Historic District Commission

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members: Micky Rowland, Lucy Dillon, Jascin Finger, Angus Macleod, Brook Meerbergen
Alternate Member: None

Planning and Land Use Services
2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554

MINUTES
Monday February 10, 2020

I. Procedural Business

Call to order at 3:30 pm
Attending members: Angus Macleod, Lucy Dillon, Jascin Leonardo-Finger
Absent members: Brook Meerbergen, Mickey Rowland
Late arrivals:
Early Departures: Angus Macleod (4:00pm)

Motion to Adopt Agenda made by Angus Macleod; Seconded by Jascin Leonardo-Finger
Vote: carried unanimously

Approval of Minutes: **N/A**
No vote taken.

II. Public Comment

None.

III. New Business – See attached Comments

	Property Owner Street	Street Address	Scope of Work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1.	Pauline Spencer	38 York Street	Shed Addition	55.4.1-50	Ross Goodwin
2.	Scott + Kristin Paton	33 Orange Street	Hardscaping	42.3.2-199	The Garden Group
3.	White Elephant Hotel LLC	4 Willard Street	Shed	42.4.1-57	Mike Duffy
4.	Carolyn Barg Trust	19 ½ W. Chester Street	Spa, otdr shower, hardscape	42.4.3-7.1	Ahern LLC
5.	23 Commercial Wharf JA LLC	23 Commercial Wharf	Granite raised bed	42.2.4-5	The Garden Group
6.	Edward Mills	4 Traders Lane	Drvwy material + extend fence	42.3.3-22	Self
7.	Art State Prop	92 Washington Street	New Dwelling	42.2.3-22	Smith + Hutton Arch
8.	K4 LLC	48 Orange Street	Roof Stairs	42.3.2-97	Chris Skehel
9.	Stevenson, Woodie	75 N. Liberty Street	Door	41-140	Val Oliver
10.	Century House Real Estate	10B Cliff Road	Color Change	42.4.4-61	Emeritus
11.	11 India St. LLC	11 India Street	Deck railing replacement	42.3.1-122.1	Emeritus
12.	3 Pleasant Street NT	3 Pleasant Street	Change fene/expand deck	42.3.3-155	Linda Williams
13.	Kristin Paton	33 Orange Street	Roofwalk alterations	42.3.2-199	Val Oliver
14.	12 Lincoln Ave Nom Trust	12 Lincoln Avenue	Addition revisions	30-183	Emeritus
15.	Diane Ash	23 Pine Street	Demo shed	42.3.2-113	Emeritus
16.	SW Assoc Realty Trust	5 S. Water Street	2nd/3rd Floor Addition	42.3.1-270	Emeritus
17.	Pug Cottage Nom Trust	13A Lincoln Ave	Addition	30-135.1	Botticelli + Pohl
18.	Kevin Fish	36 York Street	Porch	55.4.1-103	EMDA
19.	Shneider	84 Main Street	Addition and alteration	42.3.3-20	Thornewill
20.	Hulbert ACK II LLC	4 Hulbert Ave	MH lift, reno, addition	42.1.4/2	Sophia Metz
~~21.~~	~~Mark Thurston~~	~~46 Walsh Street~~	~~New Shed~~	~~29-101.1~~	~~Lewis Kelsey~~
22.	Michael Zarcone	16 Cherry Street	Pool and patio	55-379	Jesse Dutra

No motion made to approve comments from New Business items 1 – 7.
No quorum for New Business items 8 – 22.

IV. Other Business

None.

V. Adjournment

No quorum to make motion and/or vote after Agnus' departure at 4pm.

Submitted by Kadeem McCarthy

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 3:34

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
(✓) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant P. Spencer Address 38 York

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed (X) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation

East Elevation

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)*

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 3:37

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
(✓) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant Paton Address 33 Orange

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation

There are no photos of house or site

Too much hardscaping. Bluestone is not a typical or approved filler - should be grass or brick w/cobble.

East Elevation

There is not enough info.

HSAB wants back

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)*

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 3:41

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod ( ) Lucy Dillon ( ) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant White Elephant Address 4 Willard

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation Should not be on Easton St. corner
Should go in back (NW?) corner by Willard
neighbor.

East Elevation

West Elevation There are no plans showing us where going.

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)*
Jascin Leonardo Finger Lucy Dillon

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 3:44

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
(✓) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant C. Barg Trust Address 19 1/2 W Chester

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines (X) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation

HSAB would like back w/ proposed fencing to screen b/c this high up on a hill & fully visible.

East Elevation

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)* Jascin Leonardo Lucy Dillon

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 3:47

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod ( ) Lucy Dillon ( ) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant 23 Commercial Wharf Address 23 Commercial Wharf

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines (X) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation

Not in keeping w/ wharf area
Needs a diff. design

East Elevation

HSAB wants back

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)*

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 3:50

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
(✓) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant Edward Mills Address 4 Traders Lane

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing (X) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation

★ Note - has owner rec'd permission from easement holder? They must.

East Elevation

Need more info on pattern
bricks need to run parallel to street.

West Elevation

What fence happening on Pine St @ rear?

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)*

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 3:56

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod ( ) Lucy Dillon ( ) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant AA State Prop Address 92 Washington

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation
Please clarify intent on previous approvals

East Elevation
Overall - windows too small for the wall area & dormers
north side too much glazing & too ~~much~~ close

West Elevation
Single door on balcony w/ flanking windows more appropriate

South Elevation
A/C unit location
not enough fenestration on east elevation.

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)*

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 4:18

No Quorum

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant K4LLC Address 48 Orange

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines (X) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation

East Elevation

No stairs on roof
not appropriate

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)*

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 4:19

NO Quorum

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant Stevenson Address 75 N Liberty

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed (X) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation

East Elevation

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)* Lucy Dillon

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 4:21

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

NO QUORUM

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant Century House Address 10 B Cliff

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines (X) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation

East Elevation

* Completly not acceptable to have black trim, black fences

West Elevation

Not appropriate colors for historic 1810 house.

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)* Jascin Finger Lucy Dillon

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 4:24

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

No Quorum

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant 11 India LLC Address 11 India

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing (X) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

(X) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines (X) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation

No date
No photos

East Elevation

This should not need/have
to be changed

West Elevation

But if it is - it has to match
exactly. In particular

South Elevation

concerns over unique newell post.

Other

HSAB wants back.

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)*

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 4:29

No Quorum

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant 3 Pleasant St. NT Address 3 Pleasant

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation

Deck too large & will be visible
suggest making it longer towards
backyard instead

East Elevation

Grill should not be on deck

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)* Jascin Lucy Dillon

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 4:34

No Quorum

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod ( ) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant Paton Estate Address 33 Orange

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation → enlarged roofwalk not in keeping w/house or its size

East Elevation The fact that it bumps into chimney is how it was done on this size & style house in 19th c. & 18th c.

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)* Jascin Finger Lucy Dillon

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 4:37

No Quorum

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant 12 Lincoln Nominee Trust Address 12 Lincoln

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments
(X) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View
( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation NO DATE NO PHOTOS

East Elevation are we bumping out for a staircase? Should not be

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)* Lucy Dillon
Jascin Finger

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 4:45 NO QUORUM

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant Ash Address 23 Pine

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation

Is a new one being proposed? Only see a demo/move.

East Elevation

Please reuse this ~~more~~ nice older shed & its better

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)*

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time Feb. 10, 2020 4:49 NO ~~Quorum~~ Quorum

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant SW Assoc Realty Trust Address 5 S Water

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines (X) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation

This is completely inappropriate. It's smack dab in middle of Town on a building that is central to the district. It will COMPLETELY change the character of the building, the streetscape & town. You cannot compare this to other 3-storey buildings in town or nearby - esp. those added onto before the HDC in existence.

East Elevation

West Elevation

South Elevation

Question date put on application.

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)*

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 4:56

NO QUORUM

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant Pug Cottage Nom. Trust Address 13A Lincoln

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

(X) Incomplete application (X) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

No photos

North Elevation

We have no date. It's hard to think about w/ no date. Is this an early

East Elevation

carriage house/garage for Lincoln Ave?

West Elevation

It is wagging the original - too tall and looms over the front.

South Elevation

Other

HSAB would like back - w/ photos & date and w/ photos of main house.

Public Comment

Where A/C located?

Signatures *(three-members required for quorum)*
Jascin Finger Lucy Dillon

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time February 10, 2020 4:06

To: Historic District Commission No quorum
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant Fish Address 36 York

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing (X) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation

Concerns w/ the porch & visibility of it & the fireplace from street – not approved

East Elevation

porch too big
there is also an existing patio not on plans

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)*

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time Feb 10, 2020 5:01 No Quorum

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant ~~Sir~~ Shneider Address 84 Main

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing (X) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation

NO DATE

East Elevation

WORK HAS BEEN ONGOING!!
Need a fine! They have pulled out dug underneath house & built a new foundation!

West Elevation

Deck WAY too big - runs ~~ft~~ almost 19' along Pine - totally exposed.

South Elevation

No issue w/ front steps tho that photo - likely ~~does~~ not original steps

Other

You can have ONE skylight per roof plane and shouldn't have any in OHD so can keep existing only where A/C units

Public Comment

Question visibility of basement entry as walk down Pine to Main.
No 6' grill on deck on Pine St. - belongs in yard - and by code!

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)*

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time Feb 10, 2020 5:13 No Quorum

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant Hulbert ACK II LLC Address 4 Hulbert

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

(X) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation Need date - may be 1930s

East Elevation A roofwalk was never on a ca 1930s house. Not appropriate & looks silly

West Elevation Rear elevation is fully visible.

South Elevation Where is A/C?

Other East - front door - remove sidelights - not appropriate w/that door
Front - ~~A windows reduce to "B"s - (the triple gang)~~
"D" windows on front need to be "C" - ~~that~~ "D" size is accent and looks odd being used so much

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)*

Historic Structures Advisory Board *Meeting Memorandum* **HDC/HSAB**

Date/Time Feb 10, 2020 5:23

No Quorum

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod ( ) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant Zarone Address 16 Cherry

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns (X) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate *(As noted below)*

North Elevation Question if pool can be approved here

East Elevation Question visibility from Pleasant

West Elevation ~~[illegible]~~

South Elevation Is Shower currently existing under deck?

Other

Public Comment

Signatures *(three members required for quorum)* [illegible] [illegible]