



Proposed Minutes for December 22, 2009

HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

37 Washington Street

Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554

Telephone: 508.228.7231

Fax: 508.325.7572

www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Dirk Roggeveen (Chair), Valerie Norton (Secretary), John McLaughlin, Linda Williams, David Barham
Associate Commissioners: Diane Coombs, John Wagley, Dawn Hill Holdgate **Staff:** Mark Voigt, James Grieder, Terry Norton, Ann Medina

~~ MINUTES ~~

December 22, 2009 – OLD BUSINESS

Cyrus Peirce Middle School Cafeteria – 5:00 pm

Called to order at 5:09 p.m. Staff in attendance: J. Grieder & T. Norton
Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Wagley: Norton issue with item 26 added to the agenda on 12 Dec. 22. (Roggeveen arrived.) This is a high profile case, with great public interest, there is a lack of prior notification. (Barham arrived.) Motion to adopt agenda with item 26 held for the Jan. 5 meeting to allow proper public notification. (Roggeveen explains situation to applicant.)

I. CONSENT	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. Greenhound LLC – 54511	10 Washington St – HSAB	New sign: projecting sign	42.3.1-142	C. Palmieri
2. Freedman, Don – 54512	14 Centre Street – HSAB	New sign: projecting sign	42.3.1-201	D. Freeman
3. Freedman, Don – 54513	14 Centre Street – HSAB	New sign: wall sign	42.3.1-201	D. Freeman
4. Graves, Robert – 54514	23 Appleton Road	Replace all windows	66-399	Self
5. Hilfiger, Susan – 54515	9 Lincoln Avenue	Reroof: material change (cedar)	30-137	J. Lydon
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing				
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve			
Conclusion	Carried / McLaughlin abstain		Certificate #	54511 to 54515

II. OLD BUSINESS	ADDRESS	PROPOSED WORK	M&P	AGENT
1. Lighthouse Baptist Church	4 Trotters Lane	Reroof: material change	67-133	P. Patterson
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	(5:19) Williams too big a roof for architectural. Norton location and building height is not a concern.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)			
Conclusion	Carried /Williams opposed		Certificate #	54516

2. Boyer, Ken	2 Gardner Street – HSAB	Addition	42.3.3	SCI
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Rob Newman			
Concerns	(5:20) McLaughlin not visible. Barham minimally visible. Norton agrees			
Motion	Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	54517

3. Field, Nancy	31 Nonantum Avenue	Hardscaping: A/C condensers	55-187	B. Meerbergen
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Wagley			
Representing	Peter Meerbergen concern about run off from rain and could fence and hedge the location.			
Concerns	(5:22) Barham issue being on property line. Norton needs to be hidden, couched next to the building and screened. Roggeveen a well is an option. Can go under ocean-facing window.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for relocation options for units. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried		Certificate #	

4.	Carney, David	3 Cash's Court – HSAB	Addition	42.3.2-150	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham				
Alternates	Wagley				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli withdrawing deck/porch at this time.				
Concerns	Rhoda Weinman removal of porch makes client very happy. (5:31) Barham not in favor of extra 4 feet on East elevation left side. Williams no comments. Norton hipped aspect of addition will be visible from below. Also asked for info on how windows became SDLs, and evidence is they were approved TDLs; want to see all SDLs replaced with TDLs and addition windows should be TDLs. Property is in violation in the Core District. Original house dates from 1700s. McLaughlin none of this construction will interfere with the bank. Roggeveen majority of commission is concerned about windows and happy to porch disappear. Some concern about building extending beyond porch and hipped aspect of addition's roof.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and information on the SDL windows. (Williams)				
Conclusion	Carried Certificate #				
	Coombs arrived 5:34				
5.	Jacoby, Jake	3 Tautemo Way	New window	83-22	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing	Matt McEachern hoping to replace windows before season starts. Alternative six over ones.				
Concerns	(5:42) Norton two-over-one windows not appropriate with style of house. Williams agree. McLaughlin no comments. Barham houses in area are all six-over-six windows.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as one-over-one (Williams) - failed. Motion to Approve through staff as six over six, sashes grey and no picture windows. (Barham)				
Conclusion	Carried Certificate # 54518				
6.	Robinson, Raymond	36 Shell Street – SAB	Addition	73.1.3-44.3	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing	Matt McEachern built after 1975.				
Concerns	(5:49) SAB comments read. Norton additions are 100% lower than original mass, this is a really sensitive area, addition should be no more than 18 feet. Right side East elevation is strange with down step and negative mass and is very visible. Windows too varied in sizes. Barham agrees, goes within 8 feet of back of property, is way too large. Already is larger than immediate neighbors. Fin boards with windows on North elevation. Present width feels right along street. McLaughlin agrees. Roggeveen the house is bad to start with and this makes it worse.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Williams)				
Conclusion	Carried Certificate #				
7.	Glowacki, Walter	4 Lover's Lane	Rev: COA #54239	68-202	Structures Unltd
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs				
Alternates	Wagley // Williams recused				
Representing	Nancy Drahzal				
Concerns	(6:01)				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Norton)				
Conclusion	Carried Certificate # 54519				
8.	Kennedy, Jacqueline	189 Polpis Road	New art studio	45-5.2	E. Kennedy
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham				
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley				
Representing	Paul O'Rourke				
Concerns	(6:03) Norton no concerns because not visible				
Motion	Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility. (Williams)				
Conclusion	Carried Certificate # 54520				

Proposed Minutes for December 22, 2009

9. Belcher, Ward 8 Plover Lane New dwelling 12-57 M. Rowland
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Barham, Coombs
 Alternates Wagley
 Representing Micky Rowland
 Concerns (6:04) **Williams** East elevation right dormer ganged windows separated. **Norton** agrees. Design is appropriate. **Barham** dormer should be reduced by two feet. **McLaughlin** dormer set back.
 Motion **Motion to Approve through staff East elevation right-hand dormer windows separated by 12 inches.** (Williams)
 Conclusion Carried //Barham opposed **Certificate # 54521**
10. Belcher, Ward 8 Plover Lane Move off/demo 12-57 M. Rowland
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley
 Representing Micky Rowland
 Concerns
 Motion **Motion to Approve as move off only.** (Williams)
 Conclusion Carried //Norton & Barham opposed **Certificate # 54522**
11. Burruss, Jim 10 Heller Way New garage/apartment 82-7 M. Rowland
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley
 Representing Ben Normand
 Concerns (6:10) **Barham** doors inside ell. Agrees with Williams ref location. **Williams** location so close to Ishmael Road. **Norton** agree with relocation. **Roggeveen** no one wants to see anymore trees cut down for the new building
 Motion **Motion to View with stakes on current location to see how relates to trees.** (Barham)
 Conclusion Carried **Certificate #**
12. Quinlisk, Tim & Liz 79 Squam Road Rev: COA #54151 18-7 Botticelli & Pohl
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, Coombs
 Alternates
 Representing Lisa Botticelli
 Concerns (6:14)
 Motion **Motion to Approve through staff with change of door bracket to replicate one in photo and center East elevation 2nd-floor dormer window.** (Williams)
 Conclusion Carried **Certificate # 54523**
13. 23 Kimball Avenue R.T. 1 Windward lane New dwelling 30-27 Botticelli & Pohl
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley
 Representing Ray Pohl
 Concerns
 Motion Held at applicant's request for further revisions.
 Conclusion **Certificate #**
14. 23 Kimball Avenue R.T. 2 Windward lane Move on 30-26 Botticelli & Pohl
 Sitting Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham
 Alternates Coombs, Wagley
 Representing **Ray Pohl** would you entertain a demo.
 Concerns (6:21) **Norton** this should be located no closer to Windward than the neighbor's house; would like to see where that building is located on the site plan. **Williams** the house can't go back five feet?
 Motion **Motion to Hold for information on location of neighbor's house.** (Williams)
 Conclusion Carried **Certificate #**

Proposed Minutes for December 22, 2009

15. 23 Kimball Avenue R.T.	1 Windward lane	Move off	30-27	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Ray Pohl			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Hold for move on. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
16. Robert Ian Realty Trust	3 Cherry Street – HSAB	Demolition	55-376	R. Bretschneider
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	Held at applicant's request to track with new dwelling.			
Motion				
Conclusion		Certificate #		
17. Barbieri, Leonard	14 Gosnold Road	New dwelling	30-83	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli would like North elevation porch to wrap around and meet West elevation porch.			
Concerns	(6:30) Barham South elevation center dormer is now larger, all should be same size. Mini balconies over North elevation porch are out of place; West elevation sets a tone that balconies don't work with. Coombs North elevation not visible. McLaughlin North elevation French door. Norton vestibule needs to be removed; it is very atypical.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with center dormer S elevation same size as flanking dormers. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried / chair (Norton) opposed	Certificate #	54524	
18. Barbieri, Leonard	14 Gosnold Road	Move off/demo	30-83	Botticelli & Pohl
Sitting	Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs			
Alternates				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Approve as move off. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54525	
19. McCready, Richard	239 Hummock Pond Road	Addition/renovation	82-41	Emeritus
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns	Rosemary McCready trying to keep this cape design, but need to enlarge for large family. (6:39) Williams & Norton South elevation should match the North elevation. Barham 2 nd floor French doors facing road.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff per with South elevation middle French doors on 2nd floor changed to double windows. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried / Barham opposed	Certificate #	54526	
20. Griffin/Lampe	18 Rabbit Run Road	New dwelling	43.1-78	Emeritus
Sitting	Norton, McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Matt McEachern Owner feels bay windows won't be visible from road.			
Concerns	(6:48) Barham South elevation 2 nd floor windows are either hall way or bathroom and are enormous and scaling down would help reduce dormers; double dormer is too large. North elevation shed dormers could be smaller. West elevation wall coming far down onto shed roof. Coombs agrees ref windows. Should narrow windows down to two or three sizes. Bays should be more related to each other. McLaughlin Bay units visible from Shawkemo Rd. Wagley agree with Coombs and Barham ref windows. Dormers everywhere. Norton if window hierarchy could become more traditional it will reduce visual size, use two or three window sizes.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		

Proposed Minutes for December 22, 2009

21. Griffin/Lampe	18 Rabbit Run Road	New garage	43.1-78	Emeritus
Sitting	Norton McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Hold for main dwelling. (Coombs)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
22. Griffin/Lampe	18 Rabbit Run Road	Pool & fence	43.1-78	Emeritus
Sitting	Norton McLaughlin, Barham, Coombs, Wagley			
Alternates				
Representing	Matt McEachern			
Concerns				
Motion	Motion to Hold for main dwelling. (Coombs)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
23. Nielson, Carl	23C Rhode Island Ave – MAB	Rev: COA #54333 (deck)	60.3.1-124.2	L. Thornewill
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs			
Representing				
Concerns	(7:06)			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #	54527	
24. Falls, Alice	8 Meadow View Drive	Reroof: color change	56-147	D. Kinsella
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	(7:07)			
Motion	Motion to View. (McLaughlin)			
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		
25. Toland, Lita	4 Pleasant Street – HSAB	AS-BUILT: hardscaping et al	42.3.3-157	N.A.G.
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing	Steve Cohen represents three of the abutters exasperated this has been dragging on for so long. There are at least five violations denied by HDC and built anyway. Playhouse needs zoning and HDC approval and driveway and gate. App does not correctly portray what is in the public file.			
Concerns	Steve Theroux enclosed a written history of what's in Building Dept. file. (7:09) Lot and Project History read. Roggeveen put in view pack for next OB meeting Williams want to see previous permits and denials, everything that relates to this property and is available to staff. Norton wants actual HDC permits. Barham is concerned that this had drawn out for so long and would like to see resolved before the next season.			
Motion	Motion to View with additional information submitted by S. Theroux and previous HDC permits and denials, everything that relates to this property (Williams) // Roggeveen would like board to vote for HDC Administrator to request legal services from Town Manager about enforcement action on this series of apparent violations. (Williams)			
Conclusion	Carried // Carried	Certificate #		
26. T.O.N. (BOS)	48 Sparks Avenue	Wind turbine	55-242	D. Fredericks
Sitting	Roggeveen, Norton, Williams, McLaughlin, Barham			
Alternates	Coombs, Wagley			
Representing				
Concerns	Removed from agenda. To come up at Jan. 5 meeting right after Dreamland			
hMotion				
Conclusion	Carried	Certificate #		

III.HDC BUSINESS	
Review Minutes -	Dec. 15
Approve Minutes -	Dec. 8 adopted by unanimous consent.
60 Day Denials -	
Other Business -	
Commission Comments	Barham – Schwartz property Surfside could see artificial pond, docks, dock house, electrical substations, landscaping lighting poles with security cameras. HDC approval was based on that plantings would be in place. Have the building permits been signed off? Coombs there is signage as well.

Adjourned at 7:30 p.m.

HSAB – Historic Structures Advisory Board SAB – ‘Sconset Advisory Board
TAB – Tuckernuck Advisory Board MAB – Madaket Advisory Board

PROPOSED