



Proposed Minutes for December 1, 2009
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
37 Washington Street
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
Telephone: 508.228.7231 Fax: 508.325.7572
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Valerie Norton (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Linda Williams, David Barham
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

December 1, 2009 – NEW BUSINESS
Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order at 5:05 p.m. Staff in attendance: J. Grieder & T. Norton

I. CONSENT	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. Steelman, William – 54460	81 Cliff Road	Deck	30-165	P. Culbertson
2. Hale, Charles – 54461	117 Madaket Road	Door change	40-60.3&59	M. Rowland
3. Berger, Jody – 54462	178 Cliff Road	Rev. COA 54135 – windows	41-64	CWA
4. Maggio, Edward – 54463	24B Sankaty Road - SAB	Deck & steps	49.2.3-19.1	D. Pekarcik
5. Butler, Stephen - 54464	54 Fairgrounds Road	Material change roof	67-299	S. Butler
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried / McLaughlin abstained		Certificate #	54460 to 54464

II. NEW BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. Donovan, Laurie	11 Nanahumacke Lane	Door & window changes	65-84	NAG
Sitting	Roggeveen, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Doug Mills			
Concerns	(5:06)			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	54465
2. Nibi, Theresa	82B Cliff Road	Shed	3-0-279	Structures Ultd
Sitting	Roggeveen, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Williams recused			
Representing	Nancy Drazal			
Concerns	(5:08)			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Coombs)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	54466
Norton arrived 5:09 p.m.				
3. Englert, Jack	45B Vestal Street Ext	Pool, fence, gate & paving	41-591	M. Lombardi
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Mark Lombardi – lots are under 99 year leases.			
Concerns	(5:12) Williams – Pools on every lot take away the rural nature of the area. Might be visible from Madaket Road. Norton – Should revisit how development was structured. Barham – It appears the pool has been elevated out of the ground. Roggeveen – In the discussion of the neighborhood plan, wanted houses in area to relate and not be chopped up by hedges. Pool is running up against the lot line.			
Motion	Motion to View with development structure/discussions, information about owner and cross section of grading around pool and coping. (McLaughlin)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	

Proposed Minutes for December 1, 2009

4. Burruss, Jim 10 Heller Way New garage/apartment 82-7 M. Rowland
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham
 Alternates Coombs
 Representing **Ben Normand** – tried to mimic style of main house.
 Concerns (5:21) **Barham** – three-foot set back on dormers. Deck gives impression of negative void on first floor and faces road. Would like to view. **Williams** – 11X12 deck. Not in favor with present siting, would like set back on property. Eave height makes structure very vertical. Would like stairs under the deck. **Norton** – wants to view.
 Motion **Motion to View.** (Barham)
 Conclusion Carried **Certificate #**
5. Einstein, Bill 76 Cliff Road Rev. COA 54090 – arbor & door 30-70 M. Rowland
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham
 Alternates Coombs
 Representing Ben Normand -
 Concerns (5:28) **Williams** – shouldn't be bracketed. **Norton** – agree should have posts. **Barham** – agree. **McLaughlin** – no comments
 Motion **Motion to Approve through staff with 6x6 posts and natural to weather.** (Williams)
 Conclusion Carried **Certificate # 54667**
6. Robert Ian Realty Trust 3 Cherry Street – HSAB Demolition cottage 55-376 Kyberg&Wilson
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham
 Alternates Coombs
 Representing
 Concerns (5:32)
 Motion **Motion to View with photos of main house.** (Norton)
 Conclusion Carried **Certificate #**
7. Robert Ian Realty Trust 3 Cherry Street – HSAB New secondary dwelling 55-376 Kyberg&Wilson
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham
 Alternates Coombs
 Representing
 Concerns
 Motion **Motion to View with photos of main house.** (Norton)
 Conclusion Carried **Certificate #**
8. T.O.N. N.P.S. 48 Sparks Avenue Wind turbine 55-242 Permits Plus
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham
 Alternates Coombs
 Representing **Mark Poor** – 8 foot diameter tower. Blades 30 feet. Same turbine as at Country Gardens in Hyannis.
David Fredericks – Three-blade device, proven technology, right size, designed to be quiet and easy to maintain. Sited so as not to be in the way of any sports, 120% of height away from structures. Have had permits signed off by FAA. About 65 feet shorter than one at Bartlett's Farm. Designed to fall into itself first. Another possible location was at end of football field, but that caused flicker effect across football field that could affect players.
Liz Argo – Hub to tip of blade is 150 feet. Tower meets the ground. Column inside tower goes into ground. Tapers from 8 feet to about 5½ feet. Brakes kick in at 65 MPH, designed to withstand Hurricane level 4.
Emma Young – to address concerns of proximity to the historic cemetery, a wind turbine could be an icon of change; it shows the island is capable of blending old with new.
Barbara Gookin - This windmill will be near the tall field lights, which are also within sight of the historic cemetery.
 Concerns (5:34) **Norton** – Should be a darker shade. Seems like a lot of work has been accomplished before coming to the HDC which should have been the first stop. **Barham** – share color concern. Corporate logo becomes 5-foot wide sign. Present location is very visible. **McLaughlin** – Share visual concerns. Would like to see it shorter. **Williams** – visibility is not a concern. **Roggeveen** – Modern school design and wind turbine fits in with area architecture. However is very close to a historic cemetery. Closer to the elementary school would mitigate visibility from cemetery. Would like to see specific reference to Town of Nantucket on wind turbine fall zone. HDC is statutorily charged with protecting the historical integrity of the island.
 Motion **Motion to View with Map amended to show actual fall zone, locate electrical building and 450 foot buffer, Town Code ref WECS fall zone and height, actual town property line, alternate paint colors.**
 Conclusion Carried **Certificate #**

Proposed Minutes for December 1, 2009

9.	Shockey, Donald	79 Morey Lane – SAB	Window changes	73.3.2-2/39	J.G. Thorsen
	Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
	Alternates	Coombs			
	Representing	Chris Lewis			
	Concerns	(6:22)			
	Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
	Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54468	
10.	Bailliere, Thomas	224 Polpis Road	Pool and fence	26-22.3	J.G. Thorsen
	Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
	Alternates	Coombs			
	Representing	Chris Lewis			
	Concerns	(6:26) Williams – use of privet. Norton – far from road and not visible. Roggeveen – painted arbor.			
	Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with complete fence and arbor natural to weather. (Williams)			
	Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54469	
11.	Island Construction Co.	3 Highland Avenue	Rev. COA 54434	30-154	V. Oliver
	Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
	Alternates	Coombs			
	Representing	Val Oliver			
	Concerns	(6:31) Williams – South elevation forward window well is too close to front of building and visible from the street. East elevation removal of window leaves too much wall space. McLaughlin – Window wells should a small fence around them. Barham – forward well to visible and concerned about resizing of North elevation windows. East elevation would like to see dormer reduced since window is going away. Norton – agree ref dormer. Well should be farther from front of building because it is so large.			
	Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)			
	Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
12.	First Baptist Church	1 Summer Street – HSAB	Roof material change	42.3.3-70	P. Patterson
	Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
	Alternates	Coombs			
	Representing	Philip Patterson			
	Concerns	(6:38) Roggeveen – found reference to a 40-year three-tab shingle possibly manufactured in Canada.			
	Motion	Motion to View. (Norton)			
	Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
13.	Whitney, John	27 Broadway – SAB	Add dormer	73.1.3-91	Chris Holland
	Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
	Alternates	Coombs			
	Representing	Chris Holland			
	Concerns	(6:48) Barham – would like to see simple form and shape be preserved.			
	Motion	Motion to Approve dormer only as drawn. (Williams)			
	Conclusion	Carried // Barham opposed	Certificate #	54470	
14.	Whelden, Larry	95 Old South Road	Extend porch & change door	68-980	Foster
	Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
	Alternates	Coombs			
	Representing				
	Concerns	(6:53) Williams – one of the doors needs to be a distinctive front door. Norton – odd to have identical doors on the same plain. Barham – if steps went away, that would clarify the main door.			
	Motion	Motion to Hold for applicant to decide which door will be the primary 6-panel front door.			
	Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		

15. Hamill, Mike	9 Gay Street – HSAB	Rev. COA 54296 – add dormer	42.4.3-34	Emeritus
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates	Roggeveen recused			
Representing	Matt McEachern – need extra head height due to code.			
Concerns	(6:57) Williams – drawings not showing cut-in elevation. ((Application does not reflect removal of chimney. Corrected at meeting.)) McLaughlin – no comments at this time. Barham – Will be visible from the street and is too much happening on that inside corner. Would have no problem with one on the back side. Coombs - no concerns			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with inset drawing. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried // McLaughlin & Barham opposed		Certificate #	54471
16. Cannon, Kathleen	26 Liberty Street – HSAB	Rev. COA 54402 – add dormer	42.3.4-115	Emeritus
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Matt McEachern -			
Concerns	(7:05) Williams – no concerns. Barham – think visible. Norton – Historic building and last house without new wing. Two dormers remove a large amount of historic fiber, would like to see it reduced to one dormer.			
Motion	Motion to View with existing rafter plan and proposed alternative. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	
Break 7:11 to 7:21p.m. Williams not return				
17. Merullo, Michael	3 Tom Nevers Road	Tennis court & fence	71-2.1	Structures Ultd
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Nancy Drazhal – court will be 2.6 feet below grade.			
Concerns	(7:12) Barham – would like it drawn onto a proper site plan. No description of basketball back board. Norton – not visible. Coombs – not visible.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with proper site plan. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	54472
Williams returned 7:25 p.m.				
18. Diamond, Jennifer	3 Lincoln Avenue	Window changes and areaway	30-140	BPC
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Mark Cutone – Built in 1992, designed by JG Thorsen.			
Concerns	(7:25) Barham – Tischler windows have a heavy frame meant to be affixed into masonry. Norton – want to see a window schedule and manufacturer information on window.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for window schedule. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	
19. McCaire, Mary-Adaire	36 Pine Street – HSAB	Add dormer	55.4.1-8	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing				
Concerns	(7:29) Barham – dormer runs up into chimney.			
Motion	Motion to View with rafter plan and hold for representation. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	
20. Nielson, Carl	23C Rhode Island Ave – MAB	Rev. COA 54333 – Deck/roof	60.3.1-124.2	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing				
Concerns	(7:31) MAB comments read. Roggeveen – there is no precedence for a gable roof porch in Madaket. Norton – as a porch it would be too deep. Barham – cross bucks.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions.			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	

21. Cabre, Jordi	4 West Way - MAB	Solar Collectors	38-133	Jensen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Jordi Cabre			
Concerns	Jensen – horizontal tube panels are not as efficient. Lose efficiency if ground mounted. (7:35) MAB comments read. Norton – looks like windows are covered. Would like to see a large-scale cross section of installation. Barham – not comfortable with the angle and that it hangs over the roof and blocks the window. McLaughlin – should use shorter tubes. Would like to see it on the ground or parallel with roof line.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and more information.			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
22. DeBiasio, Brian	39 Meadow View Drive	Color change – trim	56-133	B. DeBiasio
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing				
Concerns	(7:49)			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54473	
23. Olbres, Jason	24 Almanack Pond Road	Replace windows & doors	25-37	J..Olbres
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing				
Concerns	(7:51)			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54474	
24. S Nantucket LLC	84 North Liberty Street – HSAB	Shed	41-131	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli – behind privet hedge			
Concerns	(7:53)			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with corrected drawings. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54475	
25. Molly Realty LLC	3 Heather Lane	Rev. COA 54172 – windows	30-24.1	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli			
Concerns	(7:57)			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54476	
26. 23 Kimball Avenue RT	1 Windward Lane	New dwelling	30-27	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli			
Concerns	(8:01)			
Motion	Motion to View with two poles. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
27. 23 Kimball Avenue RT	1 Windward Lane	Move off	30-27	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to View			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		

28. 23 Kimball Avenue RT 2 Windward Lane Move on & remove deck 30-26 Botticelli & Pohl
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham
 Alternates Coombs
 Representing Lisa Botticelli Botticelli
 Concerns
 Motion **Motion to View**
 Conclusion Carried **Certificate #**

IV.HDC BUSINESS	
Review Minutes -	Nov. 24
Approve Minutes -	Nov. 17 adopted by unanimous consent
60 Day Denials -	N/A
Other Business -	MHC letter handout ref Milestone Road signs – Signs have been removed Kevin Kuester HSAB Letter of Interest – Adopted by unanimous consent
Commission Comments	Williams - High-gloss paints being used on historic houses. Had something in the paper once warning against use of high-gloss paint; need to do it again and send a letter to MHC too.

Adjourned at 8:15 p.m.

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board

MAB – Madaket Advisory Board TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board