



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Stephen Welch (Vice-chair), Diane Coombs, Abby Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday January 26, 2023

Community Room, 4 Fairgrounds Road & Remote Participation via ZOOM.

Called to order at 1:02 pm. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Holly Backus, Historic Planner; Esmeralda Martinez, Land Use Specialist; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker

Attending Members: Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver

Remote Participants: Coombs

Absent Members: Dutra, Thornewill, Patten

Late Arrivals: None

Early Departures: None

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted (Coombs)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, Welch, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

I. COMMISSION COMMENTS

1. Coombs – Asked when HDC will discuss her citizen article.

Welch – The OFC that was going to resolve the advisory group meeting and to get additional information was cancelled because Ms. Coombs was ill.

Pohl – That discussion has been rescheduled for Thursday.

II. PUBLIC COMMENT

1. None

II. NEW BUSINESS 12/06/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Margaret Manganaro Tr 01-7750	7 Summer Street	Repair & replace	42.3.3/114	Ned Paul

IV. OLD BUSINESS 12/13/2022

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. 41 Monomoy, LLC 10-7246	41 Monomoy Road	Add roofwalk & fenest	54/79.1	Emeritus

Voting Welch (acting chair), Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Pohl

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, advisory comments, and *Building with Nantucket in Mind (BWNIM)*.

Representing Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development

Public None

Concerns (1:06) **MacEachern** – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. There is precedent for a roof walk in the area.

Backus – This is an infill in the Monomoy Height Subdivision. Appreciate removal of the skirt; per *BWNIM* a roof walk is not appropriate on a 1.5 story structure. It should be closer to the chimney.

Camp – Thinks the roof walk should be on the main-mass roof.

Oliver – Her concern is that the legs are extremely long and land on the dormers; doesn't think it's appropriate on this design.

Pohl – He's okay with it.

Coombs – The legs are too long and sit on the gable.

Welch – He agrees with Ms. Oliver. He doesn't think it should go on the 1.75-story mass. If it were smaller so the legs were shorter it would look like a "pimple."

Motion **Motion to View. (Oliver)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, Coombs, Camp, Pohl, and Welch-aye

Certificate #

Motion **Motion to bring this back ASAP. (Camp)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0// Camp, Oliver, Coombs, Pohl, and Welch-aye

2. Scott O'Connor 01-7235	2 Hussey Street	Enclose 2 nd -floor porch	42.3.1/119	Emeritus
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	Milton Rowland, Historic Structures Advisory Group (HSAG)			
Concerns (1:18)	<p>MacEachern – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p>Backus – Circa 1918 garage converted to a house built by Ellenwood Coleman. The changed doesn't look like an enclosed porch; pull the wall in to show the framework.</p> <p>Rowland – Read advisory comments: Enclosing the porch creates an awkward 2-story shed addition; it works much better as an open porch. An option might be to use vertical boards painted grey.</p> <p>Coombs – It should look like a porch with railing that was closed in. The walls of the “porch” should be shingled under the windows.</p> <p>Oliver – Likes the previous submission but with double-hung windows. She doesn't agree with vertical board for the porch area; would prefer shingles below the window.</p> <p>Welch – Reviewed ways to make it look like an enclosed porch.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff the previous submission with shingled wall under the 2nd-floor windows and the 2nd-floor windows to be double hung, and a sill element to reflect a historic porch under the windows. (Oliver)			
Roll-call vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, Coombs, and Welch-aye		Certificate #	HDC2022-01-7235

V. NEW BUSINESS 12/20/2022

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	ACK 15 CHK, LLC 01-7782	8 Chuck Hollow Road	Pool & hardscape	72/31	Atlantic Landscaping
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and correspondence.				
Representing	Lindsay Congleton, Atlantic Landscaping				
Public	Jascin Leonardo Finger, 10 Chuck Hollow Road				
Concerns (1:29)	<p>Congleton – Presented project. The shed shown on the site plan is not part of this application. We will access the area around the garage side which is already open.</p> <p>Finger – This is not appropriate for the site or the house; the pool and patio area is much larger than the house and should be reduced in size. Doubts the visibility since it's all scrub oak. To do the work, they will have to brush cut into the south to get around the house.</p> <p>Welch – He wants to view this with the pool area staked out with orange marker-ribbon. It is very large.</p> <p>Camp – It's over hardscaped for the site; the whole proposal is larger than the main structure.</p> <p>Coombs – It's too large. Agrees with Mr. Welch about a view to include a stake at the spa with a waterfall. Wants photos of the area now in the winter. She also wants to know what vegetation is planned aside from the 4 trees at the pool.</p>				
Motion	Motion to View with stakes and revisions. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Welch, Camp, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #		

2.	2 Highland Ave, LLC 01-7685	2.4.6 Highland Avenue	New dwelling	30/189	Emeritus
3.	2 Highland Ave, LLC 01-7684	2.4.6 Highland Avenue	New 2 nd dwelling	30/189	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (time)	Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Held for January 31 at applicant's request				
Roll-call Vote	N/A		Certificate #		

4. Kevin Davidson 01-7681	4 Step Lane	Addition	42.4.2/82	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, advisory comments, and <i>BW</i> NIM.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	Milton Rowland, HSAG			
Concerns (2:03)	<p>MacEachern – Presented project.</p> <p>Backus – Circa 1810 typical Nantucket for Alexander Ray. The 3 dormers are not appropriate and too much; 2 dormers are more appropriate and to be compatible to the main roof and comply with <i>BW</i>NIM. French doors should be 12-lights with kick panels. The balcony is visible and not appropriate for this structure.</p> <p>Rowland – Read advisory comments: The 3 dormers dominate the main roof plane; 2 dormers would be more appropriate. The dormers should also be shorter to reduce the amount of shingled area below the window.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with HSAG about the 3 dormers.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees the 3 dormers overpower the historic structure.</p> <p>Coombs – It’s the 3 dormers; they should be eliminated.</p> <p>Oliver – It’s all been said. Thinks if the balcony were shingled in, it would be less noticeable.</p> <p>Pohl – Agree the 3 dormers should be reduced to 2. He’s okay with the balcony.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the north elevation to go to 2 dormers and the roofs lowered 6” to 8” and the east elevation the 2nd door on the deck to have a kick panel. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Oliver, Welch, Camp, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7681

VI. OLD BUSINESS 01/03/23

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Tigerlily Nom 10-7289	7 Barnabas Lane	New dwelling	41/563	Studio Ppark
Voting	Welch (acting chair), Coombs, Camp, Pohl, Oliver				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	James Krapp, Studio Ppark				
Public	Milton Rowland, HSAG				
Concerns (1:42)	<p>Krapp – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; reduced the ceiling height to 9’4”. Cited references for inspiration of this house.</p> <p>Backus – Infill within 1980s subdivision. The transoms on secondary and rear mass should be removed. The chimney cap is atypical; should be more traditional corbelling; should be in the main mass net to the roof walk. Nano doors are not appropriate and will be visible. Friendship stairs are more for an elevation federal style; this is only 30” off grade; front facing steps would be more appropriate.</p> <p>Rowland – Read advisory comments: Chimney should be in main mass Front door fan light is unusual and should change to a more traditional horizontal transom. Shutters should be louvered. The 10’ ceiling height creates too much space between the 1st- and 2nd-floor windows; the ceiling should be dropped a foot to reduce this space. The north facing French doors in the main mass will be very visible and are not appropriate; they should change to windows; the 2nd-floor windows above are spaced too far to the sides and should be moved toward the center. The south facing flush dormer is too wide and should be broken into 2 dormers. The friendship stairs are not appropriate.</p> <p>Coombs – South and east elevations the gable should be windows; they look like vents. Agrees with Ms. Backus and HSAG. The skylight under the roof walk on the east elevation is odd but it’s in the right place.</p> <p>Pohl – Clapboard should be only on the front façade of the main gable. Should mimic the details on a Main Street fan window over the front door. Chimney on the main mass. Front stairs should not be friendship stairs.</p> <p>Oliver – North elevation, there are way too many doors; the mass with the chimney should be windows and mudroom door not a French door. The gable 4-lights could be a little larger. Agree with what’s been said.</p> <p>Camp – The formality seems out of place with the friendship stairs and fan window. The chimney should be in the main mass. Agree clapboard on the front main mass.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with Mr. Pohl. The chimney is inappropriate in design and location; should be smaller; suggested a faux chimney on the opposite side of the main mass. To the extent you can move windows it would be appropriate. Eliminate the friendship stair but not some of the rail details. The multiple doors on the rear needs to be addressed as they will be visible.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Pohl, and Welch-aye		Certificate #		

2.	Kathryn Cook 10-7257	85 Low Beach Road	New dwelling MH	75/31.3	Michael Bard
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Elizabeth Dunne Marcoulier				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:15)	Marcoulier – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. Oliver – Her biggest concern is the front facade; it's not typical and looks more like the rear of a house. Doesn't think the rear will be visible. She's concerned about the light emitted from the glass connector. Though this sets back from the road, there's nothing in front of it and is visible. Camp – Agrees about the lack of a proper front door. Not sure about the glass in the back; thinks it's conservation land at the rear. Coombs – There's no front door. The glass connector is questionable. We should view this from the conservation land in back. Welch – Recognized the lack of a front door but this is a considerable distance from the street; landscaping will mitigate the issue. He's not concerned about the rear. The glass connector could be improved by omitting that; they could bring that back once the structure is framed up. Pohl – He's okay with the nano-wall system under the porch; transparency at night might be an issue. Agrees with Mr. Welch about the glass connector and coming back to check the visibility.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Oliver, Camp, Welch, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
3.	Kathryn Cook 10-7217	85 Low Beach Road	New dwelling garage	75/31.3	Michael Bard
4.	Kathryn Cook 01-7746	85 Low Beach Road	Pool house	75/31.3	Michael Bard
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Dutra, Thornewill, Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documents, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Elizabeth Dunne Marcoulier				
Public	None				
Concerns (time)	Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold to track with the main house. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Oliver, Camp, Welch, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	

Rest held

5.	10 York, LLC 10-7291	10 York Street	Doors, windows & mas chg	55.4.1/142	Thornewill Design
6.	1010 Wins, LLC 10-7136	10 Lincoln Avenue	Demo/move garage	30/184	Emeritus
7.	1010 Wins, LLC 10-7117	10 Lincoln Avenue	New garage	30/184	Emeritus
8.	1010 Wins, LLC 01-7783	10 Lincoln Avenue	Cabana	30/184	Emeritus
9.	1010 Wins, LLC 10-7337	10 Lincoln Avenue	Hardscape: gate, pool & spa	30/184	Emeritus
10.	SAWB Corp. 11-7453	24 Cliff Road	Addition	42.4.4/49	SCI
11.	Reade, Gullicksen, etc., LLP 04-6162	42 Easton Street	Hardscape: gate & paving	42.4.1/21	'Sconset Gardener Inc
12.	John Mergrue 10-7341	36 Easton Street	New garage/apartment	42.1.4/19	EMDA

VII. NEW BUSINESS 01/10/23

	Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1.	Tigerlily Nom Trust 01-7689	7 Barnabas Lane	New garage	30/132	Studio Ppark
2.	Tigerlily Nom Trust 01-7671	7 Barnabas Lane	Pool & hardscape	30/132	Ahern
3.	John & Kelly Lee 01-7807	1 Ridge Lane	Addition	38/91	Gryphon Architects
4.	Salisbury Cottage, LLC 01-7737	13 Academy Lane	Reno dwelling, add dormers	42.4.3/112	Gryphon Architects
5.	Salisbury Cottage, LLC 01-7734	13 Academy Lane	New shed	42.4.3/112	Gryphon Architects
6.	Mark Wilmot 01-7752	35 Monomoy Road	Add shutters, replace doors	54/74	Gryphon Architects
7.	Cynthia Nelson 01-7809	30 King Street	Demo/move off	73.4.2/113	Gryphon Architects
8.	Cynthia Nelson 01-7808	30 King Street	New studio	73.4.2/113	Gryphon Architects
9.	Carlin Gifford 01-7767	4 Head of Plains	New dwelling	63/7	Gryphon Architects
10.	Carlin Gifford 01-7816	4 Head of Plains	New garag	63/7	Gryphon Architects
11.	NT Land Bank 01-7812	19 Wauwinet Road	Farmhouse addition	20/35	Normand Residential
12.	NT Land Bank 01-7753	19 Wauwinet Road	Barn fenestration change	20/35	Normand Residential
13.	NT Land bank 01-7814	19 Wauwinet Road	Stream bridge	20/35	Normand Residential
14.	Glenbeigh, LLC 01-7687	33 Nonantum Road	New garage/studio	87/49	Thornewill Design
15.	Melissa Neier 01-7725	11 Prospect Street	Roof replacement	55.4.4/42	Twig Perkins
16.	Mike Romano 01-7815	55 Easton Street	Rev. 05-6245: windows	42.4.1/86	Shelter 7
17.	Robert McCrewsky 01-7670	1A Yawkey Way	As-built new shed	69/19.1	Nate Barber
18.	Burton & Martello 01-7773	55 Meadow View Drive	New 2 nd dwelling	56/170	MCA+
19.	Burton & Martello 01-7667	55 Meadow View Drive	New pool	56/170	MCA+

Proposed HDC Minutes for January 26, 2023

20. Chris O'Connell 01-7679	3 Upper Tawpawshaw	New dwelling	53/41	EMDA
21. Keegan Hodges 01-7780	32 Union Street	New garage	42.3.2/85	Thornewill Design
22. Malcolm George 01-7666	76 Baxter Road	New shed	49/42	Nate Barber
23. 41 WMR Trust 01-7785	41 West Miacomet Ave	Replace found. & addtn	86/31.1	Emeritus
24. 41 WMR Trust 01-7672	41 West Miacomet Ave	Pool & hardscape	86/31.1	Jardins Intl.
25. Stark Point, LLC 01-7747	16 Easton Street	Rev. 04-6120	42.1.4/11	Botticelli & Pohl
26. 30 Pearl, LLC 01-7776	30 India Street	Rev. 07-6593: add window	42.3.4/137	Botticelli & Pohl
27. Kerlin & Jason Hempel 01-7761	17 Orange Street	Window change	42.3.2/12	Stephen & Company
28. Patrick & Carolyn DePalma	3 Westerwick Drive	Pool & hardscape	73/37	Carolyn DePalma

VIII. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approved Minutes Motion Vote	January 3 & 10, 2023 No action
Review Minutes	January 12 & 17, 2023
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting: Tuesday, January 31st, 2023 @ 4:00 pm Hybrid – Zoom & 4 Fairgrounds Rd, Community Room • Classification of street trees & vegetating mapping • Discussion of Wind Turbines • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, intro (update as needed) • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions • Discussion of options for house moves

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:31 pm. (Welch)**
 Vote Carried 5-0//Coombs, Oliver, Camp, Welch, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:
 Terry L. Norton

Nantucket Old Historic District

Sconset Old Historic District

Madaket Old Village

