



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Stephen Welch (Vice-chair), Diane Coombs, Abby Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday February 7, 2023

Community Room, 4 Fairgrounds Road & Remote Participation via ZOOM.

Called to order at 4:02 pm. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Holly Backus, Historic Planner; Esmeralda Martinez, Land Use Specialist; Fiona Johnson, Administrative Specialist;

Attending Members: Welch, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill, Dutra, Patten

Remote Participants: Pohl, Coombs

Absent Members: None

Late Arrivals: Dutra, 4:28pm

Early Departures: Welch, 7:00pm

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Oliver)**

Vote Carried unanimously

I. COMMISSION COMMENTS

1. None

II. PUBLIC COMMENT

1. None

III. ENFORCEMENT/ VIOLATION

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. ReMain LLC 12-7325	54 Main St	Lighting plan	42.3.1/193	Anne Dougherty
2. Ack Attack LLC 01-7770	7a Bayberry Ct	Wall sign	55/707	Andrew Grattan
3. Nantucket Atheneum 12-756	1 & 3 India St	New sign	42.3.1/73	Ann Scott

Voting Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver

Alternates Thornewill, Patten

Recused None

Documentation Sign design plans, site plan, and photos, advisory comments.

Representing None

Sign Advisory None

Concerns Saad- Item 2 no action continued to 02/21/23; items 1 & 3 held for revisions per SAC comments. HDC commissioners to view Nantucket Atheneum.

Motion **Motion to hold for revisions items 1 & 3 per SAC comments. (Coombs)**

Vote Carried unanimously

Certificate # **HDC202(as noted)**

IV. CONSENTS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. HMSW LLC 01-7777	25 Sankaty Head	Addition rev 06-6498	48/3	Emeritus LTD
2. Nita Morse 01-7765	25 Milk St	Outdoor shower	42.3.3/89	B.S. LLC
3. Roy Weedon 01-7823	9 Twin st	Add window rev 03-5964	55.4.1/7.1	EMDA
4. James Fong 01-7821	85 Tom Nevers RD	Alterations addition	91/14	Topham Design
5. Alan Burney 01-7838	24 Kendrick Dr	Chng Bulkhead to egress	71/3.2	Alan Burney
6. Ines Hutton 01-7856	49 Polpis Rd	Solar ground array	54/21	ACK Smart
7. Javier Vargas 01-7751	2 Washaman Ave	Replace windows/color chng	55/547	Thornewill Design
8. 3a Massasoit Bdge LLC 01-7813	5 Massasoit Bridge Rd.	Pool cabana	59/11.1	Will Stephens
9. Adam Lockley 02-7879	8 Larrabee Lane	Hardscape & driveway	55/102.5	Linda Williams
10. Paul Cronin 02-7876	89 Somerset Rd	fenestration chng rev12-5355	66/135.7	Emeritus LTD
11. Ken Gullicksen 01-7720	18 Pond view Dr	Rooftop solar	80/50	Cotuit Solar
12. Kelly Purcell 01-7754	32 Dukes Rd	Cabana Alteration rev04-6208	56/188	Topham Design

Voting Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver

Alternates Patten

Recused Thornewill item 7.

Documentation None

Representing	None		
Public	None		
Concerns	No concerns.		
Motion	Motion to Approve all except for item 3. (Coombs)		
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	HDC2023-01-(as noted)
Motion	Motion to approve through staff - 9 Twin st to extend column down. (Camp)		
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7823

V. CONSENTS WITH CONDITIONS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. James Burruss 01-7755	5 Ishmael rd.	MH ground solar array	82/7	Ack Smart
• Not to be visible from public way.				
2. James Burruss 01-7756	5 Ishmael rd.	Cottage ground solar array	82/7	Ack Smart
• Not to be visible from public way.				
3. Carolyn Haley 01-7774	8 Ipswich St	Demo roof walk & add door	71.3.2/118	JB Studio
• Stoop must be out of setback.				
4. Hannah Claren 01-7719	17 Pine St	Roof replacement	42.3.2/26	Stegra Corp
• Need historic information needed.				
5. Edward Sanford 01-7818	12 Doc Ryder	New pool & hardscape	66/216	David Troast
• pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity & pool to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the original application.				
6. Adam Kessler 01-7739	12 Derrymore Rd	Pool, fence & hardscape	41/241	KMLD
• pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity & pool to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the original application.				
7. 39 Monomoy Rd LLC 02-7862	39 Monomoy Rd	Pool & hardscape	54/79	Atlantic Landscaping
• pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity & pool to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the original application.				
8. 18 Sherburne Tpk NT 02-7863	2 Folger Rd	Pool, spa & hardscape	30/196.1	Atlantic Landscaping
• pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity & pool to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the original application.				
9. Chris Connell 02-7862	3 Upper Tawpawshaw	Pool & hardscape	53/41	Atlantic Landscaping
• pool not to be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity & pool to have no grade change from existing or as noted on the original application.				
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver			
Alternates	Thornewill, Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Correspondence			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	None			
Motion	Motion to Approve Items 1-9 (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	HDC2023-01-(as noted)	

VI. OLD BUSINESS 12/13/22

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Manganaro Margaret Tr 01-7750	7 Summer St	Repair & replace	42.3.3/114	Ned Paul
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Ned Paul			
Public	None			
Concerns	Backus- 1790 typical Nantucket. Batten to match previously.			
Motion	Motion to approve through staff the door on the shed and the door on the house to match what was previously existing. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7750	

VII. NEW BUSINESS 12/20/22

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	The Brant LLC 12-7612	6 & 8 N Beach St/4 Dolphin Ct	New Building	42.4.1/65.1	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver				
Alternates	Thornewill, Dutra, Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Linda Williams				
Public	TJ DiFeo- Architect				
	Mickey Rowland-				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The main mass has uneven roof pitches of 7/12 and 10/12. This needs to be corrected by changing the 7 pitch to a 10 pitch and adding a shed dormer. The flanking additive masses with the rotated gables are inappropriate. The side additive masses should have ridges parallel to – not perpendicular to the main mass. Despite the various corner boards shown on the rear elevation, this is one long unbroken wall surface. There should be some relief to that length by stepping in the side additive masses. The same issue applies to the front. The above ground plunge pool is enclosed within a huge, raised deck which will be visible from North Beach Street and Dolphin Court. Raised decks of this size are not appropriate. The triple French doors will also be visible and should be reduced to a double. The plans indicate a back exterior stairway and stoop which is not shown on the site plan. This stairway should be shown on the site plan and explained how the stoop AND stairway comply with zoning setbacks. In general, this building is squeezed between two other buildings at a skewed angle. The angle cannot be avoided, but the proximity to the other structures can be by reducing the length of the building several feet to give it some breathing space between the other structures. 				
Concerns	<p>Backus- Non-contributing structure circa 1947, structure would have to comply with Resilient Nantucket Chapter 11 for infill architecture in the FEMA ae7 zone. Elevation certificate and Ferment map will be needed.</p> <p>Oliver- the pool and doors is my biggest concern; doors are nano doors no railing around the pool.</p> <p>Coombs- the nano doors will be eye catching at nighttime. There should be something protecting the pool. Batten doors should be regular batten doors the Xs on the inside. Pool needs to be reconsidered; pool is not appropriate.</p> <p>Camp- entrance is odd, the building s oversized, would like to see a simpler building maybe a 1 story building.</p> <p>Welch- doesn't not disagree to the extent that the pool is visible and inappropriate. Recommends a view of the patio staked. The structure's 1st floor main mass reduced in height, the wings reduced by a foot, drop the ridges down and the top plates about a 1 1/2' to have 9' or 9 1/2' ceilings.</p> <p>Pohl- the vertical boards are inappropriate as a skin for the building, the pool with not rail is an issue. If you do put a rail, it would be in violation of a commercial pool code, which has to have a shelf that somebody can grab onto rather than just a rail above. The roof pitch is a concern. Aesthetic issue with the flanking gables that are perpendicular to the main gable it would be a more quiet building if the gables would be running in the shorter dimension the ridges are running in the longer dimension of those two sides wings.</p>				
Motion	Motion to hold for revisions & stake patio, deck & pool in blue. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	HDC2022-12-7612	

2.	Harold Brothers Realty, LLC 01-7685	2,4,6 Highland Ave	New dwelling 1	30/189	Emeritus LTD
----	-------------------------------------	--------------------	----------------	--------	--------------

Voting	Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Dutra, Patten				
Recused	Pohl				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	<p>Ginny Clark- 2 North Cliff Way to have a main mass and a secondary house, the design looks like two main houses and its hard to see which is the main house. The scale does not reflect the other secondary house on the neighborhood. Add the deed restriction to the property deed.</p> <p>Mickey Rowland</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> This is a nicely designed house, but the massing does not relate to any other house in the Cliff area or Brant Point. It would be better suited to a more rural area with larger lots. The front façade is very wide and should be reduced considerably. Most other large residences in the area extend to the rear instead of to the sides. The secondary masses on the sides have forward projecting gables which compete with the main mass creating a very complex façade that starts to have a hotel-like appearance. The roof walk is too wide. It should be reduced to 8' max. 				

Concerns **Backus- previous** houses on the lot were Circa 1970, be more traditional style architecture masking and fenestration of 6/6 over the one. Proposed over helms the neighborhood.
Oliver- it is very large in terms of ground cover compared to other house, on Lincoln and Capaum, the impact of a new building is largely a question of its design. High style vernacular is not typical of this area except out of town, its new introduction a new genre on the edge of town seems out of proportion and modern. The roof locks not appropriate on this house, simplify overall more one-story additive massing additionally should be remasked. L shape would help mitigate its impact make it more compatible with adjacent buildings, follow traditional forms and fabric patterns.
Camp- too big, too long a ridge line, there is no additive massing, the roof walk is inappropriate. Main mass should be reduced in size and scale.
Coombs- Building is too long, there is no additive massing, windows are cold looking, roofwalk in appropriate. The dormers come down. Windows should have trim around them, should be 6/6 or 6/1, to fit in more in the Highland Ave and surrounding areas.
Thornewill- roof slop needs to be worked on. 97 ft is not typical.
Welch- rendering in light blue, would help. Simpler structure simplify presentation maybe less linear, make one of the structures subordinate. The porch on the west elevation is overly large.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions (Coombs)**
 Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # **HDC2022-01-7685**
Break: 5:15- 5:25

3.	Harold Brothers Realty, LLC 01-7684	2,4,6 Highland Ave	New dwelling 2	30/189	Emeritus LTD
----	---	--------------------	----------------	--------	--------------

Voting **Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill**
 Alternates Dutra, Patten
 Recused Pohl
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.
 Representing Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development
 Public Mickey Rowland-

- This is a second dwelling and is only 6” lower than the main house. It should be lowered at least a couple feet to reduce its scale relative to the main house.
- The secondary ridge toward the rear should step down considerably more to help reduce the overall perceived height of the building.

Concerns **Backus** – the 2nd dwelling is massive should be reduced in size and height.
Oliver- this should be main dwelling more in keeping with the hood.
Camp- east elevation could get more character additive massing more difference between the two.
Coombs- would like to see west elevation I would like to see the dormers the one the left come down, windows should be separated to some extent., the roof eve to come down.
Thornewill- issue with the height almost being 29’, needs to come quite a lot 20% smaller that the massive house.
Welch- dimensioned window schedule and a cross section, retro actively apply to the main house. Focus on dropping the height.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions (Coombs)**
 Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # **HDC2023-01-7684**

4.	The Old Gardner	5 Broadway	Foundation work	73.2.4/4	Jeff Booms
----	-----------------	------------	-----------------	----------	------------

Voting Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver
 Alternates Thornewill, Patten
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.
 Representing Jeff Booms
 Public Robe Benchley- SAG no concerns, would like for the work done right as possible.

Concerns **Backus-** this is the Prince Gardener House, its individually significant to the Local & National District, Circa 1740’s almost 300 years old. How will the rock peers be stabilized? Should be documented and proposed to be to bring those cell beams and joists out of the dirt, understand the configuration of the concrete pads.
Welch- this a cautionary element this is an As-Built work, on one of the most historic structure in that area. Drawings of foundation plans, with cross section with detailed plans, a1sr floor plan that show what is going to be retained and not going to be retained.
Coombs- would like to know what rock is going to stay the same; would like a good plan on what he is asking for architecturally and engineeringly.
Camp- we need to be better informed, would like to see drawings of exactly what foundation would, and will look like and how it will be stabilized.
Oliver- we need it to be returned back to what it was, the fine is not enough.

Motion **Motion to return with floor plans, foundation plans, and section floor plan indicating where the existing will be retained and where elements will be replaced & what they’ll be replace with. (Welch)**
 Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # **HDC2023-01-**

VIII. NEW BUSINESS 01/10/23

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Salisbury Cottage LLC 01-7737	13 Academy Lane	Reno dwelling, add dormers	42.4.3/112	Gryphon Architects

Voting Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Patten
 Alternates Oliver, Thornewill
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.
 Representing Ethan Griffin- Gryphon Architects
 Public Mickey Rowland- The shed dormers on both sides overwhelm the main roof plane and should be reduced a couple feet on either side.

Concerns (4:16) **Backus-** non-contributing cape circa 1981, Wesco acre lots of section of town, proposal to change dwelling and parking adding a fence and arbor requires its own COA application. The dormers should follow the guidelines, the French doors on the west, may or may not be visible from Lily St, if they are visible, they should change to 12 lite with a kick panel which is consistent within the OHD. On the north proposed change to the roof line looks a little odd, the west face that's facing Academy Lane change the existing bay window, it feels modern, and it loses the character, it's trying to emulate maybe like the 20's. if there is vinyl proposed is should not be appropriate.

Coombs- would like to see the dormers come in, the west elevation French doors should have a kick panel, south elevation windows on the 2nd floor should be split, the west elevation roof changes leverage coming down.

Patten- concur with the dormers to be reduced.

Welch- ready for a view.

Pohl- reduce the dormers.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions and view (Coombs)**

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # **HDC2023-01-7737**

2. Salisbury Cottage, LLC 01-7734	13 Academy Lane	New shed	42.4.3/112	Gryphon Architects
-----------------------------------	-----------------	----------	------------	--------------------

Voting Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Patten
 Alternates Oliver, Thornewill
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.
 Representing Ethan Griffin- Gryphon Architects
 Public None

Concerns None

Motion **Motion to track. (Coombs)**

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # **HDC2023-01-7734**

3. Mark Wilmot 01-7752	35 Monomoy Road	Add shutters, replace doors	54/74	Gryphon Architects
------------------------	-----------------	-----------------------------	-------	--------------------

Voting Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Dutra
 Alternates Thornewill, Patten
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.
 Representing Ethan Griffin- Gryphon Architects
 Public None

Concerns **Backus-** this is outside the OHD, but it is within Monomoy Heights which goes to 1850s, non-contributing circa 1988, Christopher Murray House, shutters on window are a character defining feature of many of the Monomoy Heights, the door as proposed is very modern and not appropriate for this type of vernacular house. Recommended to keep door as traditional as the previous one where the lights proportionate to the 12/12 double hung windows not as proposed.

Thornewill- not opposed to the shutters, worry about the color being too much and agrees with Holly on the door style it doesn't work if the shutters on the door are temporary in the winter. Tone down the color would be better.

Dutra- likes the proposed door. The transom is a little awkward, likes the 3 lite vs. the 8 lite. Windows maybe change the pane size a little bit to match to be a little bit more square.

Camp- not sure about Folger blue, it's a very strong blue, toned down or maybe no shutters.

Coombs- does not like the new door, prefers the old door.

Pohl- front door is atypical.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)**

Vote Carried unanimously Certificate # **HDC2023-01-7752**

4. Cynthia Nelson 01-7809	30 King Street	Demo/move off	73.4.2/113	Gryphon Architects
---------------------------	----------------	---------------	------------	--------------------

Voting Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, Patten
 Alternates Camp, Dutra
 Recused None

Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Ethan Griffin- Gryphon Architects				
Public	Rob Benchley- as always this could be reused, no concerns.				
Concerns (4:16)	Backus- there is no history on this, would be very helpful especially being located within the OHD of Sconset. Oliver- no problem on it being moved. Thornewill- would like for it to be moved. Coombs- prefers for it to be moved/ demo				
Motion	Motion to approve move off/ demo (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7809
5. Cynthia Nelson	01-7808	30 King Street	New studio	73.4.2/113	Gryphon Architects
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, Patten				
Alternates	Camp, Dutra				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Ethan Griffin- Gryphon Architects				
Public	Rob Benchley- follow Building with Nantucket in mind guidelines for the windows, appreciates the modest of the house.				
Concerns	Backus- two dwelling on lot circa 1938 that's along King St and circa 1975 at rear, both have HDC Surveys on file. The fenestrations seem chaotic does not follow Building with Nantucket in mind regarding the glass percentages and within the wall, the fenestration and the massing needs a little rework, and should be TDL in the OHD. Oliver- appreciates the stature and size and agrees with Holly windows are incongruent and chaotic. Coombs- windows need work. Thornewill- make all the headers align.				
Motion	Motion to minor revisions to the fenestration. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7808
6. Carlin Gifford	01-7767	4 Head of Plains	New dwelling	63/7	Gryphon Architects
Voting	Pohl, Oliver, Coombs, Patten, Dutra				
Alternates	Camp, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Ethan Griffin- Gryphon Architects				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:16)	Oliver- it goes with the cottage.				
Motion	Motion to approve with Nt grey trim & sash.				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7767
7. Carlin Gifford	01-7816	4 Head of Plains	New garage	63/7	Gryphon Architects
Voting	Pohl, Oliver, Coombs, Patten, Dutra				
Alternates	Camp, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Ethan Griffin- Gryphon Architects				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:16)	Oliver- the main concern is the verticality, perhaps break up the north, the side that faces the road, maybe a little pent roof over that or wider. Wider would be ideal. Coombs- making it a foot or 2 wider would make it smooth, the dormers on 2 nd story make it heavy, make windows 2/1. Patten- add a little shed roof to the parked bike area, to take away the verticality. Pohl- troubled over the verticality.				
Motion	Motion to approved through staff, drop the ridge & eave to 6-8", add porch roof on west elevation whole length of it and 6ft deep. Nt grey trim & sash.				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7816
8. Kerlin & Jason Hempel	01-7761	17 Orange Street	Window change	42.3.2/12	Stephen & Company
Voting	None				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:16)	Application not opened.				
Motion	No action				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7761

IX. OLD BUSINESS 01/17/23

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
	1. Matt & Caroline Manera 10-7351	15 Morey lane	New garage	73.3.1/38	EMDA
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Ethan McMorrow, EMDA				
Public	Robert Benchley- agrees with Holly, concerns are the busyness of the dormers. Future application for the same property should be bundled.				
Concerns	<p>Backus- circa 1906 structure, HDC survey on file. Appreciate the height reduction down to 22ft to the ridge, it could be reduce in height more to be compatible with the historic main house.</p> <p>Thornewill- appreciates the drop, but could come down even more not the whole building, but the 1st hipped roof can drop to the top of the floor joist, it could come down another 8” or more, the height of that wall looks very tall above the garage doors, windows above look crammed in that tiny little space, drop the whole thing, can get bigger windows on that elevation above where the roof is dropping down.</p> <p>Coombs- on the south side could bring down closer to the windows on the 1st floor there is a lot of space between the windows and the little hip roof, drop down a 1ft or 1 ½ ft.</p> <p>Camp- would like to see the main house, instead of shed dormers something simple, a little hip roof. Garage doors should white its more appropriate. Dormers should be trimmed out, simpler.</p> <p>Pohl- by increasing the roof pitch, taking 10 & 12 making into 11 and 12, keeping the ridge at the same height , dropping the eave, the north elevation with the garage doors seeing tremendous amount of space between the top of the doors and the eave, could be modified by increasing the roof pitch.</p>				
Motion	Motion to hold for revisions (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2022-10-7351
	2. 13 Commercial WF LLC 09-6996	13 Commercial Wharf	Rev- shorten structure	42.2.4/10	NAG
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill, Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Bill McGuire- NAG				
Public	Mickey Rowland-				
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The front façade should have an independent gable that is not flush with the side addition. The second floor of the side addition should step back several feet to help define the front gable. • The front porch roof should not extend over the steps and over the empty space beyond. This creates a very unusually tall post running into the ground. The porch roof can simply cover the door and adjacent window. • The porch is only about 3 feet wide and feels awkwardly narrow. It should be a foot or so wider, and the plate height should drop a little. • On the west elevation the second gable to the right should remain at its existing height to allow it to be secondary to the newer gable. This would keep the south elevation more or less as existing, creating more appropriate additive massing. 				
Concerns (3:00)	<p>Linda Williams- Member of ConCom, has spent several meetings on this project, they are confined to that footprint, ConCom is aware and the location, its not uncommon for the ConCom to impose restriction.</p> <p>Backus- structure was originally built in 2008 its non-contributing within the OHD, on 11/22 the commission asked for a simplification in the proposal, that has been provided, and more legible to differentiate between existing and previously approved and proposed. Appreciated the changes on the east, revised north is not successful with the shed porch, the small pent roof over the front door was more successful, there is something off on the South, the rendering there is no differentiation to the ridgeline to show some sort of additive massing. This structure is elevated to meet flood, but should be able to show that additive massing.</p> <p>Oliver- agrees with Mickey, on the front to have a little bit more differentiation of that main gable, the east the rebate on that side looks like it’s about a foot between the gable and the other mass, which goes forward the street. The roofs tie in at exactly the same height.</p> <p>Camp- likes the idea of stepping and showing different massing on north elevation. West elevation is better with just two windows on left hand mass. Likes the simplified and stepping back massing, anything to change the boxiness roof lines, one higher than the other by a couple of feet.</p> <p>Coombs- would like to see less boxy.</p> <p>Dutra- change some of the roof heights, the proposed drawings are good. Agrees with Mickey’s comments.</p>				
Motion	Motion to hold for revisions (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2022-09-6996

3.	Edward Gilberth 10-7346	51 Walsh St	New roofwalk & stairs	29/61	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch, Dutra				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Linda Williams				
Public	Mickey Rowland- Shingling the exterior roof walk stair does not make it disappear. It will still be visible from Hulbert Ave with an even more unusual appearance. Allowing this will set a very bad precedent. They need to create an interior access just like everyone else.				
Concerns (4:16)	Backus- 1930 structure, it is called Sandpiper, there is an HDC survey on file. Its was probably changed into a two story after the 90's, appreciates the photos of others within the area, however it was hard to discern the proposed details. Camp- drawings were hard to read the intentions. Oliver- feels the same way, the drawings are hard to look at.				
Motion	Motion to for better drawings, hold for revisions (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7750
4.	K225 LLC 03-5944	126 Main St.	Main House revision	42.3.2/98	**Linda Williams
Voting	None				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:16)	Application not opened				
Motion	No action				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7750

X. NEW BUSINESS 01/24/23

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Town of Nantucket	16 Broad St.	Alterations	42.4.2/30	SMRT Architects
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Dutra, Patten				
Alternates	Oliver, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Alej Jancic- SMRT				
Public	Mickey Rowland- <ul style="list-style-type: none"> New windows should be TDL – not SDL as indicated. The window schedule should be provided. Cement mortar color should match existing – not grey. The ceiling light fixtures at the entrances should be historic rather than the proposed plastic lens. 				
Concerns (3:32)	Backus- Circa 1964 colonial revival it is contributing towards the National District, the alterations proposed window replacement like kind to the cupola trim, corner boards, gutters, proposal for the Green Mountain windows are SDLs instead of TDLs. Window survey not included. Appreciates the sensitive like kind repairs to this contributing structure. Coombs- windows should be TDLs. Light over the door should be star shape made light not with plastic sides. Camp- possible to make TDL that is double glazed? Patten- ceiling light at the entrances find something more historic.				
Motion	Motion to hold for a view & provide window survey. (Dutra)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7750
2.	Town of Nantucket	20 South Water St.	Alterations Bld 1	42.4.2/29	SMRT Architects
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Dutra, Patten				
Alternates	Oliver, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Alej Jancic- SMRT				
Public	None				
Concerns	Backus- circa 1929 originally the fire station, then police station, application shows cedar shingles, but this is brick , would like clarification to be reflected on the application, the cupola is to be put back as a previously approved, should be exact replica to the 1929 police station . no concerns as long it all matches the 1944 file photo. Camp- would like to see the original put back to replica what was there originally. Coombs- make fire station door of the garage the way its supposed to be. Patten- as long cupola is replicated and the garage returned to its historic.				
Motion	Motion to approved through Staff with a request for the Town to replace door to the historically appropriate carriage door that was once there. (Camp)				

Vote	4-1 vote			Certificate #	HDC2023-01-7750
3.	Town of Nantucket	20 South Water St.	Alterations Bld 2	42.4.2/29	SMRT Architects
Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Dutra, Patten				
Alternates	Oliver, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Alek Jancic- SMRT				
Public	Mickey Rowland- Historic photos show carriage house style, multi-paned swinging garage doors. Considering the overall scope of the project, it would be appropriate to replace the front garage door with one similar to the historic photo.				
Concerns (4:00:00)	<p>Backus- former police station during the50s, window survey is required, Town should lead by example, no concerns on the proposal.</p> <p>Pohl- talking about a mock-up window and testing it in the field, this would be the building to do it on, not the brick building.</p> <p>Camp- agrees with Ray’s idea of trying the Green Mountain on this building.</p> <p>Coombs- agrees</p> <p>Dutra- agrees</p> <p>Patten- agrees</p>				
Motion	Motion to approve through staff with the installation of a green mountain window & provide a window survey. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously				
4.	Boys & Girls INC	67 Sparks Ave	Rooftop Solar	55/139.4	Sunwind
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, Dutra				
Alternates	Camp, Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, & photos.				
Representing	Tim Holmes- Sunwind				
Public	None				
Concerns	None				
Motion	Motion to approved as submitted. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried unanimously				
5.	Boys & Girls INC	69 Sparks Ave	Rooftop Solar	55/139.4	Sunwind
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, Dutra				
Alternates	Camp, Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, & photos.				
Representing	Tim Holmes- Sunwind				
Public	None				
Concerns	Two separate applications need for the two structures on property.				
Motion	Motion to approve Main house only, garage will be approved through staff. (Thornewill)				
Vote	Carried unanimously				
6.	Boys & Girls INC	71 Sparks Ave	Rooftop Solar	55/139.4	Sunwind
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, Dutra				
Alternates	Camp, Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, & photos.				
Representing	Tim Holmes- Sunwind				
Public	None				
Concerns	<p>Oliver- front of the building, the shallow roof pitch,</p> <p>Camp- built in 1970, why not do solar on the back</p> <p>Coombs- agrees with Camp</p> <p>Thornewill- roof is a light color</p>				
Motion	Motion to hold for revisions (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously				
7.	Boys & Girls INC	75 Sparks Ave	Rooftop Solar	55/139.4	Sunwind
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, Dutra				
Alternates	Camp, Patten				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, & photos.				
Representing	Tim Holmes- Sunwind				
Public	None				
Concerns	None				
Motion	Motion to hold for revisions (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously				

Proposed HDC Minutes for February 7, 2023

8.	Boys & Girls INC	89 Pleasant St	Rooftop Solar	55/139.4	Sunwind
	Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, Dutra			
	Alternates	Camp, Patten			
	Recused	None			
	Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, & photos.			
	Representing	Tim Holmes- Sunwind			
	Public	None			
	Concerns	Oliver- we are asking not on the front of a building and preferably a dark roof			
	Motion	Motion to hold for revisions and view. (Camp)			
	Vote	Carried unanimously			
				Certificate #	HDC202
9.	Kim Glowacki	5 Meader St	Window replacement	42.3.2/40	Val Oliver
	Voting	None			
	Alternates	None			
	Recused	None			
	Documentation	None			
	Representing	None			
	Public	None			
	Concerns	Not opened at this time.			
	Motion	No Action			
	Vote	Carried unanimously			
				Certificate #	HDC202
10.	Sun Island Nm Trust	5a Sun Island Rd	Resurface walls	69/29.3	Val Oliver
	Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill, Patten			
	Alternates	Dutra			
	Recused	Oliver			
	Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, & photos.			
	Representing	Val Oliver			
	Public	None			
	Concerns	Thornewill- we just made someone else do shingle that was a two-story building, this is one-story. Vertical barn board to gray out and it would be cheaper than mental.			
	Motion	Motion to view. (Camp)			
	Vote	Carried unanimously			
				Certificate #	HDC202
11.	Sun Island Nm Trust	9 Sun Island Rd	Resurface walls	69/29.2	Val Oliver
	Voting	Pohl, Camp, Coombs, Thornewill, Patten			
	Alternates	Dutra			
	Recused	Oliver			
	Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, & photos.			
	Representing	Val Oliver			
	Public	None			
	Concerns	None			
	Motion	Motion to view. (Camp)			
	Vote	Carried unanimously			
				Certificate #	HDC202

Rest Held for February 9, 2023

12.	White Elephant	60 Easton St	Fence, gate, & arbors	42.4.1/60	Dennis Patnaude
13.	Rob & Lydia Petty	27 Sankaty Rd	Hardscape- new patio	73.4.2/7.1	Hristo Rashkov
14.	Robert Rios	23 Tashama Ln	Add skylight	55/464	Thornewill Design
15.	Kevin Gentzel	54 Orange St	Repair & replace deck	54/41/18	Gryphon Architects
16.	Charles Bruno	10 Monohansett rd.	New barn	79/142	Linda Williams
17.	Susan Balling	11 Nobadeer way	Demo garage	68/14	Linda Williams
18.	ACK 86 QR LLC	86 Quidnet Rd	Renovate/alter garage	21/102	Linda Williams
19.	Susan O'Malley	10 New Mill St	New fence	55.4.4/9	Linda Williams
20.	Nicole Tirapelli	18 Center St	Driveway	73.1.3/105	Nicole Tirapelli
21.	Bob Risika	18 Maclean Lane	New pool & hardscape	55/448	Atlantic Landscaping
22.	Raul Alan	109 Main St	Shed rev 09-7131	42.3.3/150	JB Studio
23.	5 Hillers Ln LLC	5 Hillers Ln	Driveway & fence	42.3.2/118	JB Studio
24.	5 Hiller Ln LLC	5 Hillers Ln	Chgn storm door	42.3.2/118	JB Studio
25.	Carleton Dafoe	102 Quidnet Rd	Fenestration roof & stairs	21/74	JB Studio
26.	7 Laurretta Lane LLC	7 Laurretta Lane	New dwelling	14/53	S. Metz
27.	7 Laurretta Lane LLC	7 Laurretta Lane	MH demo/ move off	14/53	S. Metz
28.	7 Laurretta Lane LLC	7 Laurretta Lane	Shed demo/ move off	14/53	S. Metz
29.	8 Maple LLC	Maple Ln Lot 8	New dwelling	67/303	Emeritus LTD
30.	8 Maple LLC	Maple Ln Lot 8	New garage	67/303	Emeritus LTD
31.	Bent Shimmo Nominee	4 South valley rd.	New dwelling	43/165 165.1	EMDA
32.	Bent Shimmo Nominee	4 South Valley Rd	Demo/ move off bldg.	43/165 165.1	EMDA

33. Laura Bench	17 Pleasant St	New garage studio	42.3.3/77	Gryphon Architects
34. 450 Green Park LLC	2 Stone Alley	Hardscape	39/24.1	Ahern
35. 35 LBR LLC	35 Low Beach Rd	Addition	74/34	Gryphon Architects
36. J. Malitsky & A. Bryn	253 Madaket rd	New 2 nd dwelling	59.4/210	LINK

XI. OLD BUSINESS 01/31/23

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Fair City LLC 08-6886	115 Old South Rd	Commercial bldg. LOT E	68/112	Linda Williams
2.	Fair City LLC 08-6887	115 Old South Rd	Commercial bldg. LOT F	68/112	Linda Williams
3.	Duncan Richardson 11-7494	21 Golfview Dr	Door & window revisions	66/174	SMRD
4.	Horchow & Routman 06-6534	33 Cliff Rd	MH fenestration, ramp, dormer	42.4.4/5	CWA/Link
5.	Horchow & Routman 06-6540	33 Cliff Rd	GH addition & renovation	42.4.4/5	CWA/Link
6.	Horchow & Routman 06-6541	33 Cliff Rd	Garage revision	42.4.4/5	CWA/Link
7.	J & B Leaf LLC 11-5037	43 Kendrick Ave	Guest house	76.4.3/31	CWA/Link
8.	Tamara Wing 11-6510	52 West Chester st	Guest house	41/381	Emeritus LTD
9.	John Hendricks 12-7586	1 Jefferson Ln	Door Change	55.4.1/74.1	Emeritus LTD
10.	Ashkan Vaziri 01-7692	9 Woodbury Lane	New dwelling	41/551	Studio PPark
11.	*Jean Moran 01-5621	4 Washington Ave	New Pool	60.2.4/65	Linda Williams
12.	*Jean Moran 01-5199	4 Washington Ave	New Garage	60.2.4/65	Linda Williams

XI. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes Motion Vote	January 3, 10, 12, 17, 24, 26 2023 Motion to approve January 12,17,24,26 2023. (Coombs) Hold January 3, 10 2023 for Mr. Welch's edits. Carried 5-0
Review Minutes	January 31 & February 2, 2023
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting- February 9th at 1pm *HYBRID & IN-PERSON @ 2 FAIRGROUND RD. - CONFERENCE RM. • Classification of street trees & vegetating mapping • Discussion of Wind Turbines • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, intro (update as needed) • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions • Discussion of options for house moves

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 8:32 pm. (Coombs)**
Vote Carried unanimously

YouTube link: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=8zbQPJSuVYY&t=10518s>

Submitted by:

Esmeralda Martinez

Nantucket Old Historic District

Sconset Old Historic District

Madaket Old Village