



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, June 17, 2021

2 Fairgrounds Road, Conference Room – 1:00 p.m.

Called to order at 1:05 p.m. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Cathy Flynn, HDC Compliance Coordinator; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
 Attending Members: Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch, Thornewill
 Remote attendance: Coombs
 Absent Members: Dutra
 Late Arrivals: Coombs, 1:07 p.m.
 Early Departures: None

Adoption of Agenda.

Motion **Motion to Approve as drafted. (Oliver)**

Vote Carried 5-0

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Julie Biomdi 06-3989	70 Orange Street	Rev 72356; ext vent/ODS	55.4.1/88	Topham Dsgn, Inc.
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Oliver)			
Roll-call vote	Carried 5-0//		Certificate #	HDC2021-06-3989

V. NEW BUSINESS (05/18/21)

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Village Way R.T. 05-3782	6 Village Way	New dwelling	14/42	Workshop APD
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:07)	<p>Kotchen – Presented project; trim, doors, sashes are grey; some windows are awnings to emulate a former barn and the rest fixed.</p> <p>Camp – Appreciates keeping the scale of the original structure and the simplicity of the design.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Design is applicable to the area. Not one double-hung window in the structure; that’s too modern.</p> <p>Coombs – This is a good, simple building. Asked what the windows are; the proposed windows help keep the front simple.</p> <p>Oliver – Something makes it feel too big; wishes the smaller piece were on the corner because of the amount of glass on the north elevation.</p> <p>Pohl – Appreciates the mass and grey trim; but he’s skeptical about the type of rakes and corner boards. He’d like the operable windows identified on the plans.</p> <p>Discussion if there are changes that would make this approvable through staff.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)			
Roll-call vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	

2.	37 Pocomo Road RT 05-3813	37 Pocomo Road	Cabana	14/38	Workshop/APD
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch				
Alternates	Thornewill				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:22)	Kotchen – Presented project; natural to weather exterior with grey interior ship-lat; contends no visibility. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility and not to be visible at time of inspection and thereafter. (Welch)				
Roll-call vote	Carried 5-0//McLaughlin, Coombs, Camp, Welch, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3813	
3.	Cannonbury Lane Prtnr 05-3817	14 Cannonbury Lane	New dwelling	74/11	Workshop APD
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Andrew Kotchen, Workshop APD				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:26)	Kotchen – Presented project; this model already exists in Cannonbury; white trim. Backus – Read SAB comments: east elevation, “A” window smaller for balance; north elevation, shed dormer roof off ridge more; natural to weather trim to match cottage details. Oliver – Except for white chimney, it’s fine. McLaughlin – Asked where the air conditioners (A/C) are located (not being approved today). Coombs – The dormers are large. North elevation, the 3 dormers should have the cheek walls reduced or larger windows to fill them. South elevation, the 2 nd -floor “B” windows should be at least one size larger. Camp – The chimney is appropriate but agrees not white. Pohl – No concerns if the chimney is natural brick.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the chimney to be natural brick and the east elevation “A” window to go to “B”. (McLaughlin)				
Roll-call vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Oliver, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3817	
4.	Beach Not, LLC 05-3827	16 Cannonbury Lane	Pool and hardscape	74/12	JGG Architects
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Thornewill				
Alternates	Welch				
Recused	Oliver				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Adam Davis, J. Graham Goldsmith Architects				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:36)	Davis – Presented project. Backus – Read SAB comments: no concerns; pool seems close to property line. Thornewill – Appreciates lack of hardscaping and it’s hidden by the house. Camp – No concerns. Coombs – She would prefer a native evergreen over privet to screen the fencing. McLaughlin – No concerns. Pohl – He thinks the 2 layers of privet will work.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (McLaughlin)				
Roll-call vote	Carried 4-1//Camp, Thornewill, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye; Coombs-nay		Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3827	
5.	Darrell Ferguson 05-3842	28 Main Street, Sias	Rev. 2856: cupola + pergola	73.3.1/47	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:41)	MacEachern – Presented project. Backus – Read SAB comments: cupola not in keeping with neighborhood; bracket details should be more delicate. Oliver – Would prefer pergola to be natural to weather. The cupola is too large. Camp – She preferred the previous approval; it was so simple. Coombs – Agrees the brackets are too large. The cupola is not appropriate. McLaughlin – Cupola should be eliminated. Pohl – The members of the pergola are overly large for its size and should be scaled down.				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the cupola eliminated, brackets 4X4, and the pergola beam smaller. (Oliver)				
Roll-call vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3842	

6.	Eric Kraeutler	05-3843	35 New Street	Move off/demo	73.4.2/42	Botticelli + Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch					
Alternates	Thornewill					
Recused	Pohl					
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.					
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl					
Public	None					
Concerns (1:43)	<p>Botticelli – Presented project; circa 2001 or 2004.</p> <p>Backus – Read SAB comments: no concerns.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Approve as a move-off/demolition. (Camp)					
Roll-call vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Welch, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Coombs-aye				Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3843
7.	Eric Kraeutler	05-3844	35 New Street	New cottage	73.4.2/42	Botticelli + Pohl
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver, Welch					
Alternates	Thornewill					
Recused	Pohl					
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.					
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl					
Public	None					
Concerns (1:52)	<p>Botticelli – Presented project.</p> <p>Backus – Read SAB comments: one notation about the lack of fenestration on south elevation right; reads as a shed and reflects previous structure.</p> <p>Camp – No concerns as submitted.</p> <p>Oliver – The south elevation won't be visible.</p> <p>Welch – No concerns; this is charming.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Casement windows should be changed to awnings. North elevation, the 9-light should be a double-hung.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the north elevation "C" window to be a 3-over-6 double hung. (Camp)					
Roll-call vote	Carried 4-1//Oliver, McLaughlin, Camp, and Coombs-aye; Welch-nay				Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3844
8.	Okay Okay House, LLC	06-3934	10 Union Street	Rev. 2342: door change	42.3.1/43	BPC
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver					
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.					
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC					
Public	None					
Concerns (1:59)	<p>Paul – Presented project; circa 1920 and bays not original; he has revised plans based upon HSAB comments.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments from 6/14: the small sheds on either side of the fireplace read as bays and having French doors in a bay is awkward; perhaps 3 narrow doors with lower panel to give the appearance of tall casements; option to recess French doors in existing bays, still glass at top with panel below.</p> <p>Camp – Thinks the little bay should stay as is.</p> <p>Oliver – Likes the proposal that makes them all match.</p> <p>Coombs – The shutters on the east and west won't close over the mulled windows.</p> <p>McLaughlin – No comments.</p> <p>Pohl – He likes the revisions per HSAB.</p>					
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff per Exhibit A. (Oliver)					
Roll-call vote	Carried 5-0//Camp, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	HDC2021-06-3934

9.	Hannah Gardner Hse, LLC 05-3845	6 Gull Island	Reduce bldg size + alterations	42.4.3/61	Sarah McLane
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Pohl, Thornewill, McLaughlin				
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Sarah McLane				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:10)	<p>McLane – Presented project.</p> <p>Backus – This is contributing; the main body is intact; revisions are not clear. Read HSAB comments from 5/24: the combinations of existing additions on the back of this house tells a story of its age and the transitions through generations of owners, and it is a shame to lose all sense of that character; the previous additions were small in scale and somewhat quirky while the new rear addition is of a considerably different scale and character; the proposed additions should be broken up to reflect the existing scale of the existing rear additions; west elevation dormer doesn't work and should be removed to retain original roof line.</p> <p>Camp – Did a good job with the back of the house and shoring it up; won't be visible. The chimney should be traditionally corbelled; misses windows either side of the chimney.</p> <p>Oliver – West dormer is unusual but that's okay.</p> <p>Welch – Nothing is inappropriate in the proposal.</p> <p>Coombs – West elevation, would prefer the originally approved 3 windows rather than the mulled 4 windows. Agrees about the chimney and the flanking windows being retained.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)				
Roll-call vote	Carried 4-0//Welch, Camp, Oliver, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2021-05-3845
10.	NISDA 05-3846	71 Washington Street	Move off/demo	42.2.3/41.2	BPC
11.	NISDA 05-3847	71 Washington Street	Move off/demo	42.2.3/41.2	BPC
12.	NISDA 05-3848	71 Washington Street	Move off/demo	42.2.3/41.2	BPC
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Camp, Oliver				
Alternates	Welch, Thornewill				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:28)	<p>Paul – His client wants to take part in the discussion and asked these be held for Tuesday's meeting. Not opened at this time.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for Tuesday, June 22nd at applicant's request. (Oliver)				
Roll-call vote	Carried 5-0//Thornewill, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
13.	William Scannell 05-3849	119R Eel Point Road	Rev. 2446: cupola revs	33/17.1	BPC
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Welch, Thornewill				
Alternates	None				
Recused	Camp, Oliver				
Documentation	Architectural design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:30)	<p>Paul – Presented project.</p> <p>Welch – He'd prefer to see a 3-window mock up and revised drawings.</p> <p>Thornewill – Agrees with Mr. Welch; this house is massive, and the 4-window cupola adds to that.</p> <p>McLaughlin – The cupola is inappropriate on this style of house.</p> <p>Coombs – It would look better without the cupola; It doesn't align over the 2nd-floor, 4-ganged windows. She'd like to see it with a clean roof.</p> <p>Pohl – We've never had a challenge where there was a room in the cupola and it exceeded the 30' height limit; normally a cupola doesn't count in the height. Suggested checking it out with the Building Inspector and/or Zoning Inspector.</p>				
Motion	Motion to View with a mock up and revised drawings with 3-window cupola. (Welch)				
Roll-call vote	Carried 4-0//McLaughlin, Coombs, Thornewill, Welch, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	

Rest held for Tuesday, June 22nd.

14.	Sweet Meadow Sylvia Ln 05-3851	74 West Chester Street	Hardscape	41/478	NAG
-----	--------------------------------	------------------------	-----------	--------	-----

VI. OLD BUSINESS (05/25/21)

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Mary Claus Trustee 04-3405	31 Low Beach Road	New dwelling	74/36	Botticelli + Pohl
2.	Anehialine Prop. 04-3327	19 East Creek Road	Addition	55/60	BPC
3.	38 Prospect, LLC 03-3070	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	New main house	55.4.4/80.1	B Meerbergen
4.	38 Prospect, LLC 03-3099	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	New 2 nd dwelling	55.4.4/80.1	B Meerbergen
5.	38 Prospect, LLC 02-3037	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	Water feature	55.4.4/80.1	B Meerbergen
6.	38 Prospect, LLC 02-3094	38/38R Prospect/Birdsong	Shed	55.4.4/80.1	B Meerbergen
7.	Tim Demasi 04-3424	3 Gladlands Ave	New dwelling	80/234	Emeritus
8.	Josh Gregg 05-3714	2 Sandplain Drive	Pool and hardscape	68/356	Swim Pool&Dsgn
9.	David Berson-Lacey 04-3382	6 Hedge Row	Dormer + shed addition	73.3.2/87	SM Roethke
10.	Cannonbury Holding 04-3380	18 Cannonbury Lane	New dwelling	71/13	Chip Webster
11.	Jennifer Silva 04-3381	14 Harborview Way	Lift, addition & roofwalk	42.4.1/26	Thornewill Dsgn
12.	Sam Aloisi 05-3620	19 Quaker Road	New dwelling	41/42	Thornewill Dsgn
13.	Brian Franz 04-3609	10-12 Cannonbury Lane	Pool	74/9 + 10	Ahern LLC
14.	Diedre Hamlin Trust 02-2951	6 Lowell Place	Addition	41/167	Topham Design
15.	Gary Creem 04-3603	6 + 8 Hydrangea Lane	Addition	73/87 + 88	Val Oliver Design
16.	Grey Lady Lane, LLC 04-3600	4 Grey Lady Lane	New dwelling	66/702	Val Oliver Design
17.	3 Waterview, LLC 04-3613	3 Waterview Drive	New dwelling	76/117.1	Linda Williams
18.	3 Waterview, LLC 04-3594	3 Waterview Drive	Pool and hardscape	76/117.1	Linda Williams
19.	Stephanie Basile 04-3602	8 New Mill	Garage/apartment	42.3.3/33.2	Linda Williams
20.	Kristina Amendolare 05-3625	8 Bank Street	Addition	73.1.3/69	Angus Macleod
21.	Mark Finnegan 05-3623	36 Warren's Landing	Gazebo/cabana	38/44	BPC
22.	Mark Finnegan 05-3624	36 Warren's Landing	Pool	38/44	BPC

VII. NEW BUSINESS (06/07/2021)

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	Josh Morash 05-3885	8 Bayberry Lane – Lot A	Move/demo	67/72	Val Oliver Design
2.	Josh Morash 05-3886	8 Bayberry Lane – Lot A	New dwelling	67/72	Val Oliver Design
3.	Jeff Morash 05-3881	8 Bayberry Lane – Lot B	New dwelling w/ garage	67/72	Val Oliver Design
4.	Laurence Goode 05-3887	10 Grey Lady Lane	New dwelling	66/705	Val Oliver Design
5.	Lawrence Conway 05-3891	167 Surfside Road	New dwelling	87/118	Val Oliver Design
6.	Local Buoy Props. 05-3890	39 Beach Grass Road	New duplex	66/368	Val Oliver Design
7.	Linda Towne 05-3884	5 Evergreen Way – Lot B	New dwelling	68/726	Val Oliver Design
8.	Jacob Martinson 05-3883	16 West York Lane	New dwelling	55/8.2	Val Oliver Design
9.	Diane Catino Et al 05-3892	11 D Street	New dwelling	60/2.1	E McMorrow
10.	Tomaio Development 05-3901	3 Raceway Drive	Move off/demo	66/281	E McMorrow
11.	3 Raceway Drive, LLC 06-3964	3 Raceway Drive	New dwelling	66/281	Sophie Metz
12.	Town of Nantucket 05-3897	58 Bunker Road	New metal shop building	78/119	S.M. Roethke
13.	Hatcreek Cattle Co. 05-3898	15 Beach Grass Road	New dwelling	68/394	Karsten Reinemo
14.	Patti Duester 05-3876	13 Monomoy Road	As built deer fence	54/198	Self
15.	Magnus Nicolin 06-3957	6 Brier Patch Road	Rooftop solar	21/136	Karen Alence
16.	Robert Meyer Jr. 06-3961	307 Polpis Road	Renovate barn	25/39	CWA
17.	5 Sherburne Way, LLC 06-3958	5 Sherburne Way	New guest house	30/38	Botticelli & Pohl
18.	Kristen Engle Trust 06-3979	90 Pocomo Road	Pool and hardscape	15/43	CWA
19.	Howard + Holt _____	10 Bayberry Lane	Addition	67/71	Newman Inc.
20.	Oliver Carr 06-3954	84 Cliff Road	New dwelling	30/74.1	Robert Newman
21.	Robert Newman 06-3972	6 Topping Lift Road	Addition/garage	66/308	Robert Newman
22.	Downyflake Inc 06-3974	14 West Creek Road	Commercial building	55/175	Robert Newman
23.	Downyflake Inc 06-3971	14 West Creek Road	Rooftop solar array	55/175	Robert Newman
24.	Stuart Whitlock 06-3965	101 Orange Street	As built fence	55.1.4/17	Self
25.	17 Lincoln Realty Trust 06-3968	17 Lincoln Circle	Pool and hardscape	30/18	Ben Champoux
26.	Gary Winn 06-3960	25 North Water Street	Window replacement	42.4.2/2.1	Linda Williams
27.	Peter Dupont 06-3963	47 Millbrook Road	New dwelling	56/231	E McMorrow
28.	Tim Quinlisk 06-3962	88 Quidnet Road	Rev. 0793:	21/109	Botticelli + Pohl
29.	Thomas Rhodes II Trst 06-3932	125 Main Street	New dwelling	42.3.3/49	Gryphon Arch
30.	Tim Vieth 06-3912	3 Gladlands Avenue	Pool and hardscape	88/234	Atlantic Landscap
31.	Aileen Newquist 06-3911	29 Main Street	Pool and hardscape	73.3.1/9	Atlantic Landscap
32.	Rhack, LLC 06-3909	20 Sherburne Turnpike	Pool and hardscape	30/195	Atlantic Landscap
33.	Brian Nester 06-3908	4 East Lincoln Avenue	Pool and hardscape	42.4.1/49	Atlantic Landscap
34.	41 Beach Grass, LLC 06-3953	41 Beach Grass Road	New dwelling	68/367	Val Oliver Design
35.	43 Beach Grass, LLC 06-3952	43 Beach Grass Road	New dwelling	66/358	Val Oliver Design

HDC Minutes for June 17, 2021, adopted June 29

36. John Barry 06-3956	22 Eel Point Road	New guest house	40/45	Emeritus
37. John Barry 06-3955	22 Eel Point Road	New garage	40/45	Emeritus
38. Barbara Henderson 06-3981	6A Silver Street	Spa and hardscape	55.4.1/184.1	Waterscapes
39. Thomas Wynn Trst 06-3966	10 Moors End Lane	Addition	43/214	Studio Ppark

VIII. OLD BUSINESS (06/15/2021)

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Peter Garren 04-3615	36 Pocomo Road	2 nd dwelling/garage	14/79	NAG
2. Eliza Silva 04-3391	16 Helen's Drive	Rooftop solar	66/53	ACK Smart
3. Jennifer Khoury 05-3768	27 West Chester Street	Spa	42.3.4/2	David Troast
4. Westmoor Club 05-3636	109 West Chester Street	Dorm A	41/805	JGG Architects
5. Westmoor Club 05-3637	105 West Chester Street	Dorm B	41/805	JGG Architects
6. Carol Anne Surface 04-3605	47 Warren's Landing	New dwelling	38/34	BPC
7. Carol Anne Surface 04-3606	47 Warren's Landing	Studio	38/34	BPC
8. Carol Anne Surface 04-3607	47 Warren's Landing	Pool	38/34	BPC
9. 14 MVR LLC 04-3420	14 Madequecham Valley Rd	New dwelling	89/13	Emeritus
10. Frederick Hahn 05-3797	50 Eel Point Road	Pool and hardscape	32/25.1	Atlantic Lndscp
11. Zero India Street 03-3268	1 Cambridge Street	Addition	42.3.1/150.2	Emeritus
12. One Folger Road, LLC 05-3642	1 Folger Road	Studio	30/195.1	Studio Ppark

IX. OTHER BUSINESS

Approved Minutes	None
Review Minutes	June 7, 2021
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting Tuesday, June 22, 2021 at 5:00 p.m., 4 Fairgrounds Road, Community Room • HDC Meeting Schedule Update • Coastal Resilience Plan Virtual Open House #2, June 24, 2021, 6-8pm. Registration to attend: https://www.eventbrite.com/e/nantucket-coastal-resilience-plan-open-house-2-tickets-154033750093 • Discussion of additions and new dwellings added to the consent agenda • Review policy of Move/Demo hearings in relation to new dwellings • Hardscaping
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment:

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:38 p.m. (Camp)**

Roll-call vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, Coombs, McLaughlin, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board