



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Terence Watterson, Jessie Dutra

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, April 30, 2019

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room – 4:30 p.m.

Called to order at 4:30 p.m. and announcements by Ms. Coombs

Staff in attendance: John Hedden, HDC Compliance Coordinator; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
 Attending Members: Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Watterson, Dutra
 Absent Members: Pohl
 Late Arrivals: Welch, 4:33 p.m.
 Early Departures: None

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent.

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Ivanova, Snezhana – 72342	17 Greglen Avenue	New dwelling	68-186	Ethan McMorrow
2. Land Bank – 72343	125 Somerset Road	Rev. 68627: color change	66-69	Self
3. Valencia, Rudy – 72344	33 Daffodil Road	Rev. 69480: garage doors	68-743	Linda Williams
4. Town of Nantucket – 72345	20 South Water Street	Roof change to wood	42.4.2-29	Mark Voigt
5. Kaczmarek, Tom – 72346	25 Walsh Street	Steps	29-35	David Lindstedt
6. Esposito, John – 72347	14 Eat Fire Spring Road	Rev. 66282: roof change	20-61	BPC
7. Esposito, John – 72348	14 Eat Fire Spring Road	Rev. 66283: roof change	20-61	BPC
8. Esposito, John – 72349	14 Eat Fire Spring Road	Rev. 66284: roof change	20-61	BPC
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Dutra			
Alternates	Watterson			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 4-1//McLaughlin opposed	Certificate #	72342 to 72349	

III. SIGNS

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. 17 Main ACK, LLC	17 Main Street	Wall sign	72.3.1-178	Archer Signs
2. 17 Main ACK, LLC	17 Main Street	Wall sign	72.3.1-178	Archer Signs
3. 17 Main ACK, LLC	17 Main Street	Projecting sign	72.3.1-178	Archer Signs
4. Brewster Equities, LLC	12B Oak Street	Projecting sign	42.4.2-27	BPC
5. MIYC, LLC	147 Orange Street	Wall sign	55-312	Sign Here Nant
6. Town of Nantucket	2-4 Fairgrounds Road	Informational sign	67-40/67-752	Charles Gibson
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Watterson			
Alternates	Welch, Dutra			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Sign design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	None			
Sign Advisory	None			
Concerns	Staff – The SAC recommended all be held.			
Motion	Motion to Hold signs 1-6. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #		

IV. OLD BUSINESS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Margaret Marshall Trust	17 Sherburne Turnpike	New dwelling	30-172.1	LINK
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Watterson				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Victoria Ewing , LINK – This was held for a view with height poles; trim white.				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:35)	Oliver & Camp – No concerns. Watterson – Pointed out that the air-conditioning (A/C) condensers need to be relocated out of the setback. Welch – He agrees with what’s been said.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried 5-0			Certificate #	72350
2.	Margaret Marshall Trust	17 Sherburne Turnpike	Cabana	30-172.1	LINK
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Watterson				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Victoria Ewing , LINK – Reviewed the project.				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:40)	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Watterson)				
Vote	Carried 5-0			Certificate #	72351
3.	Margaret Marshall Trust	17 Sherburne Turnpike	Pool	30-172.1	LINK
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Watterson				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Victoria Ewing , LINK – Reviewed the project; fencing will be submitted with the hardscaping plan for walls and stuff.				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:42)	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried 5-0			Certificate #	72352
4.	Heneke, Jonathan (NB)	3 Friendship Lane	New dwelling	66-248	Self
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Watterson, Dutra				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Karsten Reinemo – The owner is undecided about terratone or green sashes. Jon Heneke, owner				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:43)	Discussion about the color of the roofing shingles: charcoal grey. Oliver – If the sashes are green, the door needs to be a complimentary color. McLaughlin – We need to know where A/C condensers are going, and they need to be fenced in.				
Motion	Motion to Approve with the sashes to be either sandtone or green; door to be Folger blue of sashes are sandtone and Essex green if the sash is green. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried 5-0			Certificate #	72353

5.	2 Chestnut St. ACK, LLC	2 Chestnut Street	Demo garage	42.3.1-69	Shelter 7
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	Welch, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	Bill Hamlin – Approval for this was predicated upon approval of the replacement structure. Jason Olbres , Shelter 7 – Corrugated metal; it’s on the 1923 Sanborn map; couldn’t find photographic records.				
Public	None				
Concerns (4:49)	Camp – She’s worried about losing the historic garage doors and the design of the structure. She doesn’t support this; the historic front should be restored; doesn’t care what happens to the corrugated rear. Dutra – In the last hearing we expressed concern and wanted to see drawings of the replacement that kept the feel. Oliver – Agrees with Mr. Dutra. HSAB should comment on the new structure. McLaughlin – Stated Bill Perry built the addition in 1950. Coombs – Read HSAB comments: contributing, we believe among first garages on the Island and would change streetscape if removed; okay with removal of later additions but not the garage. Agrees with Ms. Camp, the original garage part should remain.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for review of the new dwelling application. (Dutra)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #		
6.	2 Chestnut St. ACK, LLC	2 Chestnut Street	New dwelling/commercial	42.3.1-69	Shelter 7
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	Welch, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	Jason Olbres , Shelter 7 – Presented project. Bill Hamlin				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:01)	Dutra – Too tall and garage doors aren’t being represented. Oliver – Doesn’t see how this is a nod back to the original garage. Could potentially have a front that looks more like the garage then build up in back. Most structures along the street are residential; this introduces a store front. Camp – Would like to see the garage doors reused here. Agrees it is too tall. The shed dormers on either side of the roof makes it look cumbersome in the narrow space. This is an opportunity to creatively incorporate the historic doors. McLaughlin – Asked where the A/C would go. (in the rear.) East elevation, the “A” windows are much too large and exceed the 50% guidelines. The “B” windows are highly visible. Roof pitches aren’t shown on the plans. Confirmed the hopper windows open in. Coombs – North elevation is not replicating the garage in any way. This is too tall. East and west elevation dormers are too heavy and too large. This is too much building in a small space. We need a window schedule and floor plans.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and have HSAB review it. (Oliver)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #		
7.	2 Chestnut St. ACK, LLC	2 Chestnut Street	Remove porch, deck& staircase	42.3.1-69	Shelter 7
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Dutra				
Alternates	Welch, Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.				
Representing	Jason Olbres , Shelter 7 – Presented project. Bill Hamlin				
Public	None				
Concerns (5:23)	Camp – Would prefer the front be left as is and keep the changes to the rear. Oliver – HSAB should review this as well. Coombs – Suggested Mr. Olbres look at Clay Lancaster’s book, pg. 171, which states this was built after the 1846 fire. West elevation, should be kept at 1 story.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and to have HSAB review it. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #		

8. American Legion	21 Washington Street	Firescape	42.3.1-40	Doug Seholm
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver Watterson, Dutra			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	McLaughlin			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Doug Seholm			
Public	Terry Norton, Adjutant American Legion Post 82 (Minutes taken by John Hedden)			
Concerns (5:33)	Oliver – No concerns Camp – No concerns Dutra – No concerns			
Motion	Motion to approve. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	72354	
9. Biondi, Julie	70 Orange Street	Relocate shed	55.4.1-88	Topham Design, LLC
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Watterson			
Alternates	Welch, Dutra			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Joe Topham , Topham Design – Presented project.			
Public	Julie Biondi			
Concerns (5:38)	Coombs – Read HSAB comments: no concerns. No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted with vegetation to remain in perpetuity. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	72355	
10. Biondi, Julie	70 Orange Street	Renovations	55.4.1-88	Topham Design, LLC
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Watterson			
Alternates	Welch, Dutra			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Joe Topham , Topham Design – Presented project; skylights not visible; diamond door to be used on shed.			
Public	Julie Biondi			
Concerns (5:44)	Coombs – Read HSAB comments: reuse diamond door; check visibility of skylight; contributing. Camp – Where the door is coming out, there should be a window. Would like the chimney to remain, at least from the roof up. Watterson – Agrees about keeping the chimney; okay with Velux skylights trimmed in mahogany. Oliver – The “G” windows should be 6-lights, especially facing the street. No concerns about no window in place of the door. McLaughlin – No comments.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the “G” windows to be 6-light or 3-over-3 double hung and the chimney to remain and skylights approved due to lack of visibility.			
Vote	Carried 4-0//Camp abstain	Certificate #	72356	
11. Norris, Mark	31 Pilgrim Road	Rev 69408: outdoor shower	41-97	Self
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Watterson			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Linda Williams			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:53)	Oliver – With the cedar trees, this won’t be visible. Camp – No concerns due to no visibility. McLaughlin – The shower wall boarding should be vertical.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted with the vegetation to be maintained in perpetuity and due to lack of visibility. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 5-0	Certificate #	72357	

HDC Minutes for April 30, 2019, adopted May 14

12.	Lhota, Joe	6 South Miacomet Avenue	Secondary dwelling	82-356	BPC
13.	Sullivan-Krueger Trust	6 New Lane	Move/demo	41-294	BPC
14.	Sullivan-Krueger Trust	6 New Lane	New dwelling	41-294	BPC
15.	Sullivan-Krueger Trust	2 Ackermuck Way	New 2 nd dwelling	41-294	BPC
Voting	Oliver, Watterson				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing Public	Joe Paul , BPC – Asked this be held without opening.				
Concerns (5:57)	Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold Items 12-15 at applicant's request. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried unanimously			Certificate #	
16.	Jemison, Steve	9 West Chester Street	Window/dormer revisions	42.4.3-12	JB Studio
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	Watterson				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.				
Representing Public	Juraj Bencat , JB Studio – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; the basement windows aren't changing.				
Concerns (5:58)	<p>Coombs – Read HSAB comments from April 8, 2019.</p> <p>Camp – South elevation far left, the 15-light door should have a kick panel; the “C” window above should be a 9-over-9.</p> <p>Watterson – Agrees about the French door.</p> <p>McLaughlin – North elevation, the double dormer “D” windows should be 3-over-3 or fixed.</p> <p>Oliver – All the new windows should be true divided lights (TDL)</p> <p>Welch – Agrees about the south elevation French door; about the window above it, there are windows like it on that addition on the east elevation.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the south elevation side door to be a 12-light with a kick panel and the “C” window above to be a 9-over-6; the north elevation “D” windows to be fixed. (Camp)				
Vote	Carried 5-0			Certificate #	72358
17.	Hills & Valleys, LLC	14A Greglen Avenue	New dwelling	68-182	Emeritus
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Watterson				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing Public	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.				
Concerns (6:11)	<p>Welch – It's appropriate and an improvement over a lot of existing structures.</p> <p>Oliver – No concerns.</p> <p>Camp – It still seems vertical to her.</p> <p>Coombs – This has never been a traditional neighborhood.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried 4-0			Certificate #	72359
18.	Laundro ACK, LLC	4 Hanabea Lane	Commercial building	69-15	Emeritus
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing Public	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.				
Concerns (6:18)	<p>Discussion about the main ridge height, which scales up at 33'8”.</p> <p>Oliver – This is still out of scale for the area. The bump on the front doesn't bring the perceived height down and the cupola adds to that as well. Shouldn't have such large windows on the 2nd floor.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with what's been said; the 2nd-floor fenestration is oversized. Believes that if the height comes down to 30', the cupola would be more acceptable. The east elevation will have the strongest perception of a very large building.</p> <p>Coombs – It should be no more than 30' to the ridge; if we approve this taller, more and more structures will inch up as well.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)				
Vote	Carried 4-0			Certificate #	

19. High Garden Holding, LLC	40 Jefferson Avenue	New dwelling	30-119	Emeritus
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:27)	<p>Welch – The garage mass could be moved back 2 more feet; there’s a lot of detail on the east elevation and moving the mass back would help.</p> <p>Oliver – East elevation, agrees with Mr. Welch about pushing the garage back; the “C” window in the connector makes that area complicated.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees about moving the garage back; the windows in the garage doors are too “noisy” and detract from the front; would prefer all v-groove or a simpler version of the proposed windows and to be natural to weather.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	
20. High Garden Holding, LLC	40 Jefferson Avenue	New cabana	30-119	Emeritus
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:36)	<p>Welch – It’s complicated for a little structure, but it isn’t directly visible.</p> <p>Oliver – Suggested removing some of the “Greek” elements. This and the gym all have (doghouse dormers) on top.</p> <p>Camp – She has no concerns.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 3-1//Oliver opposed		Certificate #	72360
21. High Garden Holding, LLC	40 Jefferson Avenue	New gym	30-119	Emeritus
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:40)	Welch – His comments are the same as for the cabana.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 3-1//Oliver opposed		Certificate #	72361
22. Union Lodge	30 Main Street	Revisions to entries/chimney	42.3.1-215	McMullen & Assoc.
Voting	Camp (acting chair), McLaughlin, Oliver, Dutra, Watterson			
Alternates	Welch			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historical documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	<p>Mark Norris, Union Lodge Master – Rebuilding the chimneys takes money away from the Masonic charitable deeds.</p> <p>Jeffrey Turner, Union Lodge Chaplain</p> <p>Linda Williams, for Nathan McMullen – Reviewed the building’s history. Reviewed changes per the Boston Architectural Review Board. Submitted revised 8½X11 plans at the table.</p>			
Public	Diane Coombs – Thinks it’s important to keep this looking as it did in the early 20 th century.			
Concerns (6:43)	<p>Oliver – Doesn’t care about the chimneys being removed.</p> <p>Dutra – Asked how the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) accessibility changes the entrances. (Wider doors) Feels the chimneys are part of the history of the building and worth salvaging; it is our job to preserve this sensitive building. Okay with the façade understanding the need for ADA accessibility.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No comments.</p> <p>Watterson – He’s okay with the changes. Not concerned about the chimneys.</p> <p>Camp – She’d like the chimneys restored and kept. Okay with the south elevation fenestration. Would like to see the doors without sidelights drawn up at ¼-inch scale.</p> <p>Welch – Clarified what was submitted at the table. In his mind, the chimneys have a lot of significance; suggested a view to ascertain the impact of their removal.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for a view and submission of ¼-scale plans and to be heard at the beginning of the May 7th meeting. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 5-0		Certificate #	

23. Heller, Jeffrey	7 East Lincoln Avenue	New dwelling	42.4.1-8	Robert Newman
Voting	Coombs, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing Public	Robert Newman , Sandcastle Construction Inc. – Asked to be held for the beginning of next week for Mr. Pohl to sit.			
Concerns (7:12)	(5:57) Motion to Hold for representation. (Oliver) Carried 3-0 Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for one week. (Oliver)			
Vote	Carried 3-0		Certificate #	

V. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approve Minutes	April 9, 2019: Motion to Approve. (Oliver) 5-0 (Welch not voting)
Review Minutes	April 10 & 11, 2019
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discussion of update on Vineyard Wind project. Coombs – We have two people who have also worked hard to get the facts out, Lauren Sinatra and Holly Backus. She has asked Mr. Hedden to invite them to a HDC meeting to discuss the wind farm. Welch – Feels he has worked hard to update the Commission and answer any questions. To suggest other members of the work group are not paying for their efforts is incorrect. There is a difference between someone talking about their perspective as Energy Coordinator and NP&EDC staff member versus someone asked to represent the HDC. If a commissioner has questions, you should go first to your voted representative. Update: We were able to initiate the concept of obtaining expert counsel with the town: got that approved and hired Cultural Heritage Partners. We have found Board of Ocean Energy Management (BOEM) to be more responsive to our concerns. Suggested all commissioners read the letter presented to BOEM on HDC’s behalf. • Discussion of synthetic materials. McLaughlin – He looked at some of these. Oliver – We need samples of products, so we can review and discuss them properly. • Discussion of approvable roof shingle colors, roof color change applications being placed on the Consent agenda and posting approved colors on the Town website. Motion to Approve the addition of Grey Frost 3-tab and the sheet to be posted to the website as soon as possible. (Welch) 4-1//Camp opposed (Watterson no voting) • Discussion and possible vote on Madaket Historic District Map. Coombs – Asked everyone review the map, so it can be voted on at the next meeting. • Discussion of expanding the Sconset Old Historic District. Camp – Put this down for discussion. Coombs – We need a copy of the map showing the extended area. Motion to have ‘Sconset Advisory Board review and make recommendations on expansion resulting in a map that includes the existing review area, the zoning area, and proposed changes. (Welch) Carried unanimously
Commission Comments	

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Nantucket HDC – Approvable Roof Shingle Colors.
2. Letter to BOEM
3. Madaket Historic District Map.

Adjourned at 7:30 p.m. by unanimous consent

Submitted by:
Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sign Advisory Committee