



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, March 25, 2021

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 1:00 p.m. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, HDC Administrative Specialist; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
Attending Members: Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill
Absent Members: McLaughlin, Dutra
Late Arrivals: None
Early Departures: None

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as amended. (Oliver)**
Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, Thornewill, Oliver, and Pohl-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Jenn Holloway 03-171	10 Starbuck Road	Addition	59.3/62	Emeritus
	• All French doors to be 6-lights per MAB comments.			
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch,			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No additional concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff per noted conditions. (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Coombs, Camp, Welch, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-03-3171

III. OLD BUSINESS 03/16/2021

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Sharon Hubbard 02-2943	28 Dukes Road	Pool and hardscape	56/190	Waterscapes
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Camp, Welch Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Gary King, Waterscape				
Public	Linda Williams, for 26 Dukes Road				
Concerns (1:05)	<p>King – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; pool equipment is outside the 10-foot property setback but can be put anywhere; the homeowner was trying to control project costs and put the pool in a place that would not interfere with neighbors; it is not visible in this location; doesn't think it fair that Ms. Hubbard cannot have a pool in this location just because HDC approved other pool in proximity to the neighbor at 26 Duke Road.</p> <p>Williams – The 14-foot wall, which would retain a pool, on the southwest side of their property is “attacking” her client; asking this pool to be moved to the other side of this property. They can realign the driveway. Wants to know where the pool equipment is going; it's not on the plan.</p> <p>Camp – The locus map should show Dukes Road and Vestal Street. Clarified the location of the property and pool. Discussion about the location of the pool and the impact of approved pools and this pool on the neighbor at 26 Dukes Road.</p> <p>Welch – This is discussion of items not under HDC purview. We typically don't approve pools in the front yard unless there is an intervening structure; this would, be approvable in the front yard because it will be behind the small existing building. He's not aware of any pools in the front yard in that area; on any application he's voted on, a front-yard pool had an intervening structure. His decision isn't flavored by other pools in this area. With respect to cost, HDC can't consider cost to the owner.</p> <p>Thornewill – It's unfortunate on such a large site that the pool is jammed against a neighbor, who is inundated with abutting pools. It could easily go behind the little building and get away from dense areas.</p> <p>Coombs – Location of retaining walls is within our purview; we need to see what's around this. Agrees the pool should be moved to the other side.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees with what's been said, the pool and driveway could be switched.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, Welch, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	
2.	Brett Fodiman 01-2765	111 Surfside Road	New guesthouse	80/70	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:22)	<p>MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; ridge height is 25'.</p> <p>Coombs – It's appropriate with the gable forward.</p> <p>Oliver – It's too big; there are a lot of structures on this property. This is the second dwelling and should be less tall; dropping 6 “to 9” isn't enough.</p> <p>Thornewill – No concerns. Hopes the lot won't be clear cut; separation of buildings could be emphasized with the vegetation.</p> <p>Welch – When it comes to the height, it is a little tall with proportions relative to other structures; it looks like there's room to take out up to a foot, with 9” minimum, from the ridge height without changing the roof pitch.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with 1 foot of height to be removed from the building. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//Coombs, Thornewill, Welch, and Pohl-aye; Oliver-nay			Certificate #	HDC2021-01-2765

3.	Paul Piccirillo	10-2053	6 Baltimore Road	New dwelling	60/106	Val Oliver Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Welch, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	Oliver					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.					
Representing	Val Oliver, Val Oliver Design					
Public	Paul Piccirillo, owner					
Concerns (1:35)	Linda Williams, MAB					
	(1:29) Piccirillo – Wants a 5-member board. Asked this be passed over until Mr. Welch returns.					
	Oliver – Reviewed context photos and changes made per previous concerns; massing issues were never previously mentioned.					
	Williams – All along there were concerns about the 71-foot length and overall massing; wants a half wall at the basement walkdown under the deck stairs; this is on the Madaket Road corner.					
	Thornewill – There is still a lot of fenestration on the rear, but that isn't visible. Existing shrubs will mask the 1 st floor. Okay with the wall under the deck stairs.					
	Welch – Looking at the front elevation, the right-side 2 nd -floor, the roof plan makes the connector look like it dies into the dormer, but the drawing indicates a hipped valley where it connects with the gable; asked the ridge be lowered by dropping the pitch thus helping the perceived length. In his opinion, this is now more in keeping with Madaket.					
	Camp – Her feeling is it's too large for this area; adding the right side pushed it over. The decking is excessive; doesn't want to see the stairs to the 2 nd floor. Square footage of the old house is more appropriate.					
	Coombs – Agrees with Ms. Camp. She'd like to see some reduction on the length; this section of Baltimore isn't heavily developed. South elevation, she would like to see a reduction in the number of sliding doors.					
	Pohl – He appreciates the changes. There are a lot of very large houses in the Starbuck area, so there is a precedent for this.					
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1//Thornewill, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye; Welch-nay Certificate #					
4.	Three North Gully Rd	02-2956	7 North Gully Road	Demo/move off	73.1.4/123	Botticelli + Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Camp, Oliver, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	Pohl (Welch stepped out)					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.					
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl					
Public	None					
Concerns (1:32)	Botticelli – Reviewed project; SAB wants it to remain in 'Sconset.					
	Backus – Read SAB comments: want this to stay within 'Sconset and not demolished; historic structure circa 1881.					
	Camp – Would like this to remain on this site; she is not in favor of a demolition. Likes Ms. Thornewill's suggestion.					
	Oliver – Would like it repurposed either here or elsewhere in 'Sconset.					
	Thornewill – The playground is looking for a shade structure and here it is; that would keep it in Codfish Park.					
	Coombs – She likes the suggestion of using it in the playground. It's been here a long time.					
Motion	Motion to Approve as a move off as long as it stays in 'Sconset. (Oliver)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-1//Thornewill, Oliver, and Coombs-aye; Camp-nay Certificate # HDC2021-02-2986					
5.	Emily Overlook	02-2842	22 Clifton Street	New dwelling	73.4.1/26.3	Bentley + Churchill
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Camp, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.					
Representing	Elizabeth Churchill, Bentley & Churchill					
Public	None					
Concerns (2:07)	Churchill – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; trim color has been changed to grey.					
	Backus – SAB had no concerns with the revisions.					
	Welch – His only concern is the white trim.					
	No concerns.					
Motion	Motion to Approve with grey trim. (Welch)					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Thornewill, Camp, Welch, and Coombs-aye Certificate # HDC2021-02-2986					

6.	Gifford Whitney A Trst 02-2977	6 Lily Street	Renovations	42.3.4/45	CWA
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Camp, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Webster				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:11)	<p>Webster – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; 2 French doors with transoms exist on the east elevation.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments: dormer change is improvement; too many 2nd-floor French doors; French doors shouldn't face the street; there should be a caveat on not visible in perpetuity; recommendations.</p> <p>Welch – East elevation, the 3-door configuration with transom and portico echoes what exists on other elevations; this looks like a commercial entry way. North elevation, appreciates dropping the 2nd-floor transoms; to the extent this side is visible from the pond, 2 sets of triple doors is excessive.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees with what's been said. North elevation, agrees with reducing the number of French doors; likes the suggestion the other side not being visible in perpetuity. Agrees with Mr. Welch about the front.</p> <p>Thornewill – Nothing to add.</p> <p>Camp – North elevation, is visible from the Lily Pond walk; needs a reduction in the number of French doors. East elevation, there are a lot of barns that back up to the Lily Pond, so wonders if the 2nd-floor "door" is historic; likes that 1st-floor as it exists.</p> <p>Coombs – Agrees with Mr. Welch. Would like the front kept as is.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Welch, Oliver, Thornewill, Camp, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	
Rest held for Tuesday, March 30.					
7.	Brian + Toni Franz 02-2974	12 Cannonbury Lane	New dwelling	74/10	Workshop/APD
8.	Brian + Toni Franz 02-2975	12 Cannonbury Lane	Garage	74/10	Workshop/APD
9.	Brian + Toni Franz 02-2957	12 Cannonbury Lane	Shed	74/10	Workshop/APD
10.	Charles Schwarzapfel 10-2033	9 Maine Avenue	Pool	60.3.1/425	NAG
11.	46 Union St N.T. 02-2843	46 Union Street	Addition	42.2.3/28	M. Cutone Arch
12.	Deb Wasil 01-2786	51 Pleasant Street	Hardscape	55/32.3	Linda Williams
13.	17 Avenue RT 01-2776	17 Lincoln Avenue	Rev. 12-2442: ext revisions	30/118	Botticelli + Pohl
14.	Gordon C. Russell 02-2976	3 School Street	Adtn, roofwalk & clapboard	42.3.2/125	Flavin Architects
15.	Gordon C. Russell 02-2976	3 School Street	Hardscape	42.3.2/125	Flavin Architects
16.	Taylor Murphy 02-2961	7 Evergreen Way	Garage door change	68/722	Self
17.	37 Pocomo Road R.T. 02-2932	37 Pocomo Road	New dwelling	14/38	Workshop/APD
18.	Brain Rice 02-2965	41 Crooked Lane	Main house addition	41/202	Workshop/APD
19.	Brain Rice 02-2964	41 Crooked Lane	New garage	41/202	Workshop/APD
20.	Stuart Hendrin 02-2941	43 Kendrick Street	New dwelling- MH	76.4.3/31	CWA
21.	LBC Sconset, LLC 01-2762	9 Hawks Circle	New dwelling	74/37.1	JGG Architects
22.	LBC Sconset, LLC 03-3075	9 Hawks Circle	Guest House	74/37.1	JGG Architects

VIII. NEW BUSINESS 03/23/2021

	Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1.	Mark Canavan 03-3161	31 Woodbury Lane	Roof walk	41/276.3	Linda Williams
2.	Darrell Ferguson 03-3151	28 Main Street, Sias	Pool and hardscape	73.3.1/47	Linda Williams
3.	Peter Garren	36 Pocomo Road	Addition	14/79	NAG
4.	Peter Garren 03-3155	36 Pocomo Road	Hardscape	14/79	NAG
5.	Russell Simpson	22 Bailey Road	Door change	55/504	Self
6.	Back 41 LLC 03-3154	105 Tom Nevers Road	New dwelling	91/25	CWA
7.	87 Eel Point Rd RT	87 Eel Point Road	Move building	32/11	Mark Cutone Arch
8.	87 Eel Point Rd RT	87 Eel Point Road	Pool	32/11	Mark Cutone Arch
9.	87 Eel Point Rd RT	87 Eel Point Road	Pool cabana	32/11	Mark Cutone Arch
10.	Maryann Wasik 03-3274	4 Hussey Farm Road	Rooftop solar	56/84.4	Cotuit Solar
11.	Douglas Self 03-3267	3 Martins Lane	Fence and hardscape	42.3.2/133	Ahern
12.	David Goldberg	42 Cannonbury Lane	Pool	73/29	Ahern
13.	Roberta Brown 03-3153	9 Beach Street, Sias	Studio	73.1.3/24	Topham Design
14.	Karli Hagedorn 03-3263	34 West Chester Street	Replace windows/roof	41/31	Normand Residential
15.	Erin Wilson 03-3208	8 East Dover Street	Hardscape	55.1.4/27	Alexandria Cashion
16.	Erin Wilson 03-3179	8 East Dover Street	Deck	55.1.4/27	Alexandria Cashion
17.	Jasper N.T. 03-3152	80 Millbrook Road	Pool and hardscape	40/79.1	Edgewater
18.	NIR Retail, LLC – Tavern 03-3212	Straight Wharf	Vinyl shades	42.2.1/1	Linda Williams
19.	17 Avenue RT 03-3260	17 Lincoln Avenue	Garage	30/118	Botticelli + Pohl
20.	Richard O'Leary 03-3253	7 Packet Drive	Pool house	74/18	EMDA
21.	EZIA Athletic Club 03-3258	117 Orange Street	Commercial deck	55/377	EMDA
22.	Tim & Jill Vieth 03-3196	3 Gladlands Avenue	Move/demo dwelling	80/234	Emeritus
23.	Catherine Raphael 03-3210	26A Miacomet Road	Rooftop solar	67/336.5	ACK Smart
24.	James Wilson 03-3211	1 Appleton Road	Rooftop solar	66/388	ACK Smart

Proposed HDC Minutes for March 25, 2021

25. Margaret Owen 03-3209	16 Golfview Drive	Rooftop solar	66/188	ACK Smart
26. Back 41, LLC	105 Tom Nevers Road	New dwelling	91/25	CWA
27. Philip Bloom 03-3247	9 Lily Street	Fenest/dormer/shutters	42.3.4/49	Linda Williams
28. Luis Daniel Xavier	5 Black Fish Lane	Pool and hardscape	73/126	CWA
29. James Koval	24 Pocomo Road	Window change	14/73	Botticelli + Pohl
30. Randy Sharp 03-3236	49 Meadow View Drive	New dwelling	56/390	Thornewill Design
31. Nathan Cressman	7 Weetamo Road	Addition/alteration	15/48	BPC
32. MAG Ventures 03-3168	30 Devon Street	MH new dwelling	76.4.2/1	JB Studio
33. MAG Ventures 03-3252	30 Devon Street	GH new dwelling	76.4.2/1	JB Studio
34. MAG Ventures 03-3169	30 Devon Street	Pool	76.4.2/1	JB Studio
35. Peter Kaizer	6 Nobadeer Avenue	New dwelling	80/37.2	Self
36. Peter Kaizer 03-3238	5 Weweeder Avenue	New dwelling	80/37.1	Self
37. 3 Pleasant St Trust 03-3203	3 Pleasant Street	Rev. 12-2583: hardscape	42.3.3/155	Sunset Ridge
38. Dyson Brendon C Trst 03-3187	10 North Water Street	Demo existing chimney	42.4.2/23	Emeritus
39. Jenn Holloway	10 Starbuck Road	Addition	59.3/62	Emeritus
40. Patrick Patterson 03-3205	3 First Way	New garage	55/236	Val Oliver Design
41. Gary Winn 03-3206	25 North Water Street	Fence/gate	42.4.2/2.1	BPC
42. Karen Urban 03-3216	33 Main Street, Sias	Pool	73.4.2/34	David Troast
43. 53 Vestal St ACK, LLC 03-3255	53 Vestal Street	Add covered porch	41/185.3	Shelter 7 LLC
44. 53 Vestal St ACK, LLC 03-3257	53 Vestal Street	New cabana/porch	41/185.3	Shelter 7 LLC
45. 53 Vestal St ACK, LLC	53 Vestal Street	Retaining walls	41/185.3	Shelter 7 LLC
46. 2 Mayflower Circle, LLC	2 Mayflower Circle	Pool and outdoor kitchen	68/728	Linda Williams
47. Chris Skehel 03-3239	61A Cato Lane	New garage w/ apartment	56/49	LINK
48. Sally Siebold 03-3254	16 Wannacomot Road	New pool/patio	40/25.3	LINK
49. 2A Evergreen Way Trst 03-3237	2A Evergreen Way	Rev. 2347: rfvfk, wndws, drms	68/700.1	LINK
50. Walter J. Glowacki 03-3191	5 Meader Street	Move on shed	42.2.3/40	Structures Unlimited
51. Hulbert ACK, LLC 03-3261	2 Hulbert Avenue	Add granite curbing	42.1.4/2.1	Atlantic Landscaping
52. Eric Needleman	6 Macy Road	Pool and hardscape	60/144	Atlantic Landscaping
53. Michael A Bass Trst 03-3245	154 Cliff Road	Hardscape revisions	41/73	Atlantic Landscaping
54. Gary Creem 03-3265	6 + 8 Hydrangea Lane	Pool and hardscape	73/87 + 88	Atlantic Landscaping
55. 11 India St, LLC 03-3266	11 India Street	Deck/patio	42.3.1/122.2	Ahern
56. Horchow Family Trust 03-3190	27 East Tristram	Addition	31/2	Emeritus
57. Andrew Reger 03-3241	7 East Lincoln Avenue	Garage	42.4.1/8	Emeritus
58. Curren Huyser 03-3193	69 Surfside Road	Rev. 09-1800: storage facility	67/230	Emeritus
59. 11 India St, LLC 03-3240	29 Centre Street	Rev. 10-2061: fenestration	42.3.1/122.2	Emeritus
60. Zero India St, LLC 03-3268	1 Cambridge Street	Addition	42.3.1/130.2	Emeritus
61. Isaac Ro 03-3270	40 Cannonbury Lane	New dwelling	73/28	Workshop APD
62. Isaac Ro 03-3271	40 Cannonbury Lane	Garage	73/28	Workshop APD
63. Isaac Ro 03-3272	40 Cannonbury Lane	Pool	73/28	Ahern
64. 7 New Street, LLC	7 New Street	MH + garage connector	55.4.1/37	Workshop APD
65. 7 New Street, LLC	7 New Street	Rev. 39513: 2 nd DU fenestration	55.4.1/37	Workshop APD
66. 7 New Street, LLC	7 New Street	New studio	55.4.1/37	Workshop APD

IX. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approved Minutes	February 12, 18, 23, 25 & 26 and March 1, 4 & 5, 2021
Review Minutes	March 16, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting- Tuesday 3/30/21 at 4:30pm • Discussion of Resilient Nantucket meeting • Grey shingles in the OHD/SOHD • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:29 p.m. (Welch)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried //Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board
 Sconset Advisory Board
 Madaket Advisory Board
 Sign Advisory Council

