Historic District Commission

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members: Micky Rowland, Lucy Dillon, Jascin Finger, Angus Macleod, Brook Meerbergen
Alternate Member: None

Planning and Land Use Services
2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554

MINUTES
Monday February 10, 2020

I. Procedural Business
Call to order at 3:30 pm
Attending members: Angus Macleod, Lucy Dillon, Jascin Leonardo-Finger
Absent members: Brook Meerbergen, Mickey Rowland
Late arrivals:
Early Departures: Angus Macleod (4:00pm)

Motion to Adopt Agenda made by Angus Macleod; Seconded by Jascin Leonardo-Finger
Vote: carried unanimously

Approval of Minutes: N/A
No vote taken.

II. Public Comment
None.
### III. New Business – See attached Comments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Property Owner</th>
<th>Street Address</th>
<th>Scope of Work</th>
<th>Map/Parcel</th>
<th>Agent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pauline Spencer</td>
<td>38 York Street</td>
<td>Shed Addition</td>
<td>55.4.1-50</td>
<td>Ross Goodwin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scott + Kristin Paton</td>
<td>33 Orange Street</td>
<td>Hardscaping</td>
<td>42.3.2-199</td>
<td>The Garden Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White Elephant Hotel LLC</td>
<td>4 Willard Street</td>
<td>Shed</td>
<td>42.4.1-57</td>
<td>Mike Duffy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carolyn Barg Trust</td>
<td>19 ½ W. Chester Street</td>
<td>Spa, otdr shower, hardscape</td>
<td>42.4.3-7.1</td>
<td>Ahern LLC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23 Commercial Wharf JA LLC</td>
<td>23 Commercial Wharf</td>
<td>Granite raised bed</td>
<td>42.2.4-5</td>
<td>The Garden Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edward Mills</td>
<td>4 Traders Lane</td>
<td>Drvwy material + extend fence</td>
<td>42.3.3-22</td>
<td>Self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Art State Prop</td>
<td>92 Washington Street</td>
<td>New Dwelling</td>
<td>42.2.3-22</td>
<td>Smith + Hutton Arch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K4 LLC</td>
<td>48 Orange Street</td>
<td>Roof Stairs</td>
<td>42.3.2-97</td>
<td>Chris Skehel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stevenson, Woodie</td>
<td>75 N. Liberty Street</td>
<td>Door</td>
<td>41-140</td>
<td>Val Oliver</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Century House Real Estate</td>
<td>10B Cliff Road</td>
<td>Color Change</td>
<td>42.4.4-61</td>
<td>Emeritus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 India St. LLC</td>
<td>11 India Street</td>
<td>Deck railing replacement</td>
<td>42.3.1-122.1</td>
<td>Emeritus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Pleasant Street NT</td>
<td>3 Pleasant Street</td>
<td>Change fene/expand deck</td>
<td>42.3.3-155</td>
<td>Linda Williams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kristin Paton</td>
<td>33 Orange Street</td>
<td>Roofwalk alterations</td>
<td>42.3.2-199</td>
<td>Val Oliver</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Lincoln Ave Nom Trust</td>
<td>12 Lincoln Avenue</td>
<td>Addition revisions</td>
<td>30-183</td>
<td>Emeritus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diane Ash</td>
<td>23 Pine Street</td>
<td>Demo shed</td>
<td>42.3.2-113</td>
<td>Emeritus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SW Assoc Realty Trust</td>
<td>5 S. Water Street</td>
<td>2nd/3rd Floor Addition</td>
<td>42.3.1-270</td>
<td>Emeritus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pug Cottage Nom Trust</td>
<td>13A Lincoln Ave</td>
<td>Addition</td>
<td>30-135.1</td>
<td>Botticelli + Pohl</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kevin Fish</td>
<td>36 York Street</td>
<td>Porch</td>
<td>55.4.1-103</td>
<td>EMDA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shneider</td>
<td>84 Main Street</td>
<td>Addition and alteration</td>
<td>42.3.3-20</td>
<td>Thornewill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hulbert ACK II LLC</td>
<td>4 Hulbert Ave</td>
<td>MH lift, reno, addition</td>
<td>42.1.4/2</td>
<td>Sophia Metz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Zarcone</td>
<td>16 Cherry Street</td>
<td>New Shed</td>
<td>29-101.1</td>
<td>Lewis Kelsey</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

No motion made to approve comments from New Business items 1 – 7.
No quorum for New Business items 8 – 22.

### IV. Other Business

None.

### V. Adjournment

No quorum to make motion and/or vote after Agnus’ departure at 4pm.

Submitted by Kadeem McCarthy
Historic Structures Advisory Board  Meeting Memorandum

Date/Time: February 10, 2020 3:34

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
(✓) Angus MacLeod (✓) Lucy Dillon (✓) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant: P. Spencer  Address: 38 York

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments
( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed (✓) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View
( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate (As noted below)

North Elevation

East Elevation

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures (three members required for quorum): [Signatures]

[Signatures] [Signatures] [Signatures]
Date/Time: February 10, 2020 3:37

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present:
- Angus MacLeod
- Lucy Dillon
- Jascin Leonardo Finger
- Milton Rowland
- Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant: Eaton
Address: 33 Orange

Historic information/knowz history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments:
( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View
( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate (As noted below)

North Elevation:
There are no photos of house or site.
Too much hardscaping. Bluestone is not a typical or approved filler—should be grass or brick w/cobble.

East Elevation:
There is not enough info.
HSAB wants back

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures (three members required for quorum)

[Signatures]
Historic Structures Advisory Board  Meeting Memorandum

Date/Time February 10, 2020 3:41

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod  ( ) Lucy Dillon  ( ) Jascin Leonardo Finger  ( ) Milton Rowland  ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant White Elephant  Address 4 Willard

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing  ( ) Contributing  ( ) Individually significant

Comments
( ) Incomplete application  ( ) Historical information needed  ( ) No Concerns  ( ) Recommend View
( ) Does not meet guidelines  ( ) Not appropriate  (as noted below)

North Elevation

Should not be on Easton St. corner

Should go in back (SW?) corner by Willard

East Elevation

neighbor

West Elevation

There are no plans showing us where going

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures (three members required for quorum)

[Signatures]

[Signatures]
To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod ( ) Lucy Dillon ( ) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant: Barg Trust
Address: 19 1/2 W Chester

Historic information/know History

( ) Non-Contribution ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments
( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View
( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate (As noted below)

North Elevation

[Handwritten Notes: HSB would like back w/ proposed fencing to screen b/c this]

East Elevation

[Handwritten Notes: high up on a hill u fully visible.]

West Elevation


South Elevation


Other


Public Comment


Signatures (three members required for quorum)

[Handwritten Signatures: [Redacted for privacy]
Date/Time: February 10, 2020 3:47

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present:
( ) Angus MacLeod ( ) Lucy Dillon ( ) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant: 23 Commercial Wharf
Address: 23 Commercial Wharf

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments
( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View
( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate (As noted below)

North Elevation

[Not in keeping with wharf area]

[Needs a diff. design]

East Elevation

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures (three members required for quorum)
Date/Time  February 10, 2020  3:50

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod  ( ) Lucy Dillon  ( ) Jascin Leonardo Finger  ( ) Milton Rowland  ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant  Edward Mills  Address  4 Traders Lane

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing  ( ) Contributing  X Individually significant

Comments
( ) Incomplete application  ( ) Historical information needed  ( ) No Concerns  ( ) Recommend View
( ) Does not meet guidelines  ( ) Not appropriate  (As noted below)

North Elevation
Note - has owner rec'd permission from easement holder? They must.

East Elevation
Need more info on pattern
backs need to run parallel to street.

West Elevation
What fence happening on Pine St @ rear?

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures (three members required for quorum)

[Signatures]
Date/Time: February 10, 2020 3:50

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod ( ) Lucy Dillon ( ) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant: A/P State Prop
Address: 92 Washington

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments
( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View
( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate (As noted below)

North Elevation
Please clarify intent on previous approvals

East Elevation
Overall - windows too small for the wall area
North side - too much glazing at too much close

West Elevation
Single door on balcony with planting windows
More appropriate

South Elevation
A/C unit location
Not enough fenestration on east elevation.

Other

Public Comment

Signatures (three members required for quorum)
Date/Time: February 10, 2020 4:18

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present:
( ) Angus MacLeod ( ) Lucy Dillon ( ) Jesin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant: 440C
Address: 48 Orange

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments:
( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View
( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate (As noted below)

North Elevation

East Elevation: No stairs on roof not appropriate

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures (three members required for quorum)

[Signatures]
Historic Structures Advisory Board  Meeting Memorandum  

Date/Time: February 10, 2020 4:19  

NO QUORUM  

To: Historic District Commission  
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board  

Members Present:  
- Angus MacLeod
- Lucy Dillon
- Jascin Leonardo Finger
- Milton Rowland
- Brook Meerbergen

Alternate: None  

Applicant: STEVENS  
Address: 75 N Liberty  

Historic information/known history  

( ) Non-Contributing  ( ) Contributing  ( ) Individually significant  

Comments  
( ) Incomplete application  ( ) Historical information needed  ( ) No Concerns  ( ) Recommend View  
( ) Does not meet guidelines  ( ) Not appropriate  (As noted below)  

North Elevation  

East Elevation  

West Elevation  

South Elevation  

Other  

Public Comment  

Signatures (three members required for quorum):  

[Signature]
[Signature]
[Signature]
Date/Time: February 10, 2020 4:21

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod (X) Lucy Dillon (X) Jasmin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant: Centenary House
Address: 1013 Cliff

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments
( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View
( ) Does not meet guidelines (X) Not appropriate (As noted above)

North Elevation

East Elevation

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures (three members required for quorum):

[Signatures]

[Signatures]
Date/Time: February 10, 2020 4:24 PM

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present:
- Angus MacLeod
- Lucy Dillon
- Jascin Leonardo-Finger
- Milton Rowland
- Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Quorum

Applicant: 11 India LLC
Address: 11 India

Historic information/known history:

Comments:
- Incomplete application
- Historical information needed
- No Concerns
- Recommend View
- Does not meet guidelines
- Not appropriate (as noted below)

North Elevation:
- No date
- No photos

East Elevation:
- This should not need/have to be changed

West Elevation:
- But if it is - it has to match exactly, in particular

South Elevation:
- Concerns over unique newel post

Other:
- HSMB wants back

Public Comment:

Signatures (three members required for quorum):
Lucy Dillon

[Signatures]
Date/Time: February 10, 2020 4:29  

To: Historic District Commission  
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board  

Members Present  
( ) Angus MacLeod  ( ) Lucy Dillon  ( ) Martin Leonardo Finger  ( ) Milton Rowland  ( ) Brook Meerbergen  
Alternate: None  

Applicant: Pleasant St.  
Address: Pleasant St.  

Historic information/known history: 

( ) Non-Contributing  ( ) Contributing  ( ) Individually significant  

Comments:  
( ) Incomplete application  ( ) Historical information needed  ( ) No Concerns  ( ) Recommend View  
( ) Does not meet guidelines  ( ) Not appropriate  (As noted below)  

North Elevation:  
Deck too large; will be visible.  
Suggest making it longer towards backyard instead.  

East Elevation:  
Grill should not be on deck.  

West Elevation:  

South Elevation:  

Other:  

Public Comment:  

Signatures (three members required for quorum):  

(Handwritten signature)
Historic Structures Advisory Board  Meeting Memorandum

Date/Time: February 10, 2020  4:34

No Quorum

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present:
( ) Angus MacLeod  ( ) Nancy Dillon  ( ) Jason Leonardo Finger  ( ) Milton Rowland  ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant: Paton Estate  Address: 33 Orange

Historic information/known history:

( ) Non-Contributing  ( ) Contributing  ( ) Individually significant

Comments:
( ) Incomplete application  ( ) Historical information needed  ( ) No Concerns  ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines  ( ) Not appropriate  (As noted below)

North Elevation:

> enlarged roofwalk not in keeping with house or its size

East Elevation:

The fact that it bumps into chimney is how it was done on this size and style house in 1920's - 1930's.

West Elevation:

South Elevation:

Other:

Public Comment:

Signatures (three members required for quorum):

[Signatures]
Date/Time: February 10, 2020 4:37

No Quorum

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod ( ) Lucy Dillon ( ) Jascin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant: 12 Lincoln
Address: 12 Lincoln

Historic information/knowa history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments
( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View
( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate (As noted below)

North Elevation

NO DATE NO PHOTOS

East Elevation

are we bumping out for a staircase?

should not be

West Elevation


South Elevation


Other


Public Comment


Signatures (three members required for quorum)

[Signatures]
Historic Structures Advisory Board

Meeting Memorandum

Date/Time: *February 10, 2020 4:45*  
**NO QUORUM**

To: Historic District Commission  
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present: ( ) Angus MacLeod ( ) Lucy Dillon ( ) Jasmin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen  
Alternate: None

Applicant: **Ash**  
Address: **23 Pine**

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate (as noted below)

North Elevation

Is a new one being proposed? Only

see a demo/move.

East Elevation

Please reuse this nice older shed & its better

West Elevation

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures (three members required for approval)
Historic Structures Advisory Board  Meeting Memorandum  

Date/Time  Feb 10, 2020  4:49  No Quorum

To: Historic District Commission  
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present  
( ) Angus MacLeaix  ( ) Lucy Dilllon  ( ) Jacin Leonardo Fingier  ( ) Milton Rowland  ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant: SW Above Realty Trust  Address: 5 SW Water

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing  ( ) Contributing  ( ) Individually significant

Comments

( ) Incomplete application  ( ) Historical information needed  ( ) No Concerns  ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines  X  Not appropriate  (As noted below)

North Elevation  
This is completely inappropriate. It's smack dab in middle of town on a building that is central to the district. It will completely change the character of the building. The streetscape of a town. You cannot compare this to other 3 story buildings in town or nearby - esp those added onto before.  

South Elevation

Other

Public Comment

Signatures (three members required for quorum)
NO QUORUM

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod ( ) Lucy Dillon ( ) Jascin Leonardo Finner ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant: Nug Cottage Nom. Trust
Address: 13A Lincoln

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments

X Incomplete application

Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate (As noted below)

No photos

North Elevation

We have no date. It's hard to think about w/ no date. Is this an early

East Elevation

Carnage house garage for Lincoln Ave.

West Elevation

Is it wagging the original - too tall

and looms over the front.

South Elevation

Other

It's MB would like back w/ photos a date

and w/ photos of main house.

Public Comment

Where A/C located?

Signatures (three members required for approval)

[Signatures]
Historic Structures Advisory Board

Meeting Memorandum

Date/Time: February 10, 2020 4:06

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present:
( ) Angus MacLeod
( ) Lucy Dillon
( ) Jascin Leonardo Finger
( ) Milton Rowland
( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant: Fish
Address: 306 York

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing
( ) Contributing
( ) Individually significant

Comments:
( ) Incomplete application
( ) Historical information needed
( ) No Concerns
( ) Recommend View
( ) Does not meet guidelines
( ) Not appropriate

(As noted below)

North Elevation:

Concerns w/the porch & visibility of fireplace from street - not approved

East Elevation:

Porch too big

West Elevation:

There is also an existing porch, not on plans

South Elevation:

Other:

Public Comment:

Signatures (three members required for quorum):

[Signatures of members]
Date/Time: Feb 10, 2020 5:01

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present:
( ) Angus MacLeod
( ) Lucy Dillon
( ) Conc. Leonardo Finger
( ) Milton Rowland
( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant: S. Schneider
Address: 84 Main

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing
( ) Contributing

Individually significant

Comments:
( ) Incomplete application
( ) Historical information needed
( ) No Concerns
( ) Recommend View
( ) Does not meet guidelines
( ) Not appropriate

As noted below:

North Elevation: NO DATE

East Elevation:

WORK HAS BEEN ONGOING!!

Need a fire! They have pulled out underneath house & built a new foundation!

West Elevation:

Deck WAY too big - minus 48 almost 17 along fire - totally expand.

No issue w/ front step who that photo likely shows not original step

South Elevation:

You can have ONE skylight per roof plane.

Other:

and shouldn't have any in CTID so can keep existing only

Where A/C units

Public Comment:

Question visibility of basement entry as well down line to Main.

No 6' grill on deck on Fire St. - belongs in yard - and by code!

Signatures (three members required for quorum):
Date/Time: February 10, 2020, 5:13

To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present:
- Angus MacLeod
- Lucy Dillon
- Jacek Leonardo Finger
- Milton Rowland
- Brook Meerbergen

Alternate: None

Applicant: Hubert Ack II LLC
Address: 4 Hubert

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing  ( ) Contributing  ( ) Individually significant

Comments:

☑ Incomplete application  ( ) Historical information needed  ( ) No Concerns  ( ) Recommend View

( ) Does not meet guidelines  ( ) Not appropriate  (As noted below)

North Elevation:

Need date - may be 1930s

East Elevation:

A roofwalk was never on a cad 1930s house. Not appropriate & looks silly.

West Elevation:

Rear elevation is fully visible.

South Elevation:

Where is A/C?

Other:

- East - front door, remove sidelights, not appropriate

- Front - a window reduce to "B", (the triple gang)

Public Comment:

"D windows on front need to be "C", size is accent and looks odd being used so much.

Signatures (three members required for quorum):

[Signatures]

[Signatures]
To: Historic District Commission
From: Historic Structures Advisory Board

Members Present
( ) Angus MacLeod ( ) Lucy Dillon ( ) Jasmin Leonardo Finger ( ) Milton Rowland ( ) Brook Meerbergen
Alternate: None

Applicant: Zarone
Address: He Cherry

Historic information/known history

( ) Non-Contributing ( ) Contributing ( ) Individually significant

Comments
( ) Incomplete application ( ) Historical information needed ( ) No Concerns ( ) Recommend View
( ) Does not meet guidelines ( ) Not appropriate (As noted below)

North Elevation

Question if pool can be approved here

East Elevation

Question visibility from Pleasant

West Elevation


South Elevation

Is shower currently existing under-deck?

Other

Public Comment

Signatures (three members required for quorum)