



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Stephen Welch (Vice-chair), Diane Coombs, Abby Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill, Connie Patten

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday April 18, 2023

Community Room, 4 Fairgrounds Road & Remote Participation via ZOOM.

Called to order at 4:04 pm. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Holly Backus, Historic Planner; Esmeralda Martinez, Land Use Specialist.

Attending Members: Pohl, Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Patten

Remote Participants: Thornewill

Absent Members: Dutra

Late Arrivals: Welch (5:30pm)

Early Departures: Camp (7:05pm)

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Coombs)**

Roll- Call Vote Carried 5-0 // Oliver, Coombs, Camp, Patten, and Pohl-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

II. COMMISSIONER'S COMMENTS

III. OTHER BUSINESS

- Discussion among sitting board members on 9 Sherburne Way vote on partial demolition of existing structure, March 28, 2023.
 - Motion to rescind

Discussion on the Motion:

Welch: Apparently there's a letter circulating claiming the minutes are de facto [definitive] information that has been revised for some reason; the minutes are draft minutes as we all know; the reason they are posted to the website is so that applicants and applicants' agents can without much delay go ahead and revised their drawings. To the extent they are draft they are inaccurate, as members have not had a chance to review them; they are also derived from YouTube, and we no longer have an official minutes-taker. There's been a threat of an appeal; doesn't believe an appeal is a good use of the HDC's time in this matter, or the Select Board's time in relation to this matter. States he'll make a motion to Amend Something Previously Approved, being the application at hand.

- Motion to Amend Something Previously Approved

Discussion on the Motion:

Welch: There is a legal theory presented that a Constructive Approval has been granted; his motion is separate from that, to refine the language, to clarify the original motion was to retain "the important historic elements"; not opening the move off [to Millbrook aspect] application, jeopardy related to that is not applicable; walked through a revision of the motion in Word on the screen. The intention and result of his original motion was to approve the [partial] demolition and the retention subject only to HDC review of the relocation site plan. Confirmed, in response to Chair, that we'll see it again, but we won't open up to whether the entire building is slated for demolition or not, nor how much of the building is being slated for demolition. Acknowledged having received and reviewed historic information on the building, which was provided after the original vote.

Motion **Motion to rescind the previous HDC approval for partial demo at 9 Sherburne Wy. (Coombs)**

Roll-call Vote	Failed 3-2 // Coombs and Camp-aye // Welch, Oliver, Pohl-nay	Certificate #	
Motion	Motion to Amend Something Previous Approved, previously stated as “to retain the historic elements as shown in the demolition plan, subject to a site plan review and approval of its relocation on the property”. (Welch)		
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1 // Welch, Oliver, Coombs, Pohl-aye // Camp-nay	Certificate #	HDC2023-02-7909
Motion	Motion to retain important historic elements as shown in the demolition plan—i.e., those portions in the plans not shown for demolition—subject to Commission site plan review and approval of its relocation on the property. (Welch)		
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-2 // Welch, Oliver, Pohl-aye // Camp, Coombs-nay	Certificate #	HDC2023-02-7909

IV. OLD BUSINESS 03/21/23

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	K22s LLC 03-5944	126 Main St	Main house rev	42.3.3/98	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.				
Representing	Linda Williams				
Public	None				
Concerns	None				
Motion	Motion to approve through staff subject to review of the drawings with respect to completeness, including with respect to commissions consensus requests and incorporation of photo and photo laser images of the brick and stone masonry and front facade final set. Also subject to replication of the masonry painted quaker gray with a mockup on site prior to final construction. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-2 // Welch, Camp, Pohl-aye // Coombs, Oliver-nay		Certificate #	HDC2023-03-5944	
2.	Doherty ACK LLC 08-6939	4 Mariner Way	New dwelling	55.1.4/72	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Patten				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.				
Representing	Linda Williams/ Rebecca Berry				
Public	None				
Concerns	None				
Motion	Motion to approve through staff making the chimney more typical and appropriate for this part of town, wider and not as tall. On the north elevation add a false corner board to delineate that secondary massing. Decrease the second-floor deck on the east elevation to the edge of the door on the right. Including an elevation certificate. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Patten and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2022-08-6939	
3.	Doherty ACK LLC 08-6941	4 Mariner Way	Garage	55.1.4/72	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Patten				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.				
Representing	Linda Williams/ Rebecca Berry				
Public	None				
Concerns	None				
Motion	Motion to hold for revisions. (Coombs)				
Roll-call Vote	Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Patten and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2022-08-6941	
4.	Doherty ACK LLC 08-6943	4 Mariner Way	Hardscape	55.1.4/72	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Patten				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.				
Representing	Linda Williams				
Public	None				
Concerns	None				
Motion	Motion to approve through staff subject to the brick walkway moving to the east of the patio extension. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1 // Welch, Oliver, Patten and Pohl-aye // Coombs-nay		Certificate #	HDC2022-08-6943	
5.	Doherty ACK LLC 08-6930	6 Mariner Way	New dwelling	55.1.4/72.3	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Patten				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	None				

Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Linda Williams
 Public None
 Concerns None
 Motion **Motion to approve through staff subject to modifying the chimney to more typical proportions and relocating it to an alternate location as opposed to 4 Mariner, the east elevation changing the first story mass roof pitch from a 7/12 to a 4/12 and putting a number two window above it and the Juliet balcony to be removed and replaced with a dealer's choice window and the north shed structure will have a 4/12 pitch also. Per exhibit A. (Welch)**
 Roll-call Vote Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Patten and Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2022-08-6930**

6. Doherty ACK LLC 08-6931 6 Mariner Way Hardscape 55.1.4/72.3 Linda Williams

Voting Pohl, Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Patten
 Alternates Thornewill
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Linda Williams
 Public None
 Concerns None
 Motion **Motion to approve through staff not being visible at time of inspection or thereafter. (Welch)**
 Roll-call Vote Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Patten and Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2022-08-6931**

7. Brett Fodiman 10-7279 111 Surfside Rd As-built MH shingles 80/70 Slacktide

Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill
 Alternates Patten
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Timothy Rogovich
 Public None
 Concerns None
 Motion **Motion to Approve with screening, and screening to be maintained in perpetuity. (Oliver)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 4-1 // Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill and Pohl-aye //Camp-nay Certificate # **HDC2022-10-7279**

8. Brett Fodiman 10-7281 111 Surfside Rd As-built GH shingles 80/70 Slacktide

Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill
 Alternates Patten
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Timothy Rogovich
 Public None
 Concerns None
 Motion **Motion to Approve with screening, and screening to be maintained in perpetuity. (Oliver)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 4-1 // Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill and Pohl-aye //Camp-nay Certificate # **HDC2022-10-7281**

9. Brett Fodiman 10-7280 111 Surfside Rd As built garage shingles 80/70 Slacktide

Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill
 Alternates Patten
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Timothy Rogovich
 Public None
 Concerns None
 Motion **Motion to Approve with screening, and screening to be maintained in perpetuity. (Oliver)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried 4-1 // Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill and Pohl-aye //Camp-nay Certificate # **HDC2022-10-7280**

V. NEW BUSINESS 03/28/23

Property owner name Street Address Scope of work Map/Parcel Agent

1. 450 Green Park LLC 01-7772 2 Stone Alley Hardscape 39/24.1 Ahern

Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill
 Alternates Patten
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Ahern

Public None
 Concerns Application not opened.
 Motion **No action.**
 Roll-call Vote Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill and Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2023-01-7772**

2. Conway Family 4 Canonicus St New Dwelling 87/116 Val Oliver
 Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Thornewill, Patten
 Alternates None
 Recused Oliver
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Val Oliver
 Public None
 Concerns None

Motion **Motion to Hold for Revisions. (Camp)**
 Roll-call Vote Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill and Pohl-aye Certificate #

3. Conway Family 4 Canonicus St New Garage 87/116 Val Oliver
 Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Thornewill, Patten
 Alternates None
 Recused Oliver
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Val Oliver
 Public None
 Concerns None

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Camp)**
 Roll-call Vote Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill and Pohl-aye Certificate #

4. David Baily 83 Sankaty Rd New Dwelling 48/42 Design Associates

Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Patten
 Alternates Thornewill
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Design Associates (Chris)
 Public None
 Concerns None
 Motion **Motion to Approve through Staff with the little office addition to drop its eave down to be the same height as the garage, and the dormers to drop down so the face is on top of the window. (Oliver)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

5. David Baily 100 Baxter Rd Move off building 48/42 Design Associates

Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Patten
 Alternates Thornewill
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Design Associates (Chris)
 Public None
 Concerns None
 Motion **Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

6. David Baily 100 Baxter Rd Move on & Addition 48/42 Design Associates

Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Patten
 Alternates Thornewill
 Recused None
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.
 Representing Design Associates (Chris)
 Public None
 Concerns None
 Motion **Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried unanimously Certificate #

7. Boathouse Realty	52 Warren's Landing	Historic Determination	38/29	Design Associates
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, Patten			
Alternates	Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	Design Associates (Chris)			
Public	None			
Concerns	None			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

8. Boathouse Realty	52 Warren's Landing	Move structure	38/29	Design Associates
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, Patten			
Alternates	Camp			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	Design Associates (Chris)			
Public	None			
Concerns	None			
Motion	Motion to Approve through Staff without the skirt around the building. Skirt to be revisited at another time. Applicant to provide staff with an elevation certificate. (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

9. Ready RE LLC	17 Cannonbury Lane	New dwelling	73/45	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Thornewill, Patten			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	Val Oliver			
Public	None			
Concerns	None			
Motion	Motion to Approve through Staff with the wrap around hip porch and adding kick panels to the French doors. (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

10. Ready RE LLC	17 Cannonbury Lane	New garage	73/45	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Thornewill, Patten			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	Val Oliver			
Public	None			
Concerns	None			
Motion	Motion to approve as submitted with windows being 6 over 1. (Coombs)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	

11. Ready RE LLC	17 Cannonbury Lane	New cabana	73/45	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Thornewill, Patten			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	Val Oliver			
Public	None			
Concerns	None			
Motion	Motion to approve as submitted. (Thornewill)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-1 // Coombs, Thornewill, Patten and Pohl-aye // Camp opposed		Certificate #	

12. Laura Ianetta	7 Paul Jones	Fenestration & chimney	30/68.1	Emeritus LTD
Voting	Welch, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill, Patten			
Alternates	Pohl			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern- Emeritus LTD			
Public	None			
Concerns	None			

Motion **Motion to approve through staff with taking out as much of the chimney as possible, get rid of the first step and purge entire thing and the cap can be a stone to match. (Thornewill)**

Roll-call Vote Carried unanimously

Certificate #

13. Marianne Hanley TR	86 Main St	As-built color sash	42.3.3/66	LINK
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	Victoria Ewing			
Public	None			
Concerns	Application not opened.			
Motion	Motion to hold for next Tuesday's meeting. (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	HDC2023-04-(as-noted)	

VI. OLD BUSINESS 04/04/23

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Demichelle Murphy TR 02-7889	2 Birdsong Ln	Hardscape	55.4.4/80.2	Linda Williams
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	Patten			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historical documents, advisory comments.			
Representing	Linda Williams			
Public	None			
Concerns	None			
Motion	Motion to hold for revisions to have grading revised to reflect the grade approved with the structure and reduction or elimination of the patio. On the north side clarification of what the driveway will have with respect to Belgian block or not. (Welch)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously	Certificate #	HDC2023-02-7889	

Rest held-

1. Edward Gilberth TR 10-7346	51 Walsh St	Roof walk revisions	29/61	Linda Williams
2. Sachem Corner LLC 11-7426	1 E. Hallowell Ln	Demo Garage	30/100	Linda Williams
3. David Brownlee 03-8101	81 Main St	Dormer	42.3.4/11	Linda Williams
4. Ashkan Vaziri 01-7692	9 Woodbury Lane	New Dwelling	41/551	Studio Ppark
5. Ashkan Vaziri	9 Woodbury Lane	Pool & hardscape	41/551	Atlantic Landscaping
6. Robert Meyer	307 Polpis rd.	Demolition garage	25/39	Link
7. Jason Meldelson	69 Monomoy Rd	New Dwelling	43/102	Studio Ppark
8. Vanessa Halpert 2021-12-5448	73 Burnell St	New pool	49.3.28/1.2	Topham Design
9. 256 Polpis LLC 02-7967	256 Polpis Rd	Move/reno renovation	25/25	Botticelli + Pohl
10. Holly Coburn 01-7695	5 North Beach	New Dwelling	42.4.1/92	Normand Design
11. Joshua Malitsky 01-7857	253 Madaket Rd	Rooftop solar array	59.4/210	AckSmart
12. SheepPond Prop LLC	14-16 Sheep Pond Rd	Add breezeway	63/29	Emeritus LTD

V. NEW BUSINESS 04/11/23

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Warrens Landing NT	40 Warrens Landing Rd	Move off/ demo	38/45	Normand Residential
2. Warrens Landing NT	40 Warrens Landing Rd	New dwelling	38/45	Normand Residential
3. Warrens Landing NT	40 Warrens Landing Rd	New guest house	38/45	Normand Residential
4. Warrens Landing NT	40 Warrens Landing Rd	New gazebo	38/45	Normand Residential
5. Warrens Landing NT	40 Warrens Landing Rd	New shed	38/45	Normand Residential
6. Warrens Landing NT	40 Warrens Landing Rd	Grading & hardscape	38/45	Normand Residential
7. Sleeping Indian LLC	80 Cliff rd.	Fence & gate	30/607	Topham Design
8. Ack Hang 10 LLC	21 Meader St	New dwelling	42.2.3/44	Val Oliver
9. Ack Hang 10 LLC	21 Meader St	New dwelling	42.2.3/44	Val Oliver
10. Ashkan Vaziri	9 Woodbury Lane	New garage	41/551	Studio Ppark
11. 39 Monomoy LLC	39 Monomoy Rd	Replace windows	54/79	Emeritus LTD
12. Christopher Hurd	25 E Lincoln St	Renovate/move house on site	42.4.1/2	EMDA
13. Charles Pastore	35 Sankaty Rd	Pool & hardscape	49/46.2.3	Atlantic Landscaping

HDC Minutes for April 18, 2023- adopted June 6.

14. Charles Krueger	4 Weweeder Ave	New shed	80/102	Structures Unltd
15. Kara Roger	32 Lyons Ln	New dwelling	71/6	SMRD
16. AF15CHR LLC	8 Chuck Hollow Rd	New Cabana	72/31	Val Oliver
17. Kevin Carroll	4 Shimmo Pond Rd	Addition	54/256	Thornewill Design
18. Jennifer & Dalton Frazier	5 Maple Ln lot 9	Rooftop solar array	67/303	AckSmart
19. Justin Geagan	13A Pine Tree Rd	2 nd addition dormer, roof	68/102	JB Studio
20. Lindsey Torpey Cross	7 Green Lane	Shutter, color change	42.3.3/86	Nate Barber
21. 111 Cliff Rd Tr	111 Cliff Rd	Move demo structure	41/10	Emeritus LTD
22. 7 White LLC	7 White St	New dwelling	80/9	Emeritus LTD
23. 7 White LLC	7 White St	New garage	80/9	Emeritus LTD
24. Caroline Fernandez	13 Academy Lane	Fence	42.4.3/112	Gryphon Architects
25. Caroline Fernandez	13 Academy Lane	Hardscape	42.4.3/112	Gryphon Architects
26. Timothy Moran	5 Lily St.	Addition	42.3.4/89	Linda Williams

X. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approved Minutes Motion Vote	
Review Minutes	February 23, & March 9, 28, 30 2023.
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discussion among sitting board members on 9 Sherburne Way vote on partial demolition of existing structure, March 28, 2023. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Motion to rescind • Motion to Amend Something Previously Approved • Next HDC Meeting- APRIL 18TH at 4pm *HYBRID & IN-PERSON @ 4 FAIRGROUNDS RD. - COMMUNITY RM. • Classification of street trees & vegetating mapping • Discussion of Wind Turbines • Section 106 – Sunrise Wind Farm Project, intro (update as needed) • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping • Discussion of salvaging demolitions • Discussion of options for house moves

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 8:37pm. (Coombs)**

Vote Carried unanimously

Submitted by:

Esmeralda Martinez

YouTube link: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3pZnQLk3Osk>

Nantucket Old Historic District

Sconset Old Historic District

Madaket Old Village