



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Terence Watterson, Jessie Dutra

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, April 11, 2019

Planning and Land Use Services, 2 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room – 1:00 p.m.

Called to order at 1:00 p.m. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Cathy Flynn, Administrative Specialist
Attending Members: Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Watterson
Absent Members: Dutra
Late Arrivals: Camp, 1:04 p.m.; Coombs, 1:06 p.m.
Early Departures: Watterson, 2:46 p.m.

Agenda approved as amended by unanimous consent.

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. OLD BUSINESS

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map-Parcel	Agent
1. N.I.R. Retail. LLC	38 Main Street	Color change	42.3.1-189	Jamie Lee Nass
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Jamie Lee Nass, NIR – Presented a paint chips. Club Car’s door and trim are black.			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:40)	(1:02) Motion to Hold for representation. (Welch) Carried unanimously. (Camp and Coombs not present) Oliver – Black doors are okay but black windows is an anomaly. Camp – She feels black doors would be heavy. Pohl – Consensus is okay with the “Calm white” and Essex green for the sash and doors.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with “Calm white” trim and Essex green sash and doors. (Coombs)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	72232	
2. Maraganore	41 Ocean Avenue	Expand deck	73.3.2-50	Mark Avery
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Oliver, Welch, Watterson			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:02)	Not opened at this time			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried	Certificate #		

VI. NEW BUSINESS

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map-Parcel	Agent
1. Gray, Deborah	0 New Street	Rev. 70347: dormer	73.1.3-33	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, (Camp? Arrived during Val’s presentation), Welch, Watterson			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Val Oliver – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:03)	Pohl – SAB stated this doesn’t meet the guidelines, but the dormer already existed. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	72233	

2.	Anguelov, Martin	19B Waydale Road	New dwelling	67-29	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Watterson				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Oliver, Welch				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Val Oliver – Presented project.				
Public	Stephen Welch , 13 Waydale Road – He’s not against Huntingdon homes, but he is concerned about the height of the structure. Other Huntingdon’s a 1½-story capes. If this is approved, it should be subject to screening along the street.				
Concerns (1:07)	Pohl – From the first floor to the top of window is 6’10.5” with at least 1.5 feet above that; the 1 st -floor ceiling is 7’7”. If that can be reduced, it will bring the height down. Watterson – It looks like the 1 st -floor ceiling height is around 9 feet. Okay with the front porch and bringing the height down. McLaughlin – It measures at 8’10”.				
	Camp – If the height comes down, she had no concerns.				
	Coombs – She likes the porch, suggested it go all the way across with a hipped roof.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #		
3.	Moore, Bill	3 West Chester Street	Color change	42.4.3-14	NAG
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	Steve Theroux , Nantucket Architectural Group – White trim, Essex green sashes and doors.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:16)	Pohl – Read HSAB comments: prefer other than white, sash should be sympathetic to trim. Oliver – No concerns. Camp – Likes the current color but we’ve approved this combination before.				
Motion	Motion to Approve with the sashes, front door, basement door, and window boxes Essex Green. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	72234	
4.	Casey, Steve	31 Pine Crest Drive	Patio	68-423	NAG
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Steve Theroux , Nantucket Architectural Group – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:22)	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	72235	
5.	Love, Joanne	36 Hooper Farm Road	Fence	67-103	NAG
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Milena Ilieva , Nantucket Architectural Group – Presented project. Steve Theroux , Nantucket Architectural Group – There are two existing fences; if this is a board fence, that makes three types on the property.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:24)	Pohl – The lattice should be square, not diagonal. Agrees with Ms. Camp about it being a 5-foot board fence. Oliver – It shouldn’t go all the way to the street. Retracted her concerns. Coombs – Would prefer it be reduced to 4&1. McLaughlin – The fence should be no more than 4 feet from the front of the house to the road. Camp – The fence stops 8 feet from the road. Feels the lattice draws attention to the fence; a board fence would be subtler.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the fence to be a 5-foot board from the front of the house towards the road. (McLaughlin)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	72236	

6.	Norris, Mark	31 Pilgrim Road	Rev. 69408: outdoor shower	41-97	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Juraj Bencat , JB Studio – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:34)	Oliver – This is huge. McLaughlin – Right now it is visible and 8 feet tall. The wall boards should be vertical, and height reduce to 6’8”. Pohl – A lot of this has to do with visibility. Asked if members want to view this.				
Motion	Motion to View. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #		
7.	Kilmartin, John	11 New Mill Street	Addition	55.4.4-87	Topham Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	Joe Topham , Topham Design – Main mass circa 1935, 1984 addition; 1992 rear ell rebuilt due to fire. Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:47)	Pohl – Read HSAB comments: addition overwhelms; proposed architecture not sympathetic; date of construction. Camp – Agrees with HSAB, addition overwhelms the simple original mass: too tall and pediment dormer overwhelms. Oliver – Agrees. The addition eave heights are higher than the main mass; suggested a reverse saltbox. Coombs – Agrees with HSAB. McLaughlin – Confirmed there are no air conditioning units (A/C). Noted there are three awning windows; they should be fixed. Pohl – He’s okay with the projecting rear ell matching what is there; his concerns are: it sticks out at the side and the high eave height.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #		
8.	N.H.A.	15 Broad Street	Add deck/add awning	42.2.2-61	Concept Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	Watterson				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	TJ Watterson , Concept Design – Presented project; awning is temporary and retractable for use during events only. Doug Seaholm, NHA				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:56)	Pohl – Read HSAB comments: No concerns. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate # 72237		
9.	Cohen, Steven L. Tr.	13 Squam Road	Move off shed	21-7	Jenne Atherton
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Jenne Atherton – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:01)	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate # 72238		
10.	Atherton, Jenne	7 Swift Rock Road	Move on shed	40-68	Self
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Jenne Atherton – Presented project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:03)	Pohl – There are no dimensions; we need something in the record to accurately reflect the shed.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with dimensions from road and property line entered into the record. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate # 72239		

11. 5 Cobble Court Trust	5 Cobble Court	New dwelling	55-261	Shelter 7
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch, Watterson			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Cameron Marks , owner – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:08)	McLaughlin – There are six awning windows; should be fixed. Oliver – We need large-sized corrected plans.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with large-sized, corrected drawings. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	72240	
12. Gibson, Matthew	22 Woodbine Street	Sport court	80-322	David Troast
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch, Watterson			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos.			
Representing	David Troast – Presented project; the surface is a permeable material.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:13)	Oliver – She viewed this; the court is way past where Woodbine ends. Coombs – Agrees it isn't visible. McLaughlin – Asked what the surface is. Camp – No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	72241	
13. Jemison, Steve	9 West Chester Street	Rev. 70107: dormer & windows	42.4.3-12	JB Studio
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch, Watterson			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Juraj Bencat , JB Studio – Presented project; circa 1792.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:19)	Pohl – Read HSAB comments: photos of existing conditions; north shed dormer obliterates roof; 2-story mass addition will be wall on Wyers Ln; east “C” windows; south “D” windows in addition not appropriate, 15-light should be more traditional, and door looks to be floating. McLaughlin – The “D” casement windows should be 6-light fixed. Coombs – The south elevation “D” windows should be 6-over-6. The 15-light door panes don't match the windows. The windows need to go back into the first floor. Agrees with HSAB about the north elevation. Oliver – South elevation, the window arrangement is unusual; suggested eliminating one window and center a window over the front door. North elevation, the 3 rd -floor dormer on the main mass should be broken up into two gable dormers or fill in between the existing gable dormers with a shed. Okay with removal of the chimney. The east elevation needs some fenestration. There is no indication if the windows are true-divided-light or simulated-divided-light. Camp – South elevation, the “D” windows are inappropriate and don't relate back to the original structure; should be 6-over-6 or 12-over-12; the side door should have a panel on it and look more like a side door rather than a French door. Rear, okay with the shed dormer but should come off the roofline one foot. Wall facing Wyers Lane needs fenestration. Pohl – Agrees with what's been said.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #		

14. Mackey, Liam	3 North Union Street	Rev. 71908: window changes	42.3.1-214.2	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	Watterson			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Alex Bagmets , Emeritus Development – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:40)	<p>Pohl – Read HSAB comments: previous approval done without HSAB review; west centered door not appropriate and should remain as existing in secondary mass.</p> <p>Oliver – West elevation, the bungalow door is not appropriate for this building; suggested top four-light door. Okay with the windows.</p> <p>Coombs – She agrees with Ms. Oliver’s suggested door; cited the Rose and Crown doors as a good example. The windows should be removable for summer use.</p> <p>Camp – This is now a public space and the doors don’t have to be so residential.</p> <p>McLaughlin – A/C isn’t indicated on the plans.</p> <p>Pohl – He’s okay with the revised door.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff per Exhibit A. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	72242	
15. Hanig, Marco	23 Burnell Street	Rev. 72080: window change	73.4.1-26.1	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Alex Bagmets , Emeritus Development – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:52)	<p>Pohl – Read SAB comments: east change of doors find, can’t be seen; south elevation, prefer previous approval; north, prefer 15-light doors.</p> <p>Camp – Wants to know what the east relates back to. Prefers the previous approval.</p> <p>Oliver – No concerns; the north elevation windows are under a porch and if they could be seen, they could be screened.</p> <p>Coombs – She doesn’t think there is much vegetation on the lot; it would be a good idea to screen the north elevation.</p> <p>McLaughlin – There should be harmony between the windows and the proposed doors.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the proposed doors can’t be seen upon inspection and thereafter. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 4-1//McLaughlin opposed	Certificate #	72243	
16. Hills & Valleys, LLC (OB)	14A Greglen Avenue	New dwelling	68-182	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Alex Bagmets , Emeritus Development – This was held for a view; reviewed the project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (3:03)	<p>Coombs – She’d like to have a photographic streetscape; the area is a mess to get into.</p> <p>Oliver – She doesn’t think the board should approve this without know what else is going there. This is too vertical. The west elevation should have a door; the porch shed roof should be carried across. She’s okay with casement windows over a kitchen sink and don’t face front.</p> <p>McLaughlin – This has five casements; those should be fixed or double hung. The cupola should be eliminated.</p> <p>Camp – If it comes down 1½ feet, it will look more proportional.</p> <p>Pohl – Would also like a streetscape. Agrees with Ms. Oliver about the door. Extending the porch either side might be good. Wait on the gable to see if it will be visible. Agrees with Mr. McLaughlin about the cupola.</p>			
Motion	Motion to View and hold for revisions. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #		
17. Hills & Valleys, LLC	14A Greglen Avenue	Shed	68-182	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Alex Bagmets , Emeritus Development – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (3:14)	Oliver – Side of the overhang being open is not approvable; east and north should have visibility.			
Motion	Motion to View with revisions. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #		

18. Anderson, Scott	282 Madaket Road	Enclose porch/window chg	59.4-68	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Alex Bagmets , Emeritus Development – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (3:14)	Pohl – Read MAB comments: No concerns. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	72244
19. Margaret Marshall Trst	17 Sherburne Turnpike	New dwelling	30-172.1	LINK
20. Margaret Marshall Trst	17 Sherburne Turnpike	Cabana	30-172.1	LINK
21. Margaret Marshall Trst	17 Sherburne Turnpike	Pool	30-172.1	LINK
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (3:02)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for Tuesday, April 16, 2019. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	

VII. OTHER BUSINESS Continued

Approve Minutes	March 21 & 26, 2019: held
Review Minutes	None
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discussion of update on Vineyard Wind project. Welch – BOAM issued a mandate that the community submit projects for funding. They made a finding of no adverse impact on Nantucket and have not acknowledged a need for additional visual mitigation nor have they acknowledged many of our concerns let alone have the owners negotiate with us. The Plan A is to seek expert counsel for the workgroup; we would be able to use that expert’s knowledge to create leverage for a better negotiating position. Plan B is to have a list of projects ready for submission; that has to be submitted by April 19 with the follow up meeting scheduled for April 30. Reviewed the projects for a possible HDC vote: funding to update and expand the National register surveys; funding to update <i>Building with Nantucket in Mind</i>; funding for HDC administrative cost related to coastal resiliency and hazard. His role in the workgroup is to address historic tourism, maritime education tourism, historic education. We’ve asked the turbines be moved off. Coombs – It has been proven the turbines are detrimental to marine mammals. Oliver – She is working with an environmental attorney to prepare a case to sue Vineyard Wind. Pohl – There are five parcels totaling 832,000 square acres; asked if this is for the whole lot or first parcel. Welch – This is for the first parcel, which is the worst case for Nantucket. Pohl – If we do nothing on this parcel, it will set a negotiating precedent for the rest. He endorses Mr. Welch’s efforts. Motion to Request funding for those projects as were outlined subject to a negotiating strategy. (Coombs) Carried unanimously • Discussion of attending Select Board meeting regarding upper Main Street sidewalk and road work. • Discussion of sidewalk work at Straight Wharf, Broad Street, Easy Street, lower Main Street, and Judith Chase Lane. • Discussion and possible vote to expand Historic Structures Advisory Board map for review of applications. • Discussion of approvable roof shingle colors, roof color change applications being placed on the Consent agenda and posting approved colors on the Town website. Welch – He put a sample of the grey roof shingle on the 2 Fairgrounds Road backroom file cabinets in natural-ish light. Asked commissioners to take a look at it.
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Roof shingle sample grey
2. *Building with Nantucket in Mind*

Adjourned at 3:28 by unanimous consent

Submitted by:
Terry L. Norton