



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Terence Watterson, Jessie Dutra

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, March 3, 2020

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room – 4:30 p.m.

Called to order at 4:30 p.m. and announcements by Ms. Coombs

Staff in attendance: Cathy Flynn, Land Use Specialist; Kadeem McCarthy, Administrative Specialist; Esmeralda Martinez, Administrative Specialist; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner
 Attending Members: Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Watterson
 Absent Members: Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Dutra
 Late Arrivals: Welch, 4:42 p.m.
 Early Departures: Welch, 6:00 p.m.

Agenda adopted as amended by unanimous consent.

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Lampe, Dean 02-0681	2 Okorwaw Avenue	Cabana	79-131.1	D. Lampe
2. Lee, Jeffrey 02-0761	9 Aurora Way	Rev. 73198: fence/chimney	56-450	Design Associates
3. The Westmoor Club 02-0762	10 Westmoor Lane	Rev. 73263: window/door	41-805	J Graham Goldsmith
4. Steinberg, Jeanne 02-0755	23 Surfside Road	Trim/window color change	55-113.2	Self
5. Hausberg, William 03-0768	105 Eel Point Road	Rev. 02-0647	32-5	John Curran
6. 4 Shawkemo Rd RT 02-0756	4 Shawkemo Road	240 sf garage move/demo	43-91.1	Botticelli & Pohl
7. 21 Quidnet Road, LLC 03-0782	21 Quidnet Road	Roof walk color change	21-30	Ethan McMorro
Voting	Coombs, Oliver, Watterson			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 3-0	Certificate #	HDC2020-02-(as noted) & -03-0### (as noted)	

III. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Forrester, Courtney 02-0754	141 Polpis Road	Rev. 70753: relocate shed	44-7.3	Normand Residential
• Due to lack of visibility				
2. Keith, Kate 02-0758	1 Doc Ryder	Alterations/fenestration	66-209	Permits Plus
• Due to lack of visibility				
3. Everest, Chris 03-0780	6 Bluebird Lane	Egress window well	68-594	NAG
• Due to lack of visibility				
4. Toce, Margaret 03-0781	18 Pequot Street	Pool	80-94	Craig Taylor
• Must not be visible at time of inspection and in perpetuity				
Voting	Coombs, Oliver, Watterson			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No additional concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff per noted concerns. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 3-0	Certificate #	HDC2020-02-(as noted) & -03-(as noted)	

IV. OLD BUSINESS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Shneider, Karl 02-0612	84 Main Street	Deck/stoop/skylight	42.3.3-20	Thornewill Design
Voting	Oliver, Welch, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Public	None				
Concerns	Staff – Applicant asked this to be held without opening for the next old-business meeting due to lack of quorum.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for March 17 at applicant’s request.				
Vote	Carried		Certificate #		
2.	Larrabee, Rich 02-0711	7 Millbrook Road	New dwelling	56-474	Val Oliver
Voting	Coombs, Watterson				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	None				
Representing	Val Oliver				
Public	None				
Concerns	(4:35) Oliver – Asked this be held without opening.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for March 10				
Vote	Carried		Certificate #		
3.	Chesley, Richard 02-0732	32 West Chester Street	New dwelling	42.4.3-31	BPC
Voting	Coombs, Oliver, Watterson, Welch (arrived 6 minutes into discussion)				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC Steven Cohen, Cohen & Cohen Law P.C.				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:36)	Paul – Confirmed other commissioners can read back in. Presented project. Coombs – Read HSAB comments: wall-line break along long wall; dormer overlap; glass to be vertical; front door not appropriate; west elevation, overlarge glass with commercial appearance; south elevation fenestration repetitive. Read Holly Backus comments: balcony not appropriate. Oliver – There is a lot of open space, so this is visible. The south elevation needs to be rethought, way too much glass; the balcony should be reconsidered. This needs more additive massing. Front door needs to be more traditional. Agrees with HSAB about the west elevation. Questions it’s needs to be 29 feet tall; there are no floor heights on the plans. Watterson – Agrees with HSAB. South elevation seems really over fenestrated; okay with the west elevation. The dormer at the massing brake is atypical. East elevation fenestration needs more sense in its layout. Welch – West gable seems 2 feet too taller than on the south elevation. Agrees with what’s been said. No concerns due to limited visibility of the north elevation. Concerned about the height and length because this will become a template to fill the lot front to back; it needs more of a sense of secondary massing. Coombs – Agrees it needs more additive massing. North elevation, asked about the lack of 1 st -floor windows. Ganged windows on the north and south elevations should be separated. Has issues with the front door with the porch roof and 2-over-2 windows. Agrees with Ms. Oliver about reducing the height.				
Motion	Held. (No motion made or voted)				
Vote	N/A		Certificate #		
4.	Rudofsky, Sendra 01-0493	12 Nanahumacke Lane	Roof change/rooftop solar	65-79	Sun Wind, LLC
Voting	Coombs, Oliver, Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, sample of red cedar stained black, and manufacturer spec sheet.				
Representing	Tim Holmes, Sun Wind, LLC				
Public	T.J. Watterson – He’s opposed to the black stain; envisions it an eyesore to natural to weather roofing and will look odd and call attention to the rear.				
Concerns (4:51)	(4:43) Held due to lack of quorum. Holmes – Reviewed changes made and additional information per previous concerns; used Minwax, ebony. Welch – Feels the stain will have to be revisited to maintain it. Since this is on the back, he has no concerns. If the stain was going onto anything but the low-slope dormer roofs, he would be against it. If it does look funky, come back and we can let it bleach out. Oliver – She sees Mr. Watterson’s point of staining where the panels are. Coombs – She will support this to see how it looks especially after a few months.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with staining the low-slope dormer roofs and the black stain maintained in perpetuity. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried 2-1//Oliver opposed		Certificate #	HDC2020-01-0493	

5.	Hulbert ACK, LLC 02-0633	4 Hulbert Avenue	Lift/renovate/addition	42.1.4-2	Sophie Metz
Voting	Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Sophie Metz				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:02)	(4:35) Motion to Hold for representation. (Oliver) carried 3-0 (Welch not yet here.) Coombs – Read HSAB (no quorum) and Holly Backus comments. Metz – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns. In this used the exact same size 2 nd -floor windows of the main house in the 2 nd -floor of this as well. You asked for a water table, but we can eliminate that. Watterson – Appreciates changes; suggested integrating the water table flush with corner boards and trim. Oliver – In the drone shots, it is evident that this is with the other house; the blue shutters reflect that. The roof walk is out of place. The south elevation is visible from across the wetland and should have more a feel of the sunroom that was there; the way it reads now relates to the other structure; the proposed doesn't. Welch – The roof walk is too much of an adornment with the skirt. Integrating the water table flush into the corner boards will create a different architectural style that reads as modern small cubes rather than stacking; the drip cap is not appropriate for this location. Agrees about the north elevation fenestration; change it to capture the sense of an enclosed porch; though it isn't visible. South elevation, the single-story mass the four-ganged windows, to him, should read as separated by something. The front door is an improvement over what exists. Coombs – The “C” window panes as compared to the size of the “B” window panes catch her eye since there are so many. These two houses really stand out so for that reason are important.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with no roof walk, no water table, shutters to match the existing design and color, and surveyor certification of minimum flood height increase relative to FEMA code. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried unanimously Certificate # HDC2020-02-0633				
6.	Great State Prop. 02-0589	92 Washington Street	New dwelling	42.2.3-22	Smith-Hutton Arch
Voting	Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, and advisory comments.				
Representing	No name given.				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:24)	Coombs – Read HSAB (no quorum) comments. Owner Rep. – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; have a surveyor letter confirming the 9-foot minimum lift relative to the FEMA flood level. The garage is simulated-divided lights (SDL). Watterson – Okay with all the changes. Asked what others think about the skirting, should it be on the outside. It's half-way defensible; this is 65 feet from the road behind the garage and wood windows. Welch – If this were natural brick it should be painted. The skirting should be separated; it's detailed and too formal. The A/C should come back as a separate application. This is really high. Agrees about the north elevation fenestration. Asked for a description of the Norwood line of SDL windows; there should be consistency of the windows on all visible facades; he'd like to see a cut-sheet on these windows. Oliver – She's not sure what to think about the foundation skirting. Agrees with what's been said. Preferred the north elevation as it was previously approved; the pane pattern draws attention to it. The windows are SDL; in the old historic district (OHD) the visible facades should be true divided light (TDL). Coombs – This an important location in the OHD; the small buildings that were there have been demolished and what's going in doesn't look anything like what it was. The height should come down; it should be as small and simple as possible. The windows have to be TDL in the OHD.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and a tear sheet for the windows and the A/C removed from the application. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried Certificate #				

7.	11 Meadow, LLC 02-0722	11 Meadow Lane	New dwelling	41-448	Emeritus
Voting	Coombs, Oliver, Welch				
Recused	Watterson				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:42)	<p>MacEachern – This was held for a view.</p> <p>Oliver – This is appropriate design; it's unfortunate is the way the lot was cut up creating two long skinny lots in a neighborhood with low density; asked for this house to be pushed back to mitigate that perception.</p> <p>Welch – He'd like to see the previously approved house to see this in context to that; these doors are almost 8 feet with 5-foot windows; it's tall. The issue of location on the lot is difficult to deal with; it should be no closer to the street than any other primary structure in the neighborhood; a little diversity in depth is okay. Where the dwelling sits impacts the primary mass sets relative to the street sets the tone for the streetscape.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried 3-0		Certificate #		
8.	Frates, J 02-0726	2 Ash Street	Rev. 73273: add dormers	42.4.2-96	Emeritus
Voting	Coombs, Oliver, Welch				
Recused	Watterson				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:50)	<p>Coombs – Read HSAB comments.</p> <p>MacEachern – reviewed the project.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried 3-0		Certificate #	HDC2020-02-0726	
9.	Paton, Scott 02-0585	33 Orange Street	Hardscape/Arbor	42.3.2-199	The Garden Group
Voting	Coombs, Welch, Watterson				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Landscape plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Jacob Williams, The Garden Group				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:52)	<p>Coombs – Read HSAB comments.</p> <p>Williams – Reviewed changes made and information per previous concerns.</p> <p>Discussion about the draining issues of lots on Orange Street.</p> <p>Welch – Asked about the privacy fence; it should match the one at 13 Orange.</p> <p>Watterson – Asked about the fence and arbor and that it is colored. No concerns.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with on-site drainage and privacy fence to match 13 Orange Street. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried 3-0		Certificate #	HDC2020-02-0585	
10.	123 Madaket Rd N.T. 02-0724	123 Madaket Road	Addition	40-60	Mark Cutone Architect
Voting	Coombs, Oliver, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Mark Cutone, Mark Cutone Architecture				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:02)	<p>Cutone – Presented project; circa 1984; a late request from the client is the north elevation 2nd-floor windows mulled against the door and pull the deck in to the corner.</p> <p>Oliver – She loves this.</p> <p>Watterson – It's well done. No issues with the design. North elevation won't be visible.</p> <p>Coombs – Don't cut down the trees.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff the north elevation changes per Exhibit A. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	HDC2020-02-0724	

11. Breen, Faith 02-0745		19 Broadway	A/C unit	73.1.3-111	Josh Morash
Voting	Coombs, Oliver, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Joshua Morash				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:06)	Coombs – Read SAB and Holly Backus comments: circa late 1800s, contributing, screen A/C. Morash – Presented project. Oliver – The horizontal conduit encased in natural to weather cedar shingles is a great idea; likes the vertical conduits looking like a downspout. Watterson – Likes the idea of shingling the conduits in. The lattice screening the unit is appropriate.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with vertical south elevation conduit boxed in and painted to resemble a downspout and the rest boxed in cedar single and natural to weather lattice to screen the A/C and the heater, per Exhibit A. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	HDC2020-02-0745	
12. Knutzen, Sarah 02-0677		21 Lyons Lane	Garage/studio/cabana	71-12	Ethan McMorrow
Voting	Coombs, Oliver, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Ethan McMorrow				
Public	None				
Concerns (6:15)	McMorrow – Presented project; house is circa 1970. Oliver – No concerns, except the exterior stair should tuck into the side and not stick out. Watterson – The elevations are mis-labeled. Discussion about what to do with the stairs to tuck them against the house.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the stairway direction reversed to run along the building and correction of the cardinal points. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	HDC2020-02-0677	

V. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approve Minutes	January 28, February 4, 11 & 13, 2020: Held by unanimous consent.
Review Minutes	February 18 & 25, 2020
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Application pictures: Oliver – If we have all the information at the meeting, it won't take as long; the staff aren't making sure it's all there. • Mission Statement for Town Website vote • Historic Preservation Guideline/Nantucket Resiliency updates • Time management • Organizational Focus Committee • Roof plans: threshold • Plans: Scale of Elevations, Floor & Roof Plans • Application checklist: Differentiation between complex/simple; minimum standards • Application as Master Sheet • Discussion of Net Zero Stretch Code and impacts to HDC • Discussion and update on Nantucket Sidewalk Work Group
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. None

Adjourned at 6:24 p.m. by unanimous consent

Submitted by:
Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board