



# HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

## REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road  
 Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554  
[www.nantucket-ma.gov](http://www.nantucket-ma.gov)

**Commissioners:** Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,  
**Associate Commissioners:** Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra

~~ MINUTES ~~

**Thursday, September 24, 2020**

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,  
 Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 1:00 p.m. and announcements by Ms. Coombs

Staff in attendance: Cathy Flynn, Land Use Specialist  
 Attending Members: Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch  
 Absent Members: Pohl, McLaughlin, Dutra  
 Late Arrivals: Welch, 1:11 p.m.  
 Early Departures: None

**Motion to Approve the Agenda as submitted.** (Camp)  
 Roll-call Vote: Carried 3-0//Oliver, Camp, and Coombs-aye

**I. PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

**II. NEW BUSINESS CARRIED OVER**

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Vandelay Realty, LLC <b>09-1669</b>	84 Polpis Road	Demo/move off	44/25.5	Val Oliver
2. Vandelay Realty, LLC <b>09-1661</b>	84 Polpis Road	New DU w/ attached garage	44/25.5	Val Oliver
Voting	Coombs, Camp			
Alternates	None			
Recused	Oliver			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:07)	Not opened due to lack of quorum			
Motion	<b>No action taken.</b>			
Roll-call Vote	N/A			Certificate #

**III. OLD BUSINESS**

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Mary O'Connell <b>08-1508</b>	8 Center Street Sias	Rev. 12-0352: relocate A/C	73.1.3/76	Concept Design
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	None			
Representing	None			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:08)	Not opened at this time.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for representation.</b> (Camp)			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Oliver, Camp, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #

2. Chris O'Connell **08-1556** 10 Sheep Commons Pool and retaining wall 54/274 Atlantic Lndscpng
- Voting Coombs, Camp, Oliver  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.  
 Representing Alisha Ranney, Atlantic Landscaping Inc.  
 Public None  
 Concerns (1:09) **Ranney** – Pool is below grade and not visible.  
**Oliver** – With this information, she has no concerns.  
**Camp** – No concerns.
- Motion **Motion to Approve. (Oliver)**  
 Roll-call Vote Carried 3-0//Camp, Oliver, and Coombs-aye Certificate # **HDC2020-08-1556**
3. James Conlon 08-1511 24 Woodbine New main dwelling 80/96 Emeritus
- Voting Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and 3D renderings.  
 Representing Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development  
 Public None  
 Concerns (1:11) **MacEachern** – Reviewed proposed changes per previous concerns and to the driveway and site plan.  
**Oliver** – Nice looking and appreciates the lower height. With the described landscaping, the size will be mitigated. Asked that the front door be changed; the sidelights don't align with the door panels.  
**Welch** – Agrees with what's been said. The landscaping will make it more about the people living there rather than visualizing of the home. It's a nice design. A subtlety not easily picked up in 2-dimensions is the transition between 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup>-floor shingles, which is a curved treatment; that should mitigate perception of the dormers.  
**Camp** – This is very passable.  
**Coombs** – Like the proposed redirection of the driveway. The windows look lost in the dormers; windows should be a little bigger or dormers smaller.
- Motion **Motion to Approve through staff with the front door sidelights to align with the door panels. (Camp)**  
 Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Oliver, Welch, Camp, and Coombs-aye Certificate # **HDC2020-08-1511**
4. James Conlon **08-1509** 24 Woodbine New garage 80/96 Emeritus
- Voting Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and 3D renderings.  
 Representing Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development  
 Public None  
 Concerns (1:27) **MacEachern** – Reviewed proposed changes per previous concerns and to the driveway and site plan. North elevation, he can run the eave across under the dormer.  
**Welch** – Relocating this and massing changes alleviated his concerns.  
**Camp** – No concerns.  
**Oliver** – The changes are great.
- Motion **Motion to Approve through staff with the north elevation eave line to extend across under the dormers. (Camp)**  
 Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Oliver, Welch, Camp, and Coombs-aye Certificate # **HDC2020-08-1507**
5. James Conlon **09-1699 (NB)** 24 Woodbine Shed 80/96 Emeritus
- Voting Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and 3D renderings.  
 Representing Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development  
 Public None  
 Concerns (1:31) **MacEachern** – Reviewed proposed changes to the driveway and site plan; presented this project.  
 No concerns.
- Motion **Motion to Approve. (Camp)**  
 Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Oliver, Welch, Camp, and Coombs-aye Certificate # **HDC2020-09-1699**

6. James Conlon	<b>09-1701 (NB)</b>	24 Woodbine	New 2nd dwelling/cabana	80/96	Emeritus
Voting	Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and 3D renderings.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:31)	<p><b>MacEachern</b> – Reviewed proposed changes to the driveway and site plan; presented this project.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – His only comment is the south elevation circle window; it reads less refined than the pergola and rafter end-cuts; however, it is not visible.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – Nicely done; likes the porthole window, which no one can see.</p> <p><b>Camp</b> – No concerns. Likes that there is space between the buildings giving the site an airy feeling.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve. (Camp)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, Welch, Camp, and Coombs-aye			Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-09-1701</b>

7. Sheila Wilner	<b>01-0547</b>	10 Beach Street	New dwelling	73.2.4/10	Emeritus
Voting	Camp (acting chair), Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:36)	<p><b>MacEachern</b> – Reviewed the revised proposal for a renovation/addition of the existing structure. Suggested he could go back to 2 dormers on the east elevation. Reviewed ways to bring the height down.</p> <p><b>Flynn</b> – The SAB didn't meet to review this revised plan; holding it will allow them that opportunity.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – Appreciates the changes and the idea of the 3-foot phase. This will emulate the structure that is there. East and west dormers feel large. Likes the idea of breaking up the dormer. East elevation, the gable facing the road makes it look bigger. Asked the floor-to-ceiling height; if it were dropped, you wouldn't have to adjust anything. Make the bumpout wider and changing the pitch is a demolition.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – Appreciates eliminating the outdoor living space. Has concerns: North elevation, suggested padding up the lower portion of the existing structure by 6 or 9 inches so that it appears taller, which design can support while breaking up the larger gable; maybe align the fascia with fascia over the covered porch. Overall, nice design but believes it is too large by about 30% in every direction for a side street in Cod Fish Park.</p> <p><b>Camp</b> – East elevation, the French doors should have kick panels; that's more in keeping with Cod Fish Park.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for revisions. (Oliver)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Welch, Oliver, and Camp-aye			Certificate #	

8. Sheila Wilner	<b>01-0548</b>	10 Beach Street	Demo/move off dwelling	73.2.4/10	Emeritus
Voting	Camp (acting chair), Oliver, Welch				
Alternates	None				
Recused	None				
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.				
Representing	Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development				
Public	None				
Concerns (1:47)	<p><b>MacEachern</b> – This will be withdrawn in favor of renovating the existing.</p> <p><b>Welch</b> – Noting he would not be voting to approve, suggested out of good nature that amending this to a partial demo with a revised set of plans showing the historic structure and what is being changed would then be on file.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – Suggested keeping only 3 feet of the original structure constitutes a demolition.</p> <p><b>Camp</b> – Agrees with Ms. Oliver's question.</p>				
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for an amended application. (Welch)</b>				
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Oliver, Welch, and Camp-aye			Certificate #	

9. Nicole Whidden **08-1473** 11 Davis Lane Cabana 82/75 Emeritus  
 Voting Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.  
 Representing Matt MacEachern, Emeritus Development  
 Public Maureen Gagliano, 10 Westerwyck Road  
 Concerns (1:53) **MacEachern** – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns.

**Gagliano** – The cabana still looks very large with the outdoor shower, bathroom, and grill area. Glad about putting the pool equipment underground: it’s loud and the associated lights are bright.

**Oliver** – Appreciate the changes and the cottage corners. Suggested removing the gable windows; they will be lit up at night in a very open area. Trim should be much less formal.

**Welch** – Agrees with Ms. Oliver. The 8-foot fascia should come down to 7’6”.

**Camp** – Agrees about decreasing the size, especially the length.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Welch)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Camp, Oliver, Welch, and Coombs-aye Certificate #

10. Nicole Whidden **08-1472** 11 Davis Lane Pool/spa 82/75 Ahern

Voting Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation Landscape design plans, site plan, and photos.  
 Representing Miroslava Ahern, Ahern Design, LLC  
 Public Maureen Gagliano, 10 Westerwyck Road  
 Joe Gagliano, 10 Westerwyck Road

Concerns (2:06) **Ahern** – Reviewed changes made per previous concerns; she does not agree that the planting plan is formal.

**M. Gagliano** – Looking at the plan, asked how many circles represent pitch pine and cedars (15). The area has those two trees but there are not any properties that have that many pitch pine and cedars in a formal perimeter boarder; as proposed she’s concerned it will look like a fence and less wild. The vista of the area should be preserved for everyone; that vista is open and rolling. Suggested using restoration grass between the lawn and buffer.

**Welch** – There has been a lot of discussion about plant material, but it is relevant to screening the pool. As indicated it’s a planted buffer; acknowledges applicant agent comments in the sense it isn’t a formal planting in the sense of a linear grid layout along the property line. The border can be allowed to become naturalized but as proposed is too dense for this rural open space -it enclosed the yards, partitioning the yard space from the road space which is inconsistent with the area. Though there are clusters of indigenous plants, there are two issues to his mind: too many clusters of too many different types of plants, as opposed to simpler naturalized mix; there are small groups of like plants forming a partition around the property. There needs to be some plants up and around the pool as screening but not so dense that you cannot see into the yard as you can at other neighborhood homes, which are open and rural – the nature of the general area should be replicated. The pool location makes the size generally acceptable subject to successful screening; will reserve rights on pool comments pending revised landscape/screening plan.

**Oliver** – This is too much of everything. Mr. Welch said it well. There is an image which shows the pool cut into the deck; feels nestling it in the “loungue patio” between the cabana and house would make it look like a deck and require less screening.

**Camp** – She thinks Ms. Ahern did a good job of choosing and staggering the vegetation.

**J. Gagliano** – This property is at the conjunction of 3 main streets in the middle of Cisco; the area is very flat. Regarding the perimeter vegetation, agrees with much that’s been said. This is a low growing area; if this is surrounded by trees and heavy brush, it will look like a “castle.” Mr. Pohl had suggested for another project that vegetation be brought closer to the pool. The pool itself should be pulled closer to the house with less bluestone patio so it doesn’t stand away from the house. The pool, patio, and decking area is almost twice the groundcover as the house; that footprint should be reduced by bring the pool closer to the house and reducing the amount of patio and deck.

**Coombs** – The vegetative screen should be planted to look more natural with a less than even line and formal. What goes in the front is important. For her, there is too much Inkberry proposed.

Motion **Motion to Hold for revisions. (Camp)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0// Oliver, Welch, Camp, and Coombs-aye Certificate #

11. Ecklund/Furdak <b>08-1587</b>	26 West Chester Street	Hardscape	42.4.3/56	Ahern
12. Michelle Black <b>05-0953</b>	28 Eel Point Road	Sports court	40/49	Ahern
13. Cannonbury Holdings <b>08-1569</b>	4 Sleetwing Circle	New cabana	74/23	Workshop/APD
14. Cannonbury Holdings <b>08-1566</b>	4 Sleetwing Circle	Hardscape/pool	74/23	Workshop/APD
15. Anne McGivney <b>08-1498</b>	45 West Chester Street	Shed	41/230	Structures Ultd
16. Stephen Frohwein <b>07-1285</b>	32 North Liberty Street	Addition	41/159	Emeritus
17. Hummock Pnd Hldng <b>07-1427</b>	287 Hummock Pond Rd	Move to 289 HPR + addtn	83/39	Emeritus
18. John Hendricks <b>08-1549</b>	1 Jefferson Lane	Rev. 73097: door change	55.4.1/74.1	Emeritus
19. South Water Assoc. <b>02-0629</b>	5 South Water Street	2 <sup>nd</sup> /3 <sup>rd</sup> FL. addition	42.3.1/270-275	Emeritus

Voting Coombs, Camp, Oliver, Welch

Alternates None

Recused None

Documentation None

Representing None

Public None

Concerns Not opened at this time.

Motion **Motion to Hold for Tuesday, September 29<sup>th</sup> meeting. (Welch)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0// Camp, Oliver, Welch, and Coombs-aye

Certificate #

**IV. OTHER BUSINESS**

Approve Minutes	None
Review Minutes	None
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Next HDC Meeting New Business <b>Tuesday 9/29/20 at 4:30pm</b></li> <li>• HDC review of revisions to HDC Background Summary to finalize for web page including vote</li> <li>• Discussion of 6 Fair Street Minimum Maintenance</li> <li>• Review policy of Move/demo hearings in relation to new dwellings</li> <li>• Discussion of Certified Local Government (CLG) and possible vote</li> <li>• Discussion of adding Tuckernuck to MAB</li> </ul>
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. None

Motion to Adjourn at 2:41 p.m. (Welch)

Roll-call Vote: Carried 4-0//Camp, Oliver, Welch, and Coombs-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton

Historic Structures Advisory Board Sconset Advisory Board