



# HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION REGULAR MEETING

2 Fairgrounds Road  
Nantucket, Massachusetts 02554  
[www.nantucket-ma.gov](http://www.nantucket-ma.gov)

**Commissioners:** Raymond Pohl (Chair), Diane Coombs (Vice-chair), John McLaughlin, Abigail Camp, Vallorie Oliver,  
**Associate Commissioners:** Stephen Welch, Jessie Dutra, Carrie Thornewill

~~ MINUTES ~~

**Thursday, October 1, 2020**

*This meeting was held via remote participation using ZOOM and YouTube,  
Pursuant to Governor Baker's March 12, 2020 Order Regarding Open Meeting Law*

Called to order at 1:00 p.m. and announcements by Mr. Pohl

Staff in attendance: Cathy Flynn, Land Use Specialist; Holly Backus, Preservation Planner  
Attending Members: Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill  
Absent Members: McLaughlin, Camp, Welch, Dutra,

Motion to Adopt the agenda. (Coombs)  
Roll-call vote: Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Oliver, Coombs, and Pohl-aye

## I. PUBLIC COMMENT

**Pohl** – Wants to end Thursday meetings at 2:30 in deference to the commissioners.

## VIII. NEW BUSINESS

<u>Property owner name</u>	<u>Street Address</u>	<u>Scope of work</u>	<u>Map/Parcel</u>	<u>Agent</u>
1. Geoff Smith <b>09-1803</b>	98 Old South Road	Deck and window alteration	68/429	JB Studios
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Juraj Bencat, JB Studios			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:11)	(1:04) Motion to Hold for representation. (Oliver). Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye <b>Bencat</b> – Presented project; only the buildings. <b>Pohl</b> – The parking is clouded on the site plan; that is not part of this plan and is to be stricken from this application. We are only approving architectural features on the house. <b>Oliver</b> – No concerns with the alterations to the house. <b>Thornewill</b> – South elevation roof deck, there should be a cap on the wall, so you don't know there is a deck on the other side of it. <b>Coombs</b> – North elevation, this side has a front-door-type element. Okay due to lack of visibility.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with a cap on the south elevation roof is natural to weather. (Oliver)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-09-1803</b>	
2. Lemberg Son + Daughters <b>09-1768</b>	1 White Whale Lane	Rev. 12-0299: fenest. & color	66/18	LINK
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill			
Alternates	None			
Recused	None			
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.			
Representing	Victoria Ewing, LINK			
Public	None			
Concerns (1:07)	<b>Ewing</b> – Presented project; other two duplexes across the street have white trim. <b>Coombs</b> – 2-over-1 are okay. Prefers the softer grey. <b>Oliver</b> – Okay with the change. We need a site plan; there is just the locus map. <b>Thornewill</b> – No concerns.			
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)</b>			
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye	Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-09-1768</b>	

3.	Tessa Cressman	<b>09-1781</b>	3 Wauwinet Road	Rev. 72598: fenestration	20/11.1	Thornewill Design
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver					
Alternates	None					
Recused	Thornewill					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.					
Representing	Luke Thornewill, Thornewill Design					
Public	None					
Concerns (1:20)	<p><b>Thornewill</b> – Presented project; south elevation is not visible.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – North elevation left side, preferred the previously approved single windows; this has too many ganged windows. South elevation, in the left gable with the chimney, the ganged dormer window should be a single window (that’s existing).</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – No concerns given where it is.</p> <p><b>Pohl</b> – He’s okay with this.</p>					
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as submitted. (Oliver)</b>					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-09-1781</b>
4.	Cynthia McClintlock	<b>09-1801</b>	32 Brewster Road	Move/demo building	54/84	Robert Newman
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and historic documentation.					
Representing	Robert Newman, Sandcastle Construction, Inc.					
Public	None					
Concerns (1:35)	<p><b>Newman</b> – Presented project, circa 1950s; no one has shown interest in moving this.</p> <p><b>Backus</b> – Confirmed circa 1950.</p> <p>No concerns.</p>					
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve as a move-off/demolition. (Oliver)</b>					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-09-1801</b>
5.	Cynthia McClintlock	<b>09-1818</b>	32 Brewster Road	New dwelling	54/84	Robert Newman
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.					
Representing	Robert Newman, Sandcastle Construction, Inc.					
Public	None					
Concerns (1:39)	<p><b>Newman</b> – Presented project; 29’4” tall; white with red cedar roof.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – This isn’t too different from houses approved before. Suggested the gable windows be traditional and consistent.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – Agrees about the gable windows. This is too tall for the area; the average height is 25’ to 27’. Okay with the east elevation. North elevation, the circular and the triple gables windows in the gable should both be one or the other; Ungang some of the windows. Agrees with Ms. Thornewill about how the roof ends at the roof walk.</p> <p><b>Thornewill</b> – The roof ends under the roof walk; thinks the roof should be extended to the next gable.</p> <p><b>Pohl</b> – Extending the roof would make a very long roof ridge but see’s Ms. Thornewill’s point. The porch overhangs could be brought in and drop the gable ridge below the main ridge. The round and horizontal gable windows should be tradition 4-light windows vertically formatted. Ordinarily, roof walks are centered; it could be less wide, so it doesn’t go to the end of the roof. Rear porch ridge, center roof walk, character and consistency of gable-end windows.</p>					
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for revisions. (Coombs)</b>					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	
6.	Cynthia McClintlock	<b>09-1774</b>	32 Brewster Road	New garage	54/84	Robert Newman
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.					
Representing	Robert Newman, Sandcastle Construction, Inc.					
Public	None					
Concerns (1:50)	<p><b>Newman</b> – Presented project.</p> <p><b>Oliver</b> – With the exception of the gable windows; it’s fine. Suggested everyone drive out there to review the houses out there; this is within the existing vernacular.</p> <p><b>Coombs</b> – It’s okay. Agrees about the gable windows.</p> <p><b>Thornewill</b> – Agrees.</p> <p><b>Pohl</b> – Suggested eliminating the gable windows.</p>					
Motion	<b>Motion to Approve through staff with the triple-gable windows eliminated. (Oliver)</b>					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Coombs, Thornewill, Oliver, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-09-1774</b>

7.	Tom McCann	09-1836	78 Milk Street	Pool	56/6.2	Mark Lombardi
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, and advisory comments.					
Representing	None					
Public	None					
Concerns (1:54)	Not opened at this time.					
Motion	<b>Motion to Hold for representation. (Coombs)</b>					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Oliver, Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	
8.	Johnson 7 <sup>th</sup> Gen NT	09-1773	250 Madaket Road	New 2 <sup>nd</sup> dwelling	59.4/213	Brook Meerbergen
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, and correspondence.					
Representing	Brook Meerbergen					
Public	Robert McLeish, 1 Arkansas Avenue					
Concerns (1:54)	<b>Meerbergen</b> – Presented project; 26’ tall; the existing garage is 2.9’ from the property line, but this addition is outside the setback. <b>Pohl</b> – The height limit in Madaket is 25 feet. Read into the record letters of opposition. <b>Coombs</b> – This is fine; it will have minimal visibility. Does not agree with the abutter’s assertion that the “character of Arkansas Avenue in Tristam’s Landing” will be adversely impacted by this proposal. This used to belong to Byron Coffin and the garage was placed before 1972; the buildings on this side of the road are far and few between and she doesn’t find this offensive as it fits into the area better than those on the right side of Arkansas. The deck should be only 8 feet deep. <b>Thornewill</b> – Agrees with Ms. Coombs; even if it is seen, it fits in. This is a very unassuming 1.5-story building. <b>Oliver</b> – If the height is brought down, it will conform to Madaket zoning. The 2 <sup>nd</sup> -floor deck should be pulled back away from the fence. <b>McLeish</b> – The shed dormer is out of context with the neighborhood.					
Motion	<b>Pohl</b> – The concern is not if the dormer is visible but whether or not it is appropriate, which is up to the HDC. <b>Motion to Approve through staff with the 2<sup>nd</sup>-floor deck brought in to 8 feet and the building height dropped 1 foot. (Coombs)</b>					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 3-0//Thornewill, Coombs, and Pohl-aye; Oliver-nay				Certificate #	<b>HDC2020-09-1773</b>
9.	Barbara Von Der Groeben	09-1825	132 Main Street	Rooftop solar panels	42.3.3/45	ACK Smart
Voting	Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill					
Alternates	None					
Recused	None					
Documentation	Architectural elevation plans, site plan, photos, correspondence, historic documentation, advisory comments, and manufacturer spec sheet.					
Representing	Timothy Carruthers, ACK Smart					
Public	None					
Concerns (2:13)	<b>Carruthers</b> – Read into the record a letter from Ms. Von Der Groeben; presented project. <b>Backus</b> – Read HSAB comments: concerned about visibility of the west elevation driving from Caton’s Circle and asked for a mockup on the west dormer. Circa 1920 Walter Kaddy house. The application indicates the roof is black. <b>Pohl</b> – Panels project about 4” above the shingles; a mock-up would be great with the plywood blocked up as the panels would be. Asked if what appears to be grey will be changed to black. Pulling them away from the roof edge will reduce the visibility. <b>Oliver</b> – She would like to view with the mock-up; she has concerns about it being in the OHD proper. <b>Thornewill</b> – Agrees about a view with a mock-up. Discussion about shifting the solar panels so as to reduce visibility. <b>Coombs</b> – Agrees with moving panels away from main Street. Has concerns if the roof is not black. A mock-up should accurately reflect the placement of the panels.					
Motion	<b>Motion to View with a mock up and Hold for revisions. (Oliver)</b>					
Roll-call Vote	Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye				Certificate #	

10. Sea Hero, LLC **09-1758** 7 Pilgrim Road Rev. 01-0445: alts & grade 41/216 MCA+  
 Voting Pohl, Coombs, Oliver, Thornewill  
 Alternates None  
 Recused None  
 Documentation Architectural elevation plans, site plan, and photos.  
 Representing Mark Cutone, Mark Cutone Architecture  
 Public None

Concerns (2:23) **Cutone** – Presented project; high water triggered filling grade to elevation 19; top of walls are set at elevation 22.

**Thornewill** – Asked about the grading.

**Oliver** – The houses that are in front of this, have retaining walls to hold them up; this is in a bowl. Her concern would be the abutter to the west; he is even lower.

**Coombs** – Concerned the walls will change the properties around this and cause the water to run off into the neighbors.

**Pohl** – Zoning prohibits having a structure, which is more than 4’ tall, within the setback. It would be helpful to have a string along the western side showing the proposed grade at elevation 19; we would be able to ascertain if the wall might be visible.

Motion **Motion to View with a string running north-south showing the where the finished grade will be along the west elevation of the house and going east west at the rear property line. (Oliver)**

Roll-call Vote Carried 4-0//Thornewill, Coombs, Oliver, and Pohl-aye Certificate #

Following is carried over to the next meeting.

11. David Biddison <b>09-1784</b>	22 Cannonbury Lane	New dwelling	74/15	Val Oliver
12. 33 Coffin Street LLC <b>09-1796</b>	33 Coffin Street	Rev. 05-1009: fenest+railing	73.4.1/26.1	CWA
13. Kris Megna <b>09-1831</b>	28 South Shore Road	New dwelling (Lot 2A)	80/178	Val Oliver
14. Herrick Alberry <b>09-1841</b>	28 South Shore Road	New dwelling (Lot 2B)	80/178	Val Oliver
15. Doug Carlson <b>09-1791</b>	28 South Shore Road	New dwelling (Lot 1A)	80/178	Val Oliver
16. Doug Carlson <b>09-1787</b>	28 South Shore Road	New dwelling (Lot 1B)	80/178	Val Oliver
17. Craig Beni <b>09-1838</b>	5 Tom Nevers Road	Rev. 08-1547: enlarge cabana	77/2.2	Shelter 7, LLC
18. Todd Cooper <b>09-1819</b>	5 Hollister Road	Rev. 08-1494: pergola & stairs	92.4/263	Shelter 7, LLC
19. James Pallotta <b>09-1812</b>	21 Eel Point Road	Paddle court	40/4	Botticelli + Pohl
20. P. Zernik <b>09-1846</b>	24 West Chester Street	Rev. 06-1234: fenest change	42.4.3/57	Emeritus
21. Darren Black <b>09-1839</b>	28 Eel Point Road	Rev. 12-0389: ext alterations	40/44	Emeritus
22. Jonathan Raith <b>09-1821</b>	14 Easy Street	Rev. 73100: fenest change	42.3.1/13	Emeritus
23. Elizabeth Wetherell <b>09-1852</b>	10 Hickory Meadow	Rev. 1167: copper roof	41/904	Emeritus
24. Peter O’Brien <b>09-1843</b>	36 Low Beach Road	Rev.72855: relocate&omit perg	74/55	Emeritus
25. KTT Place, LLC <b>09-1844</b>	6 North Street Sias	Addition + rotate on site	73.4.1/41	MCA+
26. KTT Place, LLC <b>09-1859</b>	6 North Street Sias	Shed	73.4.1/41	MCA+
27. KTT Place, LLC <b>09-1802</b>	6 North Street Sias	Pool	73.4.1/41	MCA+
28. Peter Sendelbach <b>09-1805</b>	21 Hummock Pond Road	New dwelling	56/11.2	Self
29. 450 Green Park, LLC <b>09-1785</b>	2 Stone Alley	Addition	42.3.1/102	LINK
30. 22 BLVD, LLC <b>09-1757</b>	22 Boulevarde	New dwelling	30/327	Normand Resid
31. 22 BLVD, LLC <b>09-1780</b>	22 Boulevarde	Entertainment building	30/327	Normand Resid
32. EPR RGH, LLC <b>09-1842</b>	119 Eel Point Rd (Lot 34)	Move off/demo	33/17.2	Brook Meerbergen
33. 12 Sconset West, LLC <b>09-1863</b>	12 Hydrangea Lane	New dwelling	73/90	Brook Meerbergen
34. 12 Sconset West, LLC <b>09-1822</b>	12 Hydrangea Lane	New shed	73/90	Brook Meerbergen
35. 12 Sconset West, LLC <b>09-1865</b>	12 Hydrangea Lane	Hardscape	73/90	Brook Meerbergen
36. 12 Lincoln Ave NT <b>09-1848</b>	12 Lincoln Avenue	Rev. 07-1374: hardscape	30/183	MCLD, LLC

**IX. OTHER BUSINESS**

Approve Minutes	None
Review Minutes-	September 17 & 22, 2020
Other Business	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Next HDC Meeting- <b>Monday 10/05/20 at 04:30 pm</b></li> <li>• HDC review of revisions to HDC Background Summary to finalize for web page including vote</li> <li>• Discussion of 6 Fair Street Minimum Maintenance</li> <li>• Review policy of Move/demo hearings in relation to new dwellings</li> <li>• Discussion of Certified Local Government (CLG) and possible vote</li> <li>• Discussion of adding Tuckernuck to MAB</li> </ul>
Commission Comments	None

List of additional documents used at the meeting:

1. None

**Motion to Adjourn at 2:39 p.m. (Oliver)**

Roll-call vote: Carried 4-0//Coombs, Thornewill, Oliver, and Pohl-aye

Submitted by:

Terry L. Norton