



# HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road  
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554  
[www.nantucket-ma.gov](http://www.nantucket-ma.gov)

**Commissioners:** Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,  
**Associate Commissioners:** Stephen Welch, Terence Watterson, Jessie Dutra

~~ MINUTES ~~

**Thursday, August 6, 2020**

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,  
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 1:06 p.m. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, Administrative Specialist; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner  
Attending Members: Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch  
Absent Members: McLaughlin, Watterson, Dutra  
Late Arrivals: None  
Early Departures: Pohl, 2:16 p.m.; Welch, 2:47 p.m.

**Motion to Approve the Agenda.** (Coombs)

Roll-call Vote Carried 5-0//Oliver, Camp, Welch, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

### I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

### II. CONSENT WITH CONDITIONS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Town of Nantucket <b>07-1438</b>	57 Surfside Road	New wastewater pump stn	67-218	Weston & Sampson
• Change windows to vertical panes, trim and sash to be Quaker Grey, and fence to be omitted from application and plans.				
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No additional concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve per noted conditions. (Oliver)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 5-0//Coombs, Camp, Welch, Oliver, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-07-1438</b>

### III. NEW BUSINESS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Donald Pongrace <b>07-1367</b>	13/16 Warren Street	Rev. 01-0558: shed-pergola	55/43.3	KM Designs
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Katie Mitchell, KM Design			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:12)	<b>Mitchell</b> – Presented project. <b>Backus</b> – HSAB had no concerns. <b>Coombs</b> – There is a hedge between this and the street and the pergola faces the house. This is in keeping with the area. No concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (Coombs)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously//Camp, Oliver, Welch, Coombs, and Pohl-aye		Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-07-1367</b>

2. Donald Pongrace <b>07-1368</b> 13/16 Warren Street Rev. 01-0557: fence/gate 55/43.3 KM Designs					
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Katie Mitchell, KM Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:17)	<b>Mitchell</b> – Presented project. <b>Backus</b> – HSAB had no concerns. No concerns.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve. (Camp)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously//Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Camp, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-07-1368</b>		
3. Laura Ubaldino <b>07-1357</b> 24 Trotters Lane As built Driveway 67/147 Thornewill Design					
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Carrie Thornewill, Thornewill Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:20)	<b>Thornewill</b> – Presented project: dirt drive with concrete apron. <b>Oliver</b> – It's the only concrete on the road and is bright and new right now; hopefully it will grey in with time. She's upset the Department of Public Works (DPW) didn't tell Ms. Ubaldino that she had to go to the HDC before doing the work. <b>Welch</b> – It will fade in. If they had come to us, we could have suggested a cobble press. <b>Camp</b> – When they put in the stone, she suggests they use a light-colored stone, so it will blend in better. She thinks it will age out.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted; any hardscaping on the property must be applied to the HDC. (Oliver)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously//Camp, Coombs, Welch, Oliver, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-07-1357</b>		
4. Laura Ubaldino <b>07-1358</b> 24 Trotters Lane As-built fenst. change 67/147 Thornewill Design					
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Carrie Thornewill, Thornewill Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:29)	<b>Thornewill</b> – Sash and trim where changed to white; the side door was changed to a window. <b>Welch</b> – The white stands out, but it will look like any other house with white trim. <b>Backus</b> – The as-built fine has not yet been applied.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with the fine for an as-built levied. (Camp)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously//Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Camp, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-07-1358</b>		
5. John Galiher <b>07-1351</b> 34 Washing Pond Road Pool - hardscape 31/133 Atlantic Landscaping					
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Lindsay Congleton, Atlantic Landscaping Inc.				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:40)	<b>Congleton</b> – Presented project. <b>Welch</b> – He's okay due to lack of visibility. <b>Camp</b> – Agrees. <b>Oliver</b> – We can hold him to the lack of visibility.				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted and shall not be visible at time of inspection and thereafter. (Welch)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously//Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	<b>HDC2020k-07-1351</b>		

6. 289 Hummock Pond, LLC **07-1424** 289 Hummock Pond Rd Move off to 287 HPR 83/4 Emeritus  
 Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.  
 Representing Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development  
 Public None  
 Concerns (1:34) **MacEachern** – Presented project; move due to erosion.  
 No concerns.  
 Motion **Motion to Approve the move off. (Camp)**  
 Roll-call Vote Carried unanimously//Coombs, Oliver, Welch, Camp, and Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2020-07-1424**
7. Hummock Pond Holdings **07-1425** 287 Hummock Pond Rd Move/demo dwelling 83/39 Emeritus  
 Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and historic documentation.  
 Representing Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development  
 Public None  
 Concerns (1:46) **MacEachern** – Presented project; this is in the way of the move on; circa 1950; someone has expressed interest in taking it.  
**Backus** – National Historic Landmarks (NHL) document indicates circa 1950.  
 No concerns.  
 Motion **Motion to Approve as a move off/demo. (Oliver)**  
 Roll-call Vote Carried unanimously//Coombs, Camp, Welch, Oliver, and Pohl-aye Certificate # **HDC2020-07-1425**
8. Hummock Pond Holdings **07-1427** 287 Hummock Pond Rd Move on to 289 HPR+addtn 83/39 Emeritus  
 Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.  
 Representing Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development  
 Public None  
 Concerns (1:50) **MacEachern** – Presented project; no significant grade changes.  
**Pohl** – This structure is 100% visible from Sanford Farm; the north elevation glass panels will reflect the sun.  
**Oliver** – There are so many ganged windows. The way the addition is knit to the original is curious; the indent should go away, and the addition be a lower secondary mass. The north elevation reads better than the south. South elevation, the gable over the front door would read better as a shed roof.  
**Coombs** – South elevation, the fenestration is chaotic and too much; the front door side windows should not go to the ground but have a lower panel. Something needs to come down to create additive massing. This doesn't look like a typical house on the water.  
**Welch** – North elevation, he's concerned about the perceptible difference in the dormer fenestration. South elevation, agrees a shed roof over the door might tone down the focal point; the different proportions of the left to right mass is also a concern.  
**Camp** – Agrees about the massing and fenestration. The connector should either be wider or be eliminated; it looks pinched.  
 Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Oliver)**  
 Roll-call Vote Carried unanimously//Welch, Camp, Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye Certificate #
9. Hummock Pond Holdings **07-1426** 287 Hummock Pond Rd Re-site garage+altts 83/39 Emeritus  
 Voting Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.  
 Representing Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development  
 Public None  
 Concerns (2:03) **MacEachern** – Suggested this hold and track with the house.  
 Not opened at this time.  
 Motion **Motion to Hold to track with the main house. (Welch)**  
 Roll-call Vote Carried unanimously//Camp, Coombs, Oliver, Welch, and Pohl-aye Certificate #

<b>10. Allie Shieffelin 07-1372</b>		<b>23 Starbuck Road</b>	<b>Addition</b>	<b>60/107</b>	<b>Thornewill Design</b>
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Luke Thornewill, Thornewill Design				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:04)	<p><b>Thornewill</b> – Presented project; front door moved to the side.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – A lot of this is an improvement; the one-story elements help ground it.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously//Coombs, Camp, Welch, Oliver, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-07-1372</b>
<b>11. Cliff Ln 81, LLC 07-1392</b>		<b>81 Cliff Road</b>	<b>Addition</b>	<b>30/165</b>	<b>BPC</b>
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:08)	<p><b>Paul</b> – Presented project; no grade changes to the front and large trees will remain.</p> <p><b>Camp</b> – You could add more windows in the front elevation dormer to expand its size.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – Agrees with Ms. Camp about the dormer being a little bigger; the proportions on the small windows are too horizontal. Appreciates the other changes.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – Agrees with Ms. Oliver and Ms. Camp about the front dormer. Gable front right, the triple-ganged windows should be larger.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – Nothing to add.</p> <p><b>Pohl</b> – Nothing to add.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously//Oliver, Welch, Coombs, Camp, and Pohl-aye			Certificate #	
<b>12. Town of Nantucket 07-1384</b>		<b>10 Surfside Road</b>	<b>Parking Lot Change</b>	<b>55/137</b>	<b>SMRT Architects</b>
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	John McMeeking, SMRT Architects				
Public	Diane O'Neil, Facilities manager Nantucket Public Schools				
Concerns (2:17)	<p><b>McMeeking</b> – Presented project; materials remain the same; the elm tree will remain; there is thought of making the exit onto Sparks Avenue, right turn only.</p> <p><b>Backus</b> – This has been vetted through the NP&amp;EDC.</p> <p><b>O'Neil</b> – This came about as a result of the 24 Surfside Road property transfer; the town wants to make a turn lane at the corner of Surfside and Sparks. The High School is completely out of space to eliminate this lot and create parking elsewhere.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – Thinks the access on Sparks Avenue will be just as much a traffic issue as the current access due to the backup caused by Williams Street spilling into Sparks.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – Asked if the new concrete paving shown for the proposed parking and the current exit is to be sidewalk (yes). Agrees with Ms. Oliver's concerns with respect to creating a problem; at this point there is only one way in on a highly trafficked road, and he thinks we're just flip-flopping it. For him there is the idea of a bigger-picture solution. He's fine with this but not thrilled about the impact on traffic.</p> <p><b>Camp</b> – Agrees with Mr. Welch and Ms. Oliver that this is trading problems. She would prefer they restore that corner and put parking elsewhere on the property; the sidewalks are terrible, and the traffic is congested.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – Agrees with Ms. Camp about parking being moved; the proposed empties across from Williams Street. Would like it noted what vegetation is being removed.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-1//Camp-nay; Welch, Oliver, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-07-1384</b>

13. Sea La Vie, LLC <b>07-1408</b>	42 Dukes Road	Rev. 67176: pool change	56/249	NAG
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and correspondence.			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:35)	<b>McCarthy</b> – The applicant asked this be held for Monday. Not opened at this time.			
Motion	<b>Held for Monday, August 10.</b>			
Roll-call Vote	N/A		Certificate #	
14. Maryanne & Dale Waive <b>07-1410</b>	11 Bishops Rise	Pool	40/31.1	Self
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Camp, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Val Oliver; V. Oliver Design Dale Waive, owner			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:35)	<b>Oliver</b> – Presented project. Reviewed photos of area pools. <b>Waive</b> – Explained the hedge will be continued to screen the pool from the street. This area is known as Trotts Hill; the grade drops about 10 feet to the property behind; the natural vegetation is 5 or 6 feet. Contends the house sits higher than Bishops Rise <b>Welch</b> – The grade on Bishops Rise is a little higher than where the driveway meets the house; the grade drops off behind the house. He’s okay with the pool; the vegetation is a greater concern. There is a shadow line where the driveway drops down and is being retained indicating Bishops Rise is higher than the house. The infinity edge on the backside of the pool will be significantly higher than the neighbors property; he wants to know how the grade will change from the back of the pool down to the neighbor’s yard. <b>Coombs</b> – Suggested a pool with markers at the height of the pool and indicators of the infinity edge.			
Motion	<b>Motion to View with height pools for the top of the pool and height of the north-most corner of the infinity edge. (Welch)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Camp, Welch, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	
15. James Soltész <b>07-1402</b>	2 Grey Lady Lane	New dwelling	66/701	Val Oliver
16. Ginger Laytham <b>07-1406</b>	18 McKinley Avenue	Rebuild existing deck	73.3.2/46	Val Oliver
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	Val Oliver, V. Oliver Design			
Public	None			
Concerns (time)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	<b>Items 15 &amp; 16 held due to lack of quorum.</b>			
Roll-call Vote	N/A		Certificate #	
17. 12 Lincoln Ave NT <b>07-1403</b>	12 Lincoln Avenue	Cabana rev. 06-1969	30/183	Emeritus
Voting	Coombs (acting chair), Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:49)	<b>MacEachern</b> – Presented project. <b>Backus</b> – HSAB had no concerns. No concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Camp, Oliver, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-07-1403</b>

18. 12 Lincoln Ave NT <b>07-1404</b>	12 Lincoln Avenue	Garage rev. 07-1327	30/183	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:53)	<b>MacEachern</b> – Presented project; sliding barn door was approved previously. <b>Backus</b> – HSAB had no concerns on revision; skeptical about the west elevation track barn-doors. No concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Camp, Oliver, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-07-1404</b>

19. Pete Hadley <b>07-1418</b>	34 Dukes Road	Rev. 72068: fenestration	56/187	Emeritus
20. Richard & Deborah Hohlt <b>07-1433</b>	121 Madaket Road	Rev. 72983: roof walk	40/60.1	Botticelli & Pohl
21. Eileen Mandell <b>07-1401</b>	15 Austin Locke Way	Addition	82/55	Botticelli & Pohl
22. Mark Wendling <b>07-1397</b>	4 John Adams Lane	Pool	30/628	Botticelli & Pohl
23. Mark Wendling <b>07-1396</b>	4 John Adams Lane	Hardscaping	30/628	Botticelli & Pohl
24. Mark Wendling <b>07-1395</b>	4 John Adams Lane	Cabana	30/628	Botticelli & Pohl
25. John Confalone R.T. <b>07-1400</b>	30 Cliff Road	Lift house + add foundation	42.4.4/36	Val Oliver
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (2:55)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold Items 19 through 25 for Monday, August 10. (Camp)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Oliver, Camp, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	

<b>VI. OTHER BUSINESS</b>	
Approve Minutes	None
Review Minutes-	July 21 & 28, 2020
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Next HDC Old Business meeting <b>Monday 8/10/20</b> at 4:30pm</li> <li>• HDC review of revisions to HDC Background Summary to finalize for web page including vote</li> <li>• Review policy of Move/demo hearings in relation to new dwellings</li> <li>• Discussion of Certified Local Government (CLG) and possible vote</li> <li>• Discussion of adding Tuckernuck to MAB</li> </ul>
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. None

**Motion to Adjourned at 2:55 p.m. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 3-0//Camp, Oliver, and Coombs-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board