



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Friday, June 11, 2021

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 1:00 p.m. and announcements by Ms. Coombs

Staff in attendance: Cathy Flynn, HDC Compliance Coordinator; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner
Attending Members: Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill
Absent Members: Pohl, Welch, Dutra
Late Arrivals: None
Early Departures: Camp, 2:36 p.m.

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as amended. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Camp, Oliver, and Coombs-aye; McLaughlin off ZOOM

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. RESILIENT NANTUCKET – Final Review and Adoption of Resilient Nantucket Design Guidelines

Voting Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill

Documentation Resilient Nantucket: Flooding Adaptation & Building Elevation Design Guidelines; The Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Rehabilitation & Guidelines on Flood Adaptation for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings; Historic Landmark District Data Sheet.

Representing Phil Thomason, Thomason & Associates, consultant

Concerns **Backus** – Mr. Thomason is here to discuss the resilience design guidelines. We are ending the review of the guidelines which has been a 2-year process. She is asking the HDC for their final review and adoption today.
Thomason – These are consistent with the National Park guidelines, which came out earlier this week. The local guidelines include many suggestions found in the National Park guidelines.
Oliver – She sent notes to Ms. Backus about example pictures and some of them not being clear that they aren't from Nantucket. Her main concern is the section, pages 81–89, referring to parking under the structure; she can't see HDC ever adopting that and asked that it be completely removed.
Coombs – Agrees.
Thomason – That isn't just for properties in the old historic district (OHD) but any properties throughout the Island; there might be places where this would work. These are recommendations to be considered on a property-by-property basis.
Oliver – She understand why it was included but she can't think of where it would be approvable; she doesn't want to give anyone the false impression they can apply for that.
Thornewill – Maybe there should be a sentence saying it will not be considered anywhere in the Historic District. However, if it is proven to be not visible, it could be done.
Thomason – He can preface the section with a comment that parking under a historic building will not be considered.
Camp – She weighs on the side of caution; even if it is mid-Island, there could be water rising from ponds.
Backus – Agrees with the idea of making it very clear that HDC doesn't allow parking under a building at this time but keeping it in the document. Review and approval is a case-by-case basis. Reminded them that the entire Island is a Historic District.
Oliver – Suggested eliminating "Nantucket" in the section title; this is after all pulled directly from the national guidelines.
Coombs – Asked if it is mentioned that all electrical equipment should be elevated into the attic. Asked about the implication that historic homes must be elevated.
Backus – Pointed out that a recent application for a house at 46 Union Street is a prime example of a historic structure attempting to accommodate for flooding while being sensitive to its historic nature.
Thornewill – Asked if there is a campaign to let people know this document will be available.
Backus – Yes; plus, it points out that historic structures can be exempt from the building code in this regard. Reviewed her out-reach efforts.

Oliver – She doesn’t understand Nr 2 under “all elevation proposals” it says, “interior photos are highly encouraged, only if the interior floorplans are to be changed to accommodate building elevation.”

Coombs – Asked for a hardcopy of the document.

Backus – She can print off a copy. Explained that the national Historic Landmark District Data Sheet is available on the Town website. We have applied for Federal funding to upgrade our historic structures survey to ensure information provided to the HDC is accurate.

McLaughlin – He read the whole document; it’s well written and explanations are down to the detail.

Motion to Adopt the Guidelines as amended in today’s discussion. (Oliver)

Motion

Roll-call Vote

Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Coombs-aye

III. CONSENT

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	3 Old Mill Court	3 Old Mill Court	Rev. 73363: add window	55/927	E. McMorrow
2.	Michael& Rachel Watts 05-3896	20 Lincoln Avenue	New gate	30/115	Sanne Payne
3.	LBC Sconset, LLC 05-3826	9 Hawk’s Circle	Re-site 5 deg./bump out	74/37.1	JGG Architects
4.	Beach Not, LLC 05-3828	16 Cannonbury Lane	Rev. 3026: re-site & window	74/12	JGG Architects

Voting Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns No concerns.

Motion **Motion to Approve. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote

Carried 5-0//Camp, Thornewill, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Coombs-aye

Certificate #

HDC2021-(as noted)

IV. SIGNS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Union Lodge Masons	30A Main Street	Projecting sign	42.3.1/2.5	Linda Williams
2.	Union Lodge Masons	30 Main Street	Master sign plan	42.3.1/2.5	Linda Williams

Voting Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation None

Representing None

Sign Advisory None

Concerns **Flynn** – Item 1 is held for revisions. Item 2 is approvable per SAC comments.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions per SAC recommendations. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote

Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Coombs-aye

Certificate #

Motion

Motion to Approve through staff per SAC comments. (Oliver)

Roll-call Vote

Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Coombs-aye

Certificate #

HDC2021-

V. OLD BUSINESS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Kristina Amendolare 05-3625	8 Bank Street	Addition	72.1.3/69	Angus MacLeod

Voting Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation Architectural elevation plans, plan, photos, historic documentation, advisory comments, and height comparison bar graph.

Representing Angus MacLeod

Public Jeff Gardner, 9 Broadway & 9 Front Street

Margaret Van Deusen, 7 Front Street

Lisa Soeder, 13 Broadway

Concerns (1:39)

MacLeod – Thinks there’s confusion about the date; an old photo shows a 1-story structure that is not what is now known as the hotdog stand. Reviewed photos of approved construction which has not been sympathetic to historic ‘Sconset and obliterated the façades of historic structures. Reviewed photos of the height poles with line drawings of the roof and massing. Reviewed the proposed elevations. Pointed out that skylights were advertised for sale on Island in the 1850s.

Backus – SAB had no further discussion on this; they had no overall concerns in their original review; there was a question about the what would be seen when the barn doors are open. The proposal is more of a new structure than an addition.

Gardner – He blocked out the drawings Mr. MacLeod provided to give a sense of the mass. It’s too tall and going from 9’ tall to 21’ tall and sits at least 3’ higher than other structures in Codfish Park. Asked the commission seek revisions lowering the height.

Van Deusen – Mr. Gardner’s photos show how the blockiness and verticality will detract from the views from Front Street. Her concern is that allowing this will set a precedent. Asked the HDC to require it be substantially lowered. East

elevation, the sliding barn doors when they are open will give Bank Street a different look. West elevation, the 1st-floor windows and the dormer are right against Middle Gully Road and the wall will close the road in.

Soeder – When this is constructed, she will lose all her views of the water. She’s opposed to the height. She’s also concerned about construction so close to the bank. Asked that the height be lowered.

Camp – Mr. MacLeod understand ‘Sconset vernacular and this is a hard site to renovate; if anyone can do it, he can. Given the history, we have to ask what we are looking for: historic fishing cottages or a compromise for today. Suggested dropping the front portion and stepping up in the rear to follow the topography.

Thornewill – As a threshold into Codfish park, the massing is monolithic and agrees with Ms. Camp that the massing should be broken down. Appreciates the simplicity; however, not everything is simple in ‘Sconset any longer; simplicity is working against you in this location by creating one big mass. The proposed is not preserving a historic building but creating a new structure.

Oliver – She likes the design. In the first meeting she mentioned breaking up the roof line to have more additive massing. Simplicity is the key. We are not in the business of preserving people’s private views; we are in the business of ensuring a structure is appropriate.

McLaughlin – The windows are the wrong type for its size and there’s too much lattice work.

Camp – We are committed to preserving the streetscape and the neighborhood. Agrees with Ms. Camp’s suggestion and reducing the height. Thinks the chimney should be restored.

MacLeod – Responded to comments: it will be all natural to weather and will blend in; he believes the strength is in the simplicity; the dormer is to get legal head-height for the bathroom; the proposed porch lowers the south gable; we will do everything we can to preserve the tree.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Camp, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Coombs-aye Certificate #

VI. NEW BUSINESS (05/18/21)

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Village Way R.T. 05-3782	6 Village Way	New dwelling	14/42	Workshop APD
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Irina Matos, Workshop APD				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:34)	Matos – Mr. Kotchen asked this be held for Tuesday, June 15 th . Not opened at this time.				
Motion	Motion to Hold at applicant’s request. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Oliver, Camp, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye Certificate #				
2.	Dolores Martin 05-3796	80 Easton Street	Spa & fence.	42.4.2/6	Self
Voting	Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Dolores Martin, owner				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:36)	Martin – Presented project; 9X16.5 with autocover and fence; 48” to 52” deep; top set 1’ to 1.5’ above grade; there is existing privet, which is very full in the summer; equipment will be located behind the studio. Backus – Read HSAB comments: need more information about the spa - size, above or below ground, exact location. It looks like there would be no visibility, but more information is needed Oliver – The application is incomplete. We need to know what the fence will look like, a picture of the spa, and better information written on the plan. Thornewill – The spa equipment can’t be in the 5’ set back. We need a surveyed site plan. Coombs – We need to know where the equipment will go.				
Motion	Motion to Hold for further information and for a second viewing and to come back on Tuesday, June 15th. (McLaughlin)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Oliver, McLaughlin, and Coombs-aye Certificate #				

Rest held for Tuesday, June 15th.

3.	37 Pocomo Road RT 05-3813	37 Pocomo Road	Cabana	14/38	Workshop/APD
4.	Cannonbury Lane Part 05-3817	14 Cannonbury Lane	New dwelling	74/11	Workshop APD
5.	Cannonbury Lane Part 05-3788	14 Cannonbury Lane	Pool & harscape	74/11	Workshop APD
6.	Gifford Whitney A Trst 05-3818	6 Lily Street	Window and door change	42.3.4/45	CWA
7.	8 Walsh, LLC 05-3819	8 Walsh Street	Addition	42.4.1/83	B. Meerbergen
8.	Barry + Robert Ang 05-3821	11 Jonathan Way	New dwelling	75/42	McMullen Assoc.
9.	Barry + Robert Ang 05-3822	11 Jonathan Way	Cottage	75/42	McMullen Assoc.
10.	Barry + Robert Ang 05-3823	11 Jonathan Way	Shed	75/42	McMullen Assoc.
11.	Barry + Robert Ang 05-3824	11 Jonathan Way	Pool and hardscape	75/42	McMullen Assoc.
12.	LBC Sconset, LLC 05-3826	9 Hawk's Circle	Minor resite + bumpout	74/37.1	JGG Architects
13.	Beach Not, LLC 05-3827	16 Cannonbury Lane	Pool and hardscape	74/12	JGG Architects
14.	103 Main Street, LLC 05-3829	103 Main Street	Gate	42.3.3/153	Atlantic Lndscpng
15.	Steven J. Renehan Tr 05-3830	24 Stone Post Way	Pool and hardscape	73.3.2/68	Atlantic Lndscpng
16.	38 Prospect, LLC 05-3831	38 Prospect – Lot 29	Spa/hardscape	54.4.4/56	Mark Lombardi
17.	Greg Raiff 05-3832	100 Low Beach Road	Rev 10-21882 minor revs	75/27	Bernice Wahler
18.	Jim Ikard 05-3833	1 Bloom Street	Addition	42.3.3/140	Emeritus
19.	Jim Helfrich 05-3834	37 Fair Street	Addition/alteration	42.3.2/212	Emeritus
20.	Earret, LLC 05-3836	6A Morey Lane	New dwelling	73.3.1/47	Emeritus
21.	John Berry 05-3837	22 Eel Point Road	Demo/move off	40/45	Emeritus
22.	John Berry 05-3838	22 Eel Point Road	New dwelling	40/45	Emeritus
23.	Bill Burke 05-3839	54 Pochick Avenue	Addition	79/128	Emeritus
24.	Doug Meyer 05-3841	18 Gardner Road	New dwelling	43/135	Emeritus
25.	Doug Meyer 05-3840	18 Gardner Road	Garage	43/135	Emeritus
26.	Darrell Ferguson 05-3842	28 Main Street, Sias	Rev. 2856: cupola + pergola	73.3.1/47	Emeritus
27.	Eric Kraeutler 05-3843	35 New Street	Move off/demo	73.4.2/42	Botticelli + Pohl
28.	Eric Kraeutler 05-3844	35 New Street	New dwelling	73.4.2/42	Botticelli + Pohl
29.	Okay Okay House, LLC 06-3934	10 Union Street	Rev. 2342: door change	42.3.1/43	BPC
30.	Hannah Gardner House 05-3845	6 Gull Island Lane	Revise bldg size + alterations	42.4.3/61	Sarah McLane
31.	NISDA 05-3846	71 Washington Street	Move off/demo	42.2.3/41.2	BPC
32.	NISDA 05-3847	71 Washington Street	Move off/demo	42.2.3/41.2	BPC
33.	NISDA 05-3848	71 Washington Street	Move off/demo	42.2.3/41.2	BPC
34.	William Scannell 05-3849	119R Eel Point Road	Rev. 2446: cupola revs	33/17.1	BPC
35.	Sweet Meadow Sylvia Ln 05-3851	74 West Chester Street	Hardscape	41/478	NAG
36.	Kingfisher Realty Trust 05-3719	278 Polpis Road	Rev. 2488: relocate on site	25/2	Gryphon Arch

VII. OLD BUSINESS (05/25/21)

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Mary Claus Trustee 04-3405	31 Low Beach Road	New dwelling	74/36	Botticelli + Pohl
2.	Anehialine Prop 04-3327	19 East Creek Road	Addition	55/60	BPC
3.	38 Prospect, LLC 03-3070	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	New main house	55.4.4/80.1	B Meerbergen
4.	38 Prospect, LLC 03-3099	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	New 2 nd dwelling	55.4.4/80.1	B Meerbergen
5.	38 Prospect, LLC 02-3037	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	Water feature	55.4.4/80.1	B Meerbergen
6.	38 Prospect, LLC 02-3094	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	Shed	55.4.4/80.1	B Meerbergen
7.	Tim Demasi 04-3424	3 Gladlands Ave	New dwelling	80/234	Emeritus
8.	Josh Gregg 05-3714	2 Sandplain Drive	Pool and hardscape	68/356	Swim Pool&Dsgn
9.	David Berson-Lacey 04-3382	6 Hedge Row	Dormer + shed addition	73.3.2/87	SM Roethke
10.	Cannonbury Holding 04-3380	18 Cannonbury Lane	New dwelling	71/13	Chip Webster
11.	Jennifer Silva 04-3381	14 Harborview Way	Lift, addition & roofwalk	42.4.1/26	Thornewill Dsgn
12.	Sam Aloisi 05-3620	19 Quaker Road	New dwelling	41/42	Thornewill Dsgn
13.	Brian Franz 04-3609	10-12 Cannonbury Lane	Pool	74/9 + 10	Ahern LLC
14.	Diedre Hamlin Trust 02-2951	6 Lowell Place	Addition	41/167	Topham Design
15.	Gary Creem 04-3603	6 + 8 Hydrangea Lane	Addition	73/87 + 88	Val Oliver Design
16.	Grey Lady Lane, LLC 04-3600	4 Grey Lady Lane	New dwelling	66/702	Val Oliver Design
17.	3 Waterview, LLC 04-3613	3 Waterview Drive	New dwelling	76/117.1	Linda Williams
18.	3 Waterview, LLC 04-3594	3 Waterview Drive	Pool and hardscape	76/117.1	Linda Williams
19.	Stephanie Basile 04-3602	8 New Mill	Garage/apartment	42.3.3/33.2	Linda Williams
20.	Kristina Amendolare 05-3625	8 Bank Street	Addition	73.1.3/69	Angus Macleod
21.	Mark Finnegan 05-3623	36 Warren's Landing	Gazebo/cabana	38/44	BPC
22.	Mark Finnegan 05-3624	36 Warren's Landing	Pool	38/44	BPC

VIII. NEW BUSINESS (06/07/2021)

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Josh Morash 05-3885	8 Bayberry Lane – Lot A	Move/demo	67/72	Val Oliver Design
2.	Josh Morash 05-3886	8 Bayberry Lane – Lot A	New dwelling	67/72	Val Oliver Design

HDC Minutes for June 11, 2021, adopted June 29

3. Jeff Morash 05-3881	8 Bayberry Lane – Lot B	New dwelling w/ garage	67/72	Val Oliver Design
4. Laurence Goode 05-3887	10 Grey Lady Lane	New dwelling	66/705	Val Oliver Design
5. Lawrence Conway 05-3891	167 Surfside Road	New dwelling	87/118	Val Oliver Design
6. Local Buoy Props. 05-3890	39 Beach Grass Road	New duplex	66/368	Val Oliver Design
7. Linda Towne 05-3884	5 Evergreen Way – Lot B	New dwelling	68/726	Val Oliver Design
8. Jacob Martinson 05-3883	16 West York Lane	New dwelling	55/8.2	Val Oliver Design
9. Diane Catino Et al 05-3892	11 D Street	New dwelling	60/2.1	E McMorrow
10. Tomaiolo Development 05-3901	3 Raceway Drive	Move off/demo	66/281	E McMorrow
11. 3 Raceway Drive, LLC 06-3964	3 Raceway Drive	New dwelling	66/281	Sophie Metz
12. Town of Nantucket 05-3897	58 Bunker Road	New metal shop building	78/119	S.M. Roethke
13. Hatcreek Cattle Co. 05-3898	15 Beach Grass Road	New dwelling	68/394	Karsten Reinemo
14. Patti Duester 05-3876	13 Monomoy Road	As built deer fence	54/198	Self
15. Magnus Nicolin 06-3957	6 Brier Patch Road	Rooftop solar	21/136	Karen Alence
16. Robert Meyer Jr. 06-3961	307 Polpis Road	Renovate barn	25/39	CWA
17. 5 Sherburne Way, LLC 06-3958	5 Sherburne Way	New guest house	30/38	Botticelli & Pohl
18. Kristen Engle Trust 06-3979	90 Pocomo Road	Pool and hardscape	15/43	CWA
19. Howard + Holt _____	10 Bayberry Lane	Addition	67/71	Newman INC.
20. Oliver Carr 06-3954	84 Cliff Road	New dwelling	30/74.1	Robert Newman
21. Robert Newman 06-3972	6 Topping Lift Road	Addition/garage	66/308	Robert Newman
22. Downyflake Inc 06-3974	14 West Creek Road	Commercial building	55/175	Robert Newman
23. Downyflake Inc 06-3971	14 West Creek Road	Rooftop solar array	55/175	Robert Newman
24. Stuart Whitlock 06-3965	101 Orange Street	As built fence	55.1.4/17	Self
25. 17 Lincoln Realty Trust 06-3968	17 Lincoln Circle	Pool and hardscape	30/18	Ben Champoux
26. Gary Winn 06-3960	25 North Water Street	Window replacement	42.4.2/2.1	Linda Williams
27. Peter Dupont 06-3963	47 Millbrook Road	New dwelling	56/231	E McMorrow
28. Tim Quinlisk 06-3962	88 Quidnet Road	Rev. 0793:	21/109	Botticelli + Pohl
29. 6 Gull Island, LLC _____	6 Gull Island	Historic determination	42.4.3/61	Sarah McLane
30. Thomas Rhodes II Trst 06-3932	125 Main Street	New dwelling	42.3.3/49	Gryphon Arch
31. Tim Vieth 06-3912	3 Gladlands Avenue	Pool and hardscape	88/234	Atlantic Landscap
32. Aileen Newquist 06-3911	29 Main Street	Pool and hardscape	73.3.1/9	Atlantic Landscap
33. Rhack, LLC 06-3909	20 Sherburne Turnpike	Pool and hardscape	30/195	Atlantic Landscap
34. Brian Nester 06-3908	4 East Lincoln Avenue	Pool and hardscape	42.4.1/49	Atlantic Landscap
35. 41 Beach Grass, LLC 06-3953	41 Beach Grass Road	New dwelling	68/367	Val Oliver Design
36. 43 Beach Grass, LLC 06-3952	43 Beach Grass Road	New dwelling	66/358	Val Oliver Design
37. John Barry 06-3956	22 Eel Point Road	New guest house	40/45	Emeritus
38. John Barry 06-3955	22 Eel Point Road	New garage	40/45	Emeritus
39. Barbara Henderson 06-3981	6A Silver Street	Spa and hardscape	55.4.1/184.1	Waterscapes
40. Thomas Wynn Trst 06-3966	10 Moors End Lane	Addition	43/214	Studio Ppark

IX. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	None
Review Minutes	June 3, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting Tuesday, June 15, 2021 at 4:30 p.m. • Coastal Resilience Plan Virtual Open House #2, June 24, 2021, 6-8pm. Registration to attend: https://www.eventbrite.com/e/nantucket-coastal-resilience-plan-open-house-2-tickets-154033750093 • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:55 p.m. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Thornewill, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Coombs-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Scosset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board

Sign Advisory Council