



HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road
 Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554
www.nantucket-ma.gov

Commissioners: Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,
Associate Commissioners: Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra

~~ MINUTES ~~

Thursday, August 27, 2020

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,
 Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 1:06 p.m. and announcements by Ms. Coombs

Staff in attendance: Kadeem McCarthy, Administrative Specialist; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner
 Attending Members: Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch
 Absent Members: Pohl, McLaughlin, Dutra
 Late Arrivals: None
 Early Departures: None

Adoption of Agenda

Motion **Motion to Approve the agenda. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote Carried unanimously// Welch, Camp, Oliver, and Coombs-aye

I. PUBLIC COMMENT

Matt MacEachern – This Old Business was carried over from August 25; the next old business meeting is scheduled for 22 September; asked that any carried-over items on this agenda be heard on a new business meeting so people aren't waiting a month

II. SIGNS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map-Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	8 Hanabea Lane, LLC 08-1443	10 Hanabea Lane	Wall sign	69-257	Sign Here Nantucket
2.	10 Hanabea Lane LLC 08-1444	8 Hanabea Lane	Wall sign	69-256	Sign Here Nantucket
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	None				
Sign Advisory	None				
Concerns (1:11)	No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously// Oliver, Camp, Welch, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2020-08-(as noted)

VI. OLD BUSINESS

	<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1.	60 Walsh St, LLC 08-1512	60 Walsh Street	Gym/rec barn	29/85.2	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:12)	Botticelli – This was a view; reviewed changes made per previous concerns; east elevation faces into the property. Backus – Read HSAB comments: appreciate changes; visibility will be factor; recommend approval without the sliding doors and submit after framing. No concerns.				
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously// Oliver, Welch, Camp, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	HDC2020-08-1512

2. Mark Wendling 07-1395	4 John Adams Lane	Cabana	30/628	Botticelli & Pohl
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Lisa Botticelli, Botticelli & Pohl			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:20)	<p>Botticelli – Reviewed project and changes made per previous concerns; visibility is limited; east faces the road.</p> <p>Oliver – We will only see the east elevation. Asked why the gabled roof is so large with small, minimal sides. No concerns.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with what’s been said.</p> <p>Camp – No concerns.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously//Welch, Oliver, Camp, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	HDC2020-07-1395
3. Richard Chesley 02-0732	32 West Chester Street	New dwelling	42.4.3/31	BPC
Voting	Coombs, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.			
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:25)	<p>Paul – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; accessed of Wesco Street, which is an eclectic collection of styles.</p> <p>Backus – Read HSAB comments: north elevation, separation in roof plain; south elevation massive wall, symmetry to French doors on right, horizontal panes, a lot of fenestration, shutters look like ‘Sconset; the porch on the north elevation could wraparound better to the east and south elevations to break up wall; south elevation need symmetry and deepen porch; this seems to be too big for the lot/area and don’t know the style it’s going for.</p> <p>Welch – Doesn’t know where HSAB was with these comments for the June 11th hearing; he asked that in the future the advisory board comments be included in the packets to allow time to consider them in advance. Appreciates north elevation changes; adjusting roof pitch is helpful; the least involved façade faces Wesco and is important. The French doors will probably be oblique to the street. Going to 6-over-1 windows and a 12-light door with kick panel is an improvement.</p> <p>Oliver – Her only concern is the heavy fenestration on the south elevation. Appreciates changes; French doors are drawn as 8 lights and should be 12 lights; would prefer to see one of the triple windows on the 1st-floor removed; 2nd floor will be visible.</p> <p>Coombs – Appreciates breaking up the roof and separating the windows. Agrees about the panes in the French doors. Feels the view will be difficult due to the amount of foliage. Appreciates seeing all submissions on one page.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with south elevation French doors to be 12-lights with kick panel. (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Welch, Oliver, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	HDC2020-02-0732
4. Cliff Lane 81, LLC 07-1392	81 Cliff Lane	Addition	30/165	BPC
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Joe Paul, BPC			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:44)	<p>Paul – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.</p> <p>Camp – If you put in 2 more windows in the dormer over the front door, the extras would align over the 1st-floor windows.</p> <p>Oliver – Confirmed the garage has been removed. Likes the dormer as is. The right gable addition eave seems higher than the existing house with the windows higher.</p> <p>Discussion about the fenestration and eave lines on the façade facing the road.</p> <p>Welch – No concerns.</p> <p>Coombs – Wants the front dormer to have only 4 windows; otherwise it would detract from the original design.</p>			
Motion	Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously//Welch, Oliver, Camp, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #	HDC2020-07-1392

5. Wayne L Rogers Trust 08-1522					
	5 North Liberty Street	Door replacement	42.3.4/7	NAG	
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, historic documentation, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Steve Theroux, Nantucket Architectural Group				
Public	none				
Concerns (1:54)	<p>Backus – Read HSAB comments: Option A 9-lights vs Option B 12-lights – don’t mind 12-lights but not for front; leave front door as is; overall front door should stay the same and side door could be Dutch.</p> <p>Oliver – Agrees a 12-light side door is okay but not for the front door; front door should remain as is.</p> <p>Camp – The left side door is under a porch and set back, so she has little concern.</p> <p>Welch – To keep in mind is the porch is set back and shadowed; the concept of 12-light vs 9 light is acceptable in that location, more so because the two doors won’t compete, and 12-light design element exists on the front facade. The 9 lights visually is not complementary for the side door, creates visual confusion.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Approve through staff with the 12-light Dutch doors. (Welch)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-1// Camp, Welch, and Coombs-aye; Oliver-nay		Certificate #	HDC2020-08-1522	
6. South Water Assoc. 02-0629					
	5 South Water Street	Second/third flr add	42.3.1/270-75	Emeritus	
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:10)	<p>MacEachern – Asked this be held for the next old business meeting.</p> <p>Not opened at this time.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for August 31 at applicant’s request. (Oliver)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Welch, Camp, Oliver, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #		
7. Thompson 05-1039					
	73 Baxter Road	Move off/demo exst garage	49/27	Emeritus	
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	None				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:10)	<p>MacEachern – This is being withdrawn.</p> <p>McCarthy – Needs an email requesting the withdrawal.</p>				
Motion	Withdrawn				
Roll-call Vote	N/A		Certificate #		
8. Thompson 07-1292					
	73 Baxter Road	Garage	49/27	Emeritus	
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and advisory comments.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (2:01)	<p>MacEachern – Utilizing a portion of the existing garage; the paperwork needs to be updated to “addition,” reviewed the new proposal.</p> <p>Backus – Read SAB comments: questions on the intended use; like idea of reusing old garage; like west elevation shed dormer; asked why rear addition is so high (cathedral ceiling); old garage is “hood ornament” for new garage; what percentage of existing will be demolished; keep south wall.</p> <p>Oliver – Appreciate a lot of the changes; still needs to be finessed; addition eave line facing street should drop making a saltbox helping the existing garage to stand out. Stature being smaller is better for the house; drop the height as much as possible.</p> <p>Welch – Agrees with Ms. Oliver’s comments. He was a little concerned about the garage door and light size; the “mushroom top” separation space should be eliminated between eave of addition and soffit and joined to the garage. Asked that if the motion is to hold, this be heard at the next meeting.</p> <p>Camp – Likes Mr. Welch’s suggestion and bringing the height down. Right now, the addition looks disconnected.</p> <p>Coombs – Do anything to bring the addition roof line down.</p>				
Motion	Motion to Hold for revisions and to come back on August 31. (Camp)				
Roll-call Vote	Carried unanimously//Camp, Oliver, Welch, and Coombs-aye		Certificate #		

9. Bartlett Farm House, LLC 06-1110	24 Bartlett Farm Road	Pool	65/86	Emeritus
10. Stephen Frohwein 07-1285	32 North Liberty Street	Addition	41/159	Emeritus
11. Wilner, Sheila 01-0548	10 Beach Street	Demo existing dwelling	73.2.4/10	Emeritus
12. Wilner, Sheila 01-0547	10 Beach Street	New dwelling	73.2.4/10	Emeritus
13. Hummock Pond Holdings 07-1427	287 Hummock Pond Rd	Move on to 289 HPR + addtn	83/39	Emeritus
14. Hummock Pond Holdings 07-1426	287 Hummock Pond Rd	Re-site garage + alts	83/39	Emeritus

Voting Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch
 Alternates None
 Recused None
 Documentation None
 Representing None
 Public None
 Concerns (2:14) No
 Motion **Motion to Hold for August 31. (Welch)**
 Roll-call Vote Carried unanimously//Camp, Oliver, Welch, and Coombs-aye Certificate #

VII. OTHER BUSINESS	
Approve Minutes	July 21 & 28, 2020 and August 3, 6 & 10, 2020
Motion	No action at this time.
Roll-call Vote	N/A
Review Minutes	August 18, 2020
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Next HDC Meeting Thursday August 27, 2020- if needed • Next HDC Meeting New Business Monday August 31, 2020: held. • HDC review of revisions to HDC Background Summary to finalize for web page including vote: held. • Resilient Nantucket Community Forum #1(virtually) September 18, 2020(11:30-1:00pm) – (6:00pm-7:30pm) : held. • Discussion of Certified Local Government (CLG) and possible vote: held. • Review policy of Move/demo hearings in relation to new dwellings: held. • Discussion of adding Tuckernuck to MAB: held.
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. Draft minutes as listed

Adjournment

Motion **Motion to Adjourn at 2:16 p.m. (Camp)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 3-0//Oliver, Welch, and Coombs-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

[Historic Structures Advisory Board](#) [Sconset Advisory Board](#) [Madaket Advisory Board](#)