



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Terence Watterson, Jessie Dutra

~~ MINUTES ~~

Tuesday, August 13, 2019

Public Safety Facility, 4 Fairgrounds Road, Training Room – 4:30 p.m.

Called to order at 4:32 p.m. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Cathy Flynn, Administrative Specialist; Terry Norton, Town Minutes Taker
 Attending Members: Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch
 Absent Members: Coombs, Oliver, Watterson, Dutra
 Late Arrivals: Camp, 4:39 p.m.
 Early Departures: None

Agenda adopted by unanimous consent.

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

II. CONSENT

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Perocelli, Brigitte – 72865	2 North Beach Street	Rev. 71128: reduce size	42.4.1-64	Ethan McMorrow
2. Macdonald, Michael – 72866	177 Eel Point Road	Roof change	33-26	Vasil Marinov
3. Bayliss, Edward – 72867	52 Eel Point Road	Rev. 71370: window to door	32-25	Emeritus
4. Moores, Raymond – 72868	4 Field Avenue	Shed	80-171	Structures Unlimited
5. Sconset Low Beach Rd Tr – 72869	27 Low Beach Road	Door color change	74-37.4	NAG
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns	No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 2-0//McLaughlin abstain	Certificate #	72865 to 72869	

III. SIGNS

Property owner name	Street Address	Scope of work	Map/Parcel	Agent
1. Brock Building Trust – 72870	53 Main Street	Existing sign change	42.3.1-223	Plymouth Sign Co.
2. Brock Building Trust – 72871	53 Main Street	Existing sign change	42.3.1-223	Plymouth Sign Co.
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Sign design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	None			
Sign Advisory	Kevin Kuester , Sign Advisory Committee – Recommend approval of Item 1 as submitted. Recommend approval of Item 2 per SAC comments.			
Concerns	No additional concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve Item 1 as submitted. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 3-0	Certificate #	72870	
Motion	Motion to Approve Item 2 through staff per SAC comments. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 3-0	Certificate #	72871	

IV. OLD BUSINESS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Brody, Paul	11 E Street	MH revisions.	60.2.1-4	BPC
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	Joe Paul , BPC – The solar panels are off the table; this is still revisions to the house.			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:38)	No sitting quorum.			
Motion	Motion to Hold due to lack of quorum. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
2. Brody, Paul	11 E Street	Cottage revisions	60.2.1-4	BPC
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Joe Paul , BPC – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:41)	Welch – Suggested the previous showing the grill clouded be removed.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the previous north elevation revised to clean up the drawing. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	72872
3. Brody, Paul	11 E Street	Garage revisions	60.2.1-4	BPC
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Joe Paul , BPC – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:45)	Welch – The doors should be simple v-groove prefer.			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the east and west doors to be vertical panel with lights no rails. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	72873
4. 202 Eel Pt Rd Realty Trust	202 Eel Point Road	Addition/window changes	38-2.3	Sanne Payne
5. 202 Eel Pt Rd Realty Trust	202 Eel Point Road	Convert garage to GH	38-2.3	Sanne Payne
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:49)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	
6. Liebling, Mark	13 Wigwam Road	Fence-gate	77-5.7	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Presented project; there is a similarly designed gate a few doors down.			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:50)	McLaughlin – The gate should be level across at 5-foot tall. Welch – It seems very tall. Camp – Agrees with Mr. Welch.			
Motion	Pohl – Agrees about the square across the top 5.5 feet. 6.5 feet is the top of the arch, 5.5 feet is the gate at the posts. Motion to Approve through staff at 6 feet tall with a swale dropping at center at 5.5 feet, per Exhibit A. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 3-1//McLaughlin opposed		Certificate #	72874

7. Yeager, Dave	2 Howard Court	Additions	42.3.4-36	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Camp (acting chair), McLaughlin, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Brook Meerbergen – Circa 1938 per interior construction.			
Public	None			
Concerns (4:58)	<p>Welch – It’s a nice design, but not for this lot. It is too much of a change from the original; it’s a lot more mass and would overwhelm the site with no continuing story. He’d like to see something that reflects the existing profile and roof elements.</p> <p>McLaughlin – East elevation transoms.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees with Mr. Welch; the style and height are inappropriate for a historic house. Would like to see the low height, sun porch and hipped roof kept.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 3-0		Certificate #	
8. Jemison, Steve	9 West Chester Street	Rev. 72358: Fenst & chim	42.4.3-12	JB Studio
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, engineering report, and historic documentation.			
Representing	Juraj Bencat , JB Studio – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:07)	<p>McLaughlin – No concern as long as the casements are non-operable.</p> <p>Welch – For the file, it’s appropriate to have documentation of the interior of the chimney and clear images of exterior conditions so that the corbelling will be replicated. The brick material should be replicated.</p> <p>Camp – Agrees with Mr. Welch</p> <p>Pohl – We need information to reference to ensure the chimney is rebuilt exactly as it looks now.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with supplement chimney imagery submitted and replacement brick to closely match the existing brick. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	72875
9. Booms, Jeff	14 Woodland Drive	Massing/wind/roof/	79-203	JB Studio
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Juraj Bencat , JB Studio – Owner wants to be here and asked this be held.			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:16)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for Tuesday, August 20 meeting. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	
10. Groves, Linda	26 New Street	As-built fence-fee	55-44	Jenny Gifford
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Jenny Gifford – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:16)	<p>(4:49) Motion to Hold for representation. (Welch) Carried unanimously</p> <p>Pohl – This is an atypical of fences normally approved not found on Nantucket. Read HSAB comments: No this is not a ship.</p> <p>Welch – This is not a typical fence; a split rail might not be appropriate in Town. He’d be okay with a (2-rail) paddock fence painted white using the existing posts.</p> <p>McLaughlin – Remove what’s there; he’d prefer a Type II picket. Need a drawing of what the fence will look like. He’s opposed to a “cattle” fence in the old historic district (OHD).</p> <p>Camp – She’d like a better picture of the house.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	

11. 2 Chestnut St. ACK, LLC	2 Chestnut Street	Remve dek/str case	42.3.1-69	Shelter 7
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:31)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	
12. Richmond Great Point	10&12 DavKim Lane	Commercial warehouse	68-61+62	Rescom Architecture
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	Ethan Griffin, Gryphon Architecture			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:31)	No sitting quorum.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for August 20 due to lack of quorum. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
13. Voyages, Rowland	14 Osprey Way	Roof top solar	82-33	Cotuit Solar
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, McLaughlin, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:33)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for representation. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 4-0-		Certificate #	
14. Green, F E Wade Tr	31 Shell Street	Addition	73.1.3-5.3	Kent Murphy
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:29)	No sitting quorum.			
Motion	Motion to Hold due to lack of quorum to be heard August 20. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
15. Vinecliff #2 N.T.	47 Cliff Road	Fence	29-43	Mark Cutone Architecture
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Doug Mills , Mark Cutone Architecture – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:35)	McLaughlin – The only thing visible is the stairs going up. There is a lot of greenery and believes it's approvable due to lack of visibility.			
Motion	Motion to Approve due to lack of visibility. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 3-0		Certificate #	72876

16. Eckert, Jennifer	21B Vestal Street	Demo/move off	41-36.1	Sophie Metz
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Sophie Metz – This is being advertised to be moved; replacement would be a 1.5-story cottage no more than 1000 square feet.			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:38)	(4:49) Motion to Hold for representation. (Welch) Carried unanimously. Pohl – Read HSAB comments: recommend denial; 60-years old and should be retained. McLaughlin – There are 8 properties that use the right of way; this building is visible from that traveled way. He'd prefer to see it saved and moved, rather than demolish it. It's a nice old shop. Welch – It is a cute little building. He'd like to hear the concept on what is planned to replace it; that silhouette should be similar to the existing. Pohl – He'd love to see the new design come in; he'd like to see it reflect this to some degree. Okay with move/demo.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as a move-off/demolition. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 3-0		Certificate #	72877
17. Hidalgo, Jose	28A Evergreen Way	Shed	68-713.2	Self
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	Jose Hidalgo			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:49)	(5:31) Motion to Hold for representation. (Welch) Carried unanimously No sitting quorum			
Motion	Motion to Hold for August 20 due to lack of quorum. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
18. Crowley, Seamus	46A Nobadeer Road	Addition	69-35	Topham Design
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Camp, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Joe Topham , Topham Design – Presented project.			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:50)	(5:33) Motion to Hold for representation. (Welch) Carried unanimously No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 4-0		Certificate #	72878
19. Raith, Jonathan	14 Easy Street	Deck alteration	42.3.1-13	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.			
Public	None			
Concerns (5:34)	(5:34) Motion to Hold for representation. (Welch) Carried unanimously No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (McLaughlin)			
Vote	Carried 3-0		Certificate #	72879

20. Black, M	28 Eel Point Road	Ancillary Structure	40-44	Emeritus
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	Matt MacEachern , Emeritus Development – Want to make revisions.			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:00)	(5:34) Motion to Hold for representation. (Welch) Carried unanimously No sitting quorum			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions at applicants request to be heard August 20. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried unanimously		Certificate #	
21. Svargaloka, LLC	5 Elbow Lane	Addition-dormers	73.2.4-43	McMullen & Associates
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory board comments.			
Representing	Nathan McMullen , McMullen & Associates – Explained why keeping the 6/12 pitch on the east elevation dormer. Karen McMullen, McMullen & Associates			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:00)	(5:35) Motion to Hold for representation. (Welch) Carried unanimously Welch – No concerns. McLaughlin – Confirmed Nr. 2 windows are double hung; dormer roof pitch should be 7/12. Pohl – No concerns.			
Motion	Motion to Approve due to circumstances of the existing building. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 3-0		Certificate # 72880	
22. 72 Main Street Trust	72 Main Street	Fence & driveway gate	42.3.1-152	LINK
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Victoria Ewing , LINK – Reviewed requested information.			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:12)	(6:07) Motion to Hold for representation. (McLaughlin) Motion to reopen. (Welch) Carried unanimously Welch – The grade of the brick slopes up from the street; the gate would have to be hinged so as to swing up if they open in or be set higher. His concern is that when it's all fenced in, it will become a wall; it's heavy and there's a lot of it in the front yard. There are fences like this on Orange Street, but they aren't as long. Agrees about diminishing the presence. McLaughlin – At 38 feet, this is too much of a board fence; should be a more open type of fence and not this high; a picket fence would be nice. Pohl – Agrees with what's been said.			
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 3-0		Certificate #	
23. Steamship Authority	1 Steamboat Wharf	Shed/ticket booth	42.4.2-14	LINK
Voting	Pohl, McLaughlin, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Victoria Ewing , LINK – Reviewed photos of it in place; assigned dates to it: 6/4 to 10/8.			
Public	None			
Concerns (6:21)	(6:07) Motion to Hold for representation. (McLaughlin) Motion to reopen. (Welch) Carried unanimously Welch – It's fine as a temporary structure. Pohl – HDC approvals are good for 3 years; at that point you reapply.			
Motion	Motion to Approve subject to being in place only on the dates June 4 to October 8 for 2019, 2020, & 2021. (Welch)			
Vote	Carried 3-0		Certificate # 72881	

V. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approve Minutes	July 16, 23, 25 & 30 and Aug. 1, 2019: Motion to Approve. (Welch) Carried unanimously
Review Minutes	August 6 & 8, 2019
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Discussion of HDC appeals and HDC representation for 41 Chuck Hollow Road and 1 Sunset Ridge Lane at Select Board meeting 8/21/19. No action at this time. • Discussion of update on Vineyard Wind project and Executive Session date and time. No action at this time. • Assignment of HDC/CPC Representative. No action at this time. • Discussion of Organizational Meeting date. No action at this time. • Mission Statement for Town Website. No action at this time. • Discussion of synthetic materials. No action at this time. • Plastic sheds. No action at this time. • Discussion and update on Nantucket Sidewalk Work Group. No action at this time. • Discussion of implementing a time during HDC application review. No action at this time. • Discussion of National Grid Distribution Reliability Project in regard to new utility poles and overhead wires. No action at this time. • Discussion of Net Zero Stretch Code and impacts to HDC. No action at this time.
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. None

Adjourned at 6:10 p.m. by unanimous consent

Meeting reopened at 6:11 p.m. by unanimous consent

Adjourned at 6:25 p.m. by unanimous consent.

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board

Sconset Advisory Board

Madaket Advisory Board

Sign Advisory Committee