November 24, 2009**

23. Griffin, Robert                      18 Rabbit Run Road                      New garage                      42-176                      Emeritus  
 Sitting                      Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Wagley  
 Alternates  
 Representing                      Matt McEachern  
 Concerns  
 Motion                      Motion to Hold for main house  
 Conclusion                      Carried                      **Certificate #**
24. Griffin, Robert                      18 Rabbit Run Road                      New pool                      42-176                      Emeritus  
 Sitting                      Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Wagley  
 Alternates  
 Representing                      Matt McEachern  
 Concerns  
 Motion                      Motion to Hold for main house  
 Conclusion                      Carried                      **Certificate #**
25. Barbieri, Leonard                      14 Gosnold Road                      New dwelling                      30-83                      Botticelli & Pohl  
 Sitting                      Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley  
 Alternates                      Coombs  
 Representing  
 Concerns                      (7:55)  
 Motion                      Motion to Hold for representation. (Williams)  
 Conclusion                      Carried                      **Certificate #**
26. Barbieri, Leonard                      14 Gosnold Road                      Move/demo                      30-83                      Botticelli & Pohl  
 Sitting                      Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham  
 Alternates                      Coombs, Wagley  
 Representing  
 Concerns  
 Motion                      Motion to Hold for representation. (Williams)  
 Conclusion                      Carried                      **Certificate #**

<b>III.HDC BUSINESS</b>	
Review Minutes -	November 17
Approve Minutes -	November 10 – adopted by unanimous consent
<b>60 Day Denials -</b>	<b><i>NIR/Medeiros, 15 South Beach Street, awning</i> – Motion to Deny carried – 55459</b>
Other Business -	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>Neff, Linda</i>, 1 Dionis Road, large fence – review and discussion. Letter read. <b>Roggeveen</b> – 6 months is not temporary and is a structure that requires approval. Staff is to send letter to property owner.</li> <li>• <i>Preservation easements/restrictions</i>: Seager residence, 15 Pleasant Street – interior easement the owner wants Town of Nantucket to hold via HDC. In office for review. <b>Roggeveen</b> – this commission can hold the easement, which must be agreed upon by BOS first to ensure legitimate. <b>Barham</b> – there might be an inspection requirement that is annual or semi-annual to ensure preservation elements have not been removed. <b>Staff</b> – going to residence to do a review inspection and document elements.</li> </ul>

(Williams depart 8:08 p.m.)

**Proposed Minutes for November 24, 2009**

Wilkes Square	<p><b>Barham</b> – one aspect is developer to be allowed to exceed 30 feet limit. Drawings show a pleasing variety of massing and material. Street scape needs to be addressed and comparison to other areas of downtown.</p> <p><b>Wagley</b> – Need to discuss height limit, there was talk of going up to 40 feet. We want to create language that states there must be modulation of height.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – why do we need lots of brick? People don't come here to have Nantucket look like Providence. This is the entrance people will see to the town which purports old and whaling. The buildings represented are not Nantucket. Town has always complained about lack of public view of harbor, and this plan has a wall of tall houses that block the view. Building should be staggered starting low and none should exceed the height limit.</p> <p><b>Roggeveen</b> – someone will buy this from Natl. Grid. We need to have guidance in place. Height is determined by use, and use is the prevue of Planning.</p> <p><b>Andrew Vorce</b> –Focus in on the blocks and different projects. The blocks will be the outline for future development Block A would need height increase. Block B not asking for height increase. Block C if contains parking garage ok, if contains market asking for higher height due to cultural uses on upper floor. Block D is alternate parking/market location to Block C. Block G has no buildings planned. Block F would need some height relief. Block E does not need height change.</p> <p><b>Norton</b> - that corner (Block E) must be kept down due to low buildings. Blocks looks very regulated except for Block A. Would like to see something less regulated looking.</p>
Commission Comments	Storm doors left open at Surfside Youth Hostel

Adjourned at 9:00 p.m.

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board  
 SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board  
TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board  
 MAB – Madaket Advisory Board

PROPOSED